

Quality and Legitimacy of Global Governance

International Political Economy Series

General Editor: Timothy M. Shaw, Professor and Director, Institute of International Relations, The University of the West Indies, Trinidad & Tobago

Titles include:

Timothy Cadman

QUALITY AND LEGITIMACY OF GLOBAL GOVERNANCE

Case Lessons from Forestry

Andrew F. Cooper and Timothy W. Shaw (*editors*)

THE DIPLOMACIES OF SMALL STATES

Between Vulnerability and Resilience

Anthony Leysens

THE CRITICAL THEORY OF ROBERT W. COX

Fugitive or Guru?

Valbona Muzaka

THE POLITICS OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS AND ACCESS TO MEDICINES

Míreya Solís, Barbara Stallings and Saori N. Katada (*editors*)

COMPETITIVE REGIONALISM

FTA Diffusion in the Pacific Rim

Peter Utting and José Carlos Marques (*editors*)

CORPORATE SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY AND REGULATORY GOVERNANCE

Towards Inclusive Development?

International Political Economy Series

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-333-71708-0 hardcover

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-333-71110-1 paperback

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Quality and Legitimacy of Global Governance

Case Lessons from Forestry

Timothy Cadman

Fellow, Sustainable Business, University of Southern Queensland, Australia

palgrave
macmillan



© Timothy Cadman 2011

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2011 978-0-230-24358-3

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6-10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2011 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-31849-0

ISBN 978-0-230-30646-2 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230306462

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 11

For Beth

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>List of Figures</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Governance and Forest Management	25
3 Forest Stewardship Council	45
4 ISO, TC 207 and the 14000 Series	75
5 Programme for the Endorsement of Forest Certification Schemes	109
6 United Nations Forum on Forests	141
7 Comparative Analysis	175
8 Conclusions	193
<i>Appendix</i>	206
<i>Notes</i>	211
<i>Bibliography</i>	233
<i>Index</i>	255

List of Tables

1.1	Four typologies of governance 1997–2008	9
1.2	Hierarchical framework of principles, criteria and indicators of governance quality	17
1.3	Evaluative matrix of institutional performance	23
2.1	Comparison of non-state market-driven governance sources of authority with other forms of governance	39
3.1	Evaluative matrix of FSC governance quality	60
4.1	Stages in the development of ISO International Standards	84
4.2	Evaluative matrix of ISO TC 207 governance quality	89
4.3	ISO member bodies and technical committee participation by ISO geographical region	92
5.1	Evaluative matrix of PEFC governance quality	123
6.1	Evaluative matrix of UNFF governance quality	155
7.1	Comparative matrix of governance quality	176
8.1	UNFCCC-REDD-plus related questionnaire – government and environmental NGOs – North and South	200
A.1	Table of key informants	206

List of Figures

1.1	Conceptual model of contemporary global governance	5
1.2	Typological framework for the classification of four hypothetical governance institutions	11
2.1	Ideal model of institutional governance quality	42
3.1	Institutional structure of the Forest Stewardship Council	55
3.2	Institutional classification of FSC	58
4.1	Institutional structure of ISO	82
4.2	Institutional structure of TC 207	85
4.3	The Environmental Management System model for ISO 14001	86
4.4	Institutional classification of ISO	87
5.1	Structure of PEFC	118
5.2	Structural and procedural arrangements for standards-setting and related activities within the PEFC system	119
5.3	Institutional classification of PEFC	122
6.1	Structure of UNFF	152
6.2	Institutional classification of UNFF	154
7.1	Institutional classification of governance type: UNFF, PEFC, FSC, ISO	191

Preface

During the 1990s, as part of a global non-governmental forest conservation organisation, I witnessed the rise of sustainable forest management, and the related market-based initiative of timber certification. I was at first hostile to both ideas, as they appeared to confirm my worst fears about sustainable development, namely that it would seek to reduce nature to a tradeable commodity, with no intrinsic, only economic, value. However, at the urging of a colleague, I agreed, somewhat reluctantly, to become a member of the Forest Stewardship Council timber certification programme. Sustainable forest management and timber certification were to have a major impact on my working life over the next few years. In late 1999 when the Australian Federal Government announced that it would be developing its own national certification scheme in collaboration with the forest industry, I was nominated by environmental NGOs to represent their interests. During the same period, a number of timber companies approached me for my advice on how to become certified under the FSC programme. In what seemed a strange twist of fate, given my initial hostility, I had somehow ended up as a major player in the negotiations between economic, environmental and social interests over the introduction of certification domestically.

The advent of certification was to have profound knock-on effects on the ground, and in the following few years it became the main game on the forest scene. In early 2004, when the local state forest management agency announced its intention to log the local valley in which I lived, a collective decision was reached amongst residents that we would try to negotiate a conflict-free settlement. The forest manager, probably mindful, like us, of the protests of previous years, eventually consented to engage in dialogue. After a lot of discussion, agreement was eventually reached over the final management plan, which confined forestry operations to regrowth forest and protected the remaining old growth in a series of informal reserves.

The success of this encounter led me to ponder what exactly had changed, when previously there had been no other option but protest. And so I decided to find out – a process which has culminated in this book. Clearly, my own direct experience has informed much of my thinking, but this has also been complemented by several years of

academic research. Out of this has arisen an analytical framework, which is essentially the product of an organic intellectual. My analysis is firstly an institutional one, and I have sought to synthesise the many and varied theories as to how institutions are, and should be, governed in this era of globalisation. Secondly, I have made use of a range of written and verbal sources to describe the evolution of forest governance over the past two decades. Finally, I have attempted to look at how these developments have been played out within a number of institutional case studies. Of course, every research design has its own flaws, and mine is no exception. I apologise now for any weaknesses or errors, and I encourage all readers to provide me with constructive feedback. In the case studies, it has not been possible to reproduce the level of research required without cluttering the text with, quite literally, hundreds of footnotes. I would therefore refer readers to the bibliography, and suggest they contact me directly if they would like to know more about my sources.

Bellingen,
New South Wales,
A.M.D.G.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank all those who have assisted me in the preparation of this work. I cannot go any further without honouring my wife and partner, Beth Gibbings, and my son, Tristan Cadman-Gibbings, for their support throughout the course of what has ultimately been a decade-long process. I am deeply grateful to my mentor Dr Fred Gale of the School of Government in the Faculty of Arts at the University of Tasmania, for his insightful comments and assistance at all stages of production. The same goes for Professor Timothy Shaw and all the editorial team at Palgrave Macmillan. I would also like to extend my gratitude to everyone who agreed to be interviewed as part of this study and who gave so generously of their time – including following up conversations and emails. My recognition goes also to Eric Gibbings, for his assistance in explaining how to model three-dimensional concepts two-dimensionally. To all those I have otherwise neglected to acknowledge, I offer my apologies and appreciation. Finally, for the copious amounts of paper used in production of this work, I acknowledge the trees. This book is printed on certified paper, but in deference to the schemes discussed in this volume I have decided not to identify the brand.

List of Abbreviations

ABU	Accreditation Business Unit (FSC)
AFP	Asia Forest Partnership
AFPA	American Forest and Paper Association
AFS	Australian Forestry Standard
ANEC	European Association for the Co-ordination of Consumer Representation in Standardisation
ASI	Accreditation Services International (FSC)
CAG	Chairman's Advisory Group (ISO)
CAR	Corrective Action Request (FSC)
CASCO	Conformity Assessment Committee (ISO)
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CD	Committee Draft (ISO)
CEI	Bois European Confederation of Woodworking Industries
CEPF	Confederation of European Private Forest Owners
CEPI	Confederation of European Paper Industries
CERFLOR	Sistema Brasileiro de Certificação Florestal
CERTFOR	Certificación Forestal en Chile
C&I	Criteria and indicators
CI	Conservation International
CLI	Country-led initiative
CoC	Chain of custody
COFO	Committee on Forestry (FAO)
COP	Conference of Parties (UN)
COPOLCO	Consumer Policy Committee (ISO)
CPF	Collaborative Partnership on Forests (UNFF)
CPPA	Canadian Pulp and Paper Association
CSA	Canadian Standards Association
CSD	United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development
CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
DCTF	Developing Countries Task Force
DEVCO	Developing Countries Committee (ISO)
DEVPRO	Developing Countries Programme (ISO)

DIS	Draft International Standard (ISO)
EA	European Cooperation for Accreditation
ECOS	European Environmental Citizens' Organisation for Standardisation
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council (UN)
EEB	European Environmental Bureau
EMAS	Environmental Management and Audit scheme
EMS	Environmental management system (ISO)
ENGO	Environmental non-governmental organisation
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FCPF	Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (the World Bank)
FDIS	Final Draft International Standard (ISO)
FERN	Forests and the European Union Resource Network
FFCS	Finnish Forest Certification Scheme
FFIF	Finnish Forest Industries' Federation (Metsäteollisuus r.y.)
FLEG	Forest Law Enforcement and Governance
FNE	France Nature Environnement
FNL	Finnish Nature League (Luonto-Liitto)
FoE	Friends of the Earth
FSC	Forest Stewardship Council
GOF	Global Objectives on Forests (UNFF)
GRI	Global Reporting Initiative
IAF	International Accreditation Forum
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
IEC	International Electrotechnical Commission
IFF	Intergovernmental Forum on Forests (UN)
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INNI	International NGO Network on ISO
IPF	Intergovernmental Panel on Forests (UN)
IPO	Indigenous Peoples' Organisation
IS	International Standard (ISO)
ISA	International Federation of the National Standardising Associations

ISEAL	International Social and Environmental Accreditation and Labelling Alliance
IR	International relations
ISO	International Standardisation Organisation
ITTA	International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTO)
ITTO	International Tropical Timber Organisation
IUCN	World Conservation Union (formerly the International Union for the Conservation of Nature)
IUFRO	International Union of Forest Research Organisations
LBI	Legally Binding Instrument
LEI	Lembaga Ekolabel Indonesia
MCPFE	Ministerial Council for the Protection of Forests in Europe
MDG	Millennium Development Goals (UN)
MSD	Multi-stakeholder Dialogue (UNFF)
MTCC	Malaysian Timber Certification Council
MTK	Central Union of Agricultural Producers and Forest Owners (Maa- ja metsätaloustuottajain Keskusliitto MTK r.y.)
MYPOW	Multi-year Programme of Work (UNFF)
NEPI	New environmental policy instruments
NFP	National Forest Programme (UNFF)
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NI	National Initiative (FSC)
NLBI	Non-legally Binding Instrument
NP	New Proposal for a Work Item (ISO)
NPM	New public management
NSMD	Non-state market driven
ODA	Official development assistance (UN)
OLI	Organisation-led initiative
P&C	Principles and criteria
PC&I	Principles, criteria and indicators
PEFC	Programme for the Endorsement of Forest Certification Schemes
PEFCC	PEFC Council
PfA	Proposals for Action (UNFF)
PEOLG	Pan European Operational Level Guidelines
PPP	public-private partnership

PROFOR	Programme on Forests (the World Bank)
PWI	Preliminary Work Item (ISO)
QMS	quality management systems
REDD	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in Developing Countries, post COP 15 referred to as REDD-plus (UN)
REMCO	Council Committee on Reference Materials (ISO)
RLI	Region-led initiative
SAGE	Strategic Advisory Group for the Environment (ISO)
SC	Sub-committee (ISO)
SFI	Sustainable Forestry Initiative
SFM	sustainable forest management
SME	Small and medium enterprise
SMF	Sustainable management of forests
TAG	Technical Advisory Group (ISO)
TBT	Technical Barriers to Trade (WTO)
TC	Technical Committee (ISO)
TFAP	Tropical Forestry Action Plan (FAO)
TFG	Task Force Group (PEFC)
TFRK	Traditional forest-related knowledge (UN/UNFF)
TG	Task Group (ISO)
TMB	Technical Management Board (ISO)
TR	Technical Report (ISO)
UN	United Nations
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCHE	United Nations Commission on the Human Environment
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNCTC	United Nations Centre for Transnational Corporations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNFF	United Nations Forum on Forests
UN-REDD	United Nations Collaborative Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in Developing Countries

WBCSD	World Business Council for Sustainable Development (formerly Business Council for Sustainable Development)
WD	Working Draft (ISO)
WG	Working Group (ISO)
WRM	World Rainforest Movement
WTO	World Trade Organisation
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature (World Wildlife Fund)