

Shakespeare and the Truth of Love

Palgrave Shakespeare Studies

General Editors: **Michael Dobson** and **Dympna Callaghan**

Editorial Advisory Board: Michael Neill, University of Auckland; David Schalkwyk, Folger Shakespeare Library; Lois D. Potter, University of Delaware; Margreta de Grazia, University of Pennsylvania; Peter Holland, University of Notre Dame

Palgrave Shakespeare Studies takes Shakespeare as its focus but strives to understand the significance of his oeuvre in relation to his contemporaries, subsequent writers and historical and political contexts. By extending the scope of Shakespeare and English Renaissance Studies the series will open up the field to examinations of previously neglected aspects or sources in the period's art and thought. Titles in the *Palgrave Shakespeare Studies* series seek to understand anew both where the literary achievements of the English Renaissance came from and where they have brought us.

Titles include:

Pascale Aebischer, Edward J. Esche and Nigel Wheale (*editors*)

REMAKING SHAKESPEARE

Performance across Media, Genres and Cultures

James P. Bednarz

SHAKESPEARE AND THE TRUTH OF LOVE

The Mystery of 'The Phoenix and Turtle'

Mark Thornton Burnett

FILMING SHAKESPEARE IN THE GLOBAL MARKETPLACE

Lowell Gallagher and Shankar Raman (*editors*)

KNOWING SHAKESPEARE

Senses, Embodiment and Cognition

David Hillman

SHAKESPEARE'S ENTRAILS

Belief, Scepticism and the Interior of the Body

Jane Kingsley-Smith

SHAKESPEARE'S DRAMA OF EXILE

Stephen Purcell

POPULAR SHAKESPEARE

Simulation and Subversion on the Modern Stage

Erica Sheen

SHAKESPEARE AND THE INSTITUTION OF THEATRE

Paul Yachnin and Jessica Slights

SHAKESPEARE AND CHARACTER

Theory, History, Performance, and Theatrical Persons

Palgrave Shakespeare Studies

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-1403-91164-3 (hardback) 978-1403-91165-0 (paperback)
(*outside North America only*)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Shakespeare and the Truth of Love

The Mystery of 'The Phoenix and Turtle'

By

James P. Bednarz

Long Island University, USA

palgrave
macmillan



© James P. Bednarz 2012

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2012 ISBN 978-0-230-31940-0
All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2012 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-33993-8 ISBN 978-0-230-39332- 5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230393325

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
21 20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12

For Edward Tayler, Stella Paul, and James Shapiro

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1 The Mystery of ‘The Phoenix and Turtle’	19
2 Eliminating Essex: <i>Richard II</i> and the <i>Diverse Poetical Essays</i>	49
3 Literary Politics: The Publication of <i>Love’s Martyr</i>	71
4 Incorporate Selves: Shakespeare’s Mythmaking	103
5 Shakespeare’s Poetic Theology	140
6 Metaphysical Wit from Shakespeare to Donne	163
Epilogue: ‘If what parts, can so remaine’	192
<i>Notes</i>	198
<i>Appendix: Diverse Poetical Essays</i>	237
<i>Index</i>	244

List of Illustrations

Cover: Engraving of the phoenix, based on a design by Marcus Gheeraerts, the Elder, in Etienne Perret's *Vingt-Cinq Fables des animaux* (Antwerp, 1578). Courtesy of the author.

- | | | |
|------|--|---------|
| 1 | Title page of <i>Loves Martyr: or, Rosalins Complaint. Allegorically shadowing the Truth of Love, in the constant Fate of the Phoenix and Turtle</i> (London, 1601). By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library. | 25 |
| 2 | <i>Diverse Poeticall Essaies</i> . Sig. Z1 ^r : Internal title page. By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library. | 26 |
| 3 | Geffrey Whitney, <i>A Choice of Emblemes and other Devises</i> (Leiden, 1586), 177. By permission of The Huntington Library, San Marino, California. | 33 |
| 4 | <i>Loves Martyr</i> , Sig. Z2 ^r . INVOCATIO. By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library. | 43 |
| 5 | <i>Loves Martyr</i> , Sig. Z2 ^v . Dedication. By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library. | 44 |
| 6 | Woodcut of the phoenix's suicide from Jan van der Noodt's <i>A Theatre [of] . . . Voluptuous Worldlings</i> (London, 1569), Sig. B6 ^r . By permission of the Huntington Library, San Marino, California. | 121 |
| 7–10 | Shakespeare's untitled poem known as 'The Phoenix and Turtle' and Marston's 'A narration and description of a most exact wondrous creature, arising out of the Phoenix and Turtle Doves ashes'. <i>Loves Martyr</i> , Sigs. Z3 ^v –2A1 ^r . By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library. | 134–137 |

Acknowledgements

Edward Taylor led me to understand why the inclusion of 'The Phoenix and Turtle' in Helen Gardner's anthology chiefly composed of seventeenth-century verse is *not* historically misleading and how categories such as 'Elizabethan' and 'Jacobean' tend to blind analysis to significant literary changes at the turn of the century.

Patrick Cheney reminded me, after I had completed *Shakespeare and the Poets' War*, of just how important 'The Phoenix and Turtle' is for a more comprehensive perception of Shakespeare's role as a 'poet' of drama and lyric in 1601.

James Shapiro encouraged me to view 'The Phoenix and Turtle' as a work that resists naïve biographical interpretations. I began this book when Shapiro was writing *Contested Will*, and through our conversations at the time I increasingly saw the need to rethink the poem's relation to biography and history.

Peter Rudnytsky provided invaluable advice on a wide range of subjects, from general conceptualization to prose style, and this study is only acceptable in so far as I have internalized his standards of insight, coherence and concision.

Patricia Donahue's reaction to successive drafts lent me courage to continue. Judith Anderson and Jennifer Vaught confirmed my suspicion that there were still important connections to be made between Shakespeare's and Donne's poetry. Annual meetings of the Shakespeare Association of America have provided a welcome forum for exploring new ideas. My colleagues at Long Island University, especially Provost Paul Forestell, Dean Katherine Hill-Miller, Phyllis Dircks, Thomas Fahy, Deborah Lutz, John Lutz and Dennis Pahl, continue to inspire me to emulate them as model scholars and educators.

I thank Felicity Plester, Michael Dobson and Dympna Callaghan for seeing this book's potential for publication by Palgrave Macmillan. Catherine Mitchell graciously assisted me through production. Linda Auld and Nick Brock deftly brought it to life. My intellectual debts are documented on every page, but what are not mentioned are those numerous acts of kindness which have made the writing of this book possible. For these I thank Ellen Anderman, Leeds Barroll, Anne Barton, Jonathan Bate, Robert Bednarz, Catherine Belsey, Peter Berek, Jesse Berger, David Bergeron, David Bevington, Harold Bloom, William C.

Carroll, Charles Cathcart, Maurice Charney, Julie Crawford, Jennifer Crewe, Mario DiGangi, Joan and John Digby, Jeff Dolven, James Donaldson, Richard Dutton, Robert C. Evans, Martin Elsky, Nicole Fermon, Ewan Fernie, Chris Fitter, P. J. Ford, Monika and Peter Greenleaf, Suzanne Gossett, Andrew Hadfield, Paul E. J. Hammer, Heather Hirschfeld, Peter Holland, Peg and Eric Jager, Alan Jutzi, David Kastan, William Kennedy, John N. King, Ted Leinwand, Diane, Dan, and Alex Linder, Lawrence Manley, James Marino, Robin Marshall, Richard McCoy, K. Ann McDonald, Russ McDonald, Christina Moustakis, Alison Rea, Michael Sexton, Tiffany Stern, Stanley Stewart, Anne and Edward Strauss, Brian Vickers, Harold Visser, Robert Weimann, Dorothy and Michael Weiss, W. B. Worthen and Georgianna Ziegler.

Facsimile reproductions were underwritten by a generous grant from the Research Committee of the C. W. Post Campus of Long Island University.