

St Antony's Series

General Editor: **Jan Zielonka** (2004–), Fellow of St Antony's College, Oxford

Recent titles include:

José Esteban Castro
WATER, POWER AND CITIZENSHIP
Social Struggle in the Basin of Mexico

Valpy Fitzgerald and Rosemary Thorp (*editors*)
ECONOMIC DOCTRINES IN LATIN AMERICA
Origins, Embedding and Evolution

Victoria D. Alexander and Marilyn Rueschemeyer
ART AND THE STATE
The Visual Arts in Comparative Perspective

Ailish Johnson
EUROPEAN WELFARE STATES AND SUPRANATIONAL GOVERNANCE OF
SOCIAL POLICY

Archie Brown (*editor*)
THE DEMISE OF MARXISM LENINISM IN RUSSIA

Thomas Boghardt
SPIES OF THE KAISER
German Covert Operations in Great Britain during the First World War Era

Ulf Schmidt
JUSTICE AT NUREMBERG
Leo Alexander and the Nazi Doctors' Trial

Steve Tsang (*editor*)
PEACE AND SECURITY ACROSS THE TAIWAN STRAIT

C.W. Braddick
JAPAN AND THE SINO-SOVIET ALLIANCE, 1950–1964
In the Shadow of the Monolith

Isao Miyaoka
LEGITIMACY IN INTERNATIONAL SOCIETY
Japan's Reaction to Global Wildlife Preservation

Neil J. Melvin
SOVIET POWER AND THE COUNTRYSIDE
Policy Innovation and Institutional Decay

Julie M. Newton
RUSSIA, FRANCE AND THE IDEA OF EUROPE

Juhana Aunesluoma
BRITAIN, SWEDEN AND THE COLD WAR, 1945–54
Understanding Neutrality

George Pagoulatos
GREECE'S NEW POLITICAL ECONOMY
State, Finance and Growth from Postwar to EMU

Tiffany A. Troxel
PARLIAMENTARY POWER IN RUSSIA, 1994–2001
A New Era

Elvira María Restrepo
COLOMBIAN CRIMINAL JUSTICE IN CRISIS
Fear and Distrust

Ilaria Favretto
THE LONG SEARCH FOR A THIRD WAY
The British Labour Party and the Italian Left Since 1945

Lawrence Tal
POLITICS, THE MILITARY, AND NATIONAL SECURITY IN JORDAN, 1955–1967

Louise Haagh and Camilla Helgø (editors)
SOCIAL POLICY REFORM AND MARKET GOVERNANCE IN LATIN AMERICA

Gayil Talshir
THE POLITICAL IDEOLOGY OF GREEN PARTIES
From the Politics of Nature to Redefining the Nature of Politics

E.K. Dosmukhamedov
FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT IN KAZAKHSTAN
Politico–Legal Aspects of Post–Communist Transition

Felix Patrikeeff
RUSSIAN POLITICS IN EXILE
The Northeast Asian Balance of Power, 1924–1931

He Ping
CHINA'S SEARCH FOR MODERNITY
Cultural Discourse in the Late 20th Century

Mariana Llanos
PRIVATIZATION AND DEMOCRACY IN ARGENTINA
An Analysis of President–Congress Relations

St Antony's Series

Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–71109–2

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Water, Power and Citizenship

Social Struggle in the Basin of Mexico

José Esteban Castro
Senior Lecturer in Sociology
University of Newcastle upon Tyne

palgrave
macmillan

in association with
St Antony's College, Oxford

© José Esteban Castro 2006

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2006 978-1-4039-4879-3

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2006 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan® is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is a registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-52516-4

ISBN 978-0-230-50881-1 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230508811

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Castro, José Esteban.

Water, power, and citizenship : social struggle in the Basin of Mexico / José Esteban Castro.

p. cm. – (St. Antony's series)

Revision of the author's thesis (doctoral)—Oxford, 1998.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

1. Water-supply—Social aspects—Mexico—Mexico, Valley of. 2. Water-supply—Political aspects—Mexico—Mexico, Valley of. 3. Power (Social sciences)—Mexico—Mexico, Valley of. 4. Citizenship—Mexico—Mexico, Valley of. 5. Social conflict—Mexico—Mexico, Valley of. 6. Mexico, Valley of (Mexico)—Social conditions. 7. Mexico, Valley of (Mexico)—Politics and government. I. Title. II. St. Antony's series (Palgrave Macmillan (Firm))
HD1696.M64M493 2005

363.6'1'09725—dc22

2005047527

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
15 14 13 12 11 10 09 08 07 06

Transferred to Digital Printing in 2005

To the memory of José Castro and Rosario Muzzupappa

Also by José Esteban Castro

LA SOCIEDAD COMPLEJA: Ensayos en Torno a la Obra de
Niklas Luhmann (*co-edited with Antonio Camou*)

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>List of Figures</i>	xii
<i>Conventions of Transcription and Translation</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
Introduction	1
Relevance of the topic	2
Water, citizenship and power	4
Outline of the book	8
1 The Social Character of Water	11
Physical-natural cycles and social regularities	12
The techno-scientific approach to water conflicts	15
Water conflict as an object of knowledge	19
Epistemic subjects	20
The meanings of conflict	21
Making social regularities observable	23
Social struggle, water and citizenship	25
Conflict and social struggle	25
Water, the state and the territory of citizenship	28
Temporal scales	30
The long-term 'conquest of water' in Mexico	31
Dismantling the 'benefactor' state?	34
Concluding remarks	37
2 The Sociogenesis of Water Stress	39
Hydrogeological profile	40
The Basin of Mexico	41
The pattern of socio-ecological change	42
The pre-Columbian scene	43
The colonial transformation	45
The 'technological deadlock' hypothesis	46
The 'water technology innovation' hypothesis	48
Colonial water development	50
Water supply and social structure	50
Productive waters	52

The drain of the Basin	53
Water syncretism and colonial domination	56
After Independence	57
The Porfirian modernization	58
Post-Revolution trends	60
The current context	62
Concluding remarks	66
3 Water and Power in the Basin of Mexico	67
Water control and state formation	68
Pre-Conquest water politics	71
Water and the 'obedient citizen'	73
The colonial development	74
The politics of flood control	75
Water expertise, institutions and political power	77
Independent Mexico	79
Water politics under Porfirio Diaz	81
Water expertise and state power	83
Changes in the legal sphere	84
Modernization, social change and citizenship	86
After the Revolution: the challenge of citizenship	88
Water and institutional development	88
Water and political power in the Basin	91
The flood control factor	92
The increasing centrality of water policy	93
Concluding remarks	95
4 Contested Waters	97
The context of the social mobilization over water in the MCMA	98
Physical-natural cycles, social regularities	103
The structure of the events	106
The protagonists	106
The opponents	108
Reason for action and instruments employed	110
A closer look into the events	112
Events to gain access to the water services	114
Events aimed at improving standards	118
Events involving the control of water resources and infrastructure	124
Concluding remarks	127

5	Water and the Evolution of Citizenship	129
	The process of citizenship	130
	Caveats and conceptual clarification	132
	Water and citizenship: specifying the links	134
	Water, 'civilized well-being' and citizenship	135
	Water and the struggle over citizenship	139
	Pre-Hispanic water management	140
	The colonial legacy	141
	Water rights	142
	The struggle over water rights	143
	A rich tradition of water law	144
	The contradictions between legal principles and actual practices	145
	Water and human well-being	148
	After Independence	151
	The making of citizens	152
	Water and the redefinition of the private–public divide	154
	A revolution for land and water	156
	Concluding remarks	160
6	Water and the Territory of Citizenship	161
	Water and citizenship in twentieth-century Mexico	162
	Re-ordering water governance	165
	The case of water resources	166
	The case of essential water supply and sanitation	167
	Contested waters	168
	Essential water services and the sociogenesis of scarcity	171
	The epistemic-political contest: mainstream water policy in action	174
	The shifting boundaries of citizenship	181
	Concluding remarks	186
	<i>Conclusion</i>	187
	<i>Notes</i>	191
	<i>Sources</i>	201
	<i>Bibliography</i>	203
	<i>Glossary</i>	223
	<i>Index</i>	225

List of Tables

3.1	Expenditure on public works during the Porfiriato. Mexico City and El Desagüe 1880–1910	82
3.2	Expenditure on public works in the Federal District. Presidency of Miguel Alemán (1946–52)	94
4.1	Relative weight of the events of conflict over water. MCMA 1985–92	105
4.2	Level of organization of the protagonists of the events of conflict over water. MCMA 1985–92	108
4.3	Actors targeted by the protagonists of the events of conflict over water. MCMA 1985–92	109
4.4	Stated causes of the events of conflict over water. MCMA 1985–92	110
4.5	Instruments employed by the protagonists of the events of conflict over water. MCMA 1985–92	111
6.1	Links between citizenship and water	183

See additional tables in an appendix at:
www.staff.ncl.ac.uk/j.e.castro/WPCAppendix.pdf

List of Figures

1.1	The Mexico City Metropolitan Area (circa 1990)	13
1.2	Map of conflicts over water supply services in the main Mexican urban centres (1980–2000)	17
2.1	The process of desiccation in the Basin of Mexico (1500–1990)	54
4.1	Annual cycle of the events over water in the MCMA	103
4.2	Social and physical–natural cycles	104
4.3	Protest in front of the Senate Chamber, Federal District (picture)	113
4.4	Mazahua Indians defending their water rights (photo)	117
6.1	The ideal-type model of governance	180
6.2	The shifting borders of the territory of citizenship	182

Note: Figures 1.1, 1.2 and 2.1 were prepared by David Sansom, Cartographer at the School of Geography and the Environment, University of Oxford.

Conventions of Transcription and Translation

We have used some Spanish and Nahuatl terms which are always written in italics followed by the English translation between square brackets in the first occurrence. A Glossary of non-English terms is added at the back of the book for further consultation. Institutional names are translated but we have retained the acronym of the original Spanish version. A List of Abbreviations is also included on pages xv–xvii. Personal and geographical names are not translated (for example, El Desagüe). Unless otherwise indicated, all translations were done by the author.

List of Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AHA	Archivo Histórico del Agua
AIA	Asociación de Ingenieros y Arquitectos
AMSO	Asociación Mexicana de Salud Ocupacional
ARDF	Asamblea de Representantes del Distrito Federal
BANOBRAS	Banco Nacional de Obras y Servicios Públicos
BNHUOP	Banco Nacional Hipotecario Urbano y de Obras Públicas
CADF	Comisión de Aguas del Distrito Federal
CAVM	Comisión de Aguas del Valle de México
CEAS	Comisión Estatal de Agua y Saneamiento
CEHOPU	Centro de Estudios Históricos de Obras Públicas y Urbanismo
CENCA	Centro de Consulta del Agua
CFE	Compañía Federal de Electricidad
CHCVM	Comisión Hidrológica del Valle de México
CIC	Colegio de Ingenieros Civiles
CIESAS	Centro de Investigaciones y Estudios Superiores en Antropología Social
CNA	Comisión Nacional del Agua
CNC	Confederación Nacional Campesina
CNDH	Comisión Nacional de Derechos Humanos
CNI	Comisión Nacional de Irrigación
CNOP	Confederación Nacional de Organizaciones Populares
CONAMUP	Coordinadora Nacional del Movimiento Urbano Popular
CONAPO	Consejo Nacional de Población
CTM	Confederación de Trabajadores de México
CVCP	Committee of Vice-Chancellors and Principals of the Universities of the United Kingdom
DDF	Departamento del Distrito Federal
DESTIN	Development Studies Institute, London School of Economics and Political Science
DF	Distrito Federal
DGCOH	Dirección General de Construcción y Operación Hidráulica
DGOH	Dirección General de Obras Hidráulicas
DGAS	Dirección de Agua y Saneamiento

DGOVM	Dirección General de Obras del Valle de México
DIS	Dirección de Ingeniería Sanitaria
EC	European Commission
ECLAC	UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean
EZLN	Ejército Zapatista de Liberación Nacional
FLACSO	Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GMP	Gross Manufacturing Product
GWP	Global Water Partnership
IDB	Inter American Development Bank
IEPES	Instituto de Estudios Políticos y Sociales
IIH	Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas
IMTA	Instituto Mexicano de Tecnología del Agua
INAH	Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia
INAINI	Instituto Autónomo de Investigaciones Ecológicas
INCO-DEV	International Co-operation for Development, European Commission
INEGI	Instituto Nacional de Estadística, Geografía e Informática
INJM	Instituto Nacional de la Juventud Mexicana
MCMA	Mexico City Metropolitan Area
MRP	Movimiento Revolucionario del Pueblo
MUP	Movimiento Urbano Popular
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NAS	National Academy of Sciences
NGO	Non Governmental Organization
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PAN	Partido Acción Nacional
PARM	Partido Auténtico de la Revolución Mexicana
PEM	Partido Ecológico Mexicano
PEMEX	Petróleos Mexicanos
PFCDN	Partido del Frente Cardenista de Reconstrucción Nacional
PMS	Partido Mexicano Socialista
PMT	Partido Mexicano de los Trabajadores
PNH	Plan Nacional Hidráulico
POM	Partido Obrero Mexicano
PPS	Partido Popular Socialista
PRD	Partido de la Revolución Democrática

PRI	Partido Revolucionario Institucional
PRM	Presidencia de la República Mexicana
PRONASOL	Programa Nacional de Solidaridad
PS	Partido Socialista
PSIRU	Public Services Internacional Research Unit
PST	Partido Socialista de los Trabajadores
PSUM	Partido Socialista Unificado de México
SAHOP	Secretaría de Asentamientos Humanos y Obras Públicas
SARH	Secretaría de Agricultura y Recursos Hidráulicos
SEDESOL	Secretaría de Desarrollo Social
SEDUE	Secretaría de Desarrollo Urbano y Ecología
SEMARNAP	Secretaría de Medio Ambiente, Recursos Naturales y Pesca
SEP	Secretaría de Educación Pública
SMA	Subsecretaría de Mejoramiento del Ambiente
SOS	Secretaría de Obras y Servicios
SRH	Secretaría de Recursos Hidráulicos
UN	The United Nations
UNAM	Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México
UNCED	The United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNECE	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization
UNRISD	United Nations Research Institute for Social Development
UNWC	The United Nations Water Conference
US	The United States of America
USAID	The United States Agency for International Development
WCED	World Commission on Environment and Development
WHO	World Health Organization

Acknowledgements

The main work that led to this book was completed as part of my doctoral research at Oxford University between 1993 and 1997. I cannot do justice to all the persons and institutions that contributed to make this project possible, but cannot fail to mention Dr María Luisa Torregrosa Armentia and Mr José Luis Barros Horcasitas, at the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO) in Mexico. María Luisa gave me continued support since I started my studies on water struggles in Mexico back in 1990 and we have developed an enduring academic partnership and personal friendship ever since. José Luis Barros Horcasitas, FLACSO's Director during my time in that institution, also gave me strategic support to complete my research. I am also deeply indebted to my 'old sociology teacher' and friend Juan Carlos Marín, at the University of Buenos Aires. Many thanks Lito for your academic generosity and especially for your continued friendship. In Oxford, I wish to thank especially Herminio Martins for being such a supportive supervisor during my doctoral studies. He gave me invaluable help to develop my interest in water into a subject of sociological inquiry. Also thanks to Erik Swyngedouw, the co-supervisor, who made me aware of crucial debates about water politics taking place outside my field of origin, sociology, and helped me to strengthen the interdisciplinary – he may also say transdisciplinary – approach that I was seeking to achieve in my work. Alan Knight thoroughly commented draft versions of some chapters and strongly supported my work and initiatives in Oxford, not just on water issues. Finally, Laurence Whitehead has been a permanent source of strategic advice and generous support in intellectual and practical matters. I am very grateful to them.

The research work was accomplished with financial support from various sources. I wish to mention in particular the Latin American Faculty of Social Sciences (FLACSO) in Mexico and the Committee of Vice-Chancellors and Principals of the Universities of the United Kingdom (CVCP). In addition I received the generous backing of the Inter-faculty Committee for Latin American Studies, the Committee for Graduate Studies, the Norman Chester Fund, the Oxford Society and St Antony's College, all of these in the University of Oxford. Also, I am very grateful to the Churches Commission on Overseas Students, the Northern Dairies Trust and the Michel Polak Foundation for their kind

support in the final stages of the doctoral dissertation. After I finished my doctoral studies, I was able to further expand and deepen my analysis first working as a Lecturer in Development Studies at the Development Studies Institute (DESTIN), London School of Economics and Political Science, and later as a Senior Research Associate at the School of Geography and the Environment, University of Oxford, funded by the International Cooperation for Development (INCO-DEV) Programme of the European Commission to coordinate a research project on water and sanitation in developing countries (PRINWASS, EC Contract PL ICA4-2001-10041), in the course of which I was able to complete the manuscript. Finally, I wish to thank the anonymous reader, whose comments and remarks helped to correct errors, give more precision to the analysis, and improve the overall readability of the text. Of course, I remain solely responsible for the final version.

JOSE ESTEBAN CASTRO

The author and publishers are grateful to the American Geographical Society for permission to reproduce Figure 2.1 from D. Fox, 'Man-Water Relationships in Metropolitan Mexico', *Geographical Review*, Vol. 55, 1965. Every effort has been made to contact all copyright-holders, but if any have been inadvertently omitted the publishers will be pleased to make the necessary arrangement at the earliest opportunity.