

Historical Reenactment

Reenactment History

Series Editors: Vanessa Agnew, Jonathan Lamb and Iain McCalman

Reenactment has been generally associated with cultural heritage events and living history performances and was seen mainly as the preserve of history buffs and fantasy role players. During the past decade, however, reenactment has emerged as a vital trend in popular as well as scholarly forms of historical representation. It has begun to make its way into historiography as a new concept in the understanding of the past. The Palgrave *Reenactment History* addresses this new interest and embraces ways of understanding diverse experiments in simulative and affective forms of historical representation. It is hospitable to the study of any practical engagement with the past in which the empirical outcome is determined not by what is known in advance, but by the experience of making it.

Common to all these forms of historical representation is an attention to the details of physical, emotional, and psychological experience rather than the sweep of large-scale historical processes, or structures. In one respect reenactment returns the specific historical moment to the discipline of scientific experiment, where what was known once may be known again by means of replicating the original circumstances of the discovery. In another respect it introduces history to passions generated when an individual dwelling in a present moment of time achieves a sympathetic identification with another inhabiting an earlier one. A hypothetical structure becomes a real position. Conjecturalism of this exact and yet powerfully dramatic kind lends reenactment a great emancipatory potential, perhaps in some respects a dangerous one. In ways that other forms of historical representation cannot, reenactment binds the circumstances of the original event to its repetition in order to release energies not usually associated with the garnering of knowledge, and powerful enough to prevent the outcome being predictable. If reenactment is an inquiry whose success depends on the mutuality of cognitive and affective impulses of the mind, implying a new understanding of the task of the reenactor-historian and the very purpose of historical representation, then a critique apt for its novel blend of epistemology and aesthetics is an urgent challenge.

The series aims then to survey new kinds of histories by breaking with traditional approaches. Its volumes treat various historical periods, sites, and disciplinary approaches to historical representation—colonialism, realism, affective cognition, literature, music, art, architecture, drama, performance, agriculture and the sea. With its comprehensive scope and its theoretical edge, the series will interrogate different disciplinary approaches to reanimating and representing the past. In so doing, the editors expect that it will cause us to not only examine what we know about the past, but also how we know it. Finally, it will prompt us to inquire into the social and political uses made of historical knowledge in the present.

Vanessa Agnew and Jonathan Lamb (*editors*)

SETTLER AND CREOLE REENACTMENT

Iain McCalman and Paul A. Pickering (*editors*)

HISTORICAL REENACTMENT

From Realism to the Affective Turn

Reenactment History

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-0-230-20286-3 (Hardback) 978-0-230-20287-0 (Paperback) (outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

Historical Reenactment

From Realism to the Affective Turn

Edited By

Iain McCalman

and

Paul A. Pickering

palgrave
macmillan



Editorial matter, selection and introduction © Iain McCalman and Paul A. Pickering 2010

All remaining chapters © their respective authors 2010

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2010 978-0-230-57612-4

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6-10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The authors have asserted their rights to be identified as the authors of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2010 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries

ISBN 978-1-349-36609-5 ISBN 978-0-230-27709-0 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230277090

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	x
1 From Realism to the Affective Turn: An Agenda <i>Iain McCalman and Paul A. Pickering</i>	1
2 ‘... Just as It would have been in 1861’: Stuttering Colonial Beginnings in ABC’s <i>Outback House</i> <i>Anja Schwarz</i>	18
3 ‘Recreating Chaos’: Jeremy Deller’s <i>The Battle of Orgreave</i> <i>Katie Kitamura</i>	39
4 On Being a Mobile Monument: Historical Reenactments and Commemorations <i>Stephen Gapps</i>	50
5 What should We Do about Slavery? Slavery, Abolition and Public History <i>James Walvin</i>	63
6 Reenactment and Neo-Realism <i>John Brewer</i>	79
7 Textual Realism and Reenactment <i>Jonathan Walker</i>	90
8 ‘No Witnesses. No Leads. No Problems’: The Reenactment of Crime and Rebellion <i>Paul A. Pickering</i>	109
9 R. G. Collingwood, Historical Reenactment and the Early Music Revival <i>Kate Bowan</i>	134
10 ‘From Wigwam to White Lights’: Popular Culture, Politics, and the Performance of Native North American Identity in the Era of Assimilationism <i>Ruth B. Phillips and Trudy Nicks</i>	159

vi *Contents*

11	Mimic Toil: Eighteenth-Century Preconditions for the Modern Historical Reenactment <i>Simon During</i>	180
12	Loutherbourg's Simulations: Reenactment and Realism in Late-Georgian Britain <i>Iain McCalman</i>	200
	<i>Index</i>	218

List of Figures

1.1	Jorvik Centre, Publicity leaflet, York, England, 2008	4
4.1	Two versions of William Bligh	51
4.2	A monument to the 1804 Battle of Vinegar Hill	54
4.3	Convicts prepare to do battle with Redcoats	57
7.1	Dance of death	96
7.2	Odd one out	97
7.3	Gerolamo Vano's rise to power	98
7.4	The arrest of Antonio Foscarini	99
7.5	Dialogue	101
8.1	Old Melbourne Gaol publicity leaflet, Victoria, 2008	111
8.2	Main Street, Glenrowan, Victoria, 2008	112
9.1	Dolmetsch family, Jesses, Haslemere, 31 August 1928	144
10.1	Princess White Deer in feather bonnet	167
10.2	Princess White Deer in oriental pose	168
10.3	Princess White Deer at the White House	171
10.4	Princess White Deer with mask	174

Acknowledgements

This volume (and the Series of which it is a part) emerged from string of conferences, seminars, and workshops held variously in Nashville, Pasadena, Canberra, Melbourne, Sydney, and Cambridge. Our thanks are due to those others who (in no particular order) presented papers and participated in conversations at and beyond the conference table: Andrea Bradley, Alex Cook, Jed Buchwald, Harry Liebersohn, Jonathan Lamb, Vanessa Agnew, Annie Hesp, David Gruber, Paul Turnbull, Bill Deverell, Robert Rosenstone, Kim McKenzie, Dan Turner, Brian Deyo, Caroline Turner, Jonathan Mane-Wheoki, Dadang Christanto, Vincent Caretta, Cassandra Pybus, Pat Hoffie, Julie Gough, Michael Mel, Adam Low, Toby Haggith, Tatiana Senkevitch, Ian Howard, Claire Roberts, Geremie Barmé, Mark Seltzer, Salima Hashmi, Helena Hammond, Michael Desmond, Anthony White, Helen Weinstein, Patrick Wildgust, James Chandler, Geoffrey Day, Madeleine Bunting, Ashley Hay, Beau Yancy Baca, Gordon Lang, Lynne Blundell, Jennifer Webb, Susan Steggall, Paula Hamilton, Lucinda Mathieson, Chris Linke, Yannick Thorval, Christine Hansen, Amanda Johnson, Tina Parolin, Vivienne Kelly, Robyn Ballinger, Michael Farrell, Otto Sibum, Jim Secord, Alison Winter, Jacques Rancière, Mark Phillips, Elizabeth Edwards, Kim Sloan, Stephanie Lindsay-Thompson, Dominique Sweeney, Will Davies, James Hurst, Melissa McEwen, Ivo Lovric, Anthony Garnaut, Travis Cutler, Mary Kilcane Cody, Anna Garretson, Laurence Gourievidis, Olwyn Beazley, Veronica Tuckerova, Roy Ritchie, Simon Baker, John Wyver, Jim Spriggs and Christopher Pinney.

Thanks also due to those who helped organise the moving feast – Leena Messina, Sally Kingsley and Sabrina Boschetti – and to those institutions which provided funding support: The Australian National University, the University of Sydney, California Institute of Technology, Vanderbilt University, Cambridge University, University of York, and the Huntington Library.

We wish to acknowledge the following institution and individuals for permission to reproduce images: Kanien'kehaka Onkwawen:na Raotitiohkwa Language and Cultural Center, Kahnawake Mohawk Nation Territory, Canada, Stephen Gapps and Dan Hallett (copyright owned by Dan Hallett and Jonathan Walker).

Our sincere thanks to Michael Strang and Ruth Ireland at Palgrave Macmillan for their interest in a new subject and for their forbearance in the face of our tardiness.

Individual authors have included words of thanks, where appropriate, in their chapters. It is left to us to thank them for their efforts in bringing this volume to completion. Working in an emerging area such as reenactment studies carries risks as well as rewards. We are grateful to those willing to take the risk.

Iain McCalman and Paul Pickering

Notes on Contributors

Kate Bowan is a Visiting Fellow at the Research School of Humanities in The Australian National University. She has published on early twentieth-century Australian music, and music and politics in the nineteenth century.

John Brewer is the Eli and Eyde Broad Professor in Humanities and Social Sciences at the California Institute of Technology in Pasadena, California. His most recent book, published this year, is *The American Leonardo: A Twentieth-Century Tale of Obsession, Art and Money*.

Simon During teaches English at Johns Hopkins University. He is the author of *Modern Enchantments: The Cultural Power of Secular Magic* and *Exit Capitalism: Literary Culture, Theory and Post-Secular Modernity*.

Stephen Gapps currently works as a consultant historian and is co-director of the history events management company, HISTORICA. His current research interests lie in the problems and possibilities of historical reenactment and public commemoration. Stephen's doctoral thesis 'Performing the Past: A Cultural History of Historical Reenactments' (University of Technology, Sydney) looked at the long history of historical reenactments and its relationship to contemporary practices of self-styled 're-enactors'.

Katie Kitamura was born in 1979 and brought up in California and Japan. She now shuttles between London and New York. She was educated at Princeton University (A.B.) and University of London (MRes, Ph.D.). She has written for numerous publications, including *The New York Times* and *The Guardian*. Her recent books include *Japanese for Travellers* and *The Longshot*.

Iain McCalman is currently Professorial Research Professor at the University of Sydney. His recent books include *The Seven Ordeals of Count Cagliostro* and *Darwin's Armada: How Four Voyagers to Australasia Won the Battle for Evolution and Changed the World*.

Ruth B. Phillips holds a Canada Research Chair in Modern Culture and is Professor of Art History at Carleton University in Ottawa, Canada. Her research focuses on critical museology and the indigenous arts

of north-eastern North America. Her books include *Trading Identities: The Souvenir in Native North American Arts from the Northeast, 1700–1900*, and, most recently, *Sensible Objects: Colonialism, Museums and Material Culture*, co-edited with Elizabeth Edwards and Chris Gosden.

Paul Pickering is Professor of History and Director of Graduate Studies at the Research School of Humanities in The Australian National University. His recent books include *Unrespectable Radicals: Popular Politics in the Age of Reform* and *Feargus O'Connor: A Political Life*.

Anja Schwarz is a researcher and lecturer in the literature department of the University of Konstanz. She holds an M.A. in Cultural Studies from the University of Lueneburg and a Ph.D. in English Literature from the Freie Universitaet Berlin. She has published on multiculturalism and historical reenactments as well as questions of gender and memory.

Jonathan Walker is Senior Research Fellow at the University of Sydney and the author of *Pistols! Treason! Murder!: The Rise and Fall of a Master Spy* and *Five Wounds*. The latter is a novel created in collaboration with the artist Dan Hallett. Walker's website is www.jonathanwalkervernice.com.

James Walvin is Professor of History Emeritus at the University of York and has written extensively on slavery and the slave trade.

Trudy Nicks is a senior curator in the Department of World Cultures at the Royal Ontario Museum, Toronto and an adjunct professor in the Anthropology Department, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario. She has recently completed work for two new galleries based on the ROM's worldwide ethnographic collections. Her recent publications include papers on early-twentieth-century Iroquoian collectors. Her current research is focused on government intervention in aboriginal arts and crafts production in twentieth-century northeastern North America.