

NOTES

Introduction (pp. 1–10)

1. Josemaría Escrivá, *The Forge* (London: Scepter, 1988), 742 (p. 256). In this day of heightened ideological division within academia, I believe a few words of the subject of labeling matters conservative and liberal might be helpful. Both Opus Dei and John Paul II's papacy have been widely proclaimed to be conservative, even ultra conservative, in the media throughout the world. From a liberal's point of view the label is justified because of the papacy's staunch defense of traditional interpretations of doctrine as it relates to belief and behavior. Opus Dei's pledge to support papal policy consequently justifies labeling Opus Dei conservative. These labels are particularly prevalent in discussion concerning sex and material goods, two overwhelmingly dominant preoccupations in modern Western society. So be it. I caution the reader liberal or conservative, however, to be careful not to let such labels close one's mind to what is being explored here. Dismissing all that comes from ethically conservative sources simply because it is incompatible with liberalism is detrimental to the search for truth, just as conservatives who disregard politically liberal sources severely handicap themselves in the pursuit of knowledge. Best that we leave such labels behind as we proceed. Moreover, in this instance the so-called conservative sources turn out to be not-so-conservative in matters concerning the concept of work. According to socialist theologian Gregory Baum, for example, John Paul II comes from a socialist society built on socialist ideas, most of which he accepted as politically valid. Thus Baum considers John Paul II to be the first socialist pope. Whether we agree with Baum's analysis of John Paul II's politics or not, we would be hard pressed to ignore the presence of socialist ideas in the pope's writings or to declare his political thought to be conservative (see note 15 below). The same point can be made concerning Opus Dei's underlying conception of work. It has much more in common with liberalism and socialism than is often acknowledged. To repeat then, better we bypass constricting labels that may inhibit the openmindedness appropriate to academic discussions whose sole goal should be the pursuit of truth, wherever it may be.

2. Josemaría Escrivá, quoted in Dennis M. Helming, *Footsteps in the Snow*, "Forward" Malcolm Muggeridge (New York: Scepter, 1986), p. 19. Escrivá's emphasis on lay spirituality is part of a movement begun in the late nineteenth century which articulated a spirituality specifically aimed at the laity and at ordinary life; Therese Martin of Lisieux and her Little Way is perhaps the most well known of these spiritualities. See Patricia Ranft, *A Woman's Way* (New York: Palgrave, 2000), pp. 182–91.
3. Josemaría Escrivá, *Furrow* (London: Scepter, 1987), 482 (p. 183).
4. *Ibid.*, 487 (p. 184).
5. Escrivá, quoted in Helming, *Footsteps*, p. 19.
6. Adriano Tilgher, *Work: What It Has Meant to Men through the Ages* (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1930), p. 90.
7. Herbert Applebaum, *The Concept of Work: Ancient, Medieval, and Modern* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1992), pp. 452–53; and Daniel Rodgers, *The Work Ethic in Industrial America: 1850–1920* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978), pp. 14–15.
8. Georg Hegel, *The Philosophy of Right*, trans. T. Knox (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1949), quoted in Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 441; see also Julian Marías, *History of Philosophy*, trans. Stanley Applebaum and Clarence Strowbridge, 22d ed. (New York: Dover Publications, 1967), pp. 328–29.
9. Marías, *ibid.*, 338, deems it most important to identify Marx's reflections as a political economy and not a philosophy. "Marx was a very important economist, but is even more important as a political theorist, the founder of one of the greatest mass movements in history. However, this does not signify philosophical importance." See also Marx's *A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy*, trans. S. W. Ryazanskaya (Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1970).
10. Hannah Arendt, *The Human Condition* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1958), p. 86 n.14 and text, p. 86.
11. Henri de Man, *Joy in Work*, trans. Eden Paul and Cedar Paul (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1929).
12. Henri Bergson, *Creative Evolution*, trans. Arthur Mitchell (1911:New York: Modern Library Edition, 1944), p. 201.
13. Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 501.
14. Pope Pius XII's *Fulgens radiatur* (March 21, 1947), an encyclical on St. Benedict, also deals with work as it pertains to the Benedictine Rule.
15. *Laborem exercens*, preface, reprinted in Gregory Baum, *The Priority of Labor: A Commentary on "Laborem exercens," Encyclical Letter of Pope John Paul II* (New York: Paulist Press, 1982), p. 95.
16. Baum, *ibid.*, p. 3.
17. *Laborem exercens* 15, in *ibid.*, p. 125.
18. "The Church in the Modern World," 35, in *The Documents of Vatican II*, ed. Walter M. Abbott, trans. Joseph Gallagher (no city: Geoffrey Chapman, 1966), p. 233.
19. *Laborem exercens* 9 (p. 112).
20. *Ibid.*, 2 (p. 97).

21. See J. Bryan Hehir, "John Paul II: Continuity and Change in the Social Teaching of the Church," in *Co-Creation and Capitalism*, ed. John Houck and Oliver F. Williams (Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1983), pp. 124–40.
22. *Laborem*, 3 (p. 100).
23. *Ibid.*, 4 (p. 101).
24. *Ibid.*, 25 (p. 142).
25. See Michael Novak, "Creation Theology," in *Co-Creation*, pp. 17–41. This stance is refuted by Stanley Hauerwas, "Work as Co-Creation: A Critique of a Remarkably Bad Idea," *ibid.*, pp. 42–58. Hauerwas argues that John Paul II's dependence on Genesis is "highly selective and comes close to being dishonest" and that his exegesis of Genesis is "shockingly naive" (pp. 43, 45). David Hollenbach, "Human Work and the Story of Creation: Theology and Ethics in *Laborem exercens*" in *ibid.*, pp. 59–77, argues that the encyclical's exegesis is "useful but incomplete and that this incompleteness leads to an oversimplification of the issues" (p. 61). Both these critiques are rooted in an environmental controversy of the 1960s and 1970s in which some maintained that Gn 1:26–28 mandated stewardship not dominance of the earth's resources and that the misreading of these verses was responsible for an ecological crisis they said was perpetuated by the West. See Lynn White, "The Historical Roots of Our Ecological Crisis," *Science* 155 (March 10, 1967): 1203–07; James Barr, "Man and Nature: The Ecological Controversy and the Old Testament," *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library* 55 (1972–73): 9–32; and Bernhard Anderson, "Human Dominion Over Nature" in *Biblical Studies in Contemporary Thought*, ed. Miriam Ward (Somerville, MA: Greeno, Hadden and Co., 1975), pp. 27–45. In the study that follows, deciding which exegesis is correct is irrelevant (and, I believe, not possible); what matters is how eleventh-century scholars interpreted the verses. I would also like to note here that Hollenbach, *ibid.*, p. 65, argues that "the major theological contribution of the encyclical, therefore, lies in the grounding it provides for a very positive evaluation of human work through the interpretation of the *imago Dei*"; I believe that eleventh-century theologians such as Peter Damian made the same contribution with the same positive result.
26. *Laborem*, 4 (p. 102).
27. *Ibid.*, 6 (p. 104).
28. Novak, "Creation Theology," p. 34.
29. *Laborem*, 27 (p. 147).
30. Michael Postan, "Why Was Science Backward in the Middle Ages?" in *The History of Science: A Symposium* (Glenoe, IL: Free Press, 1951), p. 26. See George Ovitt, *The Restoration of Perfection: Labor and Technology in Medieval Culture* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1987), pp. 3–56 for a critique of the writers of this period.
31. See Marc Bloch, *Land and Work in Medieval Europe: Selected Papers*, trans. J. E. Anderson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967); Lewis Mumford, *The Myth of the Machine: Technics and Human Development*

- (New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1966–67); Lynn White, “The Study of Medieval Technology, 1924–1978: Personal Reflections,” *Technology and Culture* 16 (1975): 519–30; Carlo Cipolla, *Before the Industrial Revolution* (New York: Norton, 1976); and Franz Feldhaus, *Die Technik der Antike und des Mittelalters* (Wildpark-Potsdam: Akademische verlagsgesellschaft Athenaion, 1931).
32. Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, trans. Talcott Parsons (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1950), p. 78; see also Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 337.
 33. See Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 337.
 34. Ovitt, *Restoration*, p. 9, summarizes Weber thus: “While medieval Catholicism, in the form of Benedictine monasticism, foreshadowed the rational system of productivity central to capitalism, it was not until Calvinism’s concept of the ‘calling’ had sanctioned the pursuit of gain and merged the contradictory impulses of asceticism with material achievement that Western capitalism received its decisive form.” I believe it was Weber’s lack of knowledge of medieval sources that led him to stop too soon in his pursuit of historical origins.
 35. Mumford, *Myth*, p. 8.
 36. *Ibid.*, pp. 263–64.
 37. Herbert Workman, *The Evolution of the Monastic Ideal* (London: Kelly, 1913), p. 219, preceded Mumford in this thesis, but Workman’s study is so flawed by his anti-Roman bias that it had little positive influence on future studies.
 38. Ernst Benz, *Evolution and Christian Hope* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1966), p. 128; cited in Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 196.
 39. *Ibid.*, 137; cited in Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, p. 197.
 40. Jacques LeGoff, *Time, Work, and Culture in the Middle Ages*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977; trans. 1980), p. 114.
 41. *Ibid.*, p. 115.
 42. Ovitt, *Restoration*, p. 200.
 43. *Ibid.*, p. 17.
 44. *Ibid.*, p. 163.
 45. *Ibid.*, p. 20.
 46. Applebaum, *Concept of Work*, pp. 180–81.
 47. Michael Uebel, “Introduction: Conceptualizing Labor in the Middle Ages,” in *The Middle Ages at Work: Practicing Labor in Late Medieval England*, ed. Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), p. 1.
 48. See in particular two works in this series: *ibid.*, and Kellie Robertson, *The Laborer’s Two Bodies: Literary and Legal Productions in Britain, 1350–1500* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004).
 49. See Lujo Brentano, “On the history and development of guilds,” in *English Guilds*, ed. Joshua Toulmin Smith (London: N. Trubner, 1870); Francis

- Aidan Hibbert, *The Influence and Development of English Gilds* (Cambridge: At the University Press, 1891; repr. New York: Augustus M. Kelly, 1970); Charles Gross, *Gild Merchant* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1890); Stella Kramer, *The English Craft Gilds and the Government* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1908; repr. New York: AMS Press, 1968); George Unwin, *The Guilds and Companies of London* (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1908; 4th ed. (Watford: Frank Cass and Co., 1963); and Georges Renard, *Guilds in the Middle Ages*, trans. Dorothy Terry (London: G. Bell and Sons, 1918; repr. New York: Augustus M. Kelly, 1968).
50. For example, as early as 1890 Charles Gross was already revising Brentano's thesis that guilds formed the foundation of English city governments. In turn James Tait, *The Medieval English Borough: Studies on Its Origin and Constitutional History* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1936) challenged Gross's revisions, to which Susan Reynolds, yet another generation later agreed and expanded upon in *Kingdoms and Communities in Western Europe, 900–1300* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984).
 51. Brian Tierney, *Medieval Poor Laws* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1959), p. 129. Anthony Musson, "Reconstructing English Labor Laws: A Medieval Perspective," in *Middle Ages at Work*, ed. Robertson and Uebel, pp. 156–87, also argues that the Statute of Laborers (1349 and 1351) were the government's response to a situation (the plague) which demanded an immediate response. "Given the need for a swift reaction it is likely that they turned to precedents with which they (and the workers) were already familiar," and "the framers were thus drawing upon their working knowledge of these models" already in place (p. 158); those models were formed during the less secular, more religious high Middle Ages.
 52. See Lawrence M. Clopper, "Langland's Persona: An Anthology of the Mendicant Orders," in *Written Work: Langland, Labor, and Authorship*, ed. Steven Justice and Kathryn Kerby-Fulton (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), pp. 144–84; Penn R. Szittyta, *The Antifraternal Tradition in Medieval Literature* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986); Robert Worth Frank, *Piers Plowman and the Scheme of Salvation* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1957); David Aers, "Piers Plowman: Poverty, Work, and Community," in David Aers, *Community, Gender and Individual Identity: English Writing 1360–1430* (London: Routledge, 1988), pp. 20–72; and Robertson, *The Laborer's Two Bodies*.
 53. Clopper, "Langland's Persona," pp. 144–45.
 54. Steven A. Epstein, *Wage, Labor, and Guilds in Medieval Europe* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1991) does acknowledge the need to study theology to uncover medieval attitudes toward work, and he presents one of the more comprehensive reviews of what some medieval theologians said about work (pp. 172–87), but he starts his search too late, with Bonaventure, Aquinas, Anthony of Padua—all thirteenth-century theologians. Unfortunately, this leads him to conclude that there was no theologian who considered work central to their theological understanding of life.

55. Applebaum is an exception, but examination of what he says about the eleventh century only reinforces my point. He entitles chapter 9 “Work in Medieval Europe: 11th to 15th Centuries” (pp. 227–52); here the only discussion of the eleventh century in the chapter, however, is in regard to his broad generalizations about the general history of the period. Moreover, even that discussion leads one to believe that nothing occurred in the eleventh century prior to the Investiture Controversy in 1076. No eleventh-century people are mentioned.
56. Dante Alighieri, *Paradise*, trans. Dorothy Sayers and Barbara Reynolds (Harmondsworth, GB: Penguin Books, 1962; repr. 1986), canto 21, 43–44; 105–110; 114–119; 121.
57. *Ibid.*, 91.
58. Witness is an essential element in Damian’s theology. See Patricia Ranft, “The Concept of Witness: From Its Origin to Its Institutionalization,” *Revue bénédictine* 103 (1987): 21–45.
59. Owen Blum has almost single handedly kept Damian alive in English. His dissertation was published in 1947 as *St. Peter Damian: His Teaching on the Spiritual Life* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1947); he has written various articles and his translation of Reindel’s critical edition continue on today: *Peter Damian Letters*, vols. 1–3, 5 vols. 6–7 with Irvén Resnick (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1989–2005). John Wang, “St. Peter Damian, the Monk,” Ph.D. diss., Fordham University, 1957, and John Oostermann, “Peter Damian’s Doctrine of Sacerotal Office,” Ph.D. diss., The Catholic University of America, 1980, are also helpful. Prior to Blum’s translations, the only works of Damian available in English were Stephen Hurlbut, *The Song of St. Peter Damiani: On the Joies and Glory of Paradise* (Washington, DC: St. Alban’s Press, 1928); and Hurlbut, *Hortus Conclusus* (Washington, DC: St. Alban’s Press, 1936); *St. Peter Damian: Selected Writings on the Spiritual Life*, trans. Patricia McNutley (London: Faber and Faber, 1959); and *Book of Gomorrah*, trans. Pierre Payer (Waterloo, Ont: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1982). Secondary works are scarce but can be found; see Irvén Resnick, *Divine Power and Possibility in St. Peter Damian’s “De Divina Omnipotentia”* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1992) and its excellent bibliography; and J. Joseph Ryan, *Saint Peter Damiani and His Canonical Sources* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute, 1956).
60. In Italian, there has been a small flourish of recent studies. See Nicolangelo D’Acunto, *I Laici Nella Chiesa E Nella Società Secondo Pier Damiani* (Roma: Nella Sede Dell’Istituto, 1999); Giuseppe Fornasari, *Medioevo Riformato del Secolo XI* (Napoli: Liguori Editore, 1996), esp. pp. 31–126; and Benedetto Calati, *Sapienza Monastica* (Roma: Studia Anselmiana 117, 1994), esp. pp. 365–89; Paolo Golinelli, *Indiscreta Sanctitas* (Roma: Nella Sede Dell’ Istituto, 1988), esp. pp. 158–91. In French Jean Leclercq, *Saint Pierre Damien Ermite et Homme D’Église* (Roma: Edizioni di Storia e Letteratura, 1960) is a standard work; also Michel Grandjean, *Laïcs dans L’Église regards de Pierre Damien, Anselme de Cantorbéry, Yves de Chartres*

(Paris: Beauchesne, 1994). In German, see Stephen Freund, *Studien zur literarischen Wirksamkeit des Petrus Damiani* (Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1995). See also the works on the Gregorian reform for occasional reference to Peter Damian; for bibliography on the reform see H. E. J. Cowdrey, *Pope Gregory VII, 1073–85* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998). Constantino Gastani's edition of Damian's *Opera omnia* is found in PL 144–145, while the critical edition of Damian's letters appears in MGH *Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit*, 4 (1983), ed. Kurt Reindel, *Petrus Damiani, Die Briefe des Petrus Damiani*. Damian's sermons are found in *Santi Petri Damiani sermones*, ed. G. Lucchesi, CCCM 57 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1983).

1 Early Christian Attitudes toward Work (pp. 13–29)

1. Scripture citations are from the Douay-Rheims translation of Jerome's Vulgate: *The Holy Bible according to the Douay and Rhemish Versions with Complete Notes of the Rev. Geo. Leo Haydock* (photo reproduction: Monrovia, CA: Catholic Treasures, 1992).
2. Athanasius, *Against the Arians*, 20:51 in NPNF 4:376, claims the opposite: "For Adam was created, not that He [sic] might work, but that first he might be man; for it was after this that he received the command to work. . . .And the like will be found in every case on inquiring into it."
3. *Didache*, 12, 1–5, in *Early Christian Writers*, ed. Cyril Richardson (Louisville, KY: Westminster Press, 1953), repr. in *The New Testament and Other Early Christian Writings*, ed. Bart Ehrman (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 316.
4. *First Epistle of Clement*, 33, in ANF 1:13–14.
5. Pseudo-Clement, *Recognitions*, 10, in ANF 8:155.
6. Justin Martyr, *Lost Fragments on the Resurrection*, 7, in ANF 1:297.
7. Origen, *De principiis*, 3:6, in ANF 4:344.
8. Cyprian, *On the Advantage of Patience*, 9:11, in ANF 5:487.
9. Cyprian, *Exhortation to Martyrdom*, 11:3.1, in ANF 5:530–32.
10. *Epistle of Ignatius to Polycarp*, 6, in ANF 1:95.
11. Clement of Alexandria, in *Early Christian Writers: Apostolic Fathers* (New York: Dorset Press, 1986), 40.
12. Tertullian, *The Soul's Testimony*, 1, in ANF 3:175–76.
13. Tertullian, *On Idolatry*, 5, in ANF 3:63.
14. Gregory of Nyssa, *On the Making of Man*, 3:1–2, in NPNF 5:390–92.
15. Basil, PG 31,1347; in Maurus Wolter, *The Principles of Monasticism*, trans. Bernard Sause (St. Louis, MO: B. Herder, 1962), p. 1641.
16. Athanasius, *The Life of St. Anthony*, 3, in NPNF 4:196.
17. Lucius, 1, in *The Sayings of the Desert Fathers: The Alphabetical Collection*, trans. Benedicta Ward (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, rev. ed., 1984), pp. 120–21.
18. Silvanus, 9, in *ibid.*, p. 224.
19. Siscoes, 13, in *ibid.*, p. 214.

20. Pistamon, 1, in *The Sayings of the Desert Fathers*, p. 200.
21. Achilles, 5, in *ibid.*, pp. 29–30.
22. Isaiah, 5, in *ibid.*, p. 70.
23. Silvanus, 11, in *ibid.*, p. 224.
24. Syncletia, 27, in *ibid.*, p. 235.
25. Mary and Euphemia, in *Holy Women of the Syrian Orient*, trans. Sebastian Brock and Susan Harvey (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2d ed. 1998), pp. 124–28.
26. Theodore, 10–11, in *Sayings*, p. 75.
27. *Saint Basil Ascetical Works*, trans. M. M. Wagner (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1950), q.37r.
28. Basil, PG 31, 1351, in Wolter, *Principles*, p. 1685.
29. *Basil Works*, q.41r.
30. *Ibid.*, q.38r.
31. *Ibid.*, q.37r.
32. PL 40,448; Augustine, *On the Good Life*, c.21, trans. in *Principles*, p. 1742.
33. Augustine, *Work of Monks*, 6:7, in *Saint Augustine Treatises on Various Subjects*, ed. Roy J. Deferrari (New York: Fathers of the Church, 1952), p. 340.
34. *Ibid.*, 7:8 (p. 342).
35. *Ibid.*, 1:1 (p. 331).
36. *Ibid.*, 3:4 (p. 335).
37. *Ibid.*, 17:20 (p. 362); 1:1–2 (pp. 331–33).
38. PL 40, 1264; Augustine, *Ad fratres in eremo*, sermo 17, in *Principles*, p. 1655.
39. Augustine, *Works*, 17:20 (p. 363).
40. *Ibid.*, 22:25 (pp. 369–70).
41. *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, trans. Raymond Canning (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1984), 5:2.
42. Augustine *The City of God*, trans. Marcus Dods (New York: Modern Library, 1950), 22:24.
43. *Ibid.*
44. *Rule of Macarius*, 8, in *Early Monastic Rules*, trans. Carmela Franklin, Ivan Havener, and J. A. Francis (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1982), p. 43.
45. *Ibid.*, p. 11.
46. *Ibid.*, p. 30, in *ibid.*, p. 51.
47. *Rule of the Four Fathers*, 12, in *ibid.*, p. 27.
48. *Ibid.*, p. 11.
49. John Cassian, *Conferences*, 11, in NPNF, 11:536.
50. *Ibid.*, 11:536–37.
51. *Ibid.*, 10:22, in *ibid.*, 11:274.
52. *Ibid.*, 10:1, in *ibid.*, 11:266.
53. *Ibid.*, 10:2, in *ibid.*, 11:267.
54. *Ibid.*, 10:7, in *ibid.*, 11:269.
55. *Ibid.*, 10:8.
56. *Ibid.*, 10:10, in *ibid.*, 11:270.

57. *Ibid.*, 10:14, in *ibid.*, 11:271.
58. *Ibid.*, 10:23, in *ibid.*, 11:274.
59. See Maria McCarthy, *The Rule for Nuns of St. Caesarius of Arles* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1960).
60. *The Rule of the Master*, trans. Luke Eberle (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1977), pp. 20, 209–13.
61. Cassiodorus, *Institutiones divinarum lectionum*, cited in M. L. W. Laistner, *Thought and Letters in Western Europe A. D. 500 to 900*, rev. ed. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1976), p. 98–101.
62. Philip Timko, “Cassiodorus,” *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*, ed. William Johnston (Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn, 2000), 1:250.
63. *St. Benedict’s Rule for Monasteries*, trans. Leonard J. Doyle (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1948). Much of what I discuss here in the Benedictine Rule has a corresponding passage in the Rule of the Master, but it is the dissemination of the Benedictine Rule that makes its content significant.
64. Other examples are Dunstan’s reform that resulted in *Regularis Concordia*, and Lanfranc’s legislation ca. 1070.
65. PL 97, 381, cited in Bede Lackner, *The Eleventh-Century Background of Cîteaux* (Washington, DC: Cistercian Publications, 1972), p. 11.
66. PL 97, 381, 383, and 388; cited in *ibid.*, pp. 18–19.
67. See *Cartulary of Osene Abbey*, ed. H. E. Salter (Oxford, 1935), v.209, no. 692.
68. Mumford, *The Myth of the Machine: Technics and Human Development* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1966–67) p. 263.
69. Rosamond McKitterick, *The Carolingians and the Written Word* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), p. 109. See also Janet Nelson, “Literacy in Carolingian government,” in *The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe*, ed. Rosamond McKitterick (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 258–96.
70. *Ibid.*, p. 125.
71. John Mitchell, “Literacy displayed: the use of inscriptions at the monastery of San Vincenzo al Volturno in the early ninth century,” in *Uses of Literacy*, pp. 220–21.
72. Kenneth Conant, “Observations on the Practical Talents and Technology of the Medieval Benedictines,” in *Clunian Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*, ed. Noreen Hunt (London: Macmillan, 1971), p. 80.
73. C. Lawrence, *Medieval Monasticism* (London: Longman, 1984), p. 112.
74. Conant, “Observations,” p. 77.

2 The Eleventh-Century World of Peter Damian (pp. 33–54)

1. Letter 67 in *Peter Damian Letters*, trans. Owen J. Blum[†] and Irven Resnick (Washington, DC: Catholic University Press, 1989–2005), 3: 78; and in PL 145, 825. Hereafter citations to *ibid.* will be in text. See Lester K. Little, “The Personal Development of Peter Damian,” in *Order and Innovation in the*

- Middle Ages*, eds. William C. Jordan, B. McNab, and T. Ruiz (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1976), p. 321.
2. See Percy Schramm, *Kaiser, Rom u. Renovatio*, 2 vols. (Darmstadt: H. Gentner, 1962). The Via Flaminia passed right by Fonte Avellana.
 3. Harold Hazeltrine, "Roman and Canon Law in the Middle Ages," *Cambridge Medieval History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1964–66), 5:734.
 4. See Schramm, *Kaiser*, 1:278; and A. Gaudenzi, "Lo svolgimento parallelo del diritto longo-bardo e del diritto romano a Ravenna," *Memorie della R. Accademia delle scienze dell' Istituto di Bologna, Classe di scienze morali*, ser. I, I: *Sezione di sc. Guiridiche*, fasc. 1–2 (1908), 37–93 and 117–164; J. K. Hyde, *Society and Politics in Medieval Italy* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1973), pp. 34, 42, and 63.
 5. Hyde, *Society*, p. 34.
 6. See J. Joseph Ryan, *Saint P. Damiani and His Canonical Sources* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute, 1956).
 7. McNulty, *St. Peter Damian: Selected Writings on the Spiritual Life*, trans. Patricia McNutley (London: Faber and Faber, 1959), p. 14.
 8. *Letters*, Introduction, 1:4–5.
 9. Ryan, *Saint P. Damiani*, p. 137.
 10. André Wilmart, "Une lettre de S. Pierre Damien à l'impératrice Agnès," *Revue bénédictine* 44 (1932); 131, argues that Damian's teaching career was insignificant. Little, "Personal Development," p. 325, disagrees.
 11. Noreen Hunt, *Cluny under Saint Hugh, 1049–1109* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), says it was William III; Philip E. McWilliams, "Cluniacs" and "Cluny, France," in *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*, 1: 310 and 314, says it was William I.
 12. See Ernst Sackur, *Die Cluniacenser in ihrer kirchlichen und allgemeingeschichtlichen Wirksamkeit bis zur Mitte des elften Jahrhunderts*, 2 vols. (Halle: Max Niemayer, 1892–1894), and Raffaello Morghan, "Monastic Reform and Cluniac Spirituality," in Noreen Hunt, *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages* (London: Macmillan, 1971), pp. 11–28.
 13. So says Lackner, *Eleventh Century Background*, p. 40; and Albert Hauck, *Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands*, 6 vols. (Leipzig: J. C. Hindrich's sche Buchhandlung, 1887–1920), 3:344.
 14. Morghan, "Monastic Reform," pp. 13–15.
 15. Colin Morris, *The Discovery of the Individual 1050–1200* (London: SPCK, 1972), p. 145.
 16. Ernst Troeltsch, *The Social Teaching of the Christian Churches*, 2 vols. (New York: Macmillan, 1931), 2: 1005–1006.
 17. "The Maintenance and Transformation of Society through Eschatology: Cluniac Monasticism," *Journal of Religious History* 14:3 (1987): 246–55.
 18. Loring M. Danforth, *The Death Rituals of Rural Greece* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1982), p. 37. Maurice Bloch, "Death, Women and Power," in *Death and the Regeneration of Life*, eds. Maurice Bloch and

- Jon Perry (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), p. 218, calls it a "challenge to the social order."
19. See David Stannard, *The Puritan Way of Death: A Study of Religion, Culture and Social Change* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1977).
 20. We are touching here upon a fundamental difference between functionalists, such as Durkheim and Hertz, and those promoting a semiotic approach, such as Geertz, who argues that "functionalism, with its emphasis on balance, equilibrium and stability, has failed to explain the dysfunctional aspects of religious behaviour and its ability to contribute to the transformation of disintegration of social and cultural systems." See *ibid.*, p. 27.
 21. Manuela Carneiro da Cunha, "Eschatology among the Kraho," in *Mortality and Immortality: Anthropology and Archeology of Death*, eds. S. C. Humphreys and Helen King (London: Academic Press, 1981), p. 161.
 22. See Joan Evans, *Monastic Life at Cluny, 910–1157* (London: Oxford University Press, 1931), p. 23 and Peter Brown, *The Cult of the Saints* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981), p. 31.
 23. See *Consuetudines Farfenses*, 1:140, in B. Albers, *Consuetudines monasticae* (Stuttgart-Vienna, 1990), 1:113–134. See also Robert Heath, *Cruce Imperatorum Philosophia* (Pittsburgh: Pickwick Press, 1976), p. 92.
 24. It is worth pondering why Cluniacs chose personal laments rather than collective laments. At the least, it is part of a trend among Cluniacs to individualize the dead, if not the living. See K. Schmid and J. Wollasch, "Die Gemeinschaft der Lebenden und Verstorbenen in Zeugnissen des Mittelalters," *Frühmittelalterliche Studien* 1 (1967), 365–405.
 25. Cited in Barbara Rosenwein, "Feudal War and Monastic Peace: Cluniac Liturgy as Ritual Aggression," *Viator* 2 (1971), 140.
 26. Cited in H. E. J. Cowdrey, "Unions and Confraternity with Cluny," *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 16 (1965), 154.
 27. *Ibid.*, 159.
 28. One interesting necrology written by the nun Elsendus and used at the first Cluniac women's monastery in Marcigny-sur-Loire, contains some 9000 names. See Joachim Wollasch, "A Cluniac Necrology from the Time of Abbot Hugh," in Hunt, *Cluniac Monasticism*, p. 181.
 29. See Danforth, *Death Rituals*, for discussion of the various approaches, and Bloch, "Death, Women."
 30. See Stannard, *Puritan Way*.
 31. Clifford Geertz, *Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), p. 119, says life is marked by "a movement back and forth between the religious perspective and the commonsense perspective." This pendulum swing is most difficult to maintain in the face of death. According to Levi-Strauss, this is the purpose of myth, "to provide a logical model capable of overcoming a contradiction." See also Danforth, *Death Rituals*, p. 30.
 32. Damian is in total agreement with modern anthropologists here (or rather vice versa), for when discussing clerical incontinence he specifies that some men engage in sex to defy death. "Many of those who are in bondage to the

- delights of carnal pleasure long to perpetuate their own memory through their posterity. This they pursue through every waking moment, since they are sure that they will not be wholly dead in this world if they continue their name in a fruitfully surviving progeny" (L 31.68).
33. Wolfhart Pannenberg, *Theology and the Kingdom of God* (Philadelphia, PA: Westminster Press, 1969), p. 59.
 34. Karl Rahner makes this distinction: "to speak from the future to the present is apocalyptic." Quoted in Edward Schillebeeckx, "Interpretation of Eschatology," in *The Problem of Eschatology*, eds. Edward Schillebeeckx and B. Williams (New York: Concilium, 1969), p. 53.
 35. John F. Wilson, *Pulpit in Parliament* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1969), pp. 198–208.
 36. Kassius Hallinger, "The Spiritual Life of Cluny in the Early Days," in Hunt, *Cluniac Monasticism*, pp. 39–43.
 37. Jean Leclercq, *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages* (London: Burnes & Oates, 1968), p. 168. Ray Petry, *Christian Eschatology and Social Thought* (New York: Abingdon Press, 1961), p. 126, believes Bernard's thought is "not unlike the poetic fantasies of Peter Damian." It is for this reason that I chose Bernard's remarks to illustrate Cluniac eschatology even though he comes after Peter Damian.
 38. Bernard of Cluny, "Sermon on the Parable of the Unjust Steward," in *The Source of Jerusalem the Golden*, trans. H. Preble, ed. S. M. Jackson (Chicago, IL: 1910), 8:194.
 39. *Ibid.*, 8:194–5.
 40. Cited in Cowdrey, "Unions," 153.
 41. See Ernest H. Kantorowicz, "The Problem of Medieval World Unity," in *Selected Studies* (Locust Valley, NY: 1965), pp. 76–81.
 42. Carolyn Walker Bynum, "Did the Twelfth Century Discover the Individual?" in *idem*, *Jesus as Mother* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), pp. 82–109.
 43. See, for example, the excellent study by Charles T. Wood, "Celestine V, Boniface VIII and the Authority of Parliament," *Journal of Medieval History* 8 (1982): 45–62.
 44. See M. D. Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century*, trans. Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1968) and Jean Leclercq, "Consciousness of Identification in Twelfth-Century Monasticism," *Cistercian Studies* 14:2 (1974): 219–231.
 45. Bruno of Quefort, *Vita quinque fratrum*, ch. 2, in MGH SS, 15:718.
 46. See PL 144,953–1008; *Petri Damiani Vita Beati Romualdi*, ed. G. Tabacco, in *Fonti per la Storia d'Italia*, vol. 94 (Rome: Fonti per la storia d'Italia, 1957); and B. Hamilton, "S. Pierre Damien et les Mouvements Monastiques de son temps," *Studia Gregoriana* 10 (1975): 175–202. See also A. M. Mundo, "Monastic Movements in the East Pyrenees," in Hunt, *Cluniac Monasticism*, pp. 98–122.
 47. See also L 106.26 and 110:31.

48. Kurt Reindel, *Petrus Damiani, Die Briefe des deutschen Kaiserzeit*, 4 (1983), 3:291: "Illic enim humani cordis ager excolitur, unde seges illa colligitur, quae prumptuarii caelestis edibus infercitur."
49. *Ibid.*, 3:290: "In posterioribus nos aculeus terroris exagitat, ut cervix nostra iugo divinae legiis attrita in laboribus non lassescat."
50. See Morris, *Discovery*; Bynum, "Did the Twelfth Century?"; and Chenu, *Nature Man*.
51. Pannenberg, *Theology*, pp. 69 and 59. Pannenberg reminds us that "eternity is not the antithesis of change."
52. *Hortus conclusus*, ed. S. Hurlbut (Washington, DC: St. Albans Press, 1932), stanzas 13–14 (p. 13) and stanza 16 (p. 15).
53. In J. M. Neale, *Mediaeval Preachers and Mediaeval Preaching* (London: Mozley, 1856), pp. 76–77 and Petry, *Christian Eschatology*, p. 350.
54. See Kenneth Conant, *Carolingian and Romanesque Architecture, 800 to 1200*, 4th ed. (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1978).
55. See Germain Morin, "Rainaud l'Ermite et Ives de Chartres: un episode de la crise du céobitisme au XIe–Xiiie siècle," *Revue bénédictine* 40 (1928): 99–115; Jean Leclercq, "Monastic Crisis of the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries," in Hunt, *Cluniac Monasticism*, pp. 217–237; Norman Cantor, "Crisis of Western Monasticism, 1050–1130," *American Historical Review* 66 (1960): 47–67; Louis Lekai, "Motives and Ideals of Eleventh Century Monastic Renewal," in *The Cistercian Spirit: A Symposium*, ed. M. Basil Pennington (Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1970). It was the accepted thesis until John van Engen, "The 'Crisis of Cenobitism' Reconsidered: Benedictine Monasticism in the Years 1050–1150," *Speculum* 61: 269–304.
56. For Nilus, see AASS, September 7, 262.
57. Certainly Peter Damian believed it. Modern scholarship agrees, although documentation is sparse.
58. See Robert Hale, "Camaldolese," *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*, 1:234.
59. *Ibid.*, 1:234. He was also sent to St. Vincent's monastery where he wrote the vita of Romuald, probably his first literary work. See Resnick, *Divine Power and Possibility in St. Peter Damian's "De Divia Omnipotentia"* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1992), p. 11.
60. David Knowles with Dimitri Obolensky, *The Christian Centuries* (New York: Paulist Press, 1983), 2:68.
61. H. E. J. Cowdrey, *Pope Gregory VII 1073–1085* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), pp. 21–26.
62. *Liber gratissimus*, ed. L Heinemann, MGH, *Libelli de lite*, 1, 15–75, posits that it is one of the most important theological treatises of the eleventh century.
63. See Humbert de Silva Candida, *Libri tres adversus simoniacos*, ed. F. Thaner, MGH *Libelli de lite*, 1 (1891): 95–253.
64. See James P. Whitney, *Hildebrandine Essays* (Cambridge: The University Press, 1932), p. 127.

65. Cowdrey, *Pope*, pp. 44–45.
66. See Kennerly Woody, “Damiani and the Radicals,” (Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1966), and Woody “*Sagena Piscatoris: Peter Damian and the Papal Election Decree of 1059*,” *Viator* 1 (1970): 33–54.
67. Cowdrey, *Pope*, p. 46, agrees.
68. David Knowles, *The Evolution of Medieval Thought* (New York: Vintage Books, 1962), pp. 79–106, quote, p. 93.
69. I. S. Robinson, “The ‘Colores Rhetorici’ in the Investiture Contest,” *Traditio* 32 (1976): 226.
70. Joseph Endres, “Petrus Damiani und die Weltlich Wissenschaft,” in *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters*, ed. C. Baeumken (Münster: Aschendorff, 1910). Jean Gonsette, *Pierre Damien et le culture profane* (Louvain: Publications Universitaires de Louvain, 1956), mounted the first rebuttal of Endres’ thesis.
71. Irvn Resnick, “Attitudes Towards Philosophy and Dialectic During the Gregorian Reform,” *Journal of Religious History* 16:2 (December 1990): 118–25.
72. See PL 144, 373, where he mentions that he sent his nephew to Cluny for an education.
73. Cowdrey, *Pope*, p. 39.
74. See Blum, *St. Peter Damian: His Teaching on the Spiritual Life* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1947), p. 26.

3 Damian’s Social Theology (pp. 55–76)

1. Marcia L. Colish, *Medieval Foundations of Western Intellectual Tradition 400–1400* (repr. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1998), p. 164.
2. For Bruno, see AASS, VI October and PG 152, 555–606; 153: 11–568.
3. For Robert, see AASS, III February and PL 162, 1079–1082.
4. For Stephen, see PL 204, 1005–1046 and AASS II February.
5. For Bernard, see PL 172, 1363–1446 and AASS II April.
6. For Stephen Harding, see AASS II April.
7. See Colin Phipps, “Romuald—Model Hermit: Eremitical Theory in Saint Peter Damian’s *Vita Beati Romualdi*, chapters 16–27,” in *Monks, Hermits and the Ascetic Tradition*, ed. W. J. Sheils (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985), pp. 65–77.
8. *Petri Damiani Vita Beati Romualdi*, pp. 43–44.
9. Phipps, “Romuald,” pp. 67, 55.
10. *Martus* and *marturein* are used extensively in scripture, some 185 times in the New Testament alone; in Acts, derivations of *martus* are found twenty-four times. For a complete analysis of the scriptural concept of witness, see Allison A. Trites, *The Concept of Witness in New Testament Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977) For its history, see my “Concept of Witness.” See also H. H. Rowley, *Short Dictionary of Bible Themes* (New York: Basic Books, 1968), p. 110. In the following discussion

the Latin is from the Vulgate: *Novum Testamentum Latine secundum editionem Sancti Hieronymi* (London: The British and Foreign Bible Society, n.d.).

11. Cf. John L. McKenzie, "The Gospel According to Matthew," *Jerome Biblical Commentary* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1968), 43:86.
12. Damian's exegesis of the passage is worth quoting in its entirety: "Ut ergo ad eos, a quibus coeperat, sermo recurrat, clericus, qui captus est amore pecuniae, nequaquam idoneus est ad ministranda verba doctrinae. Quod etiam in eo, quod superius proposimus, apostolico declaratur exemplo. Nam cum scriptura praemittat: 'Multitudinis credentium erat cor unum et anima una,' moxque subiungat: 'Nec quisquam eorum, quae possidebant, aliquid suum esse dicebat, sed erant illis omnia communia,' protinus addidit: 'Et virtute magna reddebant apostoli testimonium resurrectionis Iesu Christi Domini nostri, et gratia magna erat in omnibus illis,' deinde subinfert: 'Nec enim quisquam egens erat inter illos.' "

Quid autem sibi vult, quod huius sacrae scriptor hystoriae, dum de continentia loquitur apostolica et communi vita, repente quasi materia, interrumpit, et ad enarrandam praedicationis constantiam tanquam mutato stilo prosilit dicens: "Et virtute magna reddebant apostoli testimonium resurrectionis?" Cur uni materiae aliam interpolat, qui coeptam, persequi et continuare debuerat, nisi, ut patenter ostendat, quia illi duntaxat idonei sunt ad praedicationis officium, qui nullum terranae facultatis possidentes lucrum, et dum aliquid singulare non habent, communiter omnia possident, 'nichil scilicet habentes et omnia possidentes.' " Kurt Reindel, ed., *Die Briefe des Petrus Damiani*, 4 vols., in MGH, *Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit* (1983–993), 3:96. When Latin may be insightful, I will cite Reindel as *Briefe*. For English translation, see L 98.27–8.

13. *Briefe*, 2:196: "Sancti plane sacerdotis est, et quae sancta sunt cogitare, et qua mente conceperit, etiam in operibus evidenter exprimere. Alioquin quid prodest bonum aliquid cogitare, nisi sollerter invigilet hoc ipsum et in operatione perficere?"
14. Bruno of Cologne's life allows us to see how this process was experienced. The school of Rheims patron was Manasses I during Bruno's tenure. In 1075 when Bruno was named chancellor, accusations concerning Manasses' administration reached a crescendo. Only Manasses' contact with the school remained above reproach. Within two years of these accusations Bruno resigned his post as chancellor and went to Rome to plead his case against Manasses (see John R. Williams, "Archbishop Manasses I and Pope Gregory VII," *American Historical Review* 54 (1948–1949): 804–824; Williams, "Godfrey of Rheims," *Speculum* 22 (1947): 29–45.) To a person aware of the Christian obligation to bear witness, the dichotomy between what was preached and what was practiced in the diocese would have been most disturbing. To Manasses, the activities of the school and of the diocese were separate and unrelated. Surely this must have frustrated Bruno and contributed to his decision to withdraw from a world absent of witness into one where his every movement was a witness. See *The Letters of Peter the Venerable*,

- ed. Giles Constable (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967), 1:44–47; 333–334; 402; 402–404, for Carthusian intellectual activity.
15. See Steven Marrone, *William of Auvergne and Robert Grosseteste* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983).
 16. Sermon 47, in *Sancti Petri Damiani Sermones*, ed. G. Lucchesi (Turnhout: Brepols, 1983).
 17. Jesus' words in Mt 6:33, cited in L 38.16. Damian calls Jesus Truth in Letter 8.4; 23.20; 115.6; 108.19; 28.14; 66.27; 39.9; and 50.37.
 18. See L 23 and my "The Role of the Eremitic Monk in the Development of the Medieval Intellectual Tradition," in *From Cloister to Classroom*, ed. E. Rozanne Elder (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1986); Resnick, *Divine Omnipotence*; and comments of W. H. V. Reade, "Philosophy on the Middle Ages," in *Cambridge Medieval History*, eds. J. R. Tanner, C. W. Previte-Orton, and Z. N. Brooke (New York: Macmillan, 1929), 5: 792: "Less energy, perhaps, would have been spent in remonstrance against this apparent degradation of reason if more attention had been paid to the current usage of terms. *Philosophia* often means no more than dialectic, and dialectic no more than a display of captious arguments. That the Christian position as a whole (the Christian philosophy, in fact) was irrational, Peter Damian and his contemporaries would never have admitted."
 19. The study of the atom, genetic codes, cloning, and the development of privacy technology are just some of the areas where caution has been promoted.
 20. *Briefe*, 1:272: "Solitaria sane vita caelestis doctrinae schola est ac divinarum artium disciplina."
 21. *Briefe*, 1:252: "Christi me simplicitas doceat."
 22. *Briefe*, 1:254: "in mente et spiritu ad imaginem et similitudinem Dei homo rationalis est conditus atque ibi divinae gratiae et illuminationis est capax."
 23. Augustin Fliche, *Le réforme grégorienne*, 3 vols. (Paris: E. Champion, 1924–1927), 1:337.
 24. Cited in Henry Taylor, *The Medieval Mind*, 4th ed. (London: Macmillan, 1911), 1: 349.
 25. Bonaventure, *On Retracing the Arts to Theology*, 7, in *The Works of Bonaventure*, trans. Jose de Vinck (Paterson, NJ: St. Anthony Guild Press, 1966), pp 20–21, writes that "all kinds of knowledge are perfected in the knowledge of sacred scripture."
 26. Gilbert of Hoyland, *Treatises*, 2.2, in *Gilbert of Hoyland: Treatises, Epistles and Sermons*, trans. Lawrence C. Braceland (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981), p. 94.
 27. This is not to claim that Damian was the only one or even the first. For Bruno of Cologne see PL 153, 384, 631–760. Bruno viewed pursuit of knowledge as a means of attaining union with the sacred, not as a dubious activity, for truth and the sacred are one. Guigo I, prior eight years after Bruno's death, wrote: "Truth is life and eternal salvation, therefore, you

- ought to pity anyone whom it displeases, for to that extent he is dead and lost" (PL 153, 601–603; Guigues de Chastel, *Meditations of Guigo*, trans. John Jolin (Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1951), p. 225. See also Guibert of Nogent, *Self and Society in Medieval France*, trans. C. C. S. Bland (New York: Harper & Row, 1970), p. 61, who reports that "although they [the Carthusians] subject themselves to complete poverty, they are accumulating a very rich library."
28. M. D. Chenu, *The Theology of Work* (Dublin: M. H. Gill & Son, 1963), p. 3. According to Chenu the term *theology of work* first came into usage in the late 1950s.
 29. Chenu, *Theology*, 80. *Officina* and *labora* are the Latin equivalences.
 30. Maximus, *Ambigua*, PG 91, 1305, writes: "Man is a living workshop [*ergasterion*] which functions permanently and continuously. He himself is the unifying element of the most widely differing realities." Cited in Chenu, *Theology*, pp. 80–81.
 31. *Briefe*, 1:277: "O heremus mundi persequentis effugium, laborantium quies."
 32. *Briefe*, 1:273: "O cella spiritalis exercicii mirabilis officina, in qua certe humana anima creatoris sui in se restaurat imaginem, et ad suae redit originis puritatem."
 33. *Briefe*, 1:272: "Solitaria sane vita caelestis doctrinae schola est ac divinarum artium disciplina. Illuc Deus est ubi discitur, vita quo tenditur, atque ad summae veritatis ibi noticiam pervenitur."
 34. *Briefe*, 1:275: "Cella est ergasterium, ubi preciosi lapides poliuntur, quatinus in structura templi postmodum sine ullo cudentis mallei sonitu disponantur."
 35. *Briefe*, 1:255: "ut in pluribus una et in singulis sit per mysterium tota."
 36. *Briefe*, 1:256: "qui est proculdubio et unus et multiplex."
 37. *Briefe*, 1:262: "Si ergo tota aecclesia unum Christi corpus est et nos aecclesiae membre sumus, quid obest, si corporis nostri, id est aecclesiae singuli quique verbis utamur, qui cum ea unum veraciter sumus? Sicque fit, ut quod est omnium sit etiam singulorum, et quod quibusdam est singulariter speciale, omnibus quoque in fidei et charitatis integritate commune."
 38. Plato, *Timaeus*, in *History of Philosophy: Selected Readings*, eds. George Abernethy and Thomas Langford (Belmont, CA: Dickenson Publishing Company, 1968), p. 118.
 39. Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century*, trans. Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little (Chicago, IC: University of Chicago Press), pp. 1–48.
 40. *Ibid.*, pp. 37–38.
 41. *Ibid.*, p. 29 n. 58.
 42. Chenu's ignoring Damian in his essays on the *vita apostolica*, preaching, and canonical life is even harder to understand or excuse.
 43. *Briefe*, 1:262: "Sicut autem homo Greco aeloquio dicitur microcosmus, hoc est minor mundus, quoniam per materialem essentiam eisdem quattuor elementis homo constat, quibus et universalis hic mundus, ita etiam

- unusquisue fidelium quasi quaedam minor esse videtur aecclesia, dum salvo unitatis archanae mysterio, etiam cuncta redemptionis humanae unus homo suscipit sacramenta, quae ipsi universali aecclesiae sunt divinitus attributa.”
44. Charles Homer Haskins, *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century* (Cleveland, OH: World Publishing, repr., 1967), pp. 301–40.
 45. Chenu, *Theology*, p. 79.
 46. Chenu, *Nature*, pp. 39, 36.
 47. *Ibid.*, pp. 29–32.
 48. Mircea Eliade, *The Sacred and the Profane*, trans. Willard R. Trask (New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1959), p. 14.
 49. *Ibid.*, p. 118.
 50. *Briefe*, 3:192: “Hic libet aciem mentis paulisper attollere, et quanta divinitus homini gratia praeerogetur, breviter indagare. Cum nimirum per divini muneris institutionem elementa cuncta deserviunt, et non modo caelum et terra, aer et aquae, sed et quaeque in eis sunt, in humanae utilitatis amministrazione concurrunt. Primo quidem sibi famulantur quattuor elementa, quae diximus, quia ex eis constat, deinde quia quicquid habent, illi extrinsecus amministrant.”
 51. *Briefe*, 3:198: “Ecce dum raptim celeriterque cuncta perstringimus, usibus hominum ministrare concorditer omnia reperimus, caelum scilicet, terram pariter et infernum. Hic praesumptionis nos fortasse quis arguat, si autentica scripturae sententia non accurrat. Sed ecce Paulus Corinthius dicit: . . . Sed tunc omnia sunt veraciter hominis, si ipse homo sit veraciter homo. Est enim qui solo nomine sit homo, est qui reipsa et veritate sit homo.”
 52. *Briefe*, 3:195–96: “In hoc videlicet universalis mundi certamine non parvum spiritualis figurae mysterium deprehenditur, si quae sit in homine, minori videlicet mundo, concertatio perpendatur. Quid enim spera caeli, quae planetas includit, nisi corpus designat humanum, quod rationalem animam contegit?”
 53. Mircea Eliade, *The Myth of the Eternal Return*, trans. Willard R. Trask (New York: Harper & Row, 1959), p. 27.
 54. Chenu, *Theology*, 37.
 55. In a very interesting article Kenneth Russell, “Peter Damian’s Whip,” *American Benedictine Review* 41:1 (March 1990): 20–35, argues that “as the amount of healthy, physical labor done by the monks decreased, the effort to validate their lives by what they did increased.” Russell draws this conclusion in his analysis of Damian’s use of the discipline, but his conclusion is also appropriate here.

4 Damian’s Apostolate: Theology of Work in Action (pp. 77–96)

1. Giles Constable, *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), p. 4.

2. For positive appraisals, see J. C. Dickenson, *The Origins of the Austin Canons and Their Introduction into England* (London: SPCK, 1950), p. 34; Little, "Personal Development of Peter Damian," p. 317; and Reginald Biron, *St. Pierre Damien* (Paris: J. Gabalda Ciè, 1908), p. 203.
3. Conrad Greenia, "The Laybrother Vocation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries," *Cistercian Studies* 15(1980): 39.
4. See James Donnelly, *The Decline of the Medieval Cistercian Laybrotherhood* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1949); Greenia, "Laybrother," 38–45; Kassius Hallinger, "Woher Kommen Die Laienbrüder?" *Analecta S. O. Cisterciana* (1956): 26–42; and Irven Resnick, "Odo of Tournai and Peter Damian," *Revue bénédictine* 98 (1988): 114–40.
5. Resnick, "Odo," 137.
6. Unfortunately, little work has been done concerning the early history of laysisterhoods. However, sources for early female houses, for example, in Ireland, indicate that women hired laborers for farm work and manual labor, so the presence of lay workers in some early female houses is certain. See my *Women and Religious Life in Premodern Europe* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996), p. 18.
7. Phipps, Colin, "Romuald-Model Hermit: Eremitical Theory in Saint Peter Damian's Vita Beati Romualdi," in *Monks Hermits and the Ascetic Tradition*, ed. W. J. Sheils (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985): 64, p. 105.
8. See PL 146,671; 162,1072–1078; 152, 491–526; MGH, SS, 12, 678.
9. Katherine Allen Smith, "Lay Brothers and Lay Sisters, Christian," in *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*, 1: 748, notes that the Gilbertine laysisters were also found doing manual work in charity hospitals. See also Rose Graham, *Gilbert of Sempringham and the Gilbertines* (London: Elliot Stock, 1901), pp. 10–12.
10. Resnick, "Odo," 137.
11. Greenia, "The Laybrother Vocation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries," *Cistercian Studies*, 41 (1980).
12. Some argue that laybrotherhoods arose from monks' needs and not from laity's desires; see Constable, *Reformation*, p. 80. See Jacques Dubois, "The Laybrothers' Life in the Twelfth Century: A Form of Lay Monasticism" *Cistercian Studies* 7 (1972): 161–213: "The institute of the lay monks called *converse* was the realization of an ideal, not a palliative for decadence" (213). See *Cistercian Lay Brothers: Twelfth-Century Usages with Related Texts*, ed. Chrysogonus Waddell (Brecht: Cîteaux vonmerntarii cistercienses, 2000) for Cistercian brotherhood. Either motive, or both, is consistent with my conclusions here. Work was a means to a future good, for which humble labor was a viable instrument.
13. Greenia, "Laybrother," 44. Greenia quotes Caesar of Heisterbach, assuring us that "many clerics pretended to be laymen in order to be able to serve God in humility as Laybrothers."
14. Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century*, trans. Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1968), p. 225.

15. See Giles Constable, "The Orders of Society," in *Constable, Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Society Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 251–360.
16. Chenu, *Nature*, p. 225.
17. Pierre Mandonnet, *St. Dominic and His Work*, trans. Mary Larkin (St. Louis, MN: B. Herder Book Company, 1944), p. 265.
18. Ranft, "Rule of St. Augustine in Medieval Monasticism," *Proceedings of the PMR Conference* 11 (1986): 143–150.
19. John Cassian, *Conferences*, 18.5, in *NPNF*, 11:480–81.
20. Chapter 48: monks "must live by manual labor, as did our fathers and the apostles."
21. Ranft, "Rule."
22. Translated in Evans, *Monastic Life at Cluny, 910–1157* (London: Oxford University Press, 1931), pp. 4–6.
23. Chenu, *Nature*, p. 214 n. 25.
24. Translated in Mandonnet, *Dominic*, p. 259.
25. Cowdrey, *Pope Gregory VII, 1073–85* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), pp. 45–46.
26. Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century*, trans. Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little (Chicago, IL: Chicago University Press, 1968), pp. 214–215.
27. Constance Berman, *The Cistercian Evolution* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000), p. xiv.
28. Chenu, *Nature*, p. 238.
29. Chenu, *Nature*, p. 215; PL 145, 490.
30. Cited in Mandonnet, *Dominic*, p. 288.
31. Cowdrey, *Pope*, p. 39.
32. See Owen J. Blum, "The Monitor of the Popes: St. Peter Damian," *Studia Gregoriana* 2 (1947): 459–476.
33. Reginald Ladner, "The Plight of Preaching in the Twelfth Century," in Mandonnet, *Dominic*, pp. 120–37.
34. Blum, "Monitor," 459.
35. Blum, *St. Peter Damian: His Teaching on the Spiritual Life* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1947), p. 15; see L 82, 86, 90, 91, 95, 106, 119, 126, and 160.
36. John Wang, "St. Peter Damian the Monk." Ph.D. diss., Fordham University, 1957," p. 192.
37. Lester K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978), p. 107.
38. *The Rule of Raymond de Puy*, appendix E, in Jonathan Riley-Smith, *The Knights of St. John in Jerusalem and Cyprus c. 1050–1310* (London: Macmillan, 1967), pp. 54–55.
39. Jules Piquet, *Les Templiers* (Paris: Hachette, 1939).
40. Humbert of Romans, cited in Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 118.
41. Cited in Lester Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978), p. 107.

42. See references in Carolyn Walker Bynum, *Docere Verbo et Exemplo*, (Missoula, MT: Scholors Press, 1979), pp. 77, 93.
43. See Mandonnet, *Dominic*, 267 n. 25 and Chenu, *Nature*, p. 216.
44. Mandonnet, *Dominic*, p. 268.
45. In 440 Gaudiosus of Abitine may have adopted it for his Naples' monastery. Donatus in Castile and Nanctius in Merida may also have adopted it.
46. Ranft, "Rule."
47. PL 176, 897–898; trans. in Carolyn Walker Bynum, *Docere Verbo et Exemplo* (Missoula, MT: Scholors Press, 1979), p. 42.

5 The Regular Canons (pp. 99–119)

1. When Carolyn Walker Bynum, "The Spirituality of Regular Canons in the Twelfth Century: A New Approach," *Medievalia et humanistica* n.s, 4 (1974): 3–23, discusses canonical spirituality she hints at a theology of work but calls it service.
2. See J. C. Dickenson, *The Origin of the Austin Canons and Their Introduction into England* (London: SPCK, 1950), Carolyn Walker Bynum, *Docere Verbo et Exemplo* (Missoula, MT: Scholar Press, 1979); Charles Dereine, "Chronique: coutumiers et ordinaires de chanoines réguliers," *Scriptorium* 5 (1951): 107–13 and 8 (1959): 244–46; Charles Dereine, "Note sur l'influence de la règle de Gregoire VII pour chanoines réguliers," *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 43 (1948): 512–14; and H. M. Colvin, *The White Canons in England* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1951).
3. Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 26.
4. Mary Pia Heinrich, *The Canonesses and Education in the Early Middle Ages* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1924), p. 1.
5. Rosamond McKitterick, *The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians, 751–987* (London: Longman, 1983), p. 58.
6. See MGH Cap. 1, no. 14, c.11, 35, cited in *ibid*, p. 110.
7. *Ibid.*, pp. 111–112.
8. *Ibid.*, p. 279.
9. *Codex diplomaticus ordinis sancti Rufi*, ed. U. Chevalier (Valence, 1891), GC, Nov. 7, 37 (n. 127), pp. 1–4; cited in Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 28.
10. Cited in *ibid*.
11. Mandonnet, *St. Dominic* p. 242.
12. *Codex Vaticanus Ottobonianus*, 38 ff, 223v–226v; in Jean Mabillon, *Annales Ordines S. Benedicti*, ed. A. Werminghoff, no.7, pp. 661–675, trans. in Mandonnet, *St. Dominic*, p. 259.
13. Mabillon, *Annales*, pp. 670–671.
14. *Ibid.*, p. 671; in Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 31.
15. *Ibid.*, p. 670, in *ibid.*, p. 31.n.2.
16. *Ibid.*, in Federick Cowdrey, *Pope Gregory VII, 1073–85* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), p. 46.

17. See Dickinson, *Origins*.
18. See Dickinson, *Origins*, pp 163–98, and Bynum, *Docere*.
19. Bynum, *Docere*, p. 195.
20. *Ibid.*
21. Ranft *A Woman's Way: The Forgotten History of Women Spiritual Directors* (New York: Palgrave, 2000), pp. 1–8.
22. Bynum, *Docere*, p. 35.
23. *Expositio in regulam beati Augustini*, PL 176, 897–98, trans. in *ibid.*, p. 42.
24. *Regula canonicorum*, MS Ottoboni Lat. 175 (fols. 1–70), S.G. 6.184–85, in *ibid.*, pp. 37–38.
25. [Peter of Porto], *Regula clericorum*, PL 163, 709, in *ibid.*, p. 38.
26. *Ibid.*, PL 163, 717, in *ibid.*
27. PL 203, 748, in *ibid.*, p. 50.
28. PL 203, 690, in *ibid.*
29. PL 203, 669–70, in *ibid.*, p. 53.
30. PL 203, 756, in *ibid.*
31. Odo of St. Victor, *Epistolae de observantia canonicae professionis recte praestanda*, PL 196, 1406–08, in *ibid.*, p. 45.
32. PL 176, 945, in *ibid.*, p. 47.
33. In Marvin L. Colker, “Richard of St. Victor and the Anonymous of Bridlington,” *Traditio* 18 (1962): 214–215, in *ibid.*, p. 62.
34. *Exposition of the Rule of St. Augustine*, 127–28, in Bynum, *ibid.*, p. 60.
35. PL 198, 489, in *ibid.*, p. 62.
36. PL 198, 492, in *ibid.*, p. 63.
37. PL 198, 493–94, in *ibid.* Adam of Dryburgh was first a canon, then a Carthusian. He made the transition with his theology intact, thereby providing evidence that the theology of canons regulars and the new orders share this common denominator.
38. Ottoboni ms, *Studi Gregoriani* 6. 181–82, in *ibid.*, p. 36 and comments on p. 87.
39. Ottoboni, section 3, ch. 51, in *ibid.*, p. 37.
40. Trans. in Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 193.
41. *Ibid.*, pp. 186, 193.
42. Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 194.
43. *Ibid.*, pp. 187–92, and Haskins, *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century* (Cleveland, OH: World Publishing, reprints 1967).
44. See Knowles, *Evolution of Medieval Thought* (New York: Vintage Books, 1962), p. 142; and C. Stephen Jaeger, *The Envy of Angels* (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994), pp. 244–68. James Brundage, *Medieval Canon Law* (London: Longman, 1995).
45. Frederick Copleston, *History of Philosophy* (Westminster, MD: Newman Press), vol.6: *Wolff to Kant*, pp. 102–103.
46. Achard, Sermon on St. Augustine, *Works*, trans. Hugh Feiss (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 2001): 4–5.
47. PL 203, 670: “Unde paulo superiorius libet repetere, et de prioribus sacerdotibus aliquid dicere, ut quam necessaria fuerit hujus sacerdotis electio

- videatur, cum in gentibus multi praecesserint, quorum utilitas vel non tant, vel nulla penitus.”
48. *De questionibus*, 8, in *ibid.*, p. 56.
 49. *De institutione*, 14, PL 176, 945, in *ibid.*, p. 47.
 50. Philip of Havrengt, *De silentio*, 1, PL 203, 945–46, in *ibid.*, pp. 51–52.
 51. *Ibid.*, PL 203, 964–66; 828–29, in *ibid.*, p. 52.
 52. PL 198, 457–60, in *ibid.*, p. 61.
 53. PL 198, 557 (“utilitatibus sermonis”). PL 492 (“opus efficax et utile”); and 554.
 54. PL 176, 932–33. “Sanctorum quippe opera quae quantum ad existimationem hominum non ad dignitatem, sed ad utilitatem pertinent.”
 55. Hugh of St. Victor, *De arca Noe morali*, 2.6, in PL 176, 640: “Si autem operam dederō non tantum ut sciam, sed etiam ut agam quae bona sunt et utilia, et in hoc sedula fuerit cogitatio cordis mei, quatenus virtutes, quas in aliis jam amare, et admirari didici, meas faciam per exercitium disciplinae et formam recte vivendi, tunc possum dicere, quod utilis sit cogitatio cordis mei, et tunc ascendi in secundam mansionem, et cor meum in unum, jam magis collegi, ut non discurrat per ea quae vana sunt, et ad utilitatem non pertinent.” Trans. in Jaeger, *Envy* p. 259.
 56. P. Pourrat, *Christian Spirituality* (London, 1924), p. ii and Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 190.
 57. PL 171, 141–43, in Dickinson, *Origins*, pp. 190–91.
 58. See Little, *Religious Poverty*, pp. 99–112 for an example; R. W. Southern, *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages* (London: Penguin, 1970), pp. 241–42, at least hints at its importance. See Dickinson, *Origins*, p. 68; Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 103; and Mandonnet, *St. Dominic*, p. 285.
 59. Knowles, *Evolution*, p. 32.
 60. Monasteries in Naples, Castile, and Merida possibly used the Rule. The rules of Caesarius of Arles, St. Stephen and St. Paul, Leander of Seville, and Cassidorus show some acquaintance with the Augustinian Rule.
 61. Heinrich, *Canonesses and Education*, p. 15.
 62. Aubrey Gwynn, *The English Austin Friars in the Time of Wyclif* (London: Oxford University Press, 1940), pp. 8–9.
 63. Heinrich, *Canonesses*, p. 16. A letter of protection issued in 1182 by Pope Lucius III supports this contention.
 64. *Ibid.*, p. 18.
 65. Pierre Hélyot, *Histoire des ordres monastique religieux et militaires et des Congregations seculieres* (Paris: Nicolas Gosselin, 1714), 2:61, repeated the tradition claiming that Pope Gelasius endorsed their use of the Rule in 440.
 66. See Jacques de Vitry: “This stream, that is, regular life, which watered all of Egypt, or the whole universe, rising in the place of delight, namely, the primitive church, among the faithful who had but one heart and one soul and called nothing they possessed their own, flowed thence from this place of pleasure, and reached even to the blessed Augustine. He himself began to live according to the Rule instituted by the holy apostle. This stream produced of itself seven tributaries, or seven congregations of canons which

possess the same Rule and the same basis but have different statutes, the Canons of Prémontré form one of these; the Convent of Grandmont another; the Order of St. Victor, the third; the Order of Ardlaise, the fourth the Order of Val-des-Écoliers, the fifth; the Order of Val-des-Choux, the sixth; the Order of Friars Preachers, the seventh. . . . The stream from which these tributaries flowed is the Order of White Canons who wear linen and furs, use wine and meat, as they say Blessed Augustine and his clerics did. . . . "In Mandonnet, *St. Dominic*, pp. 285–86.

67. PL 162, 1073. This discussion on the Rule of St. Augustine was first published in my "The Rule of St. Augustine in Medieval Monasticism," *Proceedings of the PMR Conference* 11 (1986): 143–50.
68. PL 150, 928–29. See also Letter 189, *Letters of Peter the Venerable*, 1.436.
69. Charles Radding, *A World Made by Men* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1985).
70. See also Charles Radding, "The Evolution of Medieval Mentalities: A Cognitive-Structural Approach," *American Historical Review* 83:3 (1978): 577–97.
71. Southern, *Western Society*, p. 242.
72. *Les statuts de Prémontré réformés*, in *Early Dominicans: Selected Sources*, ed. Simon Tugwell (New York: Paulist Press, 1982), 5 (pp. 459–61).
73. *Ibid.*, 6, 9.

6 The Cistercians (pp. 121–39)

1. Berman, *Cistercian Evolution*, pp. 2 and 48, offers Louis Lekai, *The Cistercians: Ideals and Reality* (Kent, OH: Kent State University Press, 1977) as a history which accepts Cistercian foundation mythology without a critical eye. See also Berman, "Cistercian Ideals versus Reality: 1134 Reconsidered," *Cîteaux* 39 (1988): 217–30; and Constance Bouchard, *Holy Entrepreneurs* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991).
2. Epistle of Thurstan, Archbishop of York, to William of Corbeil, 3, in M. Basil Pennington, *The Cistercians* (Collegeville, MN: The Liturgical Press, 1992).
3. *Ibid.*, 6, in *ibid.* One should note the concept of utility within the statement.
4. *Ibid.*, 4, in *ibid.*, p. 121.
5. Southern, *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages* (London: Penguin, 1970), pp. 251–52, describes the implications of these choices in reference to Cistercians and canons with great clarity: "The Cistercians thought themselves the only true followers of the Benedictine Rule, and in the name of the Rule set themselves against the tradition and customs of the Benedictine Order; the Augustinian canons found an alternative to the Rule of St. Benedict, but they had no quarrel with Benedictine customs and were content to follow them at a distance."
6. Epistle of Thurstan, 4, in Pennington, *Cistercians*, p. 121.

7. See *ibid.*, 11, in *ibid.*, p. 124.
8. Idung of Prüfening, *Cistercians and Cluniacs. The Case for Cîteaux*, trans. Jeremiah O'Sullivan (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1977), 1:5.
9. *Ibid.*, *Dialogue* 2:4.
10. *Ibid.*, 2:50.
11. *Ibid.*, 2:6 and 2:22.
12. *Ibid.*, 2:4.
13. *Ibid.*, 1:47.
14. Gueric of Igny, *Liturgical Sermons*, 2 vols. trans. a monk of Mt. St. Bernard (Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1970), sermon 5.1. Henceforth Gueric's sermons will be cited in text.
15. Baldwin of Ford, *Spiritual Tractates*, 2 vols., trans. David Bell (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1986), 5. Henceforth Baldwin's tracts will be cited in text. See also Constable, *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), p. 324.
16. Many of the definitions imply a state of unchangeableness (when one sleeps, one changes little), but none I examined actually employ the word *unchangeable* as part of their definition of rest. Gueric also juxtaposes *operans* and *laborans* in Tract Five. "If we think about the course of time from the beginning, it is found that God at one time works but does not labor [*operans et non laborans*]; at another time labors but does not work [*laborans et non operans*]; and sometimes he works by laboring and labors by working. In the creation of the world God was working not laboring, and on the seventh day He rests not from labor but from work. In this he set an example for humans, of how before sin he worked without labor and afterwards rested." PL 204, 442.
17. Isaac of Stella, *Sermons on the Christian Year*, 2 vols., trans. Hugh McCaffery, intro. Bernard McGinn (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1979), 23.13. Henceforth, Isaac's sermons will be cited in text.
18. Bernard McGinn, Introduction, *ibid.*, p. xxi.
19. See, for example, Bruce Vawter, "Gospel according to John," 114, in *Jerome Biblical Commentary*, ed. Raymond Brown, Joseph Fitzmyer, and Roland Murphy (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1968), 63:443; and *The Navarre Bible: Saint John's Gospel*, ed. J. Casciaro, trans. Brian McCarthy (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1987), p. 134.
20. PL 194, 1774: "Cor enim quod tranquillum non est, serenum esse nullatenus potest. . ."
21. *Ibid.*, 17.8 (1:141). PL 194, 1746: "et in die laboris, sudorisque sui, collaborare, et consudare, compati quoque, ac conrucifigi."
22. Bernard of Clairvaux, *Sermons on Conversion*, trans. Marie-Bernard Said (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981), 8.17.
23. *Ibid.*, 13.20.
24. *Ibid.*, 21.37–38.
25. *Ibid.*, 15.1.
26. *Ibid.*, 8.16.

27. Bernard of Clairvaux, *Sermons on Conversion*, 10.20. Baldwin of Ford, Tract 9.3, writes at length about the evil incurred by the omission of work. "But [think of what we have lost] in ourselves! How many good deeds we have stolen from ourselves! How many good deeds we could have done but did not do! How many years we have wasted in vain! Countless days have passed away when we did evil or did nothing, and they have dragged us along with the, sliding ever downwards."
28. Bernard of Clairvaux, *The Letters of St. Bernard of Clairvaux*, trans. Bruno Scott James (Chicago, IL: Henry Regnery, 1953), letter 105.
29. PL 182, 883. Bernard's works are so voluminous and are written for so many different purposes that it is beyond the scope of this study to synthesize his comments on work into a coherent theology. For example, in *De consideratione*, he wrote about the dangers of too much work, too much emphasis on action. His guidance here addresses the specific situation and Bernard's call for less work was a solution to that problem. On the other hand, Bernard's *In Praise of the New Knighthood* emphasizes the good that is begotten from the temporal labor of the knights. Cf. Thomas Merton, *The Last of the Fathers* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1954), pp. 47–67.
30. Aelred, *Speculum caritatis* 1.9, in *Aelredi Rievallensis Opera omnia*, 1, ed. A. Hoste and C. Talbot (Turnhout: Brepols, 1961), 16.
31. Trans. in M. B. Pennington, "Third Sermon for Feast of St. Benedict," *Cistercian Studies* 4 (1969): 85.
32. *The Life of Aelred of Rievaulx*, ed. F. M. Powicke (New York: Oxford University Press, 1951), p. 22.
33. Gilbert of Hoyland, *Sermons on the Song of Songs*, 3 vols. trans. Lawrence Braceland (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1979), sermon 23.4.
34. *Ibid.*, 23.2.
35. *Ibid.*, 23.3.
36. See Berman's "Medieval Agriculture, the Southern Countryside and the Early Cistercians," *Transactions of the American Philosophical Society* 76:5 (1986); Janet Burton, *Monastic and Religious Orders in Britain 1000–1300* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), p. 71; George Zarnecki, *The Monastic Achievement* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1972), p. 70; Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 93; and Southern, *Western Society*, p. 269, who calls the Cistercian organization "the first effective international organization in Europe" (p. 255).
37. Bouchard, *Holy Entrepreneurs*, p. 3.
38. *Ibid.*, p. 187.
39. Martha Newman, *The Boundaries of Charity* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996).
40. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," points out that this is the disadvantage of a celibate work force; it does not reproduce itself.
41. James France, *The Cistercians in Scandinavia* (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1992), pp. 255–258.
42. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 31.

43. Newman, *Boundaries*, p. 73.
44. David Williams, *The Cistercians in the Early Middle Ages* (Leominster: Fowler Wright Books, 1998), p. 346.
45. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 96; and France, *Cistercians*, pp. 278, 280–84.
46. Williams, *Cistercians*, pp. 367–370.
47. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," pp. 96–97.
48. Little, *Religious Poverty, and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978) p. 93.
49. James Madden, "Business Monks, Banker Monks, Bankrupt Monks: The English Cistercians in the Thirteenth Century," *Catholic Historical Review* 49 (1963–1964): 341–364.
50. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 104.
51. Williams, *Cistercians*, pp. 370–71.
52. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 121–24; and Williams, *Cistercians*, pp. 389–92; quote in Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 124.
53. Williams, *Cistercians*, pp. 387–88.
54. Berman, "Medieval Agriculture," 121.

7 Carthusians, Women, and Marginal Groups (pp. 141–68)

1. Guigo II, *The Ladder of Monks*, trans. Edmund Colledge and James Walsh (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981), 67–68. We must remember that "active" and "contemplative" are modern labels unknown to the reformers. All religious considered themselves contemplatives.
2. PL 153, 703–708. See also *Guigues I coutumes de Chartreuse*, trans. anonymous Carthusian (Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1984) and *Consuetudines*, 28.4, cited in A. Gordon Mursell, "The Theology of the Carthusian Life in the Writings of St. Bruno and Guigo I" *Analecta Cartusiana* 127 (1988): 201.
3. *Consuetudines* 28.3–4, cited in Mursell, "Theology," 199.
4. Mursell, "Theology," 203, 206.
5. *Ibid.*, 201.
6. *Consuetudines* 29.3, in *ibid.*
7. Bruno of Cologne, cited in Mursell, "Theology," 196. *Otium negotiosim*, working leisure, is the opposite of *otium iners*, passive leisure.
8. William of St. Thierry, *The Golden Epistle of Abbott William of St. Thierry*, trans. Walter Shewring (Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1960), 1:22.82.
9. Guigo I, *The "Meditations" of Guigo I*, trans. A. Gordon Mursell (Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1995), p. 74.
10. William of St. Thierry, *Golden Epistle*, 8:21. He adds: "For the greatest evil which can befall the mind is unemployed leisure."
11. Guigo I, *The "Meditations,"* 370: "tota et sola utilitas est humanae naturae."
12. *Ibid.*, 308.
13. Mursell, "Theology," 46–47.

14. Guigo II, *Ladder*, meditation 5.
15. “*The Meditations*,” 106 (p.85).
16. *Ibid.*, 417.
17. *Ibid.*, 106.
18. See Ranft, *Women and Religious Life in Premodern Europe* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1998), pp. 45–77.
19. Trans. in Janet Summers, “‘The Violent Shall Take by Force’: The First Century of Cistercian Nuns,” 1125–28,” Ph.D. diss., University of Chicago, 1986, pp. 125–26.
20. This is not to imply that women did not leave documentation or participate in theological debates; they did. See my *Women in Western Intellectual Tradition, 600–1500* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002), for this history.
21. See Rupert of Deutz, *Super quaedam capitula regulae divi Benedicti abbot*, PL 170,517–22. See analysis in John van Engen, *Rupert of Deutz* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1983).
22. Theodoric of Echternach, *The Life of Hildegard*, 2:2, in *Jutta and Hildegard: The Biographical Sources*, trans. Anna Silvas (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999), p. 158.
23. *The Life of Jutta*, 4–6, in *Jutta and Hildegard*, p. 71–74.
24. I have not come across a similar claim in any source. One should note that the claim does not come after describing a spoiled, upper class life, but it is made concerning a woman who spent her life working with “unrelenting effort” over a long period of time.
25. *Ancrene Wisse*, Part 8, *The Outer Rule*, in *Anchorite Spirituality: Ancrene Wisse and Associated Works*, trans. Anne Savage and Nicholas Watson (New York: Paulist Press, 1991), p. 203.
26. *Ibid.*, p. 201.
27. Aelred of Rievaulx, *Rule of Life for a Recluse*, 1:4, in *The Works of Aelred of Rievaulx*, vol. 1: *Treatises: The Pastoral Prayers*, trans. M. P. Macpherson (Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1971), pp. 49–50.
28. See Richard Southern, *The Making of the Middle Ages* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1978), pp. 234–37. For a more recent assessment see Celia Chazelle, *The Crucified God in the Carolingian Era* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
29. Anselm, *Cur Deus homo?*, 1:3–7, in *St. Anselm Basic Writings* trans. S. N. Deane, 2d ed. (LaSalle, IL: Open Court, 1968), pp. 182–87.
30. She does retain the imagery of cosmic war in some of her letters. See Peter Dronke, *Women Writers of the Middle Ages* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), p. 184.
31. *Hildegard of Bingen: Scivias*, trans. M. Columba Hart and Jane Bishop (New York: Paulist Press, 1990), 2:6.100–102.
32. *Ibid.*, 3:1, Prologue.
33. *Ibid.*, 1:2.27–28.
34. *Ibid.*, 3:4.1.

35. *Scivias*, 3:8. In regards to work's originality, one should note that the other manuscript that is often dubbed most original is Herrad of Hohenburg's *Hortus deliciarum*. That two women's communities produced such original work is worthy of more attention by art historians. See my *Women and Spiritual Equality in Christian Tradition* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998), p. 171.
36. *Ibid.*, 3:8.13.
37. Jeffrey Schnapp, "Virgin Words: Hildegard of Bingen's *Lingua Ignota* and the Development of Imaginary Languages Ancient to Modern," *Exemplaria* 3:2 (1991): 278–87.
38. *Causae et curae*, ed. Paul Kaiser (Leipzig: Teubner, 1903), p. 65, cited in Heinrich Schipperges, *Hildegard of Bingen: Healing and the Nature of the Cosmos*, trans. J. Broadwin (Princeton, NJ: Markus Wiener, 1997), p. 10.
39. Newman, *Sister*, p. 19. Newman uses the title found in the earliest manuscript, *De operatione Dei*. However, *Liber divinorum operum* is the title in most other manuscripts.
40. *Scivias*, 1.2.27.
41. Preface, *Physica*, PL 197, 1125.
42. Hildegard of Bingen, *Book of the Rewards of Life*, trans. Bruce W. Hozeski (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), 1:118.136.
43. *Ibid.*, 6:17.18.
44. *Ibid.*, 1:40.52; 4:7.11.
45. *Ibid.*, 3:36.44.
46. *Ibid.*, 4:59.76
47. Letter 84r, in *The Letters of Hildegard of Bingen*, 2 vols., trans. Joseph Baird and Radd Ehrman (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), 1:188–89.
48. *Book of Rewards*, 4:9.14.
49. *Scivias*, 3.10.2.
50. *Book of Rewards*, 3:22.30.
51. *Ibid.*, 1.40.52.
52. *Ibid.*, 1.3.28.
53. Letter 188r, in *Letters*, 2:153–54.
54. *Book of Rewards*, 6:17.18.
55. *Ibid.*, 4:59.76.
56. *Ibid.*, 3:22–23, 30–31.
57. *Ibid.*, 4:8.12.
58. *Ibid.*, 4:59.76.
59. *Ibid.*, 3:31.39.
60. Letter 31r in *Letters*, 1:96.
61. *Ibid.*, 1:98.
62. *Book of Rewards*, 4:30. 40–41. See also 4:7.11 and 4:54–56. 70–71.
63. *Ibid.*, 4:59.76.
64. *Ibid.*, 4:30.40.
65. Letter 84r, in *Letters*, 1:188.

66. *Book of Rewards*, 5:3.4.
67. *Ibid.*, 5:75.94.
68. *Causae*, 41–45, in Dronke, *Women Writers*, p. 243.
69. *Scivias*, 1.4.21.
70. *Causae*, 104; Dronke, *Women Writers*, pp. 176, 244.
71. *Causae*, pp. 55–56, 18, in Marcia Chamberlain, “Hildegard of Bingen’s *Causes and Cures*: A Radical Feminist Response to the Doctor-Cook Binary” in *Hildegard of Bingen: A Book of Essays*, ed. Maud Burnett McNerney (New York: Garland, 1998), pp. 64–65.
72. Letter 155r, in *Letters*, 2:100.
73. Letter 156r, in *ibid.*, 2:103.
74. See my *A Woman’s Way* (New York: Palgrave, 2000), pp. 74–79.
75. *Scivias*, 3.1.7–8, in *Hildegard*, pp. 314–15.
76. Trans. in Newman, *Sister*, p. 96.
77. *Scivias*, 1.2.12 in *Hildegard*, p. 78.
78. *Ibid.*, 3.2.23 in *ibid.*, p. 337.
79. *Ibid.*, 1.2.29 in *ibid.*, p. 87.
80. *Book of Rewards*, 4.20.28.
81. See Patricia Cricco, “Witness and the Twelfth-Century Monastic Renewal,” masters’ thesis, West Virginia University, 1976; and Patricia Cricco, “Monasticism and Its Role as a Liminal Community in Medieval Society,” Ph.D. diss. West Virginia University, 1981.
82. Herbert Grundmann, *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages*, trans. Steven Rowan (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995), pp. 14–15. Another term for Cathars was *rustici*. In *Book of Rewards*, 4:7.11 Hildegard condemns nonworkers by calling them *rustici*: “For a worker who does not do the work he is capable of doing and who forsakes his craft and does not practice it will become a rustic.”
83. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978), p. 125.
84. See Brenda Bolton, “Innocent III’s Treatment of the Humiliati,” *Studies in Church History* 8 (1972): 73–82; and Brenda Bolton, “Sources for the Early History of the Humiliati,” *ibid.*, 11 (1975): 125–133.
85. Humbert, “Sermo ad sorores” in L. Zanoni, *Gli Umiliati nei loro rapporti con l’eresia, l’industria della lana ed i comuni nei secoli xii e xiii* (repr.: Roma: Multigrafica, 1970), pp. 261–63.
86. *Omni boni propositium*, 16, 17, and 18, cited in Frances Andrews, *The Early Humiliati* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p. 115.
87. L. Paolini, “Le Umiliati al lavoro. Appunti fra storiografia e storia,” *Bullettino dell’ Istituto storico speciale per archivisti e bibliotecari dell’ università di Roma* 2:2 (1962), 262–63.
88. *Omni*, 26, in Andrews, *Early Humiliati*, p. 117.
89. Grundman, *Religious Movements*, p. 35.
90. Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 119.
91. Andrews, *Early Humiliati*, pp. 248–49.

92. Steven Epstein, *Wage, Labour and Guilds in Medieval Europe* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina, 1991), p. 93.
93. Sally Brasher, *Women of the Humiliati* (New York: Routledge, 2003), p. 111.
94. *Letres de Jacques de Vitry*, ed. R. B. C. Huygens (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1960), p. 73.
95. Cited in Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 119; and Brasher, *Women of the Humiliati*, p. 111.
96. Paolini, *Le Umiliati*, p. 262.
97. Brasher, *Women of the Humiliati*, p. 113.
98. Jacques de Vitry, *Sermo ad virgines*, ed. Joseph Greven, *Historisches Jahrbuch* 35 (1914): 44.
99. Cited in Bolton, "Some Thirteenth Century Women in the Low Countries," *Nederlands archief voor kerkgeschiedenis* 61:1 (1981): 7–8.
100. Jacques de Vitry, *Sermo*, 44.
101. Jacques de Vitry, *Life of Marie D'Oignies*, trans. Margot King (Toronto: Peregrina Publishing, 1993), Prologue 4.
102. *Ibid.*, Prologue 1.
103. *Ibid.*, Prologue 9.
104. *Ibid.*, and 10.
105. *Ibid.*, Prologue 2.
106. *Ibid.*, Prologues 3 and 4.
107. *Ibid.*, Bk.1.11a.
108. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:12.
109. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:13.
110. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:15.
111. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:14.
112. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:24.
113. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:40.
114. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:38.
115. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:38.
116. Anonymous, *History of the Foundation of the Venerable Church of Bl. Nicholas of Oignies and the Handmaid of Christ Marie d'Oignies*, in *Supplement to The Life of Marie d'Oignes by Thomas de Cantimpré*, trans. Hugh Feiss (Saskatoon: Peregrina Publishing, 1987), p. 7.
117. Jacques de Vitry, *Life of Marie*, Bk 2:45.
118. *The Life of Juliana of Mont-Cornillon (1192–1258)*, trans. Barbara Newman (Toronto: Peregrina Publishing, 1989), Bk 1:5 (p. 38).
119. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:14.
120. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:7–8.
121. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:6.
122. *Ibid.*, prologue.
123. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:14.
124. *Ibid.*
125. *Ibid.*, Bk 1:17 for Cistercians; Bk 1:22, 1:23, 1:28–30, for Eve the recluse; and Bk 1:24, Bk 1:8, and 1:32 for laity.
126. *Ibid.*, Bk 2:2.

127. *Alice the Leper, ch. 2*, in *Lives of Ida of Nivelles, Lutgard and Alice the Leper*, trans. Martinus Cawley (Lafayette, OR: Our Lady of Guadalupe Abbey, 1987), p. 3.
128. *Ibid.*, 6.
129. *Ibid.*, 5.
130. *Ibid.*
131. *Ibid.*, 7.
132. See Dayton Phillips, "Beguiues in Medieval Strasburg: A Study of the Social Aspects of Beguine Life," Ph.D. diss., Stanford University, 1941, p. 21 and throughout.
133. *Hadewijch: The Complete Works*, trans. M. Columba Hart (New York: Paulist Press, 1980), letter 6, p. 58.
134. *Ibid.*, letter 13, pp. 75–76.
135. *Ibid.*, letter 6, p. 59.
136. Mechthild of Magdeburg, *The Flowing Light of the Godhead*, trans. Frank Tobin (New York: Paulist Press, 1998), 3.9.
137. *Ibid.*, 7.1.
138. *Ibid.*, 7.32.
139. *Ibid.*, 7.7.
140. *Gertrude of Helfta: The Herald of Divine Love*, trans. Margaret Winkworth (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 3.32. Book 3 was probably dictated in part by Gertrude and supplemented by another Helfta woman.
141. *Ibid.*, 3.68.
142. *Ibid.*

8 The Mendicants (pp. 169–89)

1. Francis of Assisi, "A Letter to the Whole Order," 8–9, in *Francis and Clare: The Complete Works*, trans. Regis Armstrong and Ignatius Brady (New York: Paulist Press, 1982), p. 56.
2. Bonaventure, *Major Life of St. Francis*, trans. Benen Faley, preface, 1, in *St. Francis of Assisi: Writings and Early Biographies*, ed. Marion A. Habig, 4th rev. ed. (Chicago, IL: Franciscan Herald Press, 1983), p. 631.
3. Thomas of Celano, *First Life of St. Francis*, ed. in *Analecta Franciscana X* (Quaracchi, 1926–1941), no. 37, trans. in Rosalind Brooke, *The Coming of the Friars* (London: G. Allen and Unwin, 1975), p. 128.
4. Cited in Pierre Mandonnet, *St. Dominic, and His Work*, trans. Mary Larkin (St. Louis, MO: B. Herder Book Company, 1994), pp. 72–74.
5. Peter of Rheims, "Sermon on Evangelists," in *Early Dominicans: Selected Writings*, ed. Simon Tugwell (New York: Panlist Press), p. 148.
6. *Lettres de Jacques de Vitry*, ed. R.B.C. Hagens (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1960), esp. 6 (pp. 131–132), in Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1979), p. 160.
7. Clare, *Testament*, 22, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 232; and *Blessing*, 8–9, in *ibid.*, p. 234.

8. 3rd letter to Agnes, 13, in *ibid.*, p. 200.
9. 3rd letter to Agnes, 4, in *ibid.*, p. 199. The phrase is scriptural and is rooted in 1 Pt 2:21. Other references are found in 2nd letter, 7, *ibid.*, p. 195; 3rd letter, 25, *ibid.*, p. 201; *Rule*, 2, *ibid.*, p. 210; and *Testament*, 10, *ibid.*, p. 229. The phrase is also found in Pope Gregory IX's *Privilege of Poverty*, granted to Clare in 1228. See discussion of Clare's *imitatio Christi* in my "An Overturned Victory: Clare of Assisi and the Thirteenth Century Church," *Journal of Medieval History* 17 (1991): 123–24. Interestingly, Thomas of Celano does not mention Clare's allegiance to *imitatio Christi*. Instead, he substitutes *imitatio Mariae*, for which there is no documentation.
10. Clare, *Testament*, 6, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 228.
11. "Bull of Canonization of the Virgin St. Clare," in Nesta de Robeck, *St. Clare of Assisi* (Milwaukee: Bruce Publishing, 1951), appendix 5, pp. 231–32, 233.
12. P. Robinson, *The Rule of St. Clare* (Philadelphia, PA: Dolphin Press, 1912), p. 12.
13. R. B. Brooke, *Early Franciscan Government* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1959), p. 71, and *Francis and Clare*, p. 209.
14. 3rd letter to Agnes, 8, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 200.
15. Clare, *Testament*, 18, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 231.
16. Although both Francis and Clare discuss work in chapter 7 of their rules, and both use the phrase "manner of working," the contents make it clear that Clare's regulations were of her design.
17. *Rule of Saint Clare*, 7.1–3, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 219.
18. *Legenda sanctae Clarae virginis: tratta del ms. 338 della Bibbl. comunale di Assisi*, ed. F. Pennachi (Assisi, 1910), p. 6. The history of the order is reconstructed in Ranft, "Overturned Victory."
19. *Lettres de Jacques de Vitry*, pp. 75–76. This passage is key to Franciscan and women's history. See my "Overturned Victory," 124–25, for discussion of how past errors in translation have altered our understanding of *sorores minores* significantly. "Sorores minores" is repeatedly omitted from the original text and the phrase is translated simply as " 'brothers minor,' as they are called."
20. *Regula*, 6.2, in *Seraphicae legislationis textus originales*, ed. Quaracchi Franciscans (Quaracchi: Collegium S. Bonaventurae, 1897).
21. Witness 2, 1, in *Cause of Canonization*, in Nesta de Robeck, *St. Clare of Assisi* (Milwaukee, WI: Bruce Publishing, 1951), appendix 4, p. 186.
22. Witness 5, *ibid.*, p. 202.
23. Witness 1, 12, *ibid.*, p. 184.
24. Witness 2, 3, *ibid.*, p. 187.
25. Witness 3, 9 *ibid.*, p. 193. See also witness 2,3, *ibid.*, p. 187.
26. Witness 1, 1, *ibid.*, p. 182.
27. Witness 6, 14, *ibid.*, p. 205.
28. Witness 9, 9 *ibid.*, p. 212.
29. Witness 1, 11, *ibid.*, p. 184.
30. *Bull of Canonization*, *ibid.*, p. 234.

31. "Letter to the Rulers of the Peoples," 2–3, 8, in *Francis and Clare*, pp. 77–78.
32. *Admonitions*, 6.1–2, in *ibid.*, p. 29.
33. "Letter to the Entire Order," 8, in *ibid.*, p. 56.
34. *Testament*, 14–15; 19–22, in *ibid.*, pp. 154–55.
35. *Earlier Rule of Francis*, 7.3–9, in *ibid.*, p. 115.
36. *Ibid.*, 1–2, in *ibid.*
37. *Later Rule of Francis*, 5.3–4, in *ibid.*, p. 140.
38. *Rule of St. Clare*, 6.4–5, in *ibid.*, p. 219.
39. *Later Rule*, 4.1–3, in *ibid.*, p. 140.
40. Thomas of Celano, *First Life of St. Francis*, in *Saint Francis of Assisi*, trans. Placid Hermann (Chicago: Franciscan Herald Press, 1963), p. 3.
41. *Ibid.*, 4.8–9.
42. Letter 96, in *Letters*, 5:65.
43. Bonaventure, *Major Life*, I: 7.5, in *St. Francis*, ed. Habig, p. 683.
44. Thomas of Celano, *First Life*, 8.18, in *Medieval Popular Religion*, ed. Skinner, p. 50.
45. Bonaventure, *Major Life*, I:1, in *St. Francis*, ed. Habig, p. 631.
46. *Ibid.*, I:2, in *ibid.*, p. 632.
47. *Ibid.*, I:1.1, in *ibid.*, p. 635.
48. *Ibid.*, I:1.4, in *ibid.*, p. 638.
49. *Ibid.*, I:1.5, in *ibid.*, p. 639.
50. *Ibid.*, I:1.7, in *ibid.*, pp. 644–45.
51. *Ibid.*, I:i.8, in *ibid.*, pp. 645–46.
52. *Ibid.*, I:3.10, in *ibid.*, p. 653.
53. *Ibid.*, I:4.3, in *ibid.*, p. 654.
54. *Ibid.*, I:4.6, in *ibid.*, p. 657.
55. *Rule for the Franciscan Third Order*, 11, in *Medieval Popular Religion*, ed. John Skinner (Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1997), p. 295.
56. Barbara Hanawalt, *Ties That Bound* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986).
57. Bonaventure, *Major Life*, I. 4.7, in *St. Francis*, ed. Habig, p. 657.
58. *Ibid.*, I:7.1–2, in *ibid.*, pp. 680–81.
59. *St. Francis*, ed. Habig, pp. 1549–96.
60. Bonaventure, *Major Life*, I:7.6 in *ibid.*, p. 683.
61. *Ibid.*, I:7.7, in *ibid.*, p. 684.
62. *Ibid.*, I:7.9, in *ibid.*, p. 686.
63. *Defense of the Mendicants*, 7.20–21, in *The Works of Bonaventure*, 5 vols., trans. José de Vinck (Paterson, NJ: St. Anthony Guild, 1960–1970), 4:144–45.
64. Bonaventure, *Major Life*, I:5.6 in *St. Francis*, ed. Habig, p. 666.
65. James Doyne Dawson, "William of Saint Amour and the Apostolic Tradition," *Mediaeval Studies* 70 (1978): 229.
66. In *Opuscula Omnia*, ed. Pierre Mandonnet (Paris: Lethielleux, 1927), pp. 1–195.

67. Thomas Aquinas, *Summa contra Gentiles*, trans. Vernon Burke (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975), Bk 3: Part II, ch. 132: 2, 6, 9, and 17, respectively.
68. *Ibid.*, ch.135:2.
69. *Ibid.*, ch.135:4 and 7, respectively.
70. *Ibid.*, ch.135:8.
71. *Ibid.*, ch.135:12.
72. *Ibid.*, ch.135:11.
73. *Ibid.*, ch.135:13.
74. *Summa theologica*, trans. Fathers of the English Dominican Province (Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, repr. 1981) Part 1, q.73, art. 2.
75. Epstein, *Wage*, p. 177.
76. Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay, *Hystoria Albigensis*, in Little, *Religious Poverty*, p. 153.
77. Jordan of Saxony, *Libellus de principiis ordinis praedicatorum*, ed. H. C. Scheeben (Dublin: Dominican Publishers, 1982).
78. *Dominican Constitutions* (1228), Prologue, in *Early Dominicans: Selected Writings*, p. 457.
79. *Ibid.*, 31, in *ibid.*, p. 467.
80. *Ibid.*, 20, in *ibid.* Not all Dominicans were automatically preachers; some had other work assigned to them.
81. *Ibid.*
82. Robert Kilwardby, "Letter to Dominican novices," in *Early Dominicans*, p. 149.
83. *Ibid.*, p. 150.
84. *Ibid.*, p. 151. He continues: "So, if anyone is to boast, it should be people who reckon that they excel in poverty because of their more sparing and temperate use of things."
85. *Statute of the Congregation of St. Dominic*, Bologna (1244), in *ibid.*, p. 433.
86. *Ibid.*, p. 435.
87. *New Statutes of the Congregation of Our Lady*, 1, Arrezzo (1262), in *ibid.*, pp. 436–37.
88. *Ibid.*, 6, in *ibid.*, p. 440.
89. *Ibid.*, 3, in *ibid.*, p. 438.
90. *Ibid.*, 14, in *ibid.*, p. 445.
91. *Ibid.*, 12, in *ibid.*, p. 444.
92. *Ibid.*, 22, in *ibid.*, p. 449.
93. *Ibid.*, 25, in *ibid.*, p. 450.
94. Humbert of Romans, *Treatise on the Formation of Preachers*, Prologue, in *Early Dominicans*, p. 183. Hereafter cited in text.
95. *Early Dominicans*, pp. 181–82.
96. "Sermon for Different Kinds of Audience" ch. 32: "Laybrothers of the Order of Preachers," 2, in *ibid.*, p. 326.
97. *Ibid.*, 3, in *ibid.*, p. 327.
98. *Ibid.*, 4, in *ibid.*
99. *Ibid.*, ch. 94: "For Women in General," 10, in *ibid.*, p. 331.

9 Epilogue (pp. 191–201)

1. See André Vauchez, “Lay People’s Sanctity in Western Europe: Evolution of a Pattern (Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries),” 21–32, in *Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe*, eds. R. Blumenfeld-Kosinski and T. Szell (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1990).
2. Francis, *Testament*, 20–22, in *Francis and Clare: The Complete Works*, trans. Regis Armstrong and Ignatius Brady (New York: Panlist Press, 1982) p. 155.
3. Francis, *Later Rule*, 5:1, in *ibid.*, p. 140.
4. Knowles, *The Christian Centuries*, p. vol. 2, *The Middle Ages* (New York: Panlist Press, 1983), p. 346.
5. Francis, *Testament*, 35–38, in *Francis and Clare*, p. 156.
6. James Doyne Dawson, “Richard FitzRalph and the Fourteenth-Century Poverty Controversies,” *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 34:3 (July 1983), 320 [315–44].
7. Bonaventure’s bias is so obvious that even the lay devotional classic *Butler’s Lives of the Saints*, ed. Herbert Thurston and Donald Attwater (Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1981), 3:98, a source which bends over backwards to flatter its subjects, admits that he “can hardly be acquitted of a tendency sometimes to strain his material so as to tell against those who favoured a moderation of the strict Franciscan life.” David Flood, “Franciscans at Work,” *Franciscan Studies* 59 (2001): 60, notes that Thomas of Celano likewise “attributes Francis’ desire to work (*volo laborare*) to Francis’ last two years” instead of a constant throughout his mission. “Whereas Francis’ *Testament* uses the word *laboritium* which comes close enough to wage labor, Thomas of Celano speaks of *pristina servituda*.”
8. Besides their stance on strict adherence to the *Rule* and *Testament*, the Fraticelli also accepted many of the eschatological tenets of Abbot Joachim of Fiore. See. Decima Douie, *The Nature and the Effect of the Heresy of the Fraticelli* (Manchester: University Press, 1932).
9. Petri Iohannis Olivi, *Tractatus de usu paupere*, ms Assisi 677; 2.9, 80vb, 84 vb, cited in David Burr, *Olivi and Franciscan Poverty* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989), p. 191.
10. Maria A. Moisa, “Fourteenth-Century Preachers’ Views of the Poor: Class or Status Group?” in *Culture, Ideology, Politics*, ed. Raphael Samuel and Gareth Jones (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983), p. 166.
11. David Aers, “*Piers Plowman*: Poverty, Work and Community,” in David Aers, *Community, Gender and Individual Identity: English Writing 1360–1430* (London, Routledge, 1983) p. 25.
12. This is the title given chapter twelve in Michael Mollat, *The Poor in the Middle Ages*, trans. Arthus Goldhammer (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1986), pp. 251–93.
13. Mollat, *ibid.*, 233, says “three important points stand out: (1) the number of poor increased between 1350 and 1500; (2) the scene of poverty shifted from the countryside to the cities; and (3) short term difficulties mask the effects of long-term structural change.”

14. Huguccio, *Summa*, cited in Brien Tierney, "The decretists and the 'undeserving poor,'" *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 1 (1958–59): 370.
15. Rufinus, *Sermons on 'Decretum,'* cited in *ibid.*, 369. See also Miri Rubin, *Charity and Community in Medieval Cambridge* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987), p. 69: "Teutonicus stated that: 'the Church need not provide for those who can work. One must take into account wholeness of body and strength of constitution when alms are dispensed.'"
 16. Brian Tierney, *Medieval Poor Law* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1959), p. 119.
 17. Rubin, *Charity*, p. 72.
 18. Cited in Emmanuel LeRoy Ladurie, *Montaillou*, trans. Barbara Bray (New York: Random House, 1979), p. 340. For full discussion of friars and property rights see Virpr Mäkinen, *Property Rights in the Late Medieval Discussion on Franciscan Poverty* (Leuven: Peeters, 2001).
 19. Moisa, "Fourteenth-century preachers," p. 168.
 20. Richard FitzRalph, *De pauperie salvatoris*, Preface, cited in Dawson, "Richard FitzRalph," 330. See Russell Brock, "An Edition of Richard FitzRalph's *De Pauperis Salvatoris*: Books V, VI, VII," Ph.D. diss., University of Colorado, 1953.
 21. Cited in Dawson, "Richard FitzRalph," 330. See also *The Beginning of the Strife between Richard FitzRalph and the Mendicants*, ed. L. L. Hammerich (Kobenhavn: Levin and Munksgaard, 1938), pp. 53–73.
 22. Dawson, "Richard FitzRalph," 330.
 23. Aubrey Gwynn, "Richard Fitz Ralph, Archbishop of Armagh, Pt. VI," *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review of Letters, Philosophy and Science*, 26 (1937): 51–52. During this period Edward III issued a writ to London sheriffs to seize friars' property. See A. G. Little, "A royal inquiry into property held by the mendicant friars in England, 1349 and 1350," in A.G. Little, *Franciscan Papers, Lists and Documents* (Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1945), pp. 144–45.
 24. B. H. Putnam, *The Enforcement of the Statute of Labourers during the First Decade after the Black Death, 1349–1359* (New York: AMS Press, 1970), p. 11.
 25. Aers, "*Piers Plowman*," p. 25, claims that FitzRalph's concept of work "involves an attitude to work more conventionally associated with Protestantism than with medieval Catholicism." I argue that FitzRalph's theology is consistent with Protestantism because both are rooted in medieval Catholicism.
 26. Kate Crassons, "The Workman is Worth his Mede': Poverty, Labor, and Charity in the Sermon of William Taylor," in *The Middle Ages at Work*, ed. Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), p. 95.
 27. *Defensio curatorum*, in *Trevisa's Dialogus*, ed. John Perry, EETS o.s. 167 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1925), p. 71. Also cited in *ibid.*, and Aers, "*Piers Plowman*," pp. 25–26.
 28. *Ibid.*, p. 87. The first four of nine complaints in *Proposicio*, the mendicant response to FitzRalph's criticisms, contain FitzRalph's belief that Christ's witness was contrary to mendicancy.
 29. Crassons, "The Workman,'" p. 95.

30. Similar labor legislation was passed in Venice, Genoa, France, and Spain. See Rubin, *Charity*, p. 32, who says that all these governments passed harsher laws to regulate the poor.
31. Moisa, "Fourteenth-century preachers," 169–70.
32. Lawrence Clopper, "*Songes of Rechelesnesse*": *Langland and the Franciscans* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1997), pp. 82–85.
33. Kelli Robertson, *Laborer's Two Bodies: Literary and Legal productions in Britain, 1350–1500* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), p. 99.
34. *Vita Sacerdotum*, cited in *ibid.*, p. 228 n.76.
35. *Works of a Lollard Preacher*, ed. Anne Hudson, EETS 317 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), II.2766–7 (p. 134), cited in *ibid.*, p. 188. "The Sermon of William Taylor (1406)," in *Two Wycliffite Texts*, ed. Anne Hudson (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993), pp. 3–23, is a good example of how steeped in medieval work theology Lollards were. Here Taylor talks about how important work is from an eschatological point of view and how we will be judged by our works, in ways that Damian wrote. He also talks of rest and creation as Thomas Aquinas and Bonaventure did. See lines 708–755 (pp. 22–23). Taylor also expands upon received tradition, trying at times to redefine the *vita apostolica* in a way that would give more emphasis to work.
36. Epstein, *Wage, Labor, and Guilds in Medieval Europe* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina, 1991), p. 1156.
37. George Ovitt, *The Restoration of Perfection: Labor and Technology in Medieval Culture* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1987), p. 163, and Jacques LeGoff, *Time, Work, and Culture in the Middle Ages*, trans. Arthur Goldhammer (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1980), pp. 114–115, both acknowledge that the church "modified its millennium-old ideal of spiritualized, communal, and inner-directed labor" (Ovitt, *ibid.*), but neither explore how the message of work theology permeated the work place.
38. S. Bernardini Senesis, "Sermo XXXIII, Dominica Quarta in Quadagesima in mane. De mercationibus et artificibus in general, et de conditionibus licitis et illicitis earundem" in *Opera Omnia*, ed. Augustini Sepinski (Quaracchi-Firenze: Ad Claras Aquas, 1956), cap. II (p. 146). For Thomas, see *Summa theologica*, Pt 2–2. q.77, art. 4, respondeo.
39. *Le prediche volgari*, ed. Piero Bargellini (Milan, 1936), cited in Epstein, *Wage*, p. 180.
40. Epstein, *Wage*, p. 156.
41. See Gervase Rosser, "Going to the Fraternity Feast: Commensality and Social Relations in Late Medieval England," *Journal of British Studies* 33 (October 1994): 431–32; and Ben R. McRee, "Religion, Guilds, and Civic Order: The Case of Norwich in the Late Middle Ages," *Speculum* 67 (1992): 70.
42. Epstein, *Wage*, p. 173.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abbreviations

- ANF The Ante-Nicene Fathers: Translations of the Fathers down to A.D. 325.* Edited by Alexander Roberts and James Donaldson. Vols. 10. American reprint of the Edinburgh edition. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1903.
- AASS Acta Sanctorum.* 2d ed. Edited by Jean Carnandt. Paris: V. Palme, 1863.
- MGH Monumenta Germaniae Historica. Scriptores.* Edited by G. H. Pertz et al., Hanover, 1826–1913.
- NPNF Nicene and Post Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church.* Edited by Phillip Schaff and Henry Wace. Vols.14. Second series. New York: The Christian Literature Co., 1893.
- PG Patrologicae cursus completus, series graeca.* Edited by Jean Paul Migne. Vols. 65. Paris, 1868.
- PL Patrologicae cursus completus, series latina.* Edited by Jean-Paul Migne. Vols. 221. Paris, 1844–64.

Primary Sources

- Aelredi Rievallensis Opera omnia.* Edited by A. Hoste and C. Talbot. Turnhout: Brepols, 1961.
- Albers, B. *Consuetudines monasticae.* Stuttgart-Vienna, 1990.
- Anchorite Spirituality. Ancrene Wisse and Associated Works.* Translated by Anne Savage and Nicholas Watson. New York: Paulist Press, 1991.
- Aquinas, Thomas. *Contra impugnantes Dei cultum et religionem.* In *Opuscula Omnia.* Edited by Pierre Mandonnet. 1–195. Paris: Lethielleux, 1927.
- . *Summa contra Gentiles.* 5 vols. Translated by Vernon J. Burke. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1975.
- . *Summa theologica.* 5 vols. Translated by the Fathers of the English Dominican Province. Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, repr. 1981.
- Archard of Saint Victor: Works.* Translated by Hugh Feiss. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 2001.
- Athanasius. *The Life of St. Anthony.* In *NPNF 4:* 195–221.
- . *Against the Arians.* In *NPNF 4:* 306–447.
- Augustine. *The City of God.* Translated by Marcus Dods. New York: Modern Library, 1950.

- Augustine. *Work of Monks*. In *Saint Augustine Treatises on Various Subjects*. Edited by Roy J. Deferrari. New York: Fathers of the Church, 1952.
- Baldwin of Ford. *Spiritual Tractates*. 2 vols. Translated by David Bell. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1986.
- Bernard of Clairvaux. *The Letters of St. Bernard of Clairvaux*. Translated by Bruno Scott James. Chicago: Henry Regnery, 1953.
- . *Sermons on Conversion*. Translated by Marie-Bernard Said. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981.
- Bernard of Cluny. "Sermon on the Parable of the Unjust Steward." In *The Source of Jerusalem the Golden*. Translated by H. Preble. Edited by S. M. Jackson. Chicago, 1910.
- Bernardini Senesis, S. *Opera Omnia*. Edited by Augustini Sepinski. Quaracchi-Firenze: Ad Claras Aquas, 1956.
- Bonaventure. *Defense of the Mendicants*. In *Works of Bonaventure*. 5 vols. Translated by Jose de Vinck. Paterson, NJ: St. Anthony's Guild Press, 1966.
- Bruno of Quefort. *Vita quinque fratrum*. In *MGH SS* 15: 718.
- Cartulary of Oseney Abbey*. Edited by H. E. Salter. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1935.
- Causa et cura*. Edited by Paul Kaiser. Leipzig: Teubner, 1903.
- Cistercian Lay Brothers: Twelfth-Century Usages with Related Texts*. Edited by Chrysogonus Waddell. Brecht: Citeaux Commentarii Cistercienses, 2000.
- Clement of Alexandria. *Early Christian Writings: Apostolic Fathers*. New York: Dorset Press, 1986.
- The Coming of the Friars*. Edited by Rosalind Brooke. London: G. Allen and Unwin, 1975.
- Cyprian. *On the Advantage of Patience*. In *ANF* 5: 484–91.
- . *Exhortation to Martyrdom*. In *ANF* 5: 347–50.
- Dante Alighieri. *Paradise*. Translated by Dorothy Sayers and Barbara Reynolds. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1962; repr. 1986.
- Didache*. In *Early Christian Writers*. Edited by Cyril Richardson. Louisville, KY: Westminster Press, 1953. Reprinted in *The New Testament and Other Early Christian Writings*. Edited by Bart Ehrman. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Documents of Vatican II*. Edited by Walter M. Abbott. Translated by Joseph Gallagher. No city: Geoffrey Chapman, 1966.
- Dronke, Peter. *Women Writers of the Middle Ages*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Early Dominicans: Selected Writings*. Edited by Simon Tugwell. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.
- Epistle of Ignatius to Polycarp*. In *ANF* 1: 93–100.
- First Epistle of Clement*. In *ANF* 1: 5–21.
- FitzRalph, Richard. *Defension Curatorum*. In *Trevisa's Dialogus*. Edited by John Perry. EETS o.s. 167. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1925.
- Francis and Clare: Complete Works*. Translated by Regis Armstrong and Ignatius Brady. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.

- Gertrude of Helfta: The Herald of Divine Love*. Translated by Margaret Winkworth. New York: Paulist Press, 1993.
- Gilbert of Hoyland. *Sermons on the Song of Songs*. Translated by Lawrence Braceland. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1979.
- . *Treatises, Epistles and Sermons*. Translated by Lawrence C. Braceland. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981.
- Gregory of Nyssa. *On the Making of Man*. In *NPNF* 5: 287–427.
- Gueric of Igny. *Liturgical Sermons*. 2 vols. Translated by a monk of Mt. St. Bernard. Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1970.
- Guibert of Nogent. *Self and Society in Medieval France*. Translated by C. C. S. Bland. New York: Harper and Row, 1970.
- Guigo II. *The Ladder of Monks: A Letter on the Contemplative Life and Twelve Meditations by Guigo II*. Translated by Edmund Colledge and James Walsh. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1981.
- Guigues I coutumes de Chartreuse*. Translated by an anonymous Carthusian. Paris: Editions du Cerf, 1984.
- Guigues de Chastel. *Meditations of Guigo*. Translated by John Jolin. Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1951.
- Hadewijch: The Complete Works*. Translated by M. Columba Hart. New York: Paulist Press, 1980.
- Hegel, Georg. *The Philosophy of Right*. Translated by T. Knox. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1949.
- Hélyot, Pierre. *Histoire des ordres monastique religieux et militaires et des Congregations seculieres*. Paris: Nicolas Gosselin, 1714.
- Hildegard of Bingen. *Book of the Rewards of Life*. Translated by Bruce W. Hozeski. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- . *Scivias*. Translated by M. Columba Hart and Jane Bishop. New York: Paulist Press, 1990.
- Holy Bible According to the Douay and Rhemish Versions with Complete Notes of the Rev. Geo. Leo Haydock*. Photo reproduction: Monrovia, CA: Catholic Treasures, 1992.
- Holy Women of the Syrian Orient*. Translated by Sebastian Brock and Susan Harvey. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1987; rev. ed., 1998.
- Hortus conclusus*. Edited by Stephen Hurlbut. Washington, DC: St. Albans Press, 1936.
- Humbert de Silva Candida. *Libri tres adversus simoniacos*. Edited by F. Thaner. In *MGH Libelli de lite* 1 (1891), 95–253.
- Humbert of Romans. *Treatise on the Formation of Preachers*. In *Early Dominicans: Selected Writings*. Edited by Simon Tugwell. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.
- Idung of Prüfening. *Cistercians and Cluniacs. The Case for Citeaux: A Dialogue between Two Monks; An Argument on Four Questions*. Translated by Jeremiah O’Sullivan. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1977.
- Isaac of Stella. *Sermons on the Christian Year*. 2 vols. Translated by Hugh McCaffrey. Introduction by Bernard McGinn. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1979.

- Jacques de Vitry. *Life of Marie D'Oignies*. Translated by Margot King. Toronto: Peregrina Publishing, 1993.
- . "Sermo ad virgines." Edited by Joseph Greven. *Historisches Jahrbuch*, 35, 1914.
- John Cassian. *Conferences*. In *NPNF* 11: 295–545.
- . *Institutes*. In *NPNF* 11: 201–290.
- Jordan of Saxony. *Libellus de principiis ordinis praedicatorum*. Edited by H. C. Scheeben. Dublin: Dominican Publications, 1982.
- Justin Martyr. *Lost Fragments on the Resurrection*. In *ANF* 1: 294–9.
- Jutta and Hildegard: *The Biographical Sources*. Translated by Anna Silvas. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1999.
- The Letters of Hildegard of Bingen*. 2 vols. Translated by Joseph Baird and Radd Ehrman. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- Letters of Peter the Venerable*. Edited by Giles Constable. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967.
- Letres de Jacques de Vitry*. Edited by R. B. C. Huygens. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1960.
- Liber gratissimus*. Edited by L. Heinemann. In *MGH*, *Libelli de lite*, 1, 15–75.
- The Life of Aelred of Rievaulx*. Edited by F. M. Powicke. New York: Oxford University Press, 1951.
- The Life of Juliana of Mont-Cornillon (1192–12580)*. Translated by Barbara Newman. Toronto: Peregrina Publishing, 1989.
- Lives of Ida of Nivelles, Lutgard and Alice the Leper*. Translated by Martinus Cawley. Lafayette, OR: Our Lady of Guadalupe Abbey, 1987.
- Marx, Karl. *A Contribution to the Critique of Political Economy*. Translated by S. W. Ryazanskaya. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1970.
- Maximus. *Ambigua*. In *PG* 91, 1290–315.
- McCarthy, Mary. *The Rule for Nuns of St. Caesarius of Arles: A Translation with a Critical Introduction*. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1960.
- Mechthild of Magdeburg. *The Flowing Light of the Godhead*. Translated by Frank Tobin. New York: Paulist Press, 1998.
- Medieval Popular Religion*. Edited by John Skinner. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1997; repr. 1999.
- The "Meditations" of Guigo I, Prior of the Charthouse*. Translated by A. Gordon Mursell. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1995.
- The Navarre Bible: Saint John's Gospel*. Edited by J. Casciaro. Translated by Brian McCarthy. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1987.
- Novum Testamentum Latine secundum editionem Sancti Hieronymi*. London: British and Foreign Bible Society, n.d.
- Origen. *De principiis*. In *ANF* 4: 239–384.
- Peter Damian. *Book of Gomorrah*. Translated by Pierre Payer. Waterloo, Ont.: Wilfrid Lourier University Press, 1982.
- Peter Damian Lettters*. Translated by Owen Blum. Vols. 1–5. Owen Blum[†] and Irven Resnick. Vols. 6–7. Translated by Owen Blum and Irven Resnick. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1989–2005.

- Petri Damiani Vita Beati Romualdi*. Edited G. Tabacco. In *Fonti per la Storia d'Italia*. Vol. 94. Rome: Fonti per la storia d'Italia, 1957.
- Petrus Damiani. *Die Briefe des Petrus Damiani*. Edited by Kurt Reindel. In *MGH, Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit 4* (1983).
- . *Opera omnia*. Edited by Constantino Gastani. In *PL* 144–5.
- Plato. *Timeus*. In *History of Philosophy: Selected Readings*. Edited by George Abernathy and Thomas Langford. Belmont, CA: Dickenson Publishing, 1968.
- Pseudo-Clement. *Recognitions*. In *ANF* 8: 75–211.
- Rule for the Franciscan Third Order*. In *Medieval Popular Religion*. Edited by John Skinner. Peterborough: Broadview Press, 1997.
- Rule of Macarius*. In *Early Monastic Rules*. Translated by Carmela Franklin, Ivan Havener and J.A. Francis. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1982.
- Rule of Raymond de Puy*. In Jonathan Riley-Smith. *The Knights of St. John in Jerusalem and Cyprus c.1050–1310*. London: Macmillan, 1967.
- Rule of Saint Augustine*. Translated by Raymond Canning. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1984.
- Rule of the Four Fathers*. In *Early Monastic Rules*. Translated by Carmela Franklin, Ivan Havener, and J. A. Francis. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1982.
- Rule of the Master*. Translated by Luke Eberle. Preface Adalbert de Vogüé. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1977.
- Rupert of Deutz. *Super quaedam capitula regulae divi Benedicti abbot*. In *PL* 170,517–22.
- St. Anselm Basic Writings*. Translated by S. N. Deane. 2d ed. LaSalle, IL: Open Court, 1968.
- Saint Basil Ascetical Works*. Translated by M. M. Wagner. New York: Fathers of the Church, 1950.
- St. Benedict's Rule for Monasteries*. Translated by Leonard J. Doyle. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1948.
- St. Francis of Assisi: Writings and Early Biographies. English Omnibus of the Sources for the Life of St. Francis*. Edited by Marion Habig. 4th rev. ed. Chicago, IL: Franciscan Herald Press, 1983.
- St. Peter Damian: Selected Writings on the Spiritual Life*. Translated by Patricia McNutley. London: Faber and Faber, 1959.
- Sancti Petri Damiani sermones*. Edited by G. Lucchesi. Turnhout: Brepols, 1983.
- The Sayings of the Desert Fathers: The Alphabetical Collection*. Translated by Benedicta Ward. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1976; rev. ed. 1984.
- Seraphicae legislationes textus originales*. Edited by Quaracchi Franciscans. Quaracchi: Collegium S. Bonaventurae, 1897.
- The Song of St. Peter Damiani: On the Joies and Glory of Paradise*. Translated by Stephen Hurlbut. Washington, DC: St. Alban's Press, 1928.
- Supplement to the Life of Marie d'Oignies by Thomas de Cantimpré*. Translated by Hugh Feiss. Saskatoon: Peregrina Publishing, 1987.
- Tertullian. *The Soul's Testimony*. In *ANF* 3: 175–9.
- . *On Idolatry*. In *ANF* 3: 61–77.

- Thomas of Celano. *First Life of St. Francis*. In *Saint Francis of Assisi*. Translated by Placid Hermann. Chicago, IL: Franciscan Herald Press, 1963.
- Two Wycliffite Texts*. Edited by Anne Hudson. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993.
- Weber, Max. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Translated by Talcott Parsons. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1950.
- William of St. Thierry. *The Golden Epistle of Abbot William of St. Thierry*. Translated by Walter Shewring. Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, 1960.
- Wolter, Maurus. *The Principles of Monasticism*. Translated by Bernard Sause. St. Louis, MO: B. Herder Book, 1962.
- The Works of Aelred of Rievaulx*. Vol. 1: *Treatises: The Pastoral Prayers*. Translated by M. P. Macpherson. Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1971.
- The Works of a Lollard Preacher*. Edited by Anne Hudson. In *EETS 317*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003.

Secondary Sources

- Aers, David. "Piers Plowman: Poverty, Work, and Community." In David Aers. *Community, Gender, and Individual Identity: English Writing 1360–1430*. 160–75. London: Routledge, 1983.
- Anderson, Bernhard. "Human Dominion over Nature." In *Biblical Studies in Contemporary Thought*. Edited by Miriam Ward, 27–45. Somerville, MA: Greeno, Hadden and Company, 1975.
- Andrews, Frances. *The Early Humiliati*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
- Applebaum, Herbert. *Concept of Work: Ancient, Medieval and Modern*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Arendt, Hannah. *The Human Condition*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1958.
- Barr, James. "Man and Nature: The Ecological Controversy and the Old Testament." *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library*, 55 (1972–73), 90–32.
- Baum, Gregory. *The Priority of Labor: A Commentary on "Laborem exercens," Encyclical Letter of Pope John Paul II*. New York: Paulist Press, 1982.
- The Beginning of the Strife between Richard FitzRalph and the Mendicants*. Edited by L. L. Hammerich. Kobenhavn: Levin and Munksgaard, 1938.
- Benz, Ernst. *Evolution and Christian Hope*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday, 1966.
- Berman, Constance. *The Cistercian Evolution: The Invention of a Religious Order in Twelfth-Century Europe*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996.
- . "Medieval Agriculture, the Southern Countryside and the Early Cistercians." *Transactions of the American Philosophical Society* 76: 5 (1986).
- Bergson, Henri. *Creative Evolution*. Translated by Arthur Mitchell. 1911: New York: Modern Library Edition, 1944.
- Biron, Reginald. *St. Pierre Damien*. Paris: J. Gabaldi Cié, 1908.
- Bloch, Marc. *Land and Work in Medieval Europe: Selected Papers*. Translated by J. E. Anderson. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1967.

- Bloch, Maurice. "Death, Women and Power." In *Death and the Regeneration of Life*. Edited by Maurice Bloch and Jon Perry. 211–30. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.
- Blum, Owen. "The Monitor of the Popes: St. Peter Damian." *Studia Gregoriana* 2 (1947), 459–76.
- . *St. Peter Damian: His Teaching on the Spiritual Life*. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1947.
- Bolton, Brenda. "Innocent III's Treatment of the Humiliati." In *Studies in Church History* 8 (1972), 73–82.
- . "Some Thirteenth Century Women in the Low Countries." *Nederlands archief voor kerkgeschiedenis* 61: 1 (1981), 7–29.
- . "Sources for the Early History of the Humiliati." In *Studies in Church History* 11 (1975), 125–33.
- Borst, A. *Die Katharer*. Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1953.
- Bouchard, Constance. *Holy Entrepreneurs*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991.
- Brasher, Sally Mayall. *Women of the Humiliati*. New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Brentano, Lujo. "On the History and Development of Gilds." In *English Gilds*. Edited by Toulmin Smith. London, 1870.
- Brock, Russell. "An Edition of Richard FitzRalph's *De Pauperis Salvatoris*: Books V, VI, VII." Diss. University of Colorado, 1953.
- Brooke, Rosalind. *Early Franciscan Government*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1959.
- Brown, Peter. *The Cult of the Saints*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1981.
- Brundage, James. *Medieval Canon Law*. London: Longman, 1995.
- Butler's Lives of the Saints*. Edited by Herbert Thurston and Donald Attwater. Westminster, MD: Christian Classics, repr. 1981.
- Burr, David. *Olivi and Franciscan Poverty*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1989.
- Burton, Janet. *Monastic and Religious Orders in Britain 1000–1300*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Bynum, Carolyn Walker. "Did the Twelfth Century Discover the Individual?" In *Jesus as Mother*. Edited by Carolyn Walker Bynum, 82–109. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1982.
- . *Docere Verbo et Exemplo*. Missoula, MT: Scholars Press, 1979.
- . "The Spirituality of Regular Canons in the Twelfth Century: A New Approach." *Medievalia et humanistica*. n.s.5: 4 (1975), 3–23.
- Calati, Benedetto. *Sapienza Monastica*. Roma, *Studia Anselmiana* 117 (1994).
- Cantor, Norman. "Crisis of Western Monasticism, 1050–1130." *American Historical Review* 66 (1960), 47–67.
- Carneiroda Cunha, Manuela. "Eschatology among the Kraho." In *Mortality and Immortality: Anthropology and Archeology of Death*. Edited by S. C. Humphreys and Helen King. London: Academic Press, 1981.
- Chamberlain, Marcia. "Hildegard of Bingen's *Causes and Cures: A Radical Feminist Response to the Doctor-Cook Binary*." In *Hildegard of Bingen: A Book of Essays*. Edited by Maud Burnett McInerney. New York: Garland, 1998.

- Chenu, M.D. *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century*. Translated by Jerome Taylor and Lester K. Little. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1968.
- . *The Theology of Work*. Dublin: M.H. Gill and Son, 1963.
- Cipolla, Carlo. *Before the Industrial Revolution*. New York: Norton, 1976.
- Clopper, Lawrence. "Langland's Persona: An Anatomy of the Mendicant Orders." In *Written Work: Langland, Labor, and Authorship*. Edited by Steven Justice and Katheryn Kerby-Fulton. 144–84. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997.
- . "*Songes of Rechelesnesse*": *Langland and the Franciscans*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1997.
- Colish, Marcia. *Medieval Foundations of Western Intellectual Tradition 400–1400*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, repr.1998.
- Colker, Marvin L. "Richard of St. Victor and the Anonymous of Bridlington." *Traditio* 18 (1962), 214–15.
- Colvin, H. M. *The White Canons in England*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1951.
- Conant, Kenneth. *Carolingian and Romanesque Architecture, 800 to 1200*. 4th ed. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1978.
- . "Observations on the Practical Talents and Technology of the Medieval Benedictines." In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt. London: Macmillan Press, 1971.
- Constable, Giles. *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- . "The Orders of Society." *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought*. 251–360. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Copleston, Frederick. *Wolff to Kant*. in *A History of Philosophy*. Vol. 6. Westminster, MD: Newman Press, 1961.
- Cowdrey, H. E. J. *Pope Gregory VII, 1073–85*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.
- . "Unions and Confraternity with Cluny." *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 16: 2 (October 1965), 152–62.
- Crassons, Kate. "'The Workman is Worth his Mede': Poverty, Labor, and Charity in the Sermons of William Taylor." In *The Middle Ages at Work: Practicing Labor in Late Medieval England*. Edited by Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel. [88–125]. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- Cricco, Patricia. "Monasticism and Its Role as a Liminal Community in Medieval Society." Ph.D. diss., West Virginia University, 1980.
- . "Witness and the Twelfth-Century Monastic Renewal." Master's thesis, West Virginia University, 1976.
- D'Acunto, Nicolangelo. *I Laici Nella Chiesa E Nella Società Secondo Pier Damiani*. Roma: Nella Sede Dell' Istituto, 1999.
- Danforth, Loring M. *The Death Rituals of Rural Greece*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1982.
- Dawson, James Doayne. "Richard FitzRalph and the Fourteenth-Century Poverty Controversies." *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 34: 3 (July 1983), 315–44.
- . "William of Saint-Amour and the Apostolic Tradition." *Mediaeval Studies* 70 (1978), 223–38.

- de Man, Henri. *Joy in Work*. Translated by Eden Paul and Cedar Paul. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1929.
- Dereine, Charles. "Chronique: coutumiers et ordinaires de chanoines réguliers." *Scriptorium* 5 (1951), 107–113.
- . "Note sur l'influence de la règle de Gregoire VII pour chanoines réguliers." *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 43 (1948), 512–14.
- de Robeck, Nesta. *St. Clare of Assisi*. Milwaukee, WI: Bruce Publishing, 1951.
- Dickenson, J. C. *The Origins of the Austin Canons and Their Introduction into England*. London: SPCK, 1950.
- Donnelly, James. *The Decline of the Medieval Cistercian Laybrotherhood*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1949.
- Douie, Decima. *The Nature and the Effect of the Heresy of the Fraticelli*. Manchester: University Press, 1932.
- Dubois, Jacques. "The Laybrothers' Life in the Twelfth Century: A Form of Lay Monasticism." *Cistercian Studies* 7 (1972), 161–213.
- Eliade, Mircea. *The Myth of the Eternal Return*. New York: Harper and Row, 1959.
- . *The Sacred and the Profane*. Translated by Williard R. Trask. New York: Harcourt, Brace and World, 1959.
- Endres, Joseph. "Petrus Damiani und die Weltlich Wissenschaft." In *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie und Theologie des Mittelalters*. Edited by C. Bauemker. Münster: Aschendorff, 1910.
- English Gilds*. Edited by J. Toulmin Smith. London: N. Trubner, 1870.
- Epstein, Steven A. *Wage, Labor, and Guilds in Medieval Europe*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina, 1991.
- Escrivá, Josemaría. *The Forge*. London: Scepter, 1988.
- . *Furrow*. London: Scepter, 1987.
- Evans, Joan. *Monastic Life at Cluny, 910–1157*. London: Oxford University Press, 1931.
- Feldhaus, Franz. *Die Technik der Antike und des Mittelalters*. Wildpark-Potsdam: Akademische verlagsgesellschaft Athenaion, 1931.
- Fliche, Augustin. *Le réforme grégorienne*. 3 vols. Paris: E. Champion, 1924–27.
- Flood, David. "Franciscans at Work." *Franciscan Studies* 59 (2001), 21–62.
- Formasari, Giuseppe. *Riformato del Secolo XI*. Napoli: Liquori Editore, 1996.
- France, James. *The Cistercians in Scandinavia*. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1992.
- Frank, Robert Worth. *Piers Plowman and the Scheme of Salvation*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1957.
- Freund, Stephen. *Studien zur literischen Wirksamkeit des Petrus Damiani*. Hannover: Hahnsche Buchhandlung, 1995.
- Geertz, Clifford. *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, 1973.
- Golinelli, Paolo. *Indiscreta Sanctitas*. Roma: Nella Sede Dell'Institutio, 1988.
- Gonsette, Jean. *Pierre Damien et la culture profane*. Louvain: Publications Universitaires de Louvain, 1956.
- Graham, Rose. *Gilbert of Sempringham and the Gilbertines*. London: Elliot Stock, 1901.

- Grandjean, Michel. *Laiques dans L'Eglise regards de Pierre Damien, Anselme de Cantorbéry Yves de Chartres*. Paris: Beauchesne, 1994.
- Greenia, Conrad. "The Laybrother Vocation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries." *Cistercian Studies* 15 (1980), 39.
- Gross, Charles. *Gild Merchants*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1890.
- Grundmann, Herbert. *Religious Movements in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Steven Rowan. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1995.
- Gwynn, Aubrey. *The English Austin Friars in the Time of Wyclif*. London: Oxford University Press, 1940.
- . "Richard FitzRalph, Archbishop of Armagh, Pt. VI." *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review of Letters, Philosophy and Science* 26 (1937), 1–57.
- Hale, Robert. "Camaldolese." In *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Edited by William M. Johnson. Chicago, IL: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000.
- Hallinger, Kassius. "The Spiritual Life of Cluny in the Early Days." In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Norren Hunt. London: Macmillan, 1971.
- . "Woher Kommer Die Laienbrüder?" *Analecta S. O. Cisterciana* (1956), 26,42.
- Hamilton, B. "S. Pierre Damien et les Mouvements Monasticques de son temps." *Studia Gregoriana* 10 (1975), 175–202.
- Hanawalt, Barbara. *Ties That Bound*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1986.
- Haskins, Charles Homer. *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century*. Cleveland, OH: World Publishing, repr. 1967.
- Hauck, Albert. *Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands*. 6 vols. Leipzig: J. C. Hindrich's che Buchhandlung, 1887–1920.
- Hauerwas, Stanley. "Work as Co-Creation: A Critique of a Remarkably Bad Idea." In *Co-Creation and Capitalism*. Edited by John Houck and Oliver F. Williams, 42–58. Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1983.
- Hazeltine, Harold. "Roman and Canon Law in the Middle Ages." In *Cambridge Medieval History*. 8 vols. Edited by J. R. Tanner, C. W. Previtè-Orton, and Z. N. Brooke. 5: 697–764. New York: Macmillan, 1911–36.
- Heath, Robert. *Cruz Imperatorium Philosophia*. Pittsburgh: Pickwick Press, 1976.
- Hehir, J. Bryan. "John Paul II: Continuity and Change in the Social Teaching of the Church." In *Co-Creation and Capitalism*. Edited John Houck and Oliver F. Williams. 124–40. Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1983.
- Heinrich, Mary Pia. *The Canonesses and Education in the Early Middle Ages*. Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1924.
- Helming, Dennis M. *Footsteps in the Snow*. Forward by Malcolm Muggeridge. New York: Scepter, 1986.
- Hibbert, Francis Aidan. *The Influence and Development of English Gilds*. New York: Augustus M. Kelly, repr. 1970.
- Hollenbach, David. "Human Work and the Story of Creation: Theology and Ethics in *Laborem exercens*." In *Co-Creation and Capitalism*. Edited by John Houck and Oliver F. Williams. 59–77. Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1983.

- Hunt, Noreen. "Cluniac Monasticism." In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt. 1–10. London: Macmillan Press, 1971.
- . *Cluny under Saint Hugh 1049–1109*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968.
- Hyde, John. *Society and Politics in Medieval Italy*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1973.
- Jaeger, C. Stephen. *The Envy of Angels*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994.
- Kantorowicz, Ernest H. "The Problem of Medieval World Unity." In *Selected Studies*. Edited by Ernest Kantorowicz. Locust Valley, NY: J. J. Augustin, 1965.
- Knowles, David. *The Evolution of Medieval Thought*. New York: Vintage Books, 1962.
- with Dimitri Obolensky. *The Christian Centuries*. Vol.2: *The Middle Ages*. New York: Paulist Press, 1983.
- Kramer, Stella. *The English Craft Guilds and the Government*. New York: AMC Press, repr. 1968.
- Lackner, Bede. *The Eleventh-Century Background of Cîteaux*. Washington, DC: Cistercian Publications, 1972.
- Ladner, Reginald. "The Plight of Preaching in the Twelfth Century." In Pierre Mandonnet. *St. Dominic and His Work*. Translated by Mary Benedicta Larkin. St. Louis, MO: B. Herder Book Company, 1944.
- Ladurie, Emmanuel LeRoy. *Montaillou*. Translated by Barbara Bray. New York: Random House, 1979.
- Laistner, M. L. W. *Thought and Letters in Western Europe A.D. 500 to 900*. Rev. ed.: Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1976.
- Lawrence, C. *Medieval Monasticism*. London: Longman, 1984.
- Leclercq, Jean. "Consciousness of Identification in Twelfth-Century Monasticism." *Cistercian Studies* 14: 2 (1974), 219–31.
- . "Monastic Crisis of the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries." In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt. London: Macmillan, 1971.
- . *Saint Pierre Damien Ermite et Homme D'Eglise*. Roma: Edizione di Storia e Letteratura, 1960.
- . *The Spirituality of the Middle Ages*. London: Burns and Oates, 1968.
- LeGoff, Jacques. *Time, Work, and Culture in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
- Lekai, Loius. "Cistercian Ideals versus Reality: 1134 Reconsidered." *Cîteaux* 39 (1988), 217–30.
- . *The Cistercians: Ideals and Reality*. Kent, OH: Kent State University Press, 1977.
- . "Motives and Ideals of Eleventh Century Monastic Renewal." In *Cistercian Spirituality: A Symposium*. Edited by M. Basil Pennington. Spencer, MA: Cistercian Publications, 1970.
- Little, A. G. "A Royal Inquiry into Property Held by the Mendicant Friars in England, 1349 and 1350." In *Franciscan Papers, Lists and Documents*. Edited by A. G. Little. 144–5. Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1945.

- Little, Lester K. *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1978.
- . “The Personal Development of Peter Damian.” In *Order and Innovation in the Middle Ages*. Edited by William C. Jordan, B. McNab and T. Ruiz. 317–42. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1976.
- Madden, James. “Business Monks, Banker Monks, Bankrupt Monks: The English Cistercians in the Thirteenth Century.” *Catholic Historical Review* 49 (1963–64), 341–63.
- Mäkinen, Virpi. *Property Rights in the Late Medieval Discussion on Franciscan Poverty*. Leuven: Peeters, 2001.
- Mandonnet, Pierre. *St. Dominic and His Work*. Translated by Mary Larkin. St. Louis, MO: B. Herder Book Company, 1944.
- Mariás, Julian. *History of Philosophy*. Translated by Stanley Applebaum and Clarence Strowbridge. 22d ed. New York: Dover Publications, 1967.
- Marrone, Steven. *William of Auvergne and Robert Grosseteste*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983.
- Martine, E. “De fratrum conversorum in monasteries origine.” In *Veterum scriptorium et monumentorum historiorum dogmaticorum, moralium, amplissima collection*. Edited by E. Martine and U. Durand. 9 vols. Paris: Montalant, 1724–33.
- McKenzie, John L. “The Gospel According to Matthew.” In *Jerome Biblical Commentary*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1968.
- McKitterick, Rosamond. *The Carolingians and the Written Word*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, repr. 1990.
- . *The Frankish Kingdoms under the Carolingians, 751–987*. London: Longman, 1983.
- McRae, Ben. “Religious Gilds and Civic Order: The Case of Norwich in the Late Middle Ages.” *Speculum* 67 (1992), 69–97.
- McWilliams, Philip E. “Cluniacs.” In *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Edited by William M. Johnston. 1: 310. Chicago, IL: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000.
- . “Cluny, France.” In *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Edited by William M. Johnston. 1: 3114. Chicago, IL: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000.
- Merton, Thomas. *The Last of the Fathers*. New York: Harcourt Brace, 1954.
- Mitchell, John. “Literacy Displayed: the use of inscriptions at the monastery of San Vincenzo al Volturno in the early ninth century.” In *The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe*. Edited by Rosamond McKitterick. 186–225. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Moisa, Maria A. “Fourteenth-Century Preachers’ Views of the Poor: class or status group?” In *Culture, Ideology, Politics*. Edited by Raphael Samuel and Gareth Jones. 160–75. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1983.
- Mollat, Michael. *The Poor in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Arthur Goldhammer. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1986.
- Morghan, Raffaello. “Monastic Reform and Cluniac Spirituality.” In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt, 11–28. London: Macmillan Press, 1971.
- Morin, Germain. “Rainaud l’ermite et Ives de Chartres: un episode de la crise du cenobitisme au XIe- *Revue bénédictine* 40 (1928), 99–115.

- Morris, Colin. *The Discovery of the Individual 1050–1200*. London: SPCK, 1972.
- Mumford, Lewis. *The Myth of the Machines: Technics and Human Development*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, Jovanovich, 1966–67.
- Mundo, A. M. “Monastic Movements in the East Pyrenees.” In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt. 98–122. London: Macmillan, 1971.
- Mursell, A. Gordon. “The Theology of the Carthusian Life in the Writings of St. Bruno and Guigo I.” In *Analecta Carthusiana* 127 (1988).
- Musson, Anthony. “Reconstructing English Labor Laws: A medieval perspective.” In *The Middle Ages at Work: Practicing Labor in Late Medieval England*. Edited by Kellie Robertson and Michael Uebel. 156–87. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- Neale, J. M. *Mediaeval Preachers and Mediaeval Preaching*. London: Mozley, 1856.
- Neel, Carol. “The Origins of the Beguines.” *Signs* 14: 2 (1989), 321–51.
- Nelson, Janet. “Literacy in Carolingian government.” In *The Uses of Literacy in Early Medieval Europe*. Edited by Rosamond McKitterick. 258–96. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Newman, Martha. *The Boundaries of Charity*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Novak, Michael. “Creation Theology.” In *Co-Creation and Capitalism*. Edited by John Houck and Oliver F. Williams. 17–41. Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1983.
- Oostermann, John. “Peter Damian’s Doctrine of Sacerdotal Office.” Ph.D. diss., Catholic University of America, 1980.
- Ovitt, George. *The Restoration of Perfection: Labor and Technology in Medieval Culture*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1987.
- Pannenberg, Wolfhart. *Theology and the Kingdom of God*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1969.
- Paolini, L. “Le Umiliati al lavoro. Appunti fra storiografia e storia.” *Bullettino dell’Istituto storico speciale per archivisti e bibliotecari dell’università di Rome*, 2:2 (1962), 260–304.
- Pennington, M. Basil. *The Cistercians*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 1992.
- . “Third Sermon for the Feast of St. Benedict.” *Cistercian Studies* 4 (1969), Petit, 85–92. François. *La Spiritualité des Prémontrés au XIIe et XIIIe siècles* Paris: J. Vrin, 1947.
- Petry, Ray. *Christian Eschatology and Social Thought*. New York: Abington Press, 1961.
- Phipps, Colin. “Romuald-Model Hermit: Eremitical Theory in Saint Peter Damian’s *Vita Beati Romualdi*, Chapters 16–27.” In *Monks, Hermits and the Ascetic Tradition*. Edited by W. J. Sheils. 65–77. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1985.
- Phillips, Dayton. “Beguines in Medieval Strasburg: A Study of the Social Aspects of Beguine Life.” Ph. D. diss., Stanford University, 1941.
- Postan, Michael. “Why Was Science Backward in the Middle Ages?” In *The History of Science: A Symposium*. 25–33. Glenoe, IL: Free Press, 1951.
- Pourrat, P. *Christian Spirituality*. 2 vols. Westminster, MD: Newman Press, 1953–55.
- Putnam, B.H. *The Enforcement of the Statute of Labourers during the First Decade after the Black Death, 1349–1359*. New York: AMS Press, repr.1970.

- Ranf, Patricia. "The Concept of Witness: From Its Origin to Its Institutionalization." *Revue bénédictine* 103 (1987), 21–45.
- . "The Maintenance and Transformation of Society through Eschatology: Cluniac Monasticism." *Journal of Religious History* 14: 3 (1987), 246–55.
- . "An Overturned Victory: Clare of Assisi and the Thirteenth-Century Church." *Journal of Medieval History* 17 (1991), 123–34.
- . "The Role of the Eremitic Monk in the Development of the Medieval Intellectual Tradition." In *From Cloister to Classroom*. Edited by E. Rozanne Elder. 80–95. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications, 1986.
- . "The Rule of St. Augustine in Medieval Monasticism." *Proceedings of the PMR Conference* 11 (1986), 143–50.
- . *A Woman's Way: The Forgotten History of Women Spiritual Directors*. New York: Palgrave, 2000.
- . *Women and Religious Life in Premodern Europe*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996.
- . *Women and Spiritual Equality in Christian Tradition*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998.
- . *Women in Western Intellectual Tradition, 600–1500*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002.
- Reade, H. V. "Philosophy in the Middle Ages." In *Cambridge Medieval History*. 8 vols. Edited by J. R. Tanner, C. W. Previte-Orton, and Z. N. Brooke. Vol 5. New York: Macmillan, 1911–36.
- Renard, Georges. *Guilds in the Middle Ages*. Translated by Dorothy Terry. New York: Augustus M. Kelly, repr. 1968.
- Resnick, Irvn. "Attitudes Towards Philosophy and Dialectic During the Gregorian Reform." *Journal of Religious History* 16: 2 (December 1990), 115–25.
- . *Divine Power and Possibility in St. Peter Damian's "De Divina Omnipotentia."* Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1992.
- . "Odo of Tournai and Peter Damian." *Revue bénédictine* 98 (1988), 114–40.
- Reynolds, Susan. *Kingdoms and Communities in Western Europe, 900–1300*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984.
- Robertson, Kellie. *The Laborer's Two Bodies: Literary and Legal Productions in Britain, 1350–1500*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- Robinson, I. S. "The 'Colores Rhetorici' in the Investiture Contest." *Traditio* 32 (1976), 209–38.
- Robinson, P. *The Rule of St. Clare: Its Observance in the Light of the Early Documents*. Philadelphia, PA: Dolphin Press, 1912.
- Rodgers, Daniel. *The Work Ethic in Industrial America: 1850–1920*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1978.
- Rosenwein, Barbara. "Feudal War and Monastic Peace: Cluniac Liturgy as Ritual Aggression." *Viator* 2 (1971), 129–57.
- Rosser, Gervase. "Going to the Fraternity Feast: Commensality and Social Relations in Late Medieval England." *Journal of British Studies* 33 (October. 1994), 430–46.

- Rowley, H. H. *Short Dictionary of Bible Themes*. New York: Basic Books, 1968.
- Rubin, Miri. *Charity and Community in Medieval Cambridge*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
- Russell, Kenneth. "Peter Damian's Whip." *American Benedictine Review* 41: 1 (March 1990), 20–35.
- Ryan, J. Joseph. *Saint Peter Damiani and His Canonical Sources*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute, 1956.
- Sackur, Ernst. *Die Cluniacenser in ihrer kirchlichen und allgemeinschtlichen Wirksamkeit bis zur Mitte des elften Jahrhunderts*. 2 vols. Halle: Max Niemayer, 1892–94.
- Schipperges, Heinrich. *Hildegard of Bingen: Healing and the Nature of the Cosmos*. Translated by J. Broadwin. Princeton, NJ: Markus Wiener, 1997.
- Schillebeeckx, Edward. "Interpretation of Eschatology." In *The Problem of Eschatology*. Edited by Edward Schillebeeckx and B. Williams. 42–56. New York: Concilium, 1969.
- Schmid, K. and J. Wollasch. "Die Gemeinschaft der Lebender und Verstorbenen in Zeugnissen des Mittelalters." *Frühmittelalterliche Studien* 1 (1967), 365–405.
- Schnapp, Jeffrey. "Virgin Words: Hildegard of Bingen's *Lingua Ignota* and the Development of Imaginary Languages Ancient to Modern." *Exemplaria* 3: 2 (1991), 267–98.
- Schramm, Percy. *Kaiser, Rom und Renovatio*. 2 vols. 1929. Darmstadt: H. Gentner, repr. 1962.
- Smith, Katherine Allen. "Lay Brothers and Lay Sisters, Christian." In *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Edited by William M. Johnson. 1: 747–8. Chicago, IL: Fitzroy Dearborn, 2000.
- Southern, Richard. *The Making of the Middle Ages*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1978.
- . *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages*. London: Penguin, 1970.
- Stannard, David E. *The Puritan Way of Death: A Study of Religion, Culture and Social Change*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Summers, Janet. "The Violent Shall Take by Force': The First Century of Cistercian Nuns, 1125–1228." Ph.D. diss., University of Chicago, 1986.
- Szittyá, Penn R. *The Antifraternal Tradition in Medieval Literature*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986.
- Tait, James. *The Medieval English Borough: Studies in Its Origin and Constitutional History*. Manchester: University of Manchester Press, 1936.
- Taylor, Henry. *The Medieval Mind*. 4th ed. London: Macmillan, 1911.
- Thrupp, Sylvia. "The Gilds." In *Cambridge Economic History of Europe*, vol.3: *Economic Organization and Policies in the Middle Ages*. Edited by M. M. Postan, E. E. Rich, and Edward Miller. 230–80. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963.
- Tierney, Brian. "The Decretists and the 'Undeserving Poor.'" *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 1 (1958–59), 360–73.
- . *The Medieval Poor Law*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1959.
- Tilgher, Adriano. *Work: What It Has Meant to Men through the Ages*. New York: Harcourt Brace, 1930.

- Timko, Philip. "Cassiodorus." In *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Edited by William M. Johnson. 1: 249–51. Chicago, IL: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2000.
- Trites, Allison. *The Concept of Witness in New Testament Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977.
- Troeltsch, Ernst. *The Social Thought of the Christian Churches*. 2 vols. New York: Macmillan, 1931.
- Uebel, Michael. "Introduction: Conceptualizing Labor in the Middle Ages." In *The Middle Ages at Work: Practicing Labor in Late Medieval England*. Edited by Kelli Robertson and Michael Uebel. 1–18. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
- Unwin, George. *The Guilds and Companies of London*. 4th ed. Watford: Frank Cass, 1963.
- van Engen, John. "The 'Crisis of Cenobitism' Reconsidered: Benedictine Monasticism in the Years 1050–1150." *Speculum* 61 (19), 269–304.
- . *Rupert of Deutz*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1983.
- Vauchez, André. "Lay People's Sanctity in Western Europe: Evolution of a Pattern (Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries)." In *Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe*. Edited by R. Blumenfeld-Kosinski and T. Szell. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1990.
- Vawter, Bruce. "Gospel according to John." In *Jerome Biblical Commentary*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1968.
- Wang, John. "St. Peter Damian, the Monk." Ph.D. diss., Fordham University, 1957.
- White, Lynn. "The Historical Roots of Our Ecological Controversy and the Old Testament." *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library* 55 (1972–73), 9–32.
- . "The Study of Medieval Technology, 1924–1978: Personal Reflections." *Technology and Culture* 16 (1975), 519–30.
- Whitney, James P. *Hildebrandine Essays*. Cambridge: University Press, 1932.
- Williams, David. *The Cistercians in the Early Middle Ages*. Leominster: Fowler Wright Books, 1998.
- Williams, John R. "Archbishop Manasses I and Pope Gregory VII." *American Historical Review* 54 (1948–49), 804–24.
- . "Godfrey of Rheims." *Speculum* 22 (1947), 29–45.
- Wilmart, André. "Une lettre de S. Pierre Damien à l'impératrice Agnès." *Revue bénédictine* 44 (1932), 125–46.
- Wilmart, A. and L. Brou. "Un office monastique pour le 2 novembre." *Sacris Erudiri* 5 (1953), 257–330.
- Wollasch, Joachim. "A Cluniac Necrology from the Time of Abbot Hugh." In *Cluniac Monasticism in the Central Middle Ages*. Edited by Noreen Hunt. London: Macmillan, 1971.
- Wolter, Maurus. *The Principles of Monasticism*. Translated and edited by Bernard Sause. St. Louis, MO: B. Herder Book Co., 1962.
- Wood, Charles T. "Celestine V, Boniface VIII and the Authority of Parliament." *Journal of Medieval History* 8 (1982), 45–62.

- Woody, Kennerly. "Damiani and the Radicals." Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1966.
- . "Sagina Piscatoris: Peter Damian and the Papal Election Decree of 1059." *Viator* 1 (1970), 33–54.
- Workman, Herbert. *The Evolution of the Monastic Ideal*. London: Kelly, 1913.
- Zanoni, L. *Gli Umiliati nei loro rapporti con l'eresia l'industria della lana ed i commisni nei secoli xii e xiii*. Milan: Hoepli, 1911.
- Zarnecki, George. *The Monastic Agreement*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1972.

INDEX

- Abbey of St. Victor 108
Abelard 62, 112
accidie 23–4
acts 133
Adam of Dryburgh 95, 106, 111
Aelred of Rievaulx 135–36, 146
Agnes of Prague 170, 172
Alan of Lille 83
Alexander of Hales 201
Alexander Nequam 108
Alice of Schaarbeeck 164
All Souls' Day liturgy 38
alms 178, 194, 197, 198, 199
Ambrose 201
Ancrene Wisse 145–46
animal husbandry 138–39
Anno, archbishop of Cologne 74
Anselm of Bec 51, 146
Anselm of Havelberg 83, 103, 108
Anselm of Laon 56
Anthony 18, 23
Applebaum, Herbert 7
Arendt, Hannah 2, 3
Arezzo statutes 184–85
Ariprandus 92, 93
Arno of Reichesberg 103, 108
ars dictandi 51
art 22, 107, 146, 147–48
Athanasius 18
Augustine 20, 21–2, 59, 84, 86,
95–6, 113–14, 116–18, 123, 201
Baldwin of Ford 130–33, 201
Basil 17, 20, 21
Baum, Gregory 3
Beatrice of Tuscany 73
Beatrijs of Nazareth 165
Bec, monastery 51
beggars, begging 161, 196, 198, 199
beguines 10, 154, 157–66, 192
Benedict of Aniane 27, 81, 100
Benedict of Nursia 25, 71, 122
Benedictines 10, 26–9, 155
Berengar of Tours 51
Bergson, Henri 2, 3
Berman, Constance 121, 137, 139
Bernard of Clairvaux 63, 134–35
Bernard of Cluny 39
Bernard of St. Victor 115
Bernard of Tiron 94
Berno, abbot of Cluny 35
Bloch, Marc 5, 6
Blum, Owen 10, 59, 91
Bonaventure 169, 176–79, 195
Book of Gomorrah 50
Book of the Rewards of Life 146–49
Brasher, Sally 156–57
Bretano, Lujo 7
Bridlington, anonymous (Master) 95,
103, 106–8
Bruno of Cologne 55, 141, 142, 155
Bruno of Quefort 41
Bull of Canonization (Clare of Assisi)
171–73
Bynum, Carolyn Walker 103, 109, 113
Caesarius of Arles 24
Calmaldolese 47, 171

- canonical movement 99–119
 canons *see* regular canons
 canons, women 114
 Carthusians 10, 55, 81,
 141–44, 155
 Cassian 23–4, 84, 123
 Cassidorus 25, 73
 Cathars 154, 182
 Catherine of Louvain 165
 cell, as workshop 64–5
 change, changeableness 36–41, 44–5,
 94, 151–53
 Charlemagne 100
 Chaucer, Geoffrey 8, 199
 Chenu, M.D. 41, 64, 66–8, 71, 83,
 90, 95
 Christ, as Truth 59–60, 153
 Christina of St. Trond 165
 Chrodegang 100
 Cistercians 10, 56, 63, 81, 83,
 121–39, 141, 142, 144, 155, 158,
 163, 164
 Clare of Assisi 170–73, 174
 class 116–17, 131, 156, 159, 165–66,
 174, 191
 Clement 16
 Clement of Llanthony 108
 Cluny 35–49, 50, 84, 115, 118, 123
 community 46–7, 64, 65–6, 73, 74,
 82, 87–9, 94, 107, 117–18,
 131–32, 135, 136, 137, 142, 180,
 191, 196
 confratres 37
Consuetudines Farfenses 37
conversi 137–38, 139, 142, 159, 192
 cooking 152–53
 Corpus Christi, feast 161
 cosmology 66–71
 Countess Blanche 82
 Countess of Ranier 74, 90
 Cyprian 16

 Damian *see* Peter Damian
 Dante 9
 death 36–8, 39–40, 42–4, 46–7,
 48–9, 173
 de Man, Hendrik 2
 deserving poor 195–96
 Desiderius of Monte Cassino 51, 74
 dialectic 51–4
 Dickenson, J. C. 99
*docere verbo et exemplo see verbo et
 exemplo*
 Dominic of Calaruego 182
 Dominicans 10, 95, 114, 169, 179,
 181–89
 Dominicus Loricatus 61
Dominus vobiscum 64, 65, 68–70
 Dun Scotus 201

 education, secular 60, 61
 Election Decree (papal) 50
 Elizabeth of Spalbeek 165
 enclosure 171
 Engels, Frederick 2
 eremiticism 48
 eschatology 9, 35–49, 63–6, 77–8,
 124, 128, 130, 134, 136, 173,
 186, 191
 Escriva de Balaguer, Josemaría 1
 etymology: canonicus 99
 Cluny 43
 witness 57
Expositio in regulam beati Augustini 104

Flowing Light of the Godhead 166
 Fonte Avellana 34–5, 47, 48, 55, 58,
 71, 80, 81, 82, 91
 Fontevrault 56, 81, 94
 Francis of Assisi 169, 170, 172,
 173–76, 177–78, 194–96
 Franciscans 8, 10, 157, 169, 173–79,
 181, 183, 194–98
 Fulk of Toulouse 158–59

Gaudium et Spes 3
 Genesis, on work 4, 7, 13–14,
 16–18, 154
 Geoffrey de Henlawe 108
 Gerald of Wales 103
 Gerbert of Aurillac (Pope
 Sylvester II) 34

- Gerhoh of Reichersberg 108
 Gertrude of Helfta 166–68
 Gesuata of Siena 114
 Gilbert of Sempringham 114
 Godfrey of Tuscany 74
 Godfrey of St. Victor 108
 Gower, John 8, 199
 Grandmontensians 56, 81, 95
 Greenier, Conrad 80, 82
 greenness 149
 Gregorian Reform 51, 99
 Gregory of Nyssa 17
 Gross, Charles 7
 Grosseteste, Robert 157
 Gueric of Igny 123–30
 Guido of Arezzo 114
 Guigo I 141, 142, 143
 Guigo II 141, 143
 Guilbert of Hoyland 63, 136–37
 guilds 7, 156, 165, 194, 200–1

 Hadewijch 166
 Hallinger, Kassius 39
 Hegel, Georg 2
Herald of Divine Love 167–68
 Herman of Tournai 144
 Hermits of St. Augustine 114
 Hibbert, Francis 7
 Hieronymites 114
 Hildebert of Lavadin 108, 112–13
 Hildebrand (Pope Gregory VII) 91,
 102–3
 Hildegard of Bingen 144–54
 Hilduin of Saint-Denis 28
homo faber 2
 Honorius of Autun 83
Hortus deliciarum 114
 Hospitallers *see* Knights Hospitallers
 Hugh, abbot of Cluny 41–3
 Hugh of St. Victor 62, 95, 105, 108,
 111
 Humbert of Romans 155,
 185–89
 Humbert of Silva Candida 50, 51
 Humiliati 10, 94, 154–57
 Humphrey of Llanthony 108

 Ida of Léau 165
 Ida of Louvain 165
 Ida of Nivelles 165
 idleness 24, 179, 180, 196, 199, 200
 Idung of Prüfening 123
 Ignatius 17
 image of God *see* imago Dei
 imago Dei 4, 13–14, 16, 65, 68, 71,
 77, 99, 112, 135, 136, 151, 154,
 170, 173–74, 191, 192
imitatio Christi 99, 124, 136, 164–65,
 171, 174, 176–77, 183, 184,
 185–87, 191, 198
 incarnational theology 146–48
 individual, individualism 4, 46, 64,
 65–6, 77, 82, 99, 108, 117–18,
 131, 136, 149, 191–92
Institutio canonicorum 102–3
 Isaac of Stella 133–34
 Ivo of Chartres 103

 Jacques de Vitry 90, 156–61, 172
 Jerome 201
 Jews 60
 John Gualbert 55
 John of Lodi 34
 John of Pointlasne 179
 John the Baptist 57–8, 125–26, 176
 Jordan of Saxony 182
 Jotsald 37
 Juliana of Mont Cornillon 161–64
 Justin Martyr 16
 Jutta 144–46

 Knights Hospitallers 94, 114
 Knights Hospitallers of St. Lazarus 94
 Knights of Our Lady of Monjoie 94
 Kramer, Stella 7

Laborens exercens 3–4, 192
 Lady Poverty 177–78
 Lanfranc 51
 Langland 8, 199
laura 56, 58
 lay workers *see* *conversi*
 laybrothers 80–3, 135, 141, 189

- laysisters 80–1, 164
 Leclercq, Jean 39, 41
 LeGoff, Jacques 6
Lingua ignota 148
 Lollards 200
 Louis the Pious 28, 100, 103
 Lutgard of Aywieres 165
- macrocosm/microcosm 65–71
 manuscript copying 141–42
 Margaret of Ypres 165
 Marie of Oignies 158–61
 Martha and Mary 80, 92, 123,
 129–30, 145
 Marx, Karl 2
 Marxism 2, 3
 Master, the Rule of 24–5
 Maurice of Kerhan 108
 Mayeul, abbot of Cluny 42
 Mechthild of Madgeburg 166–67
 medical works 148–49
 mendicants 114, 155, 169–89, 192,
 193, 196
 military orders 95, 114
 monastic rules 20–8, 34–49, 114,
 142, 170, 171, 174, 181, 194–95
 monasticism 5–7, 8, 24, 47, 38,
 84–5, 122, 193
Most Gratuitous Book 50, 93
 Mumford, Lewis 5, 6, 28
 Mystical Body 66, 131, 135
- necrologies 37
 Nilus 47
 Novak, Michael 4
- Octogesima adveniens* 3
 Odilo, abbot of Cluny 37
 Odo of St. Victor 105, 110
 Odo of Tournai 81
 Office of the Dead 37, 38
 Olivi, [Peter] 196, 201
On Divine Omnipotence 53–4
On the Joys and Glory of Paradise 46–7
 Opus Dei 1
- Ordinem vestram* 195
 Origen 16
 Ottoboni manuscript (anonymous)
 107
 Ovitt, George 6–7
- Pachomius 20
 papacy 49–51, 181
 parable, Hildegard 153
 Patarenes 50
 Peter Comestor 103
 Peter Damian 8, 9, 29, 33–100,
 100–3, 106, 107, 109, 116, 123,
 137, 160, 169, 170, 176, 180,
 182, 191, 198, 200, 201
 anti-intellectualism, (supposed)
 58–66
 bishop of Ostia 50, 91
 critical edition of works 10
 education 33–4
 hermit 78–90
 life 33–4
 preacher 90–4
 synod of 1059 50–1
 theology of witness 56–8
 Peter of Cornwall 108
 Peter of Rheims 169
 Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay 181
 Petition against Vagrants 199
 Philip of Harverngt 95, 105, 110,
 111
Piers Plowman 199
 Pomposa, monastery 47
 Poor Catholics 154, 155
 Poor Ladies 171–73
 Poor Lombards 154, 155
 Popes
- Alexander II 51, 92, 103
 Benedict VII 49
 Benedict IX 50
 Boniface VIII 169, 195
 Celeste V 195
 Clement IV 169
 Clement V 195
 Gelasius II 115–16

- Gregory I 186–87
 Gregory VII 103
 Gregory IX 169, 195
 Innocent IV 195
 John XII 49
 John XXII 195
 Leo VII 49
 Leo IX 50
 Leo XIII 3
 Nicholas II 51, 85, 91, 103
 Nicholas III 195
 Paul VI 3
 Pius XI 3
 Urban II 95, 103, 115
 Urban IV 164, 195
- poverty 48, 89–90, 100, 135, 157,
 158, 161, 174–75, 177–78,
 179–80, 183, 194–99
- Premonstratensians 81, 95, 119, 122
 Proclamation against Beggars 199
 property 88, 90, 100, 101–3, 195–97
 Puritans 2
- Quadragesimo anno* 3
 Quakers 2
Quo elongati 195
Quorumdam exigit 195
- Ralph of Aldgate 108
 Ravenna 33–4, 50, 78
 recluse 144–46, 163
Regula canonicorum 100, 105
 regular canons 10, 51, 61, 88–9, 94,
 99–119, 122, 155
 Renard, Georges 7
 reputation 104, 110–11, 116, 169
Rerum novarum 2, 3
 Resnick, Irven 10, 52–3
 rest 129–30, 131–33, 135, 142, 143,
 150, 181
 Resurrectional theology 147
 Rhabanus Maurus 178
 rhetoric 51–4
 Richard FitzRalph 197–98
 Richard of Hexham 108
- Richard of St. Victor 95, 106, 108,
 111, 122
 Robert of Arbrissel 56, 94, 115
 Robert de Bracio 108
 Robert of Betun 108
 Robert of Cricklade 108
 Robert Kilwardby 183
 Romuald 41, 47–8, 55, 81
 Rule of St. Augustine 95–6, 106,
 113–19
 Rule of St. Benedict 25–8, 35, 41,
 47, 72, 81, 84, 95, 114–15, 118,
 121, 122
 Rupert of Deutz 103, 145
- sacraments 68, 93, 102
 satisfaction of desire 180–81
 School of Christ 61
 schools 51–4, 55
 Servites 114
 spiritual direction 104, 163
 spiritual director 146, 171
 Spirituals 195
 St. Gall, monastery 28
 St. Ruf, monastery 94, 95, 100, 108
 Statute of Laborers 8, 199
 Stephen Harding 56
 Stephen of Muret 56
 synod of Rome (1059) 50–1, 102
- technology 5, 7, 28
 Templars 94, 114
 tertiaryaries 156, 184–85
 Tertullian 17
 Teutonic Knights 114
texterants 155
 Thomas Aquinas 3, 179–81, 200
 Thomas of Celano 169, 175–76
 Thomas Gallus 108
 Thurston of York 121–22
 Tierney, Brian 195–96
 Tilgher, Adriano 1
Timaues 66
 Trinitarians 114
 Troeltsch, Ernst 35

- unchangeableness 132, 133
 undeserving poor 196–97
 Unwin, George 7
 use, useful, usefulness 78, 90, 105,
 110–13, 124, 131–32, 142, 143,
 144, 150, 151, 153, 158, 165,
 167, 177, 180, 183, 186, 187,
 188, 189, 198, 201
 utility 109–13, 124, 135, 143, 150,
 151, 158, 162, 165, 167, 177, 180,
 183, 187, 188, 189, 192, 198, 201
 utopian socialists 1–2

 Vallombrosa, Vallombrosans 50, 55,
 81
 Vatican II 3
verbo et exemplo 56, 104, 109, 176,
 182, 200
Vigilanti universalis 51
 vita apostolica 84–90, 94, 95, 101,
 105, 116, 174, 181–82, 183, 185,
 188, 191, 192
 vita communis 84–90, 103, 191

 Waldensians 155
 Waldo, Peter 155
 Weber, Max 5
 White, Lynn 5, 6
 William of Aquitaine, Duke 35
 William of Champeaux 112–13
 William de Vere 108
 William of Newburgh 108
 William of St. Amour 179–80,
 195–96
 William of St. Thierry 142, 143
 William of St. Victor 108
 witness 9, 24, 56–8, 63–6, 77–8, 79,
 84–9, 92, 94–6, 102, 105–7,
 110–13, 116, 125–27, 134, 136,
 142, 162, 165, 167, 169–71, 174,
 181, 183, 191, 198

 women 19, 114, 144–46, 153,
 154–68, 170–73, 192, 201
 work
 agricultural 25, 26, 29, 81, 107–8,
 110, 130, 137–38, 142, 153, 193
 attitude toward 8, 27, 157–58,
 194, 198
 burdensome 129–30
 and canonization 192
 differentiation of labor 27–8, 75,
 131, 192
 dignity 154, 192, 200
 intellectual 25, 26, 64, 82, 107,
 119, 193
 manual 25, 26, 64, 72, 78, 81,
 82–3, 86, 95, 107, 110, 118,
 119, 123, 127, 129, 136, 141,
 142, 145, 155, 156, 159, 161,
 162, 163, 165, 172, 173, 174,
 176, 179, 180, 186, 189, 191
 meaning of 1, 3–4, 162, 168, 177,
 198
 metaphors for 25–6, 64–5, 66,
 152–53, 198
 and money 137–38, 151, 174–76,
 184
 New Testament, in 15, 201
 obligation to 63–6, 75, 92, 161
 Old Testament, in 7, 13–15, 153,
 201
 as sanctifying 167–68, 173,
 191–92, 197, 198
 value of 6, 157, 160, 161, 163,
 172, 198
 workers 8, 107, 109, 155–56,
 165–66, 177, 191, 192, 200, 201
 Wyclif 8, 200

 Yvette of Huy 165

 Zealanti 195