Late Antique Epistemology
Also by Stephen R. L. Clark
A PARLIAMENT OF SOULS
ANIMALS AND THEIR MORAL STANDING
ARISTOTLE’S MAN
BIOLOGY AND CHRISTIAN ETHICS
CIVIL PEACE AND SACRED ORDER
FROM ATHENS TO JERUSALEM
G. K. CHESTERTON: THINKING BACKWARDS, LOOKING FORWARDS
GOD, RELIGION AND REALITY
GOD’S WORLD AND THE GREAT AWAKENING
HOW TO LIVE FOREVER
HOW TO THINK ABOUT THE EARTH: MODELS OF ENVIRONMENTAL
THEOLOGY
THE MORAL STATUS OF ANIMALS
THE MYSTERIES OF RELIGION
THE NATURE OF THE BEAST
THE POLITICAL ANIMAL
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgments**  
vii

**Abbreviations**  
viii

**Notes on Contributors**  
x

**Introduction**  
*Panayiota Vassilopoulou*  
1

**Part I  Rituals, Religion and Reality**  
19

1. Porphyry and the Debate Over Traditional Religious Practices  
   *Aude Busine*  
   21

2. St John in Amelius’ Seminar  
   *John Dillon*  
   30

   *Emilie F. Kutash*  
   44

4. Having Sex with the One: Erotic Mysticism in Plotinus and the Problem of Metaphor  
   *Zeke Mazur*  
   67

**Part II  Crossing Boundaries**  
85

5. Ibn Ṭufayl and the Wisdom of the East: On Apprehending the Divine  
   *Taneli Kukkonen*  
   87

6. Plotinus, Porphyry, and India: A Re-Examination  
   *Joachim Lacrosse*  
   103

7. Animation of Statues in Ancient Civilizations and Neoplatonism  
   *Algis Uzdavinys*  
   118
### Table of Contents

**Part III  Art and Poetry** 141

8. Platonists and the Teaching of Rhetoric in Late Antiquity 143  
   *Malcolm Heath*

9. Proclus’ Notion of Poetry 160  
   *Oiva Kuisma*

10. The Homeric Tradition in Ammonius and Asclepius 174  
    *Christina-Panagiota Manolea*

**Part IV  Later Influences** 189

11. Nous and Geist: Self-Identity and Methodological Solipsism in Plotinus and Hegel 191  
    *Robert M. Berchman*

12. Ἐστὶ πᾶν σημεῖον. Plotinus, Leibniz, and Berkeley on Determinism 211  
    *Daniele Bertini*

13. Proclus Americanus 228  
    *Jay Bregman*

14. Ecology’s Future Debt to Plotinus and Neoplatonism 250  
    *Kevin Corrigan*

15. Heathen Martyrs or Romish Idolaters: Socrates and Plato in Eighteenth-Century England 273  
    *Carol Poster*

**Conclusion** 289  
*Stephen R.L. Clark*

**Glossary** 302  
*Prepared by Crystal Addey*

**Index of Names** 331

**Subject Index** 339
Acknowledgments

This volume has its beginning in the conference of the *International Society for Neoplatonic Studies* held in Liverpool in the summer of 2004. We are grateful to all those who participated in that event, and to the institutions that made it possible, including the Society itself, the *British Academy*, the *Leverhulme Trust*, the *Classical Association*, Liverpool’s Department of Philosophy, and the University of Liverpool. The *Leverhulme Trust* also provided for Dr Vassilopoulou’s eighteen-month appointment first as a Research Fellow and then as Lecturer, and Professor Clark’s three-year appointment as a Research Fellow, without which this volume would have been delayed for even longer. We are also grateful to the Academy of Finland for support for Dr Vassilopoulou’s present research, and to the University of Liverpool for allowing Professor Clark further leave to recover from illness. We also acknowledge the advice, sympathy, and forbearance shown by Gillian Clark and Elias Markolefas, as well as the many scholars who gave their time to reviewing individual papers and the whole volume. We owe special thanks to Eudoxie Delli for her help, to Crystal Addey for producing the Glossary, and to both our publisher and the contributors to this volume for their patience.

The diagram on page 246 from T.M. Johnson’s book *Proclus’ Metaphysical Elements* (1909) is reproduced with permission and was kindly provided by Karen Witt, Special Collections Librarian at the University of Missouri.
Abbreviations

Adv. Haer.  Irenaeus, *Adversus Haereses*
BD  Book of the Dead
Bell. Iud.  Flavius Josephus, *De Bello Judaico*
Bibl. hist  Diodorus Siculus, *Bibliotheca Historica*
CAG  *Commentaria in Aristotelem Graeca*
Civ. Dei  Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*
CPR  *Critique of Pure Reason*
De abstin.  Porphyry, *De Abstinentia*
De decem. dub.  Proclus, *De Decem Dubitationes Circa Providentiam*
De Myst.  Iamblichus, *De Mysteriis*
Diog. Laert., Vit.  Diogenes Laertius, *Vitae Philosophorum*
Diss.  Epictetus, *Dissertationes*
El. of Theol.  Proclus, *Elements of Theology*
Emn.  Plotinus, *Enneads*
Ep.  Pliny, *Epistulae*
Ep. Ad Aneb.  Porphyry, *Epistula ad Anebonem*
FGrH  *Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker*
Flor.  Apuleius, *Florilegium*
Geogr.  Strabo, *Geographica*
Gorg.  Plato, *Gorgias*
Id.  Hermogenes, *Peri Ideon*
IG  *Inscriptiones Graecae*
Il.  *Ilies*
In Cat.  Ammonius, *In Aristotelis Categorias Commentarius*
In de Int.  Ammonius, *In Aristotelis Librum de Interpretatione Commentarius*
In Isag.  *In Porphyrii Isagogen*
In Met.  Asclepius, *In Aristotelis Metaphysicorum Libros A–Z Commentaria*
In Metaph.  Syrianus, *In Aristotelis Metaphysica Commentaria*
In Nic.  Asclepius of Tralles, *Commentary to Nicomachus’ Introduction to Arithmetic*.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In Parm.</td>
<td>Proclus, <em>In Platonis Parmenidem Commentarii</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Phlb.</td>
<td>Damascius, <em>In Philebum</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Remp.</td>
<td>Proclus, <em>In Rem Publicam Comentarii</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Tim. or In Plat. Tim.</td>
<td>Proclus, <em>In Platonis Timaeum Commentarii</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institut. Phys.</td>
<td>Proclus, <em>Institutio Physica</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leid.</td>
<td><em>Leiden Papyrus</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lys.</td>
<td>Plato, <em>Lysis</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Med.</td>
<td>Descartes, <em>Meditations</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Met.</td>
<td>Aristotle, <em>Metaphysics</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meth.</td>
<td>Hermogenes, <em>Peri Methodou</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mor.</td>
<td>Plutarchi <em>Moralia</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHC</td>
<td><em>Nag Hammadi Codices</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Od.</td>
<td><em>Odyssea</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Or. Chald.</td>
<td><em>Chaldaean Oracles</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phaedr.</td>
<td>Hermias, <em>In Platonis Phaedrum Scholia</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phys.</td>
<td>Aristotle, <em>Physics</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plat. Th.</td>
<td>Proclus, <em>Platonic Theology</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plat.</td>
<td>Plato</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plut.</td>
<td>Plutarchus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plut. Dem.</td>
<td>Plutarchus, <em>Demosthenes</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porph., VPlot.</td>
<td>Porphyry, <em>Vita Plotini</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prep. Ev.</td>
<td><em>Preparatio Evangelica</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procl.</td>
<td>Proclus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prol.</td>
<td>David, <em>Prolegomena Philosophiae</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td><em>Prolegomenon Syllagae</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td><em>Pyramid Texts</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quint.</td>
<td>Quintilian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quod omn. prob.</td>
<td>Philo, <em>Quod Omnis Probus Liber Sit</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rep.</td>
<td>Plato, <em>Republic</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RG</td>
<td><em>Rhetores Graeci</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sch. Dem.</td>
<td>Scholia to Demosthenes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stas.</td>
<td>Hermogenes, <em>Peri Staseon</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stom.</td>
<td>Clemens of Alexandria, <em>Stromata</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SVF</td>
<td><em>Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symp.</td>
<td>Plato, <em>Symposium</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tac. Dial</td>
<td>Tacitus, <em>Dialogus de Oratoribus</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tim.</td>
<td>Plato, <em>Timaeus</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vit. Apoll.</td>
<td>Philostratus, <em>Vita Apollonii</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes on Contributors

**Robert M. Berchman**, is Professor of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Dowling College and Senior Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Theology at Bard College, USA. His research interests include the Platonic, Aristotelian, and Continental traditions and he has published on a range of topics in metaphysics, philosophy of mind, and philosophy of art. His most recent work includes *Porphyry Against the Christians* (2005), and he is the Greco-Roman editor of the *Encyclopedia of Religious and Philosophical Writings in Late Antiquity Pagan, Judaic, Christian* (2007).

**Daniele Bertini** is a Fellow of the Department of Philosophy at the University of Parma, Italy. His research concerns immaterialism, Platonism, mysticism, the history of early Christianity, and the relation between philosophy and theology. He has recently published *Giovanni, Bultmann e la demitizzazione* (2007) and *Sentire Dio* (2007).

**Jay Bregman** is Professor of History and coordinator of the Minor in Religious studies at the University of Maine, USA. He serves on the Board of Directors of the *International Society for Neoplatonic Studies*. He has written on the Neoplatonism of Synesius of Cyrene, the emperor Julian, A. H. Armstrong, and Neoplatonism in North America.


**Stephen R. L. Clark** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Liverpool, UK. His most recent book publications include *Biology and Christian Ethics* (2000) and *G.K.Chesterton: Thinking Backward, Looking Forward* (2006). His most recent papers have sought to develop Plotinian insights in ethics and philosophy of religion, in the light of modern biological discoveries.

**Kevin Corrigan** is Professor of the Liberal Arts in the Graduate Institute of the Liberal Arts at Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia, USA. His recent books are *Reading Plotinus: a Practical Guide to Neoplatonism* (2004) and (with Elena Glazov-Corrigan) *Plato’s Dialectic at Play: Structure,*
Argument, and Myth in the Symposium (2004). He has written many articles ranging over the history of philosophical and religious thought from the Presocratics, Plato and Aristotle, through Patristics, late antiquity and medieval thought, to Whitehead, Bergson, Levinas, and Derrida in contemporary thought.


**Malcolm Heath** is Professor of Greek Language and Literature at the University of Leeds, UK. His publications on ancient rhetoric include *Hermogenes on Issues: Strategies of Argument in Later Greek Rhetoric* (1995) and *Menander: a Rhetor in Context* (2004). He has also written on Greek tragedy and comedy, and on ancient literary criticism. He is currently working on Aristotle’s *Poetics*.

**Oiva Kuisma** is Lecturer in Aesthetics at the University of Helsinki, Institute for Art Research, Finland. He is also Docent in Philosophy and Aesthetics at the University of Turku. His publications include monographs on Proclus (1996), Plotinus (2003), and on the history of Finnish aesthetics (2006).

**Taneli Kukkonen** held the Canada Research Chair in the Aristotelian Tradition from 2003 to 2007, when he became Research Professor in Antiquity at the University of Jyväskylä in Finland. He has written extensively on topics in Arabic philosophy.

**Emilie F. Kutash** holds a Research Associate Position at Boston University Center for the History and Philosophy of Science, USA, and also teaches Philosophy at St. Joseph’s College. She has published widely on Plato and Proclus.

Christina–Panagiota Manolea has been a Tutor at the Hellenic Open University, Greece, for the last four years. Her work focuses on later Greek rhetorical theory and the perception of Greek epic tradition. Her publications include, *The Homeric Tradition in Syrianus* (2004).

Zeke Mazur is currently working on a Ph.D. at the University of Chicago. His doctoral dissertation is on the Gnostic background of Plotinus’ mysticism. He has published articles on Plotinus’ mysticism and theurgic rituals.

Carol Poster is Associate Professor of English at York University, Canada. She recently co-edited (with Linda Mitchell) *Letter-Writing Manuals and Instruction from Antiquity to the Present* (2007) and has published numerous contributions to journals and edited collections on the history of rhetoric, the rhetoric of religion, and the classical tradition.

Algis Uzdavinys is Associate Professor and Senior Research Fellow at the Vilnius Academy of Fine Arts, and Senior Research Fellow at the Lithuanian Academy of Sciences. His publications in English include, *The Golden Chain. An Anthology of Pythagorean and Platonic Philosophy*, (2004).

Panayiota Vassilopoulou is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Liverpool, UK, and holds a Research Fellowship with the Academy of Finland. She has published articles on Plotinus’ psychology, aesthetics, and feminism.