

Bibliography

- Aristotle *Metaphysics*. Translated by W. D. Ross. In *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, ed. R. McKeon. New York: Random House (1941).
- Armstrong, D. M., C. B. Martin, and U. T. Place. *Dispositions: A Debate*, ed. T. Crane. New York: Routledge (1996).
- Ashley Fr. Benedict, O. P., "Moral Principles Concerning Infants with Anencephaly: Observations on the Document." Accessed online, May 2009, at <http://www.ewtn.com/library/PROLIFE/bcdanen3.htm>
- Ayer, A. J. "My Death," reprinted in John Donnelly, *Language, Metaphysics, and Death* (2nd edition). New York: Fordham University Press, pp. 226–236 (1994).
- Ayer, A. J. "'What I Saw When I Was Dead': Intimations of Immortality." *National Review* (14 Oct. 1988).
- Beauchamp, T. and J. F. Childress. *Principles of Biomedical Ethics* (6th edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press (2008).
- Becker, L. "The Priority of Human Interests." In *Ethics and Animals*, eds. H. Miller and W. Williams. Clifton, NJ: Humana (1983).
- Benn, S. "Abortion, Infanticide, and Respect for Persons." In *The Problem of Abortion* (2nd edition), ed. J. Feinberg. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, pp. 135–144 (1984).
- Boonin, D. *A Defense of Abortion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (2003).
- Broad, C. D. *Examination of McTaggart's Philosophy*, Vol. 1. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (1933).
- Buckle, S. "Arguing from Potential." In *Embryo Experimentation: Ethical, Legal and Social Issues*, eds. P. Singer et al. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 90–108 (1990).
- Butler, K. "The Moral Status of Smoking." *Social Theory and Practice* 19(1): 1–26 (Spring 1993).
- Charo, R. A. "Every Cell is Sacred: Logical Consequences of the Argument from Potential in the Age of Cloning." In *Cloning and the Future of Human Embryo Research*, ed. P. Lauritzen. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 82–92 (2001).
- Committee on Doctrine, National Conference of Catholic Bishops 1996. *Moral Principles Concerning Infants with Anencephaly*. September 19, 1996. Accessed online May 2009 at <http://www.usccb.org/dpp/anencephaly.htm>.
- Conn, C. H. "Female Genital Mutilation and the Moral Status of Abortion." *Public Affairs Quarterly* 15(1): 1–15 (January 2001).
- Couper, R. "Correspondence Regarding Near-Death Experiences." *The Lancet* 359: 2116 (June 15, 2002).
- DeGrazia, D. *Human Identity and Bioethics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (2005).
- DiSilvestro, R. "Capacities, Hierarchies, and the Moral Status of Normal Human Infants." *Journal of Value Inquiry* 43: 479–492 (December 2009).
- DiSilvestro, R. "A Qualified Endorsement of Embryonic Stem-Cell Research, Based on Two Widely Shared Beliefs about the Brain-Diseased Patients Such Research Might Benefit." *Journal of Medical Ethics* 34: 563–567 (July 2008).

- DiSilvestro, R. "Not Every Cell is Sacred: A Reply to Charo." *Bioethics* 20(3): 146–157 (June 2006).
- DiSilvestro, R. "Human Embryos in the Original Position?" *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 30(3): 285–304 (June 2005).
- Dombrowski, D. *Babies and Beasts: The Argument from Marginal Cases*. Chicago: University of Illinois Press (1997).
- Ereshevsky, M., ed. *The Units of Evolution: Essays on the Nature of Species*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press (1992).
- Feinberg, J. "Abortion." In *Matters of Life and Death*, ed. T. Regan. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, pp. 183–217 (1980).
- Feldman, F. *Confrontations With the Reaper: A Philosophical Study of the Nature and Value of Death*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (1992).
- George, R. P. and C. Tollefsen. *Embryo: A Defense of Human Life*. New York: Random House Publishers (Doubleday) (2008).
- Gomez-Lobo, A. "Sortals and Human Beginnings." Online paper accessed May 2009 at http://ontology.buffalo.edu/medicine_and_metaphysics/Gomez-Lobo.doc.
- Harman, E. "The Potentiality Problem." *Philosophical Studies* 114: 173–198 (2003).
- Harman, E. "Moral Status." Ph.D. diss., MIT. Available online at <http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/17645> (2003).
- Hoffman, J. and G. S. Rosenkrantz. *Substance: Its Nature and Existence*. London: Routledge (1997).
- Harre, R. and E. H. Madden. *Causal Powers*. Oxford: Blackwell (1975).
- Kershnar, S. "The Moral Status of Harmless Adult-Child Sex." *Public Affairs Quarterly* 15(2): 111–132 (April 2001).
- Kuhse, H. and P. Singer *Individuals, Humans, Persons: Questions of Life and Death*. Herstellung, Germany: Sankt Augustin, Academia Verlag (1994).
- Lee, P. and R. P. George "The Wrong of Abortion." In *Contemporary Debates in Applied Ethics*, eds. A. Cohen and C. H. Wellman. Oxford: Blackwell (2004).
- Lockwood, M. "Warnock Versus Powell (And Harradine): When Does Potentiality Count?" *Bioethics* 2(3): 187–213 (1998).
- McInerney, P. K. "Does a Fetus Already Have a Future-Like-Ours?" *Journal of Philosophy* 5: 267–268 (1990).
- McMahan, J. *The Ethics of Killing: Problems at the Margins of Life*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (2002).
- Molnar, G. *Powers: A Study in Metaphysics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (2003).
- Moreland, J. P. and S. B. Rae. *Body and Soul: Human Nature and the Crisis in Ethics*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press (2000).
- Mumford, S. *Dispositions*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (1998).
- Nagel, T. *Mortal Questions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (1979).
- Narveson, J. "Animal Rights." *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 7: 161–178 (1997).
- Neuhaus, R. J. *The Eternal Pity*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press (2000).
- Neuhaus, R. J. *The Naked Public Square: Religion and Democracy in America*. Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishers (1984).
- Norcross, A. "Killing, Abortion, and Contraception: A Reply to Marquis." *The Journal of Philosophy* 87(5): 268–277 (1990).
- Nussbaum, M. "Capabilities and Human Rights." *Fordham Law Review* 66: 273–300 (1997). Reprinted in pp. 117–149 of eds. P. De Greiff and C. Cronin, *Global Justice and Transnational Politics: Essays on the Moral and Political Challenges of Globalization*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press (2002).
- Nussbaum, M. "Human Functioning and Social Justice: In Defense of Aristotelian Essentialism." *Political Theory* 20: 202–246 (1992).
- Nussbaum, M. "Nature, Function, and Capability: Aristotle on Political Distribution." In *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*, Supplementary Volume I. Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 145–184 (1988).

- Nussbaum, M. *Women and Human Development*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (2000).
- Nussbaum, M. *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press (2006).
- Nussbaum, M. "Human Dignity and Political Entitlements." In *The President's Council on Bioethics, Human Dignity and Bioethics*. Washington, DC: The President's Council on Bioethics, pp. 351–380 (March 2008).
- Oderberg, D. "Modal Properties, Moral Status, and Identity." *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 26(3): 259–298 (1997).
- Olson, E. *The Human Animal: Personal Identity Without Psychology*. Oxford: Oxford University Press (1997).
- Parfit, D. *Reasons and Persons*. Oxford: Clarendon Press (1984).
- Parnia, S. and P. Fenwick "Near Death Experiences in Cardiac Arrest: Visions of a Dying Brain or Visions of a New Science of Consciousness?" *Resuscitation* 52: 5–11 (2002).
- Peters, T. "Embryonic Stem Cells and the Theology of Dignity." In *The Human Embryonic Stem Cell Debate: Science, Ethics, and Public Policy*, eds. S. Holland, K. Lebacqz and L. Zoelth. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press (2001).
- Pojman, L. "The Moral Status of Affirmative Action." *Public Affairs Quarterly* 6(2): 181–206 (April 1992).
- The President's Council on Bioethics *Alternative Sources of Human Pluripotent Stem Cells*. Washington, DC: The President's Council on Bioethics (May 2005).
- The President's Council on Bioethics *Controversies in the Determination of Death: A White Paper by the President's Council on Bioethics*. Washington, DC: The President's Council on Bioethics (January 2009).
- Prior, E. *Dispositions*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press (1985).
- Quinn, W. "Abortion: Identity and Loss." *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 13(1): 24–54 (Winter 1984).
- Rawls, J. *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press (1971).
- Rawls, J. *Political Liberalism*. New York: Columbia University Press (1993).
- Rea, M., ed. *Material Constitution: A Reader*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield (1997).
- Reagan, M. "I'm With My Dad on Stem Cell Research." Accessed online (8/13/2007) at <http://www.humaneventsonline.com/article.php?id=4286>
- Reagan, R., Jr. Speech to the 2004 democratic national convention, accessed online (8/13/2007) at <http://www.pbs.org/newshour/vote2004/demconvention/speeches/reagan.htm>
- Reichlin, M. "The Argument from Potential: A Reappraisal." *Bioethics* 11(1): 1–23 (January 1997).
- Regan, T. "An Examination and Defense of One Argument Concerning Animal Rights." *Inquiry* 22 (1979).
- Sen, A. "Capability and Well-Being." In *Quality of Life*, eds. Martha N. and Amartya S. Oxford: Clarendon Press, pp. 30–53 (1993).
- Sober, E. *Philosophy of Biology*. Boulder, CO: Westview (1993).
- Singer, P. *Practical Ethics* (2nd edition). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (1993).
- Stone, J. "Why Potentiality Matters." *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 17(4): 815–830 (1987).
- Tooley, M. *Abortion and Infanticide*. Oxford: Clarendon Press (1983).
- Tuomela, R., ed. *Dispositions*. Dordrecht: D. Reidel Publishing Company (1978).
- Van Lommel, P., R. van Wees, V. Meyers, and I. Elfferich "Near-Death Experience in Survivors of Cardiac Arrest: A Prospective Study in The Netherlands." *The Lancet* 358 (December 15, 2001).
- Virginia Tech Department of Philosophy. Conference advertisement for "The Metaethics of Moral Status: Perspectives on the Nature and Source of Human Value." April 4–6, 2003. Available online at <http://www.phil.vt.edu/HTML/events/metaethics2003.pdf>.
- Warren, M. A. *Moral Status: Obligations to Persons and Other Living Things*. Oxford: Clarendon Press (1997).
- Wiggins, D. *Identity and Spatio-Temporal Continuity*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell (1967).
- Wiggins, D. *Sameness and Substance*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press (1980).

- Wiggins, D. *Sameness and Substance Renewed*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (2001).
- Wilkerson, T. E. "Natural Kinds." *Philosophy* 63: 29–41 (1988).
- Wilkerson, T. E. "Species, Essences, and the Names of Natural Kinds." *Philosophical Quarterly* 43: 1–19 (1993).
- Wilson, R., ed. *Species: New Interdisciplinary Essays*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press (1999).
- Wreen, M. "The Possibility of Potentiality." In *Values and Moral Standing*, ed. T. Attig, D. Callen, and L. W. Sumner. Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green State University Press, pp. 137–154 (1986).

Index

A

- Actual, continuing subjects of experiences
 - defined, 79–80
 - compared with capacities, 81–85
- Adam (teenager who believes he can't survive past nineteen), 30–31
- Albert and Benjamin (comparable adult and infant), 43–44, 76, 77
- Al (example of re-electing the potential president), 138
- Alien abduction example, 84
- Altered Nuclear Transfer-Oocyte Assisted Reprogramming (ANT-OAR), 194
- Alzheimer's disease, 1
- Anencephaly, 196–201
- A-rays and B-rays
 - that change a human into a dog and a dog into a human, 159–160, 167–168
 - that produce and cure a genetic disability, 58–59
- Argument from Marginal Cases (AMC), 55–56
 - critical *versus* constructive version, 143–144
 - weak *versus* strong version, 144
- Argument of book, xii
- Argument from Potential (AFP)
 - controversial, 109
 - different versions, 109
 - its importance, 109
- Aristotle, 18–19
- Armstrong, D. M., 17
- Ashley, B., 197, 199
- Ayer, A. J., 176–178

B

- Balaam's donkey, 161–162
- Becker, L., 56

- Benn, S., 132, 134
- Ben (teenager who believes he can't survive his twenties), 31–32
- Bill (example of being a person/then not being a person/then being a person again), 138
- Boonin, D., 78–79, 147–148, 153
- Brain damage and genetic conditions, 57–60
- Broad, C. D., 22–23, 56–57
- Buckle, S., 121
- Bush, G. W., 81–82
- Butler, K., 11

C

- Caleb and Drake (comparable adult and fetus), 45, 77
- Capacities, 184–193
 - active *versus* passive, 18–19
 - characterized, 17–18
 - controversial, xiii
 - first-order *versus* immediate/immediately exercisable, 25–26, 73
 - general *versus* specific, 19–20
 - hierarchies of, 20–26
 - identity-preserving *versus* compositional, 18–19, 189–190
 - typical human capacities, 19, 26
- Caterpillars *versus* scatterpillars, 159
- Cerebral cortex (not necessary for having higher-order capacity to think), 40
- Charo, R. A., 117–131
- Clinton, H., 9–10
- Comparison argument
 - defended, 76–79
 - set out, 77
- Complete reprogramming of upper brain (Tooley), 81
- Conn, C. H., 11

- Corpse problem
 described, 169–170
 “not dead yet” response,
 170
 Couper, R., 180
- D**
- Death
 cardiopulmonary *versus* neurological
 criteria for, 170–171
 discussed by President’s Council on
 Bioethics, 170–173
 often assumed to be irreversible, 170
 reversible, 173
 Developmental distance, 35–37
 Dispositions
 and background conditions, 60–61
 and initiating causes, 61–62
 Dombrowki, D., 56, 92, 145
 Dumbo (the elephant), 158
- E**
- Ebert and Frank (comparable adult
 and embryo), 45, 77
 Egoistic concern, 4
 Embarrassing Entailment, The, 138
 Embodiment conditions *versus* disembodiment
 conditions, 195–196
 Ereshevsky, M., 154
 Essential properties
 individually-essential, 159
 kind-essential, 159
- F**
- Feinberg, J., 27, 133, 134
 Feldman, F., 13
 Finnis, J., 184
 Fission, 52–55
Flatliners (movie), 183
 Fusion, 52–55
- G**
- Gandhi, 83
 George, R. P., 184–188
 Gilbert and Harry (comparable adult
 and zygote), 45, 77
 Gomez-Lobo, A., 192–193
 Grisez, G., 184
- H**
- Harman, E., 12, 109
 Harre, R., 17
 Hoffman, J., 122–123
- Human
 count sense *versus* stuff (mass, quantity)
 sense, 122–123
 definition (DiSilvestro), 9–10
 descriptive concept of, 101
 Nussbaum’s concept of, 101
 various senses of, 8
 Hume, D. *versus* Robinson, D., 24
 Hurlbut, W., 184, 195
 Hydatidiform moles, 194
- I**
- Identical twins (in thought-experiment), 68–69
 Incapacities, 158
 Innocuous Implication, The, 138
 Irreversible damage, 58
- J**
- John (Tooley’s temporarily desireless
 adult), 48
- K**
- Kant, I., 8
 Kerry, J., 81–82
 Kershnar, S., 11
 Killing
 and skilling, 15–16
 strong moral presumption against, 12–13
 Kuhse, H., 52–53
- L**
- Lee, P., 185, 186
 Lew and Kareem, 111–112
 Lockwood, M., 55
- M**
- Madden, E. H., 17
 McInerney, P. K., 117
 McMahan, J., 13–14
 fetus with cerebral deficits compared
 to dogs, 148–153
 and shrinking to become an embryo,
 51–52, 71, 145
 Mereological sum, 113–116
 Mereological switch, 111–112
 Modal boundary, 159
 Molnar, G., 17, 25
 Moral status
 different concepts of, 10–12
 independent of historical properties, 70
 serious, 12–15
 Warren’s definition, 5
 Moreland, J. P., 123
 Mumford, S., 17

N

- Nagel, T.
 brain bisection, 54
 infantilized adult, 43, 57
- Narveson, J., 143
- Natural kinds, 155–157
 and evolution, 161
- Near Death Experiences (NDEs), 174
 appropriately named, 175
 relevance to temporary change arguments,
 180–182
- Neuhaus, R. J., 175–176
- Norcross, A., 115–116
- Normalizing approach, 37–38
- Nussbaum, M., 65, 85, 94–104
 basic capabilities, 95–96
 capabilities and human rights, 100–101
 capabilities and justice in distribution,
 97–100
 combined capabilities, 97
 differences between, and DiSilvestro's
 approach, 101–103
 internal capabilities, 97
 lower-level capabilities the same as
 higher-order capacities, 96
 summary of the relevance of, capabilities
 approach, 101

O

- Obama, B., 9
- Oderberg, D., 131
- Olson, E., 6, 22
- Out of Body Experiences (OBEs), 179–180
- Overdetermination, 71, 72–73

P

- Parfit, D.
 fission of the self, 54
 replication booths, 70
- Parkinson's disease, 2
- Parnia, S. and Fenwick, P., 178–179
- Parthenogenesis, 114–115
- Passive capacities, 60
- Passive potentiality, 46
- Pellegrino, E., 182–183
- Permanent vegetative state (PVS) applied
 to genes, 118–119, 126–127
- Personal identity
 with an anesthetized/sleeping/drunken
 person, 43
 with an infant, 42–43
 causal connections not necessary for,
 47–51
 psychological accounts of, 44

- Personal Pronoun Police, 29–30
- Personhood* Generates A Right To Life, 141
- Personhood
 normative/moral personhood *versus*
 descriptive/commonsense, 27, 133
 in potential, 132
- Persons, 26–29
- Peters, T., 117
- Pojman, L., 11
- Potential to become *versus* potential to
 produce, 121
- Potential Personhood Generates A Right To
 Life, 132
- Potential persons
 Tooley's account, 45–46
 why it's better to avoid the concept, 137
- Potential president example and the problem of
 re-election, 131–241
- Potential Relevant To Moral Status, 132
- President's Council on Bioethics
 discussing alternative sources of human
 pluripotent stem cells, 195
 discussing death, 170–173
- Prior, E., 17, 60–64
- Proteus, 159
- Python, M., 118

Q

- Quinn, W., 130

R

- Rae, S., 123
- Rawls, J., 85–94
 higher-order capacities as the basis of
 moral personhood and human equality,
 89–94
 higher-order capacities in *Political
 Liberalism*, 87–88
 paternalism and the original position,
 86–89
- Reagan, M., 1–2
- Reagan, R., 1–7, 32–33, 47–48, 167
- Reagan, R. Jr., 1–2
- Rea, M., 112
- Regan, T., 143–144
- Reichlin, M., 117, 119
- Replicas, 70–71, 72–73
- Rosenkrantz, G., 122–123

S

- Sabom, M., 180
- Scatterpillars, 159–160
- Scrooge-like objection, 60–64
- Sen, A., 94

- Serious moral status, definition of, xi, 10–15
- Shrinking human example (McMahan), 51–52, 114, 116–117
- Shumans and humans, 66–67, 164
- Singer, P., 52–53, 132
- Sober, E., 155, 161
- Sortals, 16, 18, 135–136, 192
- “person” as phase or substance sortal, 136–137
- phase sortals *versus* substance sortals, 18, 136
- “president” as phase sortal, 135–136
- Species problem, 154–155
- Stone, J., 109
- T**
- Temporary change argument
- metaphysical version, 39–42, 165–166
- moral version, 66, 68, 166–167
- Temporary changes
- assumptions, 39
- defined, 39
- Temporary coma
- applied to genes, 118–119, 126–127
- Teratomas, 194
- Tollefsen, C., 184–188
- Tooley, M., 109–110, 129
- distinctions among capacities/potentialities, 20–22
- approach to temporary changes involving “deprogramming” of the upper brain, 46–47
- kitten example, 147, 153
- and persons, 28–29, 45
- reasons for not trusting common intuitions about infanticide, 66
- Totipotency, 52–55
- Tuomela, R., 17
- U**
- Van Lommel, P., 179–180
- V**
- Warnock, M. A., 55
- Warren, M. A., 5, 92, 113–114
- Wiggins, D., 18, 136
- Wilkerson, T. E., 155–157
- Wilson, R., 154
- Wreen, M., 109, 135
- Z**
- Zygotes, 42, 45, 53, 78, 113ff