

Science, Technology and Medicine in Modern History

General Editor: **John V. Pickstone**, Centre for the History of Science, Technology and Medicine, University of Manchester, England (www.man.ac.uk/CHSTM)

One purpose of historical writing is to illuminate the present. At the start of the third millennium, science, technology and medicine are enormously important, yet their development is little studied.

The reasons for this failure are as obvious as they are regrettable. Education in many countries, not least in Britain, draws deep divisions between the sciences and the humanities. Men and women who have been trained in science have too often been trained away from history, or from any sustained reflection on how societies work. Those educated in historical or social studies have usually learned so little of science that they remain thereafter suspicious, overawed, or both.

Such a diagnosis is by no means novel, nor is it particularly original to suggest that good historical studies of science may be peculiarly important for understanding our present. Indeed this series could be seen as extending research undertaken over the last half-century. But much of that work has treated science, technology and medicine separately; this series aims to draw them together, partly because the three activities have become ever more intertwined. This breadth of focus and the stress on the relationships of knowledge and practice are particularly appropriate in a series which will concentrate on modern history and on industrial societies. Furthermore, while much of the existing historical scholarship is on American topics, this series aims to be international, encouraging studies on European material. The intention is to present science, technology and medicine as aspects of modern culture, analysing their economic, social and political aspects, but not neglecting the expert content which tends to distance them from other aspects of history. The books will investigate the uses and consequences of technical knowledge, and how it was shaped within particular economic, social and political structures.

Such analyses should contribute to discussions of present dilemmas and to assessments of policy. 'Science' no longer appears to us as a triumphant agent of Enlightenment, breaking the shackles of tradition, enabling command over nature. But neither is it to be seen as merely oppressive and dangerous. Judgement requires information and careful analysis, just as intelligent policy-making requires a community of discourse between men and women trained in technical specialities and those who are not.

This series is intended to supply analysis and to stimulate debate. Opinions will vary between authors; we claim only that the books are based on searching historical study of topics which are important, not least because they cut across conventional academic boundaries. They should appeal not just to historians, nor just to scientists, engineers and doctors, but to all who share the view that science, technology and medicine are far too important to be left out of history.

Titles include:

Roberta E. Bivins

ACUPUNCTURE, EXPERTISE AND CROSS-CULTURAL MEDICINE

Roger Cooter

SURGERY AND SOCIETY IN PEACE AND WAR

Orthopaedics and the Organization of Modern Medicine, 1880–1948

David Edgerton

ENGLAND AND THE AEROPLANE

An Essay on a Militant and Technological Nation

Jean-Paul Gaudillière and Ilana Löwy (*editors*)

THE INVISIBLE INDUSTRIALIST

Manufacture and the Construction of Scientific Knowledge

Thomas Schlich

SURGERY, SCIENCE AND INDUSTRY

A Revolution in Fracture Care, 1950s–1990s

Eve Seguin (*editor*)

INFECTIOUS PROCESSES

Knowledge, Discourse and the Politics of Prions

Crosbie Smith and Jon Agar (*editors*)

MAKING SPACE FOR SCIENCE

Territorial Themes in the Shaping of Knowledge

Science, Technology and Medicine in Modern History

Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–71492–X hardcover

Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–80340–X paperback

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Infectious Processes

Knowledge, Discourse and the Politics
of Prions

Edited by

Eve Seguin

palgrave
macmillan



Editorial matter, selection, Introduction, Chapter 6 and Conclusion
© Eve Seguin 2004. Remaining material © Palgrave Macmillan 2004
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2004 978-1-4039-3223-5

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2004 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010
Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan® is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-51588-2 ISBN 978-0-230-52439-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1057/9780230524392

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Infectious processes : knowledge, discourse, and the politics of
prisons / edited by Eve Seguin.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Prion diseases – History. 2. Prions – History. I. Seguin, Eve, 1963–

QR201.P737I535 2004
614.5'98—dc22

2004043624

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
13 12 11 10 09 08 07 06 05 04

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction: Prions? <i>Eve Seguin</i>	1
1 The Early History of the Protein-only Hypothesis: Scientific Change and Multidisciplinary Research <i>Maj-Britt Juhl Poulsen and Hanne Andersen</i>	4
2 Styles of Scientific Practice and the Prion Controversy <i>Ki-Heung Kim</i>	38
3 Paradigm Change? Explaining the Nature of the TSE Agent in Germany <i>Kerstin Dressel</i>	73
4 Visualizing Prions: Graphic Representations and the Biography of Prions <i>Jérôme Segal and Eric Francoeur</i>	99
5 Prion Research and the Public Sphere in France <i>Brigitte Chamak</i>	135
6 The UK BSE Crisis and the Prion Discursive Chain in Scientific Literature <i>Eve Seguin</i>	161
Conclusion: the Prion Case <i>Eve Seguin</i>	186
<i>Index</i>	189

List of Figures

1.1	Diagrammatic illustrations of the model of replication proposed by the Prusiner group	21
1.2	Griffith's thermodynamical argument for the possibility of protein replication	26
1.3	Diagrammatic illustrations of the model of replication proposed by the Prusiner group	28
4.1	Micrographs used by the Prusiner group showing prions that reacted with antibodies	105
4.2	Three possible models of prion multiplication	107
4.3	Electron micrographs of polymerized peptides	108
4.4	Multiplication of PrP ^{Sc}	109
4.5	Four kinds of helices for possible structures of PrP ^C	110
4.6	Stereoview of the predicted three-dimensional structure of PrP ^C (the points of helix-helix interactions are highlighted)	111
4.7	Schematic drawings of the six plausible structures of PrP ^{Sc}	112
4.8	Proposed three-dimensional structure of PrP ^{Sc} after correlation with genetic data on residues involved in species barrier	113
4.9	Conformational model for prion replication (PrP* is a rare partially unfolded, monomeric structure, that is an intermediate in the formation of PrP ^C)	114
4.10	Stereoviews of an NMR structure of a Syrian Hamster prion (the different views show different parts and, in the original publication, colours are used to highlight different secondary structures)	115
4.11	Schematic diagram showing the flexibility of the polypeptide chain for PrP (29-231)	116
4.12	The first protein structure designed by NMR	121
4.13	Tertiary structure of mouse PrP	122
4.14	Stereoviews of a part of Ure2p (part 95-354 (a) and 97-354 (b))	125
4.15	Stereoview of the superposition of the Ure2p dimer with <i>E. coli</i> GST (above) and superposition of a monomer of Ure2p with a monomer of <i>A. thaliana</i> GST (below)	126

4.16	Structure of the yeast prion protein (<i>Structure</i> , front cover)	127
6.1	Annual numbers of papers published by Prusiner, 1982–95	168
6.2	Cumulative numbers of papers published by Prusiner, 1982–95	169
6.3	Cumulative numbers of different journals where Prusiner published, 1982–95	170
6.4	Annual numbers of journals where Prusiner published for the first time, 1982–95	171
6.5	Proportions of new journals where Prusiner published, 1982–95 (%)	172
6.6	Numbers of citations received by 1982 paper, 1982–95 (including self-citations)	173
6.7	Numbers of citations received by 1982 paper, 1982–95 (excluding self-citations)	174
6.8	Partial overview of Prusiner's citations, 1982–95	176
6.9	Difference between citations and citing papers	176
6.10	Full overview of Prusiner's citations, 1982–95	177
6.11	Annual numbers of papers citing Prusiner, 1982–95 (excluding self-citing papers)	177
6.12	Cumulative numbers of papers citing Prusiner, 1982–95 (excluding self-citing papers)	178
6.13	Cumulative numbers of different journals that cited Prusiner, 1982–95	180
6.14	Annual numbers of journals that cited Prusiner for the first time, 1982–95	180
6.15	Proportions of new journals that cited Prusiner, 1982–95 (%)	181

List of Tables

1.1	Citation analysis of the core papers by Alper, Pattison and Griffith	22
1.2	Citation analysis of the core papers advancing the prion theory	22
1.3	Differences between Griffith the outsider and Prusiner the insider	29
2.1	Stylistic differences between the prion advocates and prion sceptics	60
5.1	TSE research funding in France, 1996–2001	145
6.1	Prusiner as first and sole author of his publications, 1982–95	167
6.2	Numbers of papers by TSE researchers, 1982–95	168
6.3	Journals where Prusiner published 10 or more papers, 1982–95	170
6.4	Mean numbers of citations received by 10-year-old papers	175
6.5	Journals where 20 or more papers cited Prusiner, 1982–95	179

Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the following for permission to reproduce copyright material:

American Association for the Advancement of Science for Figure 1 of Chapter 1 taken from *Science* 252: 1520.

Macmillan Magazines Limited for Figure 2 of Chapter 1 taken from *Nature* 215: 1044.

John Wiley & Sons Limited for Figure 3 of Chapter 1 taken from R. Brown (chairman): Novel infectious agents and the central nervous system. *Ciba Foundation Symposium* 135: 212.

American Chemical Society for Figure 4 of Chapter 4 taken from *Biochemistry* 31(49): 12278.

Elsevier for Figures 2, 14, 15, 16 of Chapter 4, respectively taken from *Virus Research* 35: 121, *C.R. Biologies* 325: 42 (twice) and *Structure* 91: front cover.

National Academy of Sciences for Figures 3, 5, 6, 10, 11, 14, 15 of Chapter 4, respectively taken from *PNAS USA* 89(22): 10943, *PNAS USA* 91(15): 7141 (twice), *PNAS USA* 97(19): 10088 (twice), *PNAS USA* 94(25): 13456 and *PNAS USA* 98(4): 1462 (twice).

Nature Publishing Group for Figures 12 and 13 of Chapter 4, respectively taken from *Nature Structural Biology* 8: 924 and *Nature* 382: 181.

Scientific American for Figure 1 of Chapter 4, taken from *Scientific American* 251: 49.

Springer for Figures 7, 8, 9 of Chapter 4 taken from *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* 207: 57–8.

Prof. Stanley Prusiner for Figures 1, 7, 8, 9 of Chapter 4, respectively taken from *Scientific American* 251: 49 and *Curr. Top. Microbiol. Immunol.* 207: 57–8 (three figures).

Prof. Kurt Wüthrich for Figures 12 and 13 of Chapter 4, respectively taken from *Nature Structural Biology* 8: 924 and *Nature* 382: 181.

We are also very grateful to our commissioning editor, Luciana O'Flaherty, to our series editor, John Pickstone, and to an anonymous reviewer.

Notes on the Contributors

Hanne Andersen is an associate professor in the Department of Medical Philosophy and Clinical Theory at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark. She previously worked as curator at the Danish National Museum for the History of Science and Medicine. Her research focuses on the nature and processes of conceptual change in science, specifically on how incommensurability develops, and on its implications for the realism debate. Among her recent publications are the monograph *On Kuhn* (Wadsworth, 2001), and articles in such journals as *Philosophy of Science*, *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science* and *Erkenntnis*.

Brigitte Chamak worked as a neurobiologist for ten years. She then decided to study the history and sociology of science and did a PhD on the emergence of cognitive science in France. Her book *Le Groupe des Dix* was published by Editions du Rocher in 1997. She is currently working as a sociologist of science in the Cesames (Centre de recherche Psychotropes, Santé Mentale) at the Université Paris 5, France. After doing research on the prion hypothesis, she is now studying the controversies generated by different representations of autism. Her articles have been published in such journals as *La Pensée*, *Alliage*, *Intellectica*, *La Revue d'Histoire des Sciences* and *Social Studies of Science*.

Kerstin Dressel is a sociologist and is currently the scientific secretary of the German TSE Research Platform at the University of Munich, Germany. She is also a member of the board of the South German Institute of Empirical Social Research in Munich. She has conducted several social scientific studies on various aspects of the BSE case for the EU, WHO, OECD and the German Parliament. She has published several papers on the issue and her book *BSE – the New Dimension of Uncertainty* was published by Edition Sigma in 2002. Her research interests encompass the science–policy interface, social and cultural studies of science, scientific knowledge and ignorance, and risk and policy research.

Eric Francoeur is a sociologist of science who specializes in the use of models in chemistry. He has worked at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science in Berlin and in the Centre de Sociologie de l'Innovation at the Ecole Nationale Supérieure des Mines de Paris. He is currently lecturer at the Ecole de technologie supérieure de Montréal,

Canada. He has published articles in such journals as *Hyle: an International Journal for the Philosophy of Chemistry and Social Studies of Science*.

Maj-Britt Juhl Poulsen is a research adviser in the Health Care Sector in Frederiksborg County, Denmark. After working as a researcher in the field of molecular biology at Statens Serum Institut in Copenhagen, she gained a PhD in Science and Technology Studies. Her research focuses on competition and cooperation in biomedical research, on the development of biomedical research, and on research integrity. Her recent publications are found in *International Journal of Technology Management* and *Proceedings of the First ORI Research Conference on Research Integrity*.

Ki-Heung Kim recently completed his PhD thesis on the history of scrapie research in the Science Studies Unit at the University of Edinburgh. He is now a research fellow in the Wellcome Trust Centre for the History of Medicine at University College London, UK, where he is doing a comparative study on the history of research on neurological diseases in the UK and USA.

Jérôme Segal trained as an engineer and did a PhD in the history of science on the scientific concept of information. He has worked on the history of molecular biology at the Max Planck Institute for the History of Science in Berlin. He is now an assistant professor at the Institut Universitaire de Formation des Maîtres in Paris and a researcher at the Centre Cavailles of the Ecole Normale Supérieure de Paris, France. He has made several contributions on cybernetics, information theory and the history of molecular biology to edited volumes, and has published articles in such journals as *Annals of Science*. His book *Le zéro et le un* was published by Syllepse in 2003.

Eve Seguin is a political scientist and a researcher in the Department of History at the University of Aberdeen, UK. Her research interests encompass public controversies on technoscientific issues, science studies, the links between science and politics, discourse analysis, and the use of expertise in policy-making. In case studies such as *in vitro* fertilization or BSE, her work specifically addresses the political function of scientific discourse. She has published a number of articles in such journals as *Theory, Culture and Society*, *Revue française de science politique*, *Discourse and Society*, *Revue française d'administration publique*, *Science as Culture*, *Langage et société*, *Science and Public Policy*, *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science*.

List of Abbreviations

ABRO	Animal Breeding Research Organization (UK)
AFSSA	Agence Française de Sécurité Sanitaire des Aliments (France)
AHS	Army Health Service (SSA: Service de santé des armées) (France)
AIDS	acquired immune deficiency syndrome
AFRC	Agricultural and Food Research Council (UK)
ARC	Agricultural Research Council (UK)
BSE	bovine spongiform encephalopathy
cDNA	complementary DNA
CEA	Centre d’Energie Atomique (France)
CJD	Creutzfeldt–Jakob disease
CNEVA	Centre National d’Etudes Vétérinaires et Alimentaires (France)
CNRS	Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (France)
CNS	central nervous system
CWD	chronic wasting disease
DH	Department of Health (UK)
DMA	Délégation Ministérielle pour l’Armement (France)
DNA	deoxyribonucleic acid
DRET	Direction des Recherches et Etudes Techniques (France)
EU	European Union
GH	growth hormone
GIS	Groupement d’intérêt scientifique (France)
GSS	Gerstmann–Sträussler–Scheinker syndrome
HIV	human immunodeficiency virus
HSP	heat-shock proteins
IAH	Institute of Animal Health (UK)
IBR	Institute of Basic Research (USA)
INRA	Institut National de la Recherche Agronomique (France)
INSERM	Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale (France)
IRAD	Institute for Research on Animal Diseases (UK)
MAFF	Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food (UK)
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology (USA)
mRNA	messenger RNA
MRC	Medical Research Council (UK)

NMR	nuclear magnetic resonance
NPU	Neuropathogenesis Unit (UK)
PCR	polymerase chain reaction
PNS	peripheral nervous system
PrP	prion protein
PrP ^C	cellular (normal) isoform of PrP
PrP ^{Sc}	scrapie (pathological) isoform of PrP
PVR	poliovirus receptor
RKI	Robert-Koch Institute (Germany)
RML	Rocky Mountain Laboratory (USA)
RNA	ribonucleic acid
SAFs	scrapie associated fibrils
SEs	spongiform encephalopathies
SEAC	Spongiform Encephalopathies Advisory Committee (UK)
SSI	sociology of scientific ignorance
SSK	sociology of scientific knowledge
TME	transmissible mink encephalopathy
TSEs	transmissible spongiform encephalopathies
UC	University of California (USA)
UCSF	University of California in San Francisco (USA)
vCJD	new variant of Creutzfeldt–Jakob disease
WOS	Web of Science