

## NOTES

### Introduction: *clarissimum in feminis*

1. Geoffrey Chaucer, *The Clerk's Tale*, lines 932–38. For Chaucer's works I use Geoffrey Chaucer, *The Riverside Chaucer*, ed. Larry D. Benson, 3rd ed. (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1987). Subsequent references to Chaucer's works will be from this edition and will appear parenthetically in the text.
2. Lars Engle, "Chaucer, Bakhtin, and Griselda," *Exemplaria* 1 (1989): 448.
3. See J. Burke Severs, *The Literary Relationships of Chaucer's "Clerkes Tale"* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1942), pp. 3–37.
4. See J. Allan Mitchell, "Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale* and the Question of Ethical Monstrosity," *Studies in Philology* 102 (2005): 1–26.
5. M. M. Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, ed. Michael Holquist, trans. Caryl Emerson and Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), p. 106.
6. See Laurel Braswell, "Chaucer and the Art of Hagiography," in *Chaucer in the Eighties*, ed. Julian Wasserman and Robert J. Blanch (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1986), pp. 209–21; Valerie Edden, "Sacred and Secular in *The Clerk's Tale*," *Chaucer Review* 26 (1992): 369–76; Kathryn McKinley, "The *Clerk's Tale*: Hagiography and the Problematics of Lay Sanctity," *Chaucer Review* 33 (1998): 92; Diana T. Childress, "'Secular Hagiography' in Middle English Literature," *Philological Quarterly* 57 (1978): 311–22; Margaret Hurley, "Saints' Legends and Romance Again," *Genre* 8 (1975): 6–73; Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Saints' Lives and the Female Reader," *Forum for Modern Language Studies* 27 (1991): 314–32; Saul Nathaniel Brody, "Chaucer's Rhyme Royal Tales and the Secularization of the Saint," *Chaucer Review* 20 (1985): 128; and Jo Ann McNamara, "The Need to Give: Suffering and Female Sanctity in the Middle Ages," in *Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe*, ed. Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski and Tímea Szell (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991), pp. 199–221.
7. See, for example, Catherine Sanok, "Reading Hagiographically: The Legend of Good Women and Its Feminine Audience," *Exemplaria* 13 (2001): 339–54.
8. Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination*, p. 107.
9. See Amy W. Goodwin, "The Griselda Game," *Chaucer Review* 39 (2004): 53.

10. See Ralph Hanna III, "Some Commonplaces of Late Medieval Patience Discussions: An Introduction," in *The Triumph of Patience: Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, ed. Gerald J. Schiffhorst (Orlando: University Presses of Florida, 1978), p. 77; and Prudentius, *Psychomachia*, in *Prudentius*, ed. H. J. Thomson, 2 vols. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1969) 1:274–343, lines 125–30.
11. See Hanna, "Some Commonplaces," p. 68.
12. See Elizabeth D. Kirk, "'Who Suffreth More Than God?': Narrative Redefinition of Patience in *Patience* and *Piers Plowman*," in *The Triumph of Patience*, p. 91.
13. See Goodwin, "The Griselda Game," p. 54.
14. See Augustine, *de Patientia*, chapters 17, 23, 29, ed. Joseph Zycha CSEL 41 (Vienna: Tempsky, 1900), pp. 665–91; Galatians 5:22 and Ephesians 4:2. I use *The Catholic Bible: Douay-Rheims Version* (Charlotte, NC: Saint Benedict Press, 2009). See William Langland, *Piers Plowman: An Edition of the C-Text*, ed. Derek Pearsall (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), Passus 12, lines 170–76; Passus 15, lines 274–78.
15. Jacques Derrida, *Ulysses Gramophone*, in *Acts of Literature*, ed. Derek Attridge (New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 291; *Margins of Philosophy*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), p. 9.
16. See Herbert Musurillo, ed. and trans., *The Acts of the Christian Martyrs* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972), pp. 79–81, and 25, 69, 129. Subsequent references to the acts of martyrs will be to this edition, using parenthetical page references in the text. I also use Musurillo's facing page translations.
17. Impatience is wrong because it "reduplicates Adam's primal sin, . . . substitutes man's judgment for God's," and expresses doubts concerning God's plans. Hanna, "Some Commonplaces," p. 73; Tertullian, *de Patientia*, ed. E. Dekkers, in Tertullian, *Opera*, 2 vols., CCSL 1 and 2 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1954), 1:4.4. All my references to Tertullian's works are taken from these two volumes. All subsequent references will appear in the text.
18. See Peter Cantor, *Verbum Abbreviatum CXIV. PL* 205:300–301. Peter Cantor writes c. 1186.
19. Julianus Pomerius, *De vita contemplativa* 3.20.2, *PL* 59:504; Tertullian, *de Patientia*, 1.3, 3.11.
20. Gregory the Great, *Dialogi* 1.2, *PL* 77:161.
21. Basil, *Homilia in Psalmum LXI*, *PG* 29:469–84, Cyprian, *de bono patientiae*, in *A Donat et la Vertu de Patience*, ed. Jean Molanger, SC 291 (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1982).
22. Jacques Derrida, *Dissemination*, trans. Barbara Johnson (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1981), p. 221.
23. Tertullian, *de Patientia*, 2, 3.
24. The Penguin translation gives a better sense of this extreme emotion: Vettius Epagathus "boil[ed] with indignation." Eusebius, *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*, trans. G. A. Williamson (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1965), p. 194.

25. Brent D. Shaw, "Body/Power/Identity: Passions of the Martyrs," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 4 (1996): 279, 278. Subsequent references to this article will occur parenthetically in the text. See also Daniel Boyarin, *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1999), pp. 1–41.
26. Judith Perkins, "Space, Place, Voice in the *Acts* of the Martyrs and the Greek Romance," in *Mimesis and Intertextuality in Antiquity and Christianity*, ed. Dennis Ronald MacDonald (Harrisburg, PA: Trinity Press International, 2001), p. 117.
27. See Derrida, *Margins of Philosophy*, p. 5.
28. See Derrida, *Of Grammatology*, trans. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976), pp. 112–13; and Julia Kristeva, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, ed. Leon S. Roudiez, trans. Thomas Gora, Alice Jardine, and Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980), pp.133–46.
29. Perkins, "Space, Place, Voice," p. 117; *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in the Early Christian Era* (London: Routledge, 1995), p. 246.
30. Brent D. Shaw, "The Passion of Perpetua," *Past and Present* 139 (1993): 15.
31. Jacobus de Voragine, *Legenda Aurea*, ed. Th. Graesse, 3rd ed. (1890; repr. Osnabrück: Otto Zeller, 1965). Subsequent references to this work will be to *LA*, by page numbers.
32. See Sanok, "Reading Hagiographically," p. 330.
33. Maud Burnett McNerney, *Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), p. 49.
34. Gregory the Great, *Homelias in Evangelia*, ed. Raymond Étaix. CCSL 141 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1999), 2.35.4; Hanna, "Some Commonplaces," p. 68. See Gregory the Great, *Dialogi* 3.26.
35. I use Hanna's translations of the passages that he quotes. See Augustine, *de Patientia*, 2, and Hanna, "Some Commonplaces," p. 68.
36. Lynda L. Coon, *Sacred Fictions: Holy Women and Hagiography in Late Antiquity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), p. 8. See also Gregory the Great, *Moralia in Job*, ed. M. Adriaen, CCSL 143. 3 vols. (Turnhout: Brepols, 1979–85), chap. 30.
37. See Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), pp. xi, 27 (and n. 13), 34–49.
38. Clement of Rome, *First Epistle to the Corinthians*, in *A New Eusebius: Documents Illustrative of the History of the Church to A.D. 337*, ed. J. Stevenson (London: SPCK, 1960), p. 4. I do not mean to imply that any religion is more inherently sexist than any other.
39. Tertullian, *Ad Scapulam*, ed. E. Dekkers, *Opera* 2:1132 (translation: Rudolph Arbesmann, in *Tertullian: Apologetical Works and Minucius Felix: Octavius*. FC 10 [Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1950], p. 160); Shaw, "Passion of Perpetua," p. 13.
40. Minucius Felix, *Octavius*, ed. W. C. A. Kerr, trans. Gerald H. Rendall (London: William Heinemann, 1966), 37.10. I have adjusted the translation.

41. Tertullian's *Apologeticum* contains much condemnation of Roman imperial tyranny (4.1 [p. 92]). He argues, for instance, for efficacy of law (4.13 [p. 94]), freedom of conscience (24.6–7 [p. 134], 28.1 [p. 139], 39.5 [pp. 150–51], 49.4 [p. 169]), equality before the law (2.1–5 [pp. 87–88]), and the right of a free citizen to a fair and open trial (2.10–11 [p. 89], 3.3 [p. 91], 4.13 [p. 94], 37.4 [p. 148]). Some of his phrases suggest overthrow of the political system (20.2–3 [p. 122]), 42.8 [pp. 157–58], 45.7 [p. 160]). He even reads the male and female body in an even-handed fashion. See Perkins, "The Rhetoric of the Maternal Body in *The Passion of Perpetua*," in *Mapping Gender in Ancient Religious Discourses*, ed. Todd Penner and Caroline Vander Stichele (Leiden: Brill, 2007), p. 332. Many critics note that the professed egalitarianism of Christianity must be inimical to the political beliefs associated with the Roman Empire. See, for example, Giselle de Nie, "'Consciousness Fecund through God': From Male Fighter to Spiritual Bride-Mother in Late Antique Female Sanctity," in *Sanctity and Motherhood: Essays on Holy Mothers in the Middle Ages*, ed. Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker (New York: Garland, 1995), pp. 104, 108.
42. Pliny the Younger, *Epistularum Libri Decem*, ed. R. A. B. Mynors (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963), 10.96.9 (p. 339); translation: Henry Bettenson, ed. and trans., *Documents of the Christian Church* (London: Oxford University Press, 1943), p. 5.
43. This egalitarianism has been noted almost obsessively by critics down through the ages, but, almost certainly due to incorrigibly sexist attitudes and to a general discomfort in influential academic circles with ideals that are based on religious faith, it curiously and confoundedly still does not receive the attention that it deserves for its significance. See, for example, Evelyn Birge Vitz, "Gender and Martyrdom," *Medievalia et Humanistica*, new series 26 (1999): 92.
44. Tacitus, *Annales Livres XIII–XVI*, ed. Pierre Wuilleumier (Paris: Société d'Édition "Les Belles Lettres," 1978), 13.32; translation: Bettenson, *Documents*, p. 1.
45. Pliny the Younger, *Epistulae*, 10.96.8 (p. 339); translation: Bettenson, *Documents*, p. 5.
46. Eusebius, *History*, pp. 23, 418–20, 337, 341.
47. "Passion of Perpetua," p. 13, and n. 36. In the later Middle Ages, female saints typically drop to about 20 percent of the corpus. See Sanok, *Her Life Historical*, p. 39.
48. Eusebius, *History*, p. 192, n. 1.
49. Clement of Rome, *Epistle*, p. 4.
50. See Virginia Burrus, *Saving Shame: Martyrs, Saints, and Other Abject Subjects* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), p. 24. For female slaves, see Christine Trevett, *Christian Women and the Time of the Apostolic Fathers (AD c. 80–160): Corinth, Rome and Asia Minor* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2006), pp. 201–03.
51. Susan Stanford Friedman, *Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographies of Encounter* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998), p. 25, and

- see Rosi Braidotti, *Nomadic Subjects: Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Contemporary Feminist Theory* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), pp. 4, 268–77.
52. Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 25.
  53. Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 27, and Elizabeth A. Castelli, *Visions and Voyeurism: Holy Women and the Politics of Sight in Early Christianity* (Berkeley: Center for Hermeneutical Studies, 1995), p. 19.
  54. Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination*, p. 105; Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 28. For class in these narratives, see Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, p. 113.
  55. Shaw is particularly helpful in explaining the traditions and influence of the Greek athletic contest. See “Body,” pp. 278, 289–90.
  56. See Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.1–9 (pp. 169–70); Clement of Rome, *Epistle*, p. 4; and Aldhelm’s prose *De Virginitate*, composed c. 700 (Aldhelmi *Opera Omnia*, ed. R. Ehwald [Berlin: Monumenta Germaniae Historica, 1919], *De Virginitate*, p. 230).
  57. Vitz, “Gender and Martyrdom,” p. 80. See Clement of Rome, *Epistle*, p. 4; Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.8 (p. 170).
  58. See P. Vergili Maronis, *Opera*, ed. A. Sidgwick, 2 vols. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1927) 1: *Aeneid* 1, lines 275–96. For the power that the martyrs gain through the spectacle of their tortures, see Peter Brown, *The Cult of the Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981), pp. 106–27.
  59. See Robert Graves, *The Greek Myths*, 2 vols. (New York: George Braziller, 1955), 2:113–16, 121–22.
  60. Shaw, “Passion of Perpetua,” pp. 6, 18.
  61. Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination*, p. 108.
  62. Vergil, *Aeneid* 1:378–79; see Mary R. Lefkowitz, “The Motivations for St. Perpetua’s Martyrdom,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 44 (1976): 418.
  63. Tacitus, *Annales* 13.33; translation: Bettenson, *Documents*, p. 1.
  64. See Clare A. Lees, “At a Crossroads: Old English and Feminist Criticism,” in *Reading Old English Texts*, ed. Katherine O’Brien O’Keeffe (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1997), p. 161.
  65. 4 Maccabees 6:7; Peter Damian, *Opusculum* 40.9, *PL* 145:659–60.
  66. Kirk, ““Who Suffreth More Than God?”” p. 92.
  67. See Ignatius of Antioch, *Epistle to the Romans*, in Ignatius of Antioch, *Lettres*, ed. P. Th. Camelot, 4th ed. (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1969), 6.1–2. Subsequent references to Ignatius’s *Epistles* will be to this edition. See also Acts 2:24, Galatians 4:19.
  68. See Shaw, “Body,” pp. 287–88, and n. 58; and Elizabeth A. Castelli, *Martyrdom and Memory: Early Christian Culture Making* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), pp. 71–77.
  69. See Ignatius, *Epistle to the Trallians*, 4.1.
  70. Achilles Tatius, *The Adventures of Leucippe and Clitophon*, with an English translation by S. Gaselee (London: William Heinemann, 1984), 6.21.345.

- Subsequent references to this work will appear in the text. Cf. Musurillo, ed., pp. 79, 133, 159, and see Shaw, "Body," p. 271, and n. 3.
71. Perkins, "Space, Place, Voice," p. 117.
  72. Perkins, "Space, Place, Voice," p. 118.
  73. See Shaw, "Body," pp. 291–4; Susan Signe Morrison, *Women Pilgrims in Late Medieval England: Private Piety as Public Performance* (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 112; and Patricia Cox Miller, ed., *Women in Early Christianity: Translations from Greek Texts* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2005), pp. 253–86. For Seneca, see *De Ira in Seneca: Moral Essays*, ed. John W. Basore, 3 vols. (London: William Heinemann, 1952), 1:2.12.6; and Hanna, "Some Commonplaces," p. 77.
  74. Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality Volume 1: An Introduction*, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Vintage, 1990), pp. 97, 94, 98; Derrida, *Margins of Philosophy*, p. 17.
  75. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, pp. 116, 123.
  76. See Jerome, *Epistola 1*, in *Select Letters of St. Jerome*, ed. F. A. Wright (London: William Heinemann, 1963), 1.7–9.
  77. The slighting also appears in 4 Maccabees (see 15:4–5).
  78. Pliny the Elder, *Naturalis historia Livre VII*, ed. Robert Schilling (Paris: Belles Lettres, 1977), 7.23.87 (p. 70); Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.8 (p. 170). See Pausanias, *Graecia descripto*, ed. Maria Helena Rocha-Pereira, 3 vols. (Leipzig: Teubner, 1973–81), 1: 1.23.1–2.
  79. Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.8 (p. 170). The translation I use is that of Emily Joseph Daly, in Tertullian, *Apologetical Works*, FC 10 (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1950), pp. 1–126. Subsequent references will appear in the text.
  80. Pliny the Elder, *Naturalis historia*, 7.23.87 (p. 70).
  81. See also Larissa Tracy, trans. and intro., *Women of the Gilte Legende: A Selection of Middle English Saints Lives* (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2003), p. 111; and Kevin Brownlee, "Martyrdom and the Female Voice: Saint Christine in the *Cité des dames*," in *Images of Sainthood in Medieval Europe*, pp. 124–32. The tongue-severing episode, suggestive of self-castration, is appropriated into the vita of Paul the Hermit. The roles of the major characters are exactly reversed: he is tempted by a prostitute (*LA*, 94).
  82. Tertullian prefers the magnified version of her sexual history from Pliny. In Pausanias's account, she is not a prostitute but the mistress of one of the conspirators. See Pausanias, *Graecia descripto*, 1:1.23.1–2.
  83. Roland Barthes, *A Lover's Discourse: Fragments*, trans. Richard Howard (New York: Hill and Wang, 1978), p. 154.
  84. Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.8 (p. 170); translation: Daly, in *Tertullian: Apologetical Works*, p. 124.
  85. See Cicero, *De inventione*, 2.54.163: *Scripta quae manserunt omnia, fasc. 2: Rhetorici libri duo qui vocantur de inventione*, ed. E. Stroebel (Stuttgart: Teubner, 1965), p. 149; and Tertullian, *de Patientia*, 2, 3, 4.
  86. Pausanias, *Graecia descripto*, 1:1.23.2.

87. Hélène Cixous, "The Laugh of the Medusa," *Signs* 1 (1967): 883; and *LA*, 420, 421.
88. This text has been dated to both pre-Christian and post-Christian times. The first century AD seems the most probable date. I use *The Testament of Job*, in *The Apocryphal Old Testament*, ed. H. F. D. Sparks (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1984), pp. 617–48. Subsequent references will occur by chapter numbers parenthetically in the text.
89. For the original's term for these girdles, see *The Testament of Job According to the SV Text*, ed. Robert A. Kraft (Missoula: Society of Biblical Literature and Scholars' Press, 1974), p. 79, n. 46.8.
90. For Gregory the Great's *Regulae Pastoralis*, I use *PL* 77:9–128.
91. A major reason for these changes is that "masculine identity is itself rendered queerly malleable and unstable by its explicit linking with the suffering endurance of women." Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 32.
92. See Longus, *Daphnis and Chloe*, trans. George Thornley, revised J. M. Edmonds (London: William Heinemann, 1935), 1.28.50–52, 2.20.95–97. Subsequent references will appear in the text.
93. Frequently martyrs are placed in prison (Musurillo, ed., 70–73, 108–11, etc.), but this location is not a By Way. It merely suspends and continues the same kind of suffering process as the Suffering Portion.
94. Perpetua's narrative is an important transitional text with regard to By Ways. Her first dialogue with her father is quasi-judicial, even though it seems to occur in the family home, because (among other things) it includes a statement of Belief Identification and is reminiscent of a marriage dispute (Musurillo, ed., 108–09). Certainly the head of a Roman family can claim a kind of legal authority over his family members that is parallel to the judge-persecutor's authority in many passios.
95. Examples of varying translations are Musurillo, ed., 79; Eusebius, *History*, p. 202; Stevenson, *New Eusebius*, p. 39; Shaw "Passion of Perpetua," p. 18.
96. See Shaw, "Passion of Perpetua," pp. 7–9, and nn. 18, 20.
97. See Henry George Liddell and Robert Scott, eds., *A Greek-English Lexicon*, 9th ed., 2 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1940), s. v. *γυργαθόν*.
98. See Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, p. 200; Jacques Lacan, *Écrits: A Selection*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Norton, 1977), p. 305. See also p. 306; and *The Four Fundamental Concepts of Psychoanalysis: The Seminar of Jacques Lacan Book XI*, ed. Jacques-Alain Miller, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Norton, 1981), p. 72; and Castelli, *Visions and Voyeurism*, pp. 2–9.
99. Kirk, "'Who Suffreth More Than God?'" p. 89.
100. Lees, "At a Crossroads," p. 151.
101. See Braidotti, *Nomadic Subjects*, pp. 269–70.
102. Sheila Delany, "'Mothers to Think Back Through': Who Are They? The Ambiguous Example of Christine de Pizan," in *Medieval Texts and Contemporary Readers*, ed. Laurie A. Finke and Martin B. Shichtman

- (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1987), pp. 179–81, 196–97. The idea of a woman's tradition is continually refreshed by redefining that tradition. See *Gendering the Master Narrative: Women and Power in the Middle Ages*, ed. Mary C. Erler and Maryanne Kowaleski (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2003).
103. See Scott Bukatman, *Terminal Identity: The Virtual Subject in Postmodern Science Fiction* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1993), pp. 244–47, 260–61.
  104. Elizabeth A. Castelli, "'I Will Make Mary Male': Pieties of the Body and Gender Transformation of Christian Women in Late Antiquity," in *Body Guards: The Cultural Politics of Gender Ambiguity*, ed. Julia Epstein and Kristina Straub (New York: Routledge, 1991), pp. 33 and 42. These glimpses work like the ideas of "the trace" and "the supplement" in Derrida's theories of language. See *Of Grammatology*, pp. 145, 178. Another way of understanding these glimpses is as occasional glimpses of the immanent Marxist revolution, endlessly delayed by culture. See Raymond Williams, *The Long Revolution* (London: Chatto and Windus, 1961), p. 50. See also Michel Foucault, *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, trans. Bouchard and Sherry Simon (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1977), pp. 154–56.
  105. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 116. See pp. 116–21.
  106. Emmanuel Levinas, *Difficult Freedom: Essays on Judaism*, trans. Seán Hand (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990), p. 293.
  107. See McNerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, pp. 3–4, and n. 7; and Foucault, *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*, pp. 154–56. Another important reason for repetition in the saints' lives has to do with attitudes toward the body. The bodies of martyrs have the same tortures visited upon them again and again because that is the way, as Barthes notes, that the bodies of victims of sadism nearly always appear in literary works and other artistic compositions: the victim's body is constantly renewed for new torture. See Barthes, *A Lover's Discourse*, p. 207; Musurillo, ed., 69.
  108. See Augustine, *Sermones*, 280.1.1, *PL* 38:1281.
  109. As Thomas J. Farrell has noticed. See "The Chronotopes of Monology in Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*," in *Bakhtin and Medieval Voices*, ed. Thomas J. Farrell (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1995), pp. 150–1, and, more generally, E. P. Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (New York: Pantheon, 1963), p. 4.
  110. See Jo Ann McNamara, "Sexual Equality and the Cult of Virginity in Early Christian Thought," in *Women in Early Christianity*, ed. David M. Scholer (New York: Routledge, 1993), pp. 228–29.
  111. See Robert Mills, "Can the Virgin Martyr Speak?" in *Medieval Virginites*, ed. Anke Bernau, Ruth Evans, and Sarah Salih (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003), pp. 201; 187; and Castelli, *Visions and Voyeurism*, p. 10.
  112. Bukatman, *Terminal Identity*, p. 265.



113. Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), p. 90; Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1990), p. 145. See also pp. 140–41, 148.
114. McNerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 4. Explicit justification for the appropriation of hagiographical material from one life to another occurs in *The Earliest Life of Gregory the Great*, ed. Bertram Colgrave (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1985), pp. 130–32, and Gregory of Tours, *Vitam Patri*, Preface, in *Miracula et Opera Minora*, ed. B. Krusch. *Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptorum rerum Merovingicorum* 1 (Hanover: Hahnsche, 1885): 661–744.
115. See Hippolyte Delehaye, *Les légendes hagiographiques* (Brussels: Société des Bollandistes, 1905), pp. ix, 71–106. Sherry L. Reames neatly summarizes Delehaye's complicated and influential but ultimately patronizing attitude toward the *Legenda Aurea*. See her *The Legenda aurea: A Reexamination of Its Paradoxical History* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985), pp. 20–26; and Thomas J. Heffernan, *Sacred Biography: Saints and Their Biographers in the Middle Ages* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), pp. 55–67.
116. These attitudes began in the early modern period and have persisted. See Reames, *Legenda aurea*, pp. 27–63.
117. See Gregory the Great, *Dialogi* 3.28.
118. Bhabha, *Location of Culture*, p. 86. See also Michael Tausig, *Mimesis and Alterity*, (New York: Routledge, 1993), p. 19.
119. Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble*, p. 146. For a more positive version of mimicry through gender, see Luce Irigaray, *The Irigaray Reader*, ed. Margaret Whitford (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1991), p. 124; and Gail Ashton, "Patient Mimesis: Griselda and the *Clerk's Tale*," *Chaucer Review* 32 (1998): 233.
120. Jacobus, *LA*, 31. Jacobus's ultimate source for the passion of Lucy is the version now considered part of the *Acta Sanctorum*, most likely composed in the fifth century.
121. William Granger Ryan, trans., Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*, 2 vols. (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993), 1:29. Subsequent references will occur in the text.
122. Lives of Lucy in earlier texts contain the same idea of doubling (*duplicabitur*). See B. Mombritius, ed., *Sanctuarium seu Vitae Sanctorum*, 2nd ed., 2 vols. (Paris: Fontemoing, 1910) 2:108; and the Cotton-Corpus Legendary, CCCC 9, 220r.
123. McNerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 4.
124. Bhabha, *Location of Culture*, p. 86.
125. Irigaray, *Irigaray Reader*, p. 124 (see also p. 134); N. Katherine Hayles, *How We Became Posthuman: Virtual Bodies in Cybernetics, Literature, and Informatics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), pp. 8–9.
126. See *Pearl*, ed. E. V. Gordon (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1953), lines 169–240, 1101–07, 1115, 1147; *Sir Orfeo*, ed. A. J. Bliss, 2nd ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966), lines 304, 321–22, 405–08.

127. Julian of Norwich, *The Writings of Julian of Norwich: A Vision Showed to a Devout Woman and A Revelation of Love*, ed. Nicholas Watson and Jacqueline Jenkins (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2006), p. 131; Margery Kempe, *The Book of Margery Kempe*, ed. Sanford Brown Meech and Hope Emily Allen (London: Oxford University Press, 1940, repr. 1997), pp. 8, 68–69.
128. Bhabha, *Location of Culture*, pp. 88–89. See also p. 91. I mean by the distressed canon that the traditional literary and intellectual canon is never “ready” for writing that is exclusively feminine, but it is also never “happy” with its impulse to exclude. See Lees, “At a Crossroads,” p. 152.
129. See Laura Mulvey, “Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema,” in *Contemporary Literary Criticism: Literary and Cultural Studies*, ed. Robert Con Davis and Ronald Schleifer, 3rd ed. (New York: Longman, 1994), p. 429.

## 1 The Female Patience Figure as Speaker

1. See Judith Perkins, *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in the Early Christian Era* (London: Routledge, 1995), p. 104. For the manuscripts and editions of this passio, see Carolyn Osiek, “Perpetua’s Husband,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 10 (2002): 287, n. 1. For the later manuscript versions of this passio and its reception in centuries after its first appearance, see Rex D. Butler, *The New Prophecy and “New Visions”: Evidence of Montanism in “The Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas”* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2006), pp. 98–126.
2. See Brent D. Shaw, “The Passion of Perpetua,” *Past and Present* 139 (1993): 45. The passio has been relatively neglected by specialists in literary analysis. A notable exception is Erin Ronse, “Rhetoric of Martyrs: Listening to Saints Perpetua and Felicitas,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 14 (2006): 283–327. See also Thomas J. Heffernan and James E. Shelton, “*Paradisus in carcere*: The Vocabulary of Imprisonment and the Theology of Martyrdom in the *Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 14 (2006): 217–23.
3. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, pp. 105, 113, 112. See Barbara Baert, in “Mantle, Fur, Pallium: Veiling and Unveiling in the Martyrdom of Agnes of Rome,” in *Weaving, Veiling, and Dressing: Textiles and Their Metaphors in the Late Middle Ages*, ed. Kathrun M. Rudy and Baert (Turnhout: Brepols, 2007), nn. 9 and 18.
4. See Heidi Vierow, “Feminine and Masculine Voices in the *Passion of Saints Perpetua and Felicitas*,” *Latomus* 58 (1999): 618.
5. See Ronse, “Rhetoric of Martyrs,” pp. 292–93. See Brent D. Shaw, “Judicial Nightmares and Christian Memory,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 11 (2003): 546; and Joyce E. Salisbury, *Perpetua’s Passion: The Death and Memory of a Young Roman Woman* (New York: Routledge, 1997), p. 114.

6. Ross Shepard Kraemer, *Her Share of the Blessings: Women's Religions among Pagans, Jews, and Christians in the Greco-Roman World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), pp. 159–61. For Montanism, see R. Butler, *New Prophecy*, pp. 9–43.
7. Elizabeth A. Castelli, "'I Will Make Mary Male': Pieties of the Body and Gender Transformation of Christian Women in Late Antiquity," in *Body Guards: The Cultural Politics of Gender Ambiguity*, ed. Julia Epstein and Kristina Straub (New York: Routledge, 1991), pp. 33 and 42, her emphasis.
8. See Shaw, "Passion of Perpetua," p. 29; Salisbury, *Perpetua's Passion*, pp. 105–06; and Giselle de Nie, "'Consciousness Fecund through God': From Male Fighter to Spiritual Bride-Mother in Late Antique Female Sanctity," in *Sanctity and Motherhood: Essays on Holy Mothers in the Middle Ages*, ed. Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker (New York: Garland, 1995), p. 119. The wound in Dinocrates's face may be allegorized in other ways. See F. J. Dölger, "Antike Parallelen zum leidenden Dinocrates in der Passio Perpetuae," *Antike und Christentum* 2 (1930): 28–31.
9. Julia Kristeva, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, ed. Leon S. Roudiez, trans. Thomas Gora, Alice Jardine, and Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980), p. 135.
10. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 133. She calls the sounds of an infant that have no connection with signified objects examples of "chora," a term she gets from Plato. See pp. 133, 135.
11. Ronse, "Rhetoric of Martyrs," p. 319; Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 140.
12. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, pp. 139, 134.
13. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 139. See Virginia Burrus, *Saving Shame: Martyrs, Saints, and Other Abject Subjects* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), p. 28.
14. This idea of domestic space also connects Perpetua with Jewish traditions. See Daniel Boyarin, *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1999), p. 81.
15. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, pp. 133; 140. See also pp. 138, 142. The connection between the waterpot and transformational language recalls the Samaritan woman to whom Jesus describes "living water" and reveals Himself as the Messiah (John 4:6–30). She abandons her waterpot and urges the local townspeople to come and see Jesus (4:28–30). The parallel between water carried in a pot and her (potentially transformational) message is obvious.
16. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 142. He says *uideo* [I see], and then tries to blind his daughter.
17. Ronse, "Rhetoric of Martyrs," p. 320. See Margaret R. Miles, *Carnal Knowing: Female Nakedness and Religious Meaning in the Christian West* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1989), p. 59. Within the Judeo-Christian tradition, a vase or waterpot calls to mind besides John 4:6–30 associations with Rebecca (Genesis 24:10–20). See Mary Douglas, *Purity and Danger: An*

- Analysis of the Concepts of Pollution and Taboo* (1966, repr. London: Ark, 1984), p. 158. For Jerome, a water pitcher is an image of a chaste woman's body. See *Epistola* 22, 64.
18. See Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, pp. 140–41.
  19. See Eva C. Keals, "Attic Vase-Painting and the Home Textile Industry," in *Ancient Greek Art and Iconography*, ed. Warren G. Moone (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1983), pp. 209, 210–14, and figs. 14.1–6. In ancient Greek art a woman carrying a water jar is subject to "male erotic fantasies," "voyeurism," and "rape." See pp. 212, 210, 214. For the vase in the passio, see Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, p. 59. For an early medieval artwork depicting a woman at a well, see Lynda L. Coon, *Sacred Fictions: Holy Women and Hagiography in Late Antiquity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1997), p. 47, fig. 1.
  20. However, this pattern is broken at the fourth vision. No use of *facio* appears just before this last dream, perhaps because Perpetua does not pray for a vision, or for anything else, at this juncture.
  21. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 135. Perpetua uses a form of *facio* to indicate her famous transformation into a man: *et expoliata sum et facta sum masculus* (p. 118) [my clothes were stripped off, and suddenly I was a man] (p. 119).
  22. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 137. In a later version of her passio, Perpetua uses wordplay with regard to her name, which makes her usurpation of the masculine power of naming even clearer. See Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, p. 60.
  23. Ronsse, "Rhetoric of Martyrs," p. 311.
  24. See Robert Rousselle, "The Dreams of Vibia Perpetua: Analysis of a Female Christian Martyr," *The Journal of Psychohistory* 14 (1987): 193–206, for a very convincing psychological reading that has received much acknowledgment, but little engagement.
  25. See Alwyn Pettersen, "Perpetua—Prisoner of Conscience," *Vigiliae Christianae* 41 (1987): 144. "Caseo" certainly means "cheese," not "milk." The image makes heaven Eucharistic, but the substance that Perpetua consumes comes from a ewe, a female source, rather than from Christ's male body.
  26. See also Jerome's *Commentarium in Ezekiel* 3.5 in *PL* 25.35d. The honey image appears in later saints' lives concerning women. See John Capgrave, *The Life of Saint Katherine*, ed. Karen Winstead (Kalamazoo, Middle English Text Series [TEAMS], 1999), Prologue, lines 83–107; IV, lines 43–71. More generally, see the discussion concerning a passage in Chaucer's *Prioress's Tale* that features a "greyn" representing powers of speech (lines 643–676, and p. 916, n. 662).
  27. De Nie, "'Consciousness Fecund through God,'" pp. 102–03, 109–10. E. R. Dodds seems to have first made the cheese=semen connection. See *Pagan and Christian in an Age of Anxiety: Some Aspects of Religious Experience from Marcus Aurelius to Constantine* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1965), p. 51.

28. Clement of Alexandria, *Le Pédagogue*, ed. Henri-Irénée Marrou, 3 vols. (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1960–83) 1:6.42.3, 43.3–4, 46.1. I found this reference in de Nie, “‘Consciousness Fecund through God,’” pp. 113–14, and see Caroline Walker Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), pp. 132–35; and Susan Signe Morrison, *Women Pilgrims in Late Medieval England: Private Piety as Public Performance* (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 10.
29. Ambrose, *De Virginibus*, ed. Egnatius Cazzaniga (Turin: G. B. Paravia, 1948), 1.5.22. Translation: Boniface Ramsey, trans. *Ambrose* (London: Routledge, 1997).
30. Evelyn Birge Vitz, “Gender and Martyrdom,” *Medievalia et Humanistica*, new series 26 (1999): 90; *LA*, 163, 168, 171–72, 203–04, 398, 528, 794. For the reference to Tertullian, see his *Apologeticum*, 50.13 (p. 171); and Timothy David Barnes, *Tertullian: A Historical and Literary Study*, rev. ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985), pp. 77–78.
31. *Hrotsvithae Opera*, ed. Paulus de Winterfeld (Munich: Monumenta Germaniae Historica, 1978), p. 188, lines 5–7.
32. *The Plays of Hrotswitha of Gandersheim*, trans. Larissa Bonfante (New York: New York University Press, 1979), p. 159. I found these references in Vitz, “Gender and Martyrdom,” p. 81.
33. Vitz, “Gender and Martyrdom,” p. 90. See n. 20, and de Nie, “‘Consciousness Fecund through God,’” p. 114, and nn. 59, 60, and 61. The image is common. See *LA*, 168, 203–04, 794, and Thomas J. Heffernan, *Sacred Biography: Saints and Their Biographers in the Middle Ages* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988), p. 288.
34. De Nie, “‘Consciousness Fecund through God,’” p. 119, and see n. 82. For a summary of the various interpretations of Perpetua’s first dream, see Patricia M. Davis, “The Weaning of Perpetua: Female Embodiment and Spiritual Growth Metaphor in the Dream of an Early Christian Martyr,” *Dreaming* 15 (2005): 263–64.
35. See Walter J. Ong, *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word* (London: Routledge, 1981), pp. 38–39, 43–45.
36. Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 139.
37. R. Butler, *New Prophecy*, pp. 70, 91–92. For the terms for “prayer” and “sigh” in Greek and Latin, see p. 70. He also refers to Romans 8:26.
38. Tertullian, *Apologeticum*, 50.1–9 (pp. 169–70); *de Patientia*, 4.4; Salisbury, *Perpetua’s Passion*, pp. 109–10.
39. See Perkins, “The Rhetoric of the Maternal Body,” p. 316.
40. Ronsse, “Rhetoric of Martyrs,” pp. 307; 321–22.
41. The child can of course represent other things besides language and/or female inheritance.
42. Cf. Maud Burnett McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), p. 21; and Perkins, *Roman Imperial Identities in the Early Christian Era* (London: Routledge, 2009), pp. 163–69.
43. Ronsse, “Rhetoric of Martyrs,” pp. 323–24. See also p. 325.

44. See Ronsse, "Rhetoric of Martyrs," p. 325. One may take this idea of inheritance further, into, for instance, the careers of women who found and organize exclusively female monastic societies. See de Nie, "Consciousness Fecund through God," p. 128, who observes that Saint Eugenia inspires other women to found convents of nuns. See also p. 136. For Eugenia, see *Vita Sanctae Eugeniae Virginis ad Martyris*, in *De Vitis Patrum* 1, PL 73:606–24.
45. See Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, p. 61. M. Louise Robert, "Une vision de Perpétue martyre en 203," *Comptes rendus de l'académie des inscriptions et belles-lettres* (1982): 256–58, puts the strongest case that Perpetua must change into a man in order to participate in the wrestling match. For analogues to Perpetua's battle with the devil, see Lloyd A. Thompson, *Romans and Blacks* (London: Routledge, 1989), pp. 110–13. The Egyptian may be an image suggested by Tertullian. See R. Butler, *New Prophecy*, pp. 74–76.
46. See Pettersen, "Perpetua—Prisoner of Conscience," p. 149, and n. 79; and de Nie, "Consciousness Fecund through God," pp. 122, 149–50. If it is necessary for Perpetua to become a man in order to triumph and to gain heaven, why in her first dream does she tread on the dragon's head, an openly Christlike (and hence male) act, and then get to a kind of heaven without needing any gender transformation? See Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 29.
47. See Wayne A. Meeks, "The Image of the Androgyne: Some Uses of a Symbol in Earliest Christianity," *History of Religions* 13 (1974): 165–208. McInerney notes that *masculus* could be an adjective rather than a noun, so Perpetua might become "masculine" rather than "a man" at this juncture. The treatment of her by the attendants, in my view, suggests instead an actual change of sex. See *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 26.
48. See Tertullian, *Spectaculis*, 3.8.
49. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, p. 112; de Nie, "Consciousness Fecund through God," p. 120. In the passio, see *hanc . . . hunc . . . Filia* (118) [her . . . her . . . Daughter] (119).
50. Perkins, "The Rhetoric of the Maternal Body," p. 326. See Shaw, "Judicial Nightmares," p. 546, for an analogous dream by a man who fights the emperor in the arena.
51. See Castelli, "I Will Make Mary Male," p. 37. Critics are perhaps wary of calling a text "feminist" when it cannot be described as such. See p. 46. Feminism, in its twentieth-century and twenty-first-century manifestations, is a body of attitudes that late antique people could not possibly have held or even considered. At best a kind of "locational feminism" may be detected in previous eras. See Susan Stanford Friedman, *Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographies of Encounter* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 3–13, 102–03.
52. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, p. 106.
53. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, p. 107; R. Butler, *New Prophecy*, p. 65.
54. See Robert, "Une vision de Perpétué," pp. 255–56.

55. Perpetua fulfills the text in Genesis 3:15 by bruising the head of the serpent. For Rousselle, the weapons are phallic symbols, and this dream, like the others, represents a wish for sexual activity, suggested by words like *ascendo*. See “Dreams of Vibia Perpetua,” p. 195. This interpretation only shores up the masculine soldier-ideal embodied in the weapons, which Perpetua overcomes.
56. Perkins, *The Suffering Self*, pp. 109, 107. See the *passio*, 112–13, 116–17.
57. Castelli, “I Will Make Mary Male,” p. 39; Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 29.
58. Mary R. Lefkowitz, “The Motivations for St. Perpetua’s Martyrdom,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 44 (1976): 421. See also Miles, *Carnal Knowing*, p. 59, who notes that her dreams tend to be of men—lots of men. She never dreams of a woman, save herself. Examples of benign, supportive men would be the old shepherd, Dinocrates, the trainer, and Perpetua’s seconds at the wrestling match.
59. His position on the ladder ahead of Perpetua in the first vision works as a prophecy of his death before hers in the martyrdoms. Satorus first appears in this vision, where he gets the description of leader and teacher. He is not arrested with the same group of catechumens as Perpetua’s (110–11). He reappears rather suddenly when the narrator intrudes Satorus’s vision right after her diary concludes (118–23). Satorus then has a leading role in the martyrdoms, rightly predicting the manner of his death (126–27). He is killed first, and this position seems to be interpreted as a point of honor among the catechumens (128–31). None of Perpetua’s subsequent visions need prompting from a man in order to occur.
60. Satorus’s vision is unexpected and seems slightly out of place when otherwise the narrative reads quite smoothly. The ending of Perpetua’s section leads the audience to expect a description of martyrdoms, not a vision by another prisoner.
61. In heaven, Satorus announces to her *Habes quod uis* (120) [“Your wish is granted”] (121), as if he had a higher position than her in the heavenly hierarchy and maintained some authority over her. Perpetua’s narrative, on the other hand, does not suggest that Satorus is superior to her.
62. A deacon, he first appears as a briber of Perpetua’s prison guards (108), then as a messenger from her to her father (114), and finally in Perpetua’s fourth vision (116).
63. Shaw, “Passion of Perpetua,” p. 7.
64. Shaw, “Passion of Perpetua,” pp. 7–8, 6.
65. Burrus, *Saving Shame*, p. 31.
66. See John Anson, “The Female Transvestite in Early Monasticism: The Origin and Development of a Motif,” *Viator* 5 (1974): 1–32; and Mathew Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch: Masculinity, Gender Ambiguity, and Christian Ideology in Late Antiquity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001), pp. 241–42.
67. See Paul E. Szarmach, “Ælfric’s Women Saints: Eugenia,” in *New Readings on Women in Old English Literature*, pp. 146–57, and his “St. Euphrosyne: Holy Transvestite,” in *Holy Men and Holy Women: Old English Prose Saints’ Lives*

- and Their Contexts*, ed. Szarmach (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996), pp. 356–65.
68. But see Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch*, p. 231. For female transvestism, see *LA*, 353, 397, 603, 674–77; for male, 654. Boyarin fully discusses the story's origin in a narrative of a Jewish virgin who saves her chastity through tricking her adversaries. See Boyarin, *Dying for God*, pp. 81–82.
  69. Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch*, pp. 147. See also pp. 243–44, and Virginia Burrus, “*Begotten, Not Made*”: *Conceiving Manhood in Late Antiquity* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2000), pp. 138–40.
  70. McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 67. The translation from Ambrose is that of Boniface Ramsey, in *Ambrose* (London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 71–116 (future references will occur in the text). The narrative is vastly concerned with place, constantly mentioning specific buildings and allegorical connections between buildings and people: *Ubi cumque virgo Dei est, templum Dei est* [Wherever a virgin of God is, there is a temple of God] (4.26; see also 4.27, 4.30, 4.32).
  71. See Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch*, p. 243, and n. 130. See also Deuteronomy 22:5.
  72. All of the characters in the *De Virginibus* speak in Ambrose's own peculiar style, which remains “shrill” throughout his writing career. Burrus, “*Begotten, Not Made*”, p. 138.
  73. For masquerades and sexual differences see Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1990), pp. 47–48, 50, 137–39.
  74. Ambrose uses the language of athletic competition throughout the text in a manner similar to Tertullian. See, for example, Ambrose, *De Virginibus*, 4.33.
  75. Indeed the possession of a woman's underclothes is often seen among men as a trophy representative of sexual conquest, even if the possessor did not engage in sex.
  76. Burrus, “Reading Agnes: The Rhetoric of Gender in Ambrose and Prudentius,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 3 (1995): 33. See also pp. 25, 42–43.
  77. See Burrus, *Begotten, Not Made*, p. 148.
  78. Cf. Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch*, p. 243.
  79. If the miracle, in the less modest one's eyes, of the soldier's transformation includes not only a metamorphosis into a woman but also into a virgin, the newcomer also reflects the soldier's presumed desire for a new life as a devout Christian.
  80. See Ramsey, *Ambrose*, p. 100, n. 21. This highly learned reference obviously is meant to appeal to a literary audience and shows most clearly how Ambrose's own voice is behind the discourse of all of his characters.
  81. Burrus, “*Begotten, Not Made*,” p. 150.
  82. See Kuefler, *The Manly Eunuch*, pp. 231, 243–44.
  83. The difference between the two characters' disguises are many. For instance, surely the virgin would be as ridiculous and unconvincing in



her new garb as the soldier is were anyone to inspect her closely, but apparently no-one does. A typical Roman soldier, familiar to local citizens yet anonymous and indistinguishable from other soldiers through the wearing of a kind of uniform, is not a typical object of the male gaze. The cross-dressing soldier is recognized immediately as a man because (among other reasons) he replaces a woman when a woman in a brothel is typically an object of the male gaze. In more practical terms, there is more substance to the dress of a Roman legionnaire than the dress of prostitute in a bedroom, so the soldier's armor can do a better job of covering up the person wearing it. Indeed, his armor has been designed for the exact purpose of shielding and covering.

84. Boyarin, *Dying for God*, p. 86.
85. I thus disagree with McInerney when she calls Ambrose's typical female martyr "pure symbolic object, perfectly passive and perfectly silent." See *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 11.
86. Virginia Burrus, "'Equipped for Victory': Ambrose and the Gendering of Orthodoxy," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 4 (1996): 472.
87. McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 50. She is thinking of Jerome's exhortations that women be learned, but largely silent. See pp. 64–65. I part company with McInerney completely when she finds the Virgin of Antioch to be "silenced by her own virginity, paralyzed by shame and fear of public opinion" (p. 72).
88. Bruno Krusch, ed., *Ionae Vitae Sanctorum Columbani, Vedastis, Iohannis* (Hanover: Impensis Bibliopolii Hahniani, 1905), 1–294; Jo Ann McNamara, John E. Halborg, and E. Gordon Whatley, eds. and trans., *Sainted Women of the Dark Ages* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1992), pp. 155–75. See also Coon, *Sacred Fictions*, pp. 24–26, 120–41; and Jane Tibbetts Schulenberg, *Forgetful of Their Sex: Female Sanctity and Society ca. 500–1100* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998).
89. The translation is that of McNamara and Halborg in *Sainted Women of the Dark Ages*, pp. 155–75.

## 2 The Female Patience Figure as Frozen Speaker

1. Later, male figures become more common, for example, the male personification of Patience in William Langland's *Piers Plowman: An Edition of the C-Text*, ed. Derek Pearsall (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978). See Passus 15, lines 33–34.
2. The complexity is surprising because critics have often treated Tertullian as strongly antifeminist. See Maud Burnett McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), p. 17.
3. Tertullian, *de Patientia*, 15.4. The translation I use is that of Emily Joseph Daly, in Tertullian, *Disciplinary, Moral and Ascetical Works*, FC 40 (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 1959), pp. 189–222. Subsequent references will appear in the text.

4. Shaw says that Tertullian “imagines *patientia* as a woman in dress and deportment—demure, shy, withdrawn, passive—the *alumna* or foster child of god. Tertullian accept[s] that this was, indeed, not just a female, but also a servile virtue.” “Body,” p. 297.
5. Men did not typically wear garments described as close-fitting in Tertullian’s day. Ambrose links patience itself with the idea of clothing. In his *de Iacob*, he says *induat patientia* (4.14), “let us put on patience,” ed. C. Schenkl, CSEL 32, part 2 (Vienna: F. Tempsky, 1897), pp. 1–70; Michael P. McHugh, trans. *Ambrose: Seven Exegetical Works*, FC 65 (Washington: Catholic University of America Press, 1972), p. 155. Ambrose also says *sume operimentum fidei atque patientiae* (4.10), [take up the covering of faith and of patience] in his *de Interpellatione Iob et David*, (ed. C. Schenkl, CSEL 32, part 2), pp. 209–96; trans., p. 375.
6. See Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality, Volume 2: The Use of Pleasure*, trans. Robert Hurley (New York: Vintage, 1990), pp. 46–47.
7. The presumption is far too reductive.
8. Tertullian can be quite egalitarian in general, and certainly praises women martyrs as much as men, with little in the way of distinction between their personal qualities. See Daniel L. Hoffman, *The Status of Women and Gnosticism in Irenaeus and Tertullian* (Lewiston: Edwin Mellen Press, 1995), pp. 169–70. For critical works concerning Tertullian’s rhetorical skill, see Erin Ronsse, “Rhetoric of Martyrs: Listening to Saints Perpetua and Felicitas,” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 14 (2006): n. 15.
9. Tertullian, *De Cultu Feminam*, ed. A. Kroymann, *Opera* 1:341–70. See McNerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, pp. 17–20; and Brad Windon, “The Seduction of Weak Men: Tertullian’s Rhetorical Construction of Gender and Ancient Christian ‘Heresy,’” in *Mapping Gender in Ancient Religious Discourses*, ed. Todd Penner and Caroline Vander Stichele (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 459, 469.
10. See Perkins, “The Rhetoric of the Maternal Body,” pp. 320–23.
11. See Gregory’s letters in Bede, *Bede’s Ecclesiastical History of the English People*, ed. Bertram Colgrave and R. A. B. Mynors (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969), 1.27 and 30.
12. A. N. Doane, ed., *Genesis A: A New Edition* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1978), pp. 36–37. I use the edition in *The Junius Manuscript*, ed. George Philip Krapp (New York, Columbia University Press, 1931), pp. 3–87. For a review of criticism concerning this poem, see Paul G. Remley, *Old English Biblical Verse: Studies in Genesis, Exodus, and Daniel* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1996), pp. 18–19, 97.
13. Remley, *Old English Biblical Verse*, pp. 114, 143–49.
14. See Malcolm R. Godden, “The Trouble with Sodom: Literary Responses to Biblical Sexuality,” *Bulletin of the John Rylands Library* 77 (1995): 118, 119.
15. See M. Nussbaum, *The Therapy of Desire: Theory and Practice in Hellenistic Ethics* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), pp. 359–401.

16. See *Andreas and The Fates of the Apostles*, ed. Kenneth R. Brooks (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961), *Andreas*, lines 713, 717.
17. Julia Kristeva, "Women's Time," in *The Kristeva Reader*, ed. Toril Moi (New York: Columbia University Press, 1986), pp. 187–213.
18. Geoffrey W. Bromley, ed., *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia*, 4 vols. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1986), 3:172; J. D. Douglas and Merrill C. Tenney, eds., *The New International Dictionary of the Bible: Pictorial Edition* (Basingstoke: Marshall Pickering, 1987), p. 602. See Martin Harries, *Forgetting Lot's Wife: On Destructive Spectatorship* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2007), p. 28, fig. 3; p. 7, n. 5.
19. See Harries, *Forgetting Lot's Wife*, p. 104.
20. Some early texts interpret Lot's wife as a pillar, on the basis of their understanding of the Hebrew word used to describe her in her transformed state. See Josephus, *Jewish Antiquities Books I-IV*, in *Josephus*, ed. and trans. H. St. J. Thackeray, 9 vols. (London: William Heinemann, 1961), 4:101.
21. See *The Caedmon Manuscript of Anglo-Saxon Biblical Poetry: Junius xi in the Bodleian Library*, intro., Israel Gollancz (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1927), pp. 119–21. There is a space of about a page and a half for illustrations immediately after the transformation of Loth's wife appears in the poem.
22. C. R. Dodwell and Peter Clemoes, eds., *The Old English Illustrated Hexateuch: British Museum Cotton Claudius B. IV EEMF 18* (Copenhagen: Rosenkilde and Bagger, 1974), p. 56; and Benjamin C. Withers, *The Illustrated Old English Hexateuch, Cotton Claudius B. iv: The Frontier of Seeing and Reading in Anglo-Saxon England* (Toronto: British Museum and University of Toronto Press, 2007), pp. 18, 21.
23. See C. R. Dodwell, *Anglo-Saxon Gestures and the Roman Stage* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 134, and plates XLIX a and b.
24. *The Old English Heptateuch and Ælfric's Libellus de veteri Testamento et novo*, ed. Richard Marsden (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 43 (Genesis 19:26). Hereafter, referred to as *Heptateuch* with page references in the text.
25. Peter Kidd at the British Library provided information concerning the illustration (personal communication). In other illustrations, Loth's wife's robe is light-colored. Cf. Cotton Claudius B. iv, 32r.
26. Angel-messengers tend to appear on the left in the illustrations to *Genesis A* in the Junius 11 manuscript as well. See the facsimile, pp. 65, 74, 82, 84, and 87.
27. See also *Ælfric's Anglo-Saxon Version of Alcuini Interrogationes Sigewulfi Presbyteri in Genesin*, ed. George Edwin MacLean (Hallé: E. Karras, 1883) (hereafter *Interrogationes Sigewulfi*), pp. 104–07. The traditions of how to depict the ruined cities and Lot's wife in artworks vary.
28. See Allen J. Frantzen, "The Disclosure of Sodomy in *Cleanness*," *PMLA* 111 (1996): 459–60, where he describes the landscape of the destroyed

- cities as anal. See also his *Before the Closet: Same-Sex Love from "Beowulf" to "Angels in America"* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1998), pp. 184–226.
29. *Cleanness*, in *The Poems of the Pearl Manuscript: Pearl, Cleanness, Patience, Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*, ed. Malcolm Andrew and Ronald Waldron (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1978), lines 981–84.
  30. Martin Harries, "Forgetting Lot's Wife: Artaud, Spectatorship, and Catastrophe," *Yale Journal of Criticism* 11 (1998): 227. Bede also stresses the sounds of destruction that reach her. See Charles W. Jones, ed., *Bedaе Venerabilis Opera, In Principium Genesis*. CCSL 118a (Turnhout: Brepols, 1967), 19.26, p. 227.
  31. Harries, *Forgetting Lot's Wife*, p. 28. See also pp. 106–07, and Jacques Lacan, *Écrits: A Selection*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Norton, 1977), p. 43.
  32. See Jean Baudrillard, "Simulacra and Simulations," in *Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader*, ed. David Lodge with Nigel Wood (Harlow: Longman, 2000), p. 405. An anonymous third-century (?) Latin poem describes her as *ipsa et imago sibi* [herself an image of herself]. *Incertum de Sodoma*, ed. Rudolf Peiper, *Cypriani Galli Poetae Heptatevchos*. CSEL 23, Part 3 (Vienna: F. Tempsky, 1881), pp. 212–20, line 120. The poem has been attributed to Tertullian and Cyprian. Its authorship remains unknown.
  33. S. J. Crawford supplied parentheses that clearly demark the phrase as an addition to the Vulgate text. They are not in the manuscript. See Crawford, ed., *The Old English Version of the Heptateuch, Ælfric's Treatise on the Old and New Testament and His Preface to Genesis* (London: Oxford University Press, 1922), p. 134; Frederick M. Biggs, "Biblical Glosses in Ælfric's Translation of Genesis," *Notes and Queries* 38 (1991): 291, *Heptateuch*, p. 43; and Rebecca Anne Barnhouse, "Shaping the Hexateuch Text for an Anglo-Saxon Audience," in *The Old English Hexateuch: Aspects and Approaches*, ed. Rebecca Anne Barnhouse and Benjamin C. Withers (Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications, 2000), pp. 97–98.
  34. Biggs notices the parallel uses of *getacnunge* for the requisite Genesis passages in Ælfric's works. See Biggs, "Biblical Glosses," p. 291.
  35. For "sense for sense" translation as opposed to "word for word" (the idea came originally from Cicero, and was further popularized by Jerome and King Alfred), see Robert Stanton, *The Culture of Translation in Anglo-Saxon England* (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2002), pp. 75, 82, 110–11.
  36. She contrasts with the personified female figure of Wisdom that is a major feature of the text and supposedly "rescues" Lot (Wisdom 10:6).
  37. Clement of Rome, *The First Epistle of Clement to the Corinthians*, in *The Epistles of St. Clement of Rome and St. Ignatius of Antioch*, trans. James A. Kleist. Ancient Christian Writers 1 (Westminster, MD: The Newman Press, 1961), p. 15.
  38. Bede, *In Lucae Evangelium expositio*, ed. D. Hurst, CCSL 120 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1960), 17.32, p. 319. Bede is similarly moralistic in his *In Principium Genesis*. See 19.26, pp. 227–28.

39. The translation is from Dolores Warwick Frese, "Sexing Political Tropes of Conquest: 'The Wife's Lament' and Laſamon's *Brut*," in *Sex and Sexuality in Anglo-Saxon England: Essays in Memory of Daniel Gillmore Calder*, ed. Carol Braun Pasternack and Lisa M. C. Weston (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2004), p. 211, n. 22.
40. For instance, according to the poem *Sodoma*, trees in the area bear fruits that turn to ashes in one's mouth. *Incerti de Sodoma*, lines 137–38, and see *The Defective Version of Mandeville's Travels*, ed. M. C. Seymour (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), p. 42. The desert also has associations with the lives of hermits and ascetics.
41. The complete passage is *Denique uxor Loth, ubi respexit, remansit et in salem conuersa hominibus fidelibus quoddam praestitit condimentum, quo sapiant aliquid, unde illud caueatur exemplum*. Augustine, *Civitas Dei*, ed. Bernard Dombart and Alphonse Kalb, 4th ed. CCSL 48 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1955), 16.30.535, "Furthermore, Lot's wife was rooted to the spot where she looked back; and by being turned into salt she supplied a kind of seasoning for the faithful—a seasoning of wisdom to make them beware of following her example." Henry Bettenson, trans., *Concerning the City of God Against the Pagans* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1972), p. 692.
42. *Incerti de Sodoma*, line 125. See Irénée de Lyon [Irenaeus], *Contre les Hérésies Livre IV: Édition Critique [Adversus Haereses]*, ed. Adelin Rousseau, Bertrand Memmerdinger, Louis Doutreleau, and Charles Mercier, 2 vols. (Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1965), 2:794, 4.31.3.
43. Salt-stone is not one of the harder or more durable varieties of stone, but the Old English accounts of Loth's wife stress the "stone" of her new substance, whereas the vulgate stresses *salis*, "salt." For the "stoniness" of certain female saints, see Andrea Rossi-Reder, "Embodying Christ, Embodying Nation: Ælfric's Accounts of Saints Agatha and Lucy," in Pasternack and Weston, eds., *Sex and Sexuality in Anglo-Saxon England*, pp. 187, 190.
44. Clement of Rome, *Corinthians 1*, pp. 15–16.
45. Bede associates her motives for looking back with a rejection of Christ's promise to redeem humanity (*In Lucae Evangelium expositio*, p. 319). This reading only makes sense if one accepts the Old Testament as figuring the New.
46. See *Klaeber's Beowulf and The Fight at Finnsburg*, ed. R. D. Fulk, Robert E. Bjork, and John D. Niles, 4th ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), *Beowulf*, lines 1384–87.
47. *Incerti de Sodoma*, lines 121–26. It is difficult to ascertain how influential this poem would be. See also Augustine, *Civitas Dei*, 16.30.535.
48. Irenaeus, *Adversus Haereses*, 4.31.3.
49. Henry Bettenson, ed. and trans., *The Early Christian Fathers: A Selection from the Writings of the Fathers from St. Clement of Rome to St. Athanasias* (London: Oxford University Press, 1963), p. 122.
50. Niobe's story is an analogue to Lot's wife's in that the former is transformed into a physical object, the rock of Sipylos, which one may still visit. According to tradition, the rock still weeps. See Robert Graves,

- The Greek Myths*, 2 vols. (New York: George Braziller, 1955), 1:259. *The Adventures of Leucippe and Clitophon* also connects the immovability of its heroine with Niobe (Achilles Tatius 3.15.167). In Aesop's *Fables*, truth is "a woman standing all alone" out in the desert, having left "the town," which is full of liars. See B. E. Perry, ed., *Aesopica*, vol. 1 (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1952), Number 355. For the translation, see *Fables of Aesop*, trans. S. A. Handford (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1964), Number 160, p. 164.
51. See Harries, *Forgetting Lot's Wife*, p. 20. Augustine notes that she is rooted to her spot (*Civitas Dei*, 16.30.535; Bettenson, trans., *City of God*, p. 692).
  52. Julia Kristeva, *Tales of Love*, trans. Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), pp. 376, 375.
  53. Lacan, *Écrits*, pp. 305, 43; Harries, "Forgetting Lot's Wife," p. 233.
  54. For connections between landscape, body, and the surface of a manuscript page, see Withers, *The Illustrated Old English Hexateuch*, p. 264; and Patricia Cox Miller, "The Blazing Body: Ascetic Desire in Jerome's *Letter to Eustochium*," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 1 (1993): 27–30.
  55. See Withers, *The Illustrated Old English Hexateuch*, p. 293, for the tendency of Old Testament manuscripts to promote the written word while retaining oral aspects. He also connects manuscripts, monumental objects, and law. See pp. 157–58.
  56. In the Old English *Heptateuch*, the word *getacnunge* is followed immediately by *Ða beheold Abraham on ærne mergen þyderweard* [then Abraham looked over there in the early morning], so that the translator's addition to the biblical account implies that Abraham looks "over there" to the *getacnunge*: Loth's wife in her changed form. However, unexpectedly, no further mention is made of her image by him or by the translator (p. 43).
  57. For instance, a church is built on the site of Cecilia's martyrdom. The texts concerning her therefore suggest that readers should visit this site (*LA*, 777). See also Josephus, *Antiquities*, 4:101; Rabanus Maurus, *De universo*, 2.2, *PL* 111:36, and *Mandeville's Travels*, p. 42, where "dwelliþ Lothis wyf a stoon of salt." The landscape is hellish (pp. 41–42).
  58. Even Jesus's injunction to remember Lot's wife could make the rememberer complicit in these desires (Luke 18:2). See Pasternack and Weston, eds., *Sex and Sexuality in Anglo-Saxon England*, p. xlvi. As Harries notes, the desire of Lot's wife could be masochistic or even self-destructive. See *Forgetting Lot's Wife*, pp. 15, 98.
  59. I am ignoring other possibilities: one might parachute in; one might go straight to the sites of Sodom and Gomorrah. I assume that a typical traveler would approach Lot's wife with a view to receiving some kind of information from her. For medieval understanding of the site, see, for instance, Ælfric's *Interrogationes Sigewulfi: for barn seo eorþe. 7 bið æfre unwæstmære. 7 mid fulum wætere ofer gan* [the ground was all scorched and will be barren forever and covered with poisoned water] (p. 104),

- Josephus, *The Jewish War*, trans. G. A. Williamson (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1959), 4.483–85, 385–86, *Mandeville's Travels*, pp. 41–42, and *Cleanness*, lines 1008–48.
60. *Incerti de Sodoma*, lines 125–26. The menstruation confirms that she is alive and remains premenopausal. Hence, Eve's punishment for disobedience is extended until the end of time for Lot's wife, who thus connects with Genesis's theme of fertility in language. This portrayal of Lot's wife as still menstruating in her transformed state appears much more rarely during the Middle Ages as compared to other traditions concerning her. Her blood recalls the blood of the martyrs, often associated with relics and cults. See Peggy McCracken, *The Curse of Eve, the Wound of the Hero: Blood, Gender, and Medieval Literature* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), pp. 2–8, 22–37.
  61. Menstrual blood connects with the early medieval idea of learning through breast milk. See Susan Signe Morrison, *Women Pilgrims in Late Medieval England: Private Piety as Public Performance* (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 32; Joyce E. Salisbury, *Perpetua's Passion: The Death and Memory of a Young Roman Woman* (New York: Routledge, 1997), p. 142; and Julia Kristeva, *Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*, trans. Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1982), p. 71.
  62. Many ancient monuments present the human figure as larger or smaller than life. See Max Wegener, *Greek Masterworks of Art*, trans. Charlotte La Rue (New York: George Braziller, 1961), plates 2, 3, 6, 7, 12, 58, 63, 64, 108–11. Most medieval depictions of Lot's wife in artworks suggest that she is life-sized.
  63. *Genesis A* frequently refers to written scriptural authority (lines 227, 969, 1121, 1239, 1630, 1723, 2565, 2612–13) though it, as other Old English poems do, refers to oral authority as well. The illustrations of the Lothnarrative in MS Claudius B. iv depict God and one of His angel-messengers carrying what seem to be tablets. See folio 31r.
  64. See *The Old English "Apollonius of Tyre,"* ed. Peter Goolden (London: Oxford University Press, 1958), chap. 10, p.16.
  65. See Peter Brown, *Society and the Holy in Late Antiquity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1982), pp. 103–65; Graves, *Greek Myths*, 1:11. For what cities represent to Anglo-Saxons, see Nicholas Howe, "Rome: Capital of Anglo-Saxon England," *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies* 34 (2004): 147–72.
  66. By associating Lot's wife with people *in tribulatione*, "in tribulation," in his *In Lucae Evangelium expositio* (p. 319), Bede suggests that she had conflicted desires.
  67. The distinction suggests the illustration in MS Claudius B. iv, with its depiction of many dead people lying about. Many depictions of the destruction of the cities of the plain show only burning cities, with no obvious casualties. If she empathizes with suffering, she follows Christ's later teachings.

68. See Bernard F. Huppé, *Doctrine and Poetry: Augustine's Influence on Old English Poetry* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1959), pp. 203–04; Bede, *In Lucae Evangelium expositio*, p. 319; Godden, “The Trouble with Sodom,” p. 99. On the other hand, were one to treat the tribes that descend from Lot’s daughters as the products of evil deeds, under the taint of incest, one would have to acknowledge that Lot’s wife, by being turned into a salt-stone, “never becomes part of the incestuous community after the destruction of the cities” and thus might also be considered a figure of “salvation” (Harries, *Forgetting Lot's Wife*, p. 32).
69. See Augustine, *Civitas Dei*, 16.30.535.
70. MacLean conveniently supplies Alcuin’s Latin version of the source passages for *Interrogationes Sigewulfi* as a parallel text in his edition of the Old English translation. For a complete edition, see *PL* 100:542, in particular *Interrogationes Sigewulfi*, 188.
71. In a more general discussion of the Genesis material. The bargaining scene is omitted from the poem.
72. Godden, “The Trouble with Sodom,” p. 111. See Frantzen, *Before the Closet*, p. 186. Of course, God punishes these Sodomites further when the cities are leveled. One must acknowledge that Christian commentators on Genesis display a general tendency, which Ælfric seems to be following, “to invest the Genesis narrative with sharp and weighty moral distinctions,” as Godden notes. “The Trouble with Sodom,” p. 99.
73. Bede, at the end of his *De Schematibus et Tropis*, reverses the pattern of reference with regard to these passages, which suggests that biblical scholars tended to treat these passages as making up a whole. After quoting Jesus’s statement about who will be taken on judgment day and who will not, he adds *Et memores estote uxoris Loth*, “And remember Lot’s wife” (Bede, *Libri II De Arte Metrica et de Schematibus et Tropis—The Art of Poetry and Rhetoric*, ed. and trans. Calvin B. Kendall, Bibliotheca Germanicus, new series 2 [Saarbrücken: Verlag, 1991], pp. 202, 209). Frese sees the addition as a “pointed” comment against the unguarded use of non-Christian learning (“Sexing Political Tropes of Conquest,” pp. 210–11, 216–17), when I believe that Bede uses it merely as an example of an “illustrative story” that warns (Bede, *De Schematibus et Tropis*, p. 209). By simply appearing very near in Luke’s gospel to the previously quoted scriptural passage, the example suggested itself to Bede.
74. Concerns about the arbitrariness of God’s punishment of the people in the cities of the plain were certainly current in the early Middle Ages. Obvious questions would be why do the women have to die if anal intercourse between men seems to be what God abhors? Why do the children have to die? See Godden, “The Trouble with Sodom,” pp. 100–01. As Frantzen notes, certain medieval writers tried to answer these questions. Sometimes women were blamed for engendering the illicit sexual practices of the men in Sodom. See Frantzen, “Disclosure of Sodomy,” p. 456.
75. See *Interrogationes Sigewulfi*, pp. 104–05.



76. Harries, "Forgetting Lot's Wife," pp. 222, 228.
77. In *Genesis A*, the figure of Loth's wife is also an image of the poet's individual art. By mentioning explicitly that the story of her transformation is *mære*, "famous," the poet emphasizes that such a story can only remain famous because poets and other artists choose to make it so in an oral-traditional society.
78. Graves, *Greek Myths*, 2:316. Not to mention the stone figure in *Andreas* that speaks explicitly (line 713). For emblems of Patience, see Gerald J. Schiffhorst, ed., *The Triumph of Patience: Medieval and Renaissance Studies* (Orlando: University Presses of Florida, 1978), frontispiece, and pp. 16–19, and 116.
79. In a significant parallel, Catherine E. Karkov notices that the illustrations in MS Junius 11 are particularly concerned with depicting inheritance, usually through the male line ("The Anglo-Saxon Genesis: Text, Illustration, and Audience," in *The Old English Hexateuch*, p. 214). Junius 11 also contains an unexpectedly large number of depictions of women, typically as wives and mothers (p. 225).
80. See "The Trouble with Sodom," pp. 101, 103–04. Godden concludes that Lot's incest seems to have been more a matter of curiosity than horror among the Anglo-Saxons. See pp. 112–13, and *Riddle 46 of The Exeter Book*, ed. George Philip Krapp and Elliott Van Kirk Dobbie (New York: Columbia University Press, 1936), p. 205. In Godden's view, the illustrations of the seduction and subsequent births in Cotton MS. Claudius B. iv suggest "cosy domesticity rather than shock or sensuality" ("The Trouble with Sodom," p. 104, and figs. 3, 4). Frantzen observes that Lot's incest generally receives little attention from early medieval commentators, as compared to the harsh condemnations that the assumed acts of the Sodomites inspire. Presumably, though this incest is illicit, it is more acceptable than the Sodomites' practices because it is heterosexual (*Before the Closet*, pp. 222–23; Jerome, *Epistola 22*, p. 72).
81. Joseph Bosworth, ed., *An Anglo-Saxon Dictionary* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1882), with a *Supplement* by T. Northcote Toller (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1921), *Enlarged Addenda and Corrigenda to the Supplement* by Alastair Campbell (Oxford: Clarendon Press), 1972, s. v. "Sið".
82. Godden, "The Trouble with Sodom," p. 111.
83. Godden, "The Trouble with Sodom," p. 103; cf. Marsden, ed. *Heptateuch*, p. 43.
84. Jonathan Wilcox explains the sources for this scene, identifying thoroughly the differences in the various depictions. See "The First Laugh: Laughter in Genesis and the Old English Tradition," in *The Old English Hexateuch*, pp. 259–60.
85. This abrupt shift occurs in part because the poet omits the content of about nine verses at this juncture. Cf. Genesis 18:13–21.
86. The sex with them that the Sodomites demand then is a further offense against God's plans because it presumably has the potential to change

- their fertility-message physically. Once again semen can be associated with God's word, promise, and powers of creation.
87. For *Elene*, I use *The Vercelli Book*, ed. George Philip Krapp (New York: Columbia University Press, 1932), pp. 66–102.
  88. Brown has associated the political concept of civic authority with early saints in late antiquity. The role of female saints and other authoritative women in such positions has been relatively neglected. See Brown, *Society and the Holy*, pp. 103–65.
  89. See Bosworth and Toller, eds., *An Anglo-Saxon Dictionary*, s. v. "Wic"; Richard L. Venezky and Antonette DiPaolo Healey, eds., *A Microfiche Concordance to Old English* (Toronto: Dictionary of Old English Project, University of Toronto, 1980), s. v. "Wic." Both the abode of the Grendel family and the dragon's barrow are described as examples of *wic*, so the term is not unambiguously positive. See *Beowulf*, lines 1612a, 3083a. I gratefully acknowledge Richard Firth Green who drew my attention to the use of this term in the *Genesis A* passage.
  90. *Travels of John Mandeville*, p. 42.
  91. Anita R. Riedinger, "The Englishing of Arcestrate: Woman in Apollonius of Tyre," in *New Readings on Women in Old English Literature*, ed. Helen Damico, Alexandra Hennesey Olsen, and Marijane Osborn (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1990), p. 301.

### 3 The Female Patience Figure as Counterfeit

1. See Sherry L. Reames, *The Legenda aurea: A Reexamination of its Paradoxical History* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985), pp. 198–99.
2. William Granger Ryan, trans., Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*, 2 vols. (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993), p. xv; Martha Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death in the Huntington Library *Legenda aurea*," in *Gender and Holiness: Men, Women and Saints in Late Medieval Europe*, ed. Samantha J. E. Riches and Sarah Salih (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 49.
3. See Maud Burnett McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins: From Thecla to Joan of Arc* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003), pp. 67–73.
4. *Life of Syncretica*, PG 28:1487–558. See Virginia Burrus, *Saving Shame: Martyrs, Saints, and Other Abject Subjects* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), pp. 100–07.
5. I am thinking of Jacobus's habit of including the etymologies of saints' names.
6. The collection is patterned after the many earlier medieval martyrologies, which played a large part in organizing people's time. See Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death," p. 49. The *Legenda Aurea* survives in about 1,000 manuscripts and in hundreds of adaptations and printed editions, "both in the original Latin and in every Western European language." Ryan, *Golden Legend* 1:xiii.
7. Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death," pp. 50–51.

8. For differences between the treatment of male and female martyrs' bodies, see Kirsten Wolf, "The Severed Breast: A Topos in the Legends of Female Virgin Martyr Saints," *Arkiv för Nordisk Filologi* 112 (1997): 100–104.
9. Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death," p. 51.
10. See Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death," p. 57. For the treatment of rape in the *Legenda Aurea*, see Mills, "Can the Virgin Martyr Speak?" pp. 190–91. For discussion of Ambrose's and Prudentius's depictions of female martyrs, see McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, pp. 70–75. As the readership for lives of women saints is increasingly associated with women, the idea of these lives as pornography becomes more problematic. See Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), p. 27.
11. See Larissa Tracy, trans. and intro., *Women of the Gilte Legende: A Selection of Middle English Saints Lives* (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2003), p. 6, and n. 14; p. 109. Later hagiography in turn tends to treat female saints in a "gentler" fashion even than the *Legenda Aurea*. See Reames, *Legenda aurea*, pp. 206–07.
12. Easton, "Pain, Torture and Death," p. 57 (See also p. 61); McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, p. 81.
13. Easton detects a tendency for genders to be blurred in later hagiography, perhaps, an effect of the gendering of patience literature. See "Pain, Torture and Death," pp. 52–53.
14. McInerney, *Eloquent Virgins*, pp. 73, 75.
15. Carol F. Heffernan, "Praying before the Image of Mary: Chaucer's *Prioress's Tale*, VII 502–12," *Chaucer Review* 39 (2004): 109. See pp. 109–10, n. 24, and Lee Patterson, *Temporal Circumstances: Form and History in the Canterbury Tales* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), pp. 135, 137–38. For the treatment of images of Mary, see also Susan Signe Morrison, *Women Pilgrims in Late Medieval England: Private Piety as Public Performance* (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 12.
16. Patterson, *Temporal Circumstances*, p. 129. See William Orth, "The Problem of the Performative in Chaucer's *Prioress Sequence*," *Chaucer Review* 42 (2007): 202, 204.
17. See C. Heffernan, "Praying Before the Image of Mary," pp. 104, 112. The abbot's treatment of the clergeon's body suggests an image of the *pietà* and thus the reproduction of such images. See p. 114.
18. The *Tale's* rather abrupt mention of Saint Hugh of Lincoln is another example of how the narrator apparently thinks of the saints as largely interchangeable (684–87). See Patterson, *Temporal Circumstances*, p. 153.
19. See Orth, "Problem of the Performative," pp. 205–06, nn. 25–28.
20. See Patterson, *Temporal Circumstances*, p. 151. Chaucer hints at parody of rote learning when the next tale after the *Prioress's Tale* is an obvious burlesque. The narrator "lernerd" it "longe agoon." *Prologue to Sir Thopas* (Fragment VII, line 709).

#### 4 The Female Patience Figure as Frozen Empress

1. See Alison Weir, *Eleanor of Aquitaine: A Life* (New York: Ballantyne Books, 1999), pp. 175–76. See also Eric Hicks, *Le Débat sur “Le Roman de la Rose,”* Bibliothèque du XVe siècle, no. 43 (Paris: Honoré Champion, 1977), pp. li–liv, 187–94.
2. Chrétien de Troyes, *Les Romans de Chrétien de Troyes: II Cligés*, ed. Alexandre Micha (Paris: Honoré Champion, 1957). Further references will be by line in the text.
3. Critics have considered this feigned death episode to be much more in a comic vein than the romance’s style and subject-matter maintain elsewhere. See Laine E. Doggett, “On Artifice and Realism: Thessala in Chrétien de Troyes’s *Cligés*,” *Exemplaria* 16 (2004): 66, n. 87. The episode seems to have been popular with medieval audiences because it appears as a discrete excerpt. See Joan Tasker Grimbert, “*Cligés* and the Chansons: A Slave to Love,” in *A Companion to Chrétien de Troyes*, ed. Norris J. Lacy and Grimbert (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2005), p. 134, and nn. 48 and 49.
4. For the parallels between the legendary phoenix and Christ, see *The Phoenix*, ed. N. F. Blake (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1964), pp. 8–13.
5. See Doggett, “On Artifice and Realism,” pp. 67–71.
6. See Kathleen Coyne Kelly, *Performing Virginity and Testing Chastity in the Middle Ages* (London: Routledge, 2000), pp. 64–65.
7. Translation: Chrétien de Troyes. *Arthurian Romances*, trans. William W. Kibler (London: Penguin Books, 1991), pp. 123–205, at p. 195. Subsequent references by page number in the text.
8. The four lines in brackets are not in all manuscripts. See Micha, ed., *Cligés*, p. 215.
9. She creates a new version of herself as dead, like a funeral effigy: a conventional artistic representation.
10. For *Cligés* as satire of the story of Tristan and Ysold, see 3125–36, 5239–43; Jean Frappier, *Chrétien de Troyes: l’homme et l’œuvre*, 2nd ed. (Paris: Hatier, 1957), pp. 112–13; and Doggett, “On Artifice and Realism,” p. 44, n. 8.
11. Brigitte Cazelles, *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1991), pp. 59, 81.
12. Just such a discovery scene occurs later in the narrative (6362–63).
13. Roland Barthes, *A Lover’s Discourse: Fragments*, trans. Richard Howard (New York: Hill and Wang, 1978), p. 207.
14. Grimbert, “*Cligés* and the Chansons,” p. 131. Grimbert concludes that Fénice is “a slave to love” (p. 136).

#### 5 The Female Patience Figure at an Extreme

1. See, for example, A. C. Spearing, “Narrative Voice: The Case of Chaucer’s *Man of Law’s Tale*,” *New Literary History* 32 (2001): 738.

2. See Lisa J. Kiser, *Telling Classical Tales: Chaucer and the Legend of Good Women* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1983), pp. 101–11; Anne Middleton, “The *Physician’s Tale* and Love’s Martyrs: ‘Ensamples mo than ten’ as a Method in the *Canterbury Tales*,” *Chaucer Review* 8 (1973): 9–32; Sheila Delany, *The Naked Text: Chaucer’s Legend of Good Women* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), pp. 64, 68–69; and Catherine Sanok, “Reading Hagiographically: *The Legend of Good Women* and its Feminine Audience,” *Exemplaria* 13 (2001): 339–54.
3. See Sanok, “Reading Hagiographically,” pp. 333–39.
4. For the work as explicitly addressed to a mostly female audience, see *The Legend of Good Women*, 1254–59, 1263–64, 1879–85; Nicola F. MacDonald, “Chaucer’s *Legend of Good Women*, Ladies at Court and the Female Reader,” *Chaucer Review* 35 (2000): 22, 34–39; and Kara A. Doyle, “Thisbe out of Context: Chaucer’s Female Readers and the Findern Manuscript,” *Chaucer Review* 40 (2006): 231–32, 238–52, 256–57.
5. See Sanok, “Reading Hagiographically,” pp. 340, 350.
6. See Sarah Stanbury, “Regimes of the Visual in Premodern England: Gaze, Body, and Chaucer’s *Clerk’s Tale*,” *New Literary History* 28 (1997): 262.
7. The more usual reading of this passage is that Grisilde makes this request of Walter because she is charitable, a reading that is consistent with her character as described in the poem. See note 4 in the introduction for critics who find Grisilde heroic.
8. See Amy W. Goodwin, “The Griselda Game,” *Chaucer Review* 39 (2004): 54–56.
9. For a discussion of the precise ways in which Grisilde is “translated,” see Carolyn Dinshaw, *Chaucer’s Sexual Poetics* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1989), p. 144; and Sarah Stanbury, *The Visual Object of Desire in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), p. 131. Walter’s subsequent acts of “counterfeiting” confirm that the entire sign system of clothing is hollow.
10. Griselda’s thoughts here are an addition by Petrarch. For his *Epistolae seniles* 17.3, I use J. Burke Severs, *Literary Relationships of Chaucer’s “Clerkes Tale”* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1942), pp. 254–92, referred to from now on as “Petrarch.” See p. 260. I also use Severs’s text (pp. 255–89) for the anonymous French version of Griselda’s story from Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, MS fr. 12459. 260.
11. See Andrew Sprung, “‘If it youre wille be’: Coercion and Compliance in Chaucer’s *Clerk’s Tale*,” *Exemplaria* 7 (1995): 349, 364–65. Grisilde’s body is so important to the narrative that I disagree with Stanbury’s argument that Grisilde, particularly when Walter first publicly designates her as his bride, seems “to escape categorical definition by gender through assimilation with devotional schema.” “Regimes of the Visual,” p. 283. Such devotional schema do not eclipse the marquis’s desire, which is for (among other things) a woman’s body.
12. Anne Cranny-Francis, “From Extension to Engagement: Mapping the Imaginary of Wearable Technology,” *Visual Communication* 7 (2008): 366;

- Barbara Czarniawska and Eva Gustavsson, "The (D)evolution of the Cyberwoman?" *Organization* 15 (2008): 666. See also Donna Haraway, *Simians, Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature* (London: Free Association Books, 1991), p. 152.
13. Haraway, *Simians, Cyborgs and Women*, p. 152. For intelligent machines, see N. Katherine Hayles, *How We Became Posthuman: Virtual Bodies in Cybernetics, Literature, and Informatics* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), pp. 7, 161. McKinley captures something of Grisilde's artificiality with the phrase "a hagiographic 'Barbie.'" Kathryn McKinley, "The Clerk's Tale: Hagiography and the Problematics of Lay Sanctity," *Chaucer Review* 33 (1998): 96.
  14. Delany argues that there "is an element of irony associated with" most of Chaucer's hagiographical references. See *The Naked Text*, p. 61. For various kinds of parody in *The Clerk's Tale*, see M. Keith Booker, "'Nothing that is so is so': Dialogic Discourse and the Voice of the Woman in the Clerk's Tale and Twelfth Night," *Exemplaria* 3 (1991): 527; Engle, "Chaucer, Bakhtin, and Griselda," pp. 429–59; Linda Georgianna, "The Clerk's Tale and the Grammar of Assent," *Speculum* 70 (1995): 805, 818.
  15. But see *The Franklin's Tale*, 771–90. The point of this passage is undercut by the impatience of the characters in the tale. See Alcuin Blamires, *Chaucer, Ethics, and Gender* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 163.
  16. The translation is by Earl Jeffrey Richards. Christine de Pizan, *The Book of the City of Ladies*, trans. Earl Jeffrey Richards (New York: Persea, 1982), p. 255.
  17. Though Christine's attitudes are perhaps no more unexpected than the humility and repentance that appear in Chaucer's retraction at the end of *The Canterbury Tales* (X [1], 1081–92).
  18. See Roberta L. Krueger, "Uncovering Griselda—Christine de Pizan, 'une seule chemise,' and the Clerical Tradition: Boccaccio, Petrarch, Philippe de Mézières and the Ménagier de Paris," in *Medieval Fabrications: Dress, Textiles, Clothwork, and Other Cultural Imaginings*, ed. E. Jane Burns (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 86–88.
  19. Maureen Quilligan, *The Allegory of Female Authority: Christine de Pizan's "Cité des Dames"* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1991), p. 167.
  20. See Sheila Delany, "'Mothers to Think Back Through': Who Are They? The Ambiguous Example of Christine de Pizan," in *Medieval Texts and Contemporary Readers*, ed. Laurie A. Finke and Martin B. Shichtman (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1987), pp. 177–97.
  21. See Elizabeth Allen, "Chaucer Answers Gower: Constance and the Trouble with Reading," *ELH* 64 (1997): 642–43, 645; and Henry Barnett Hinckley, "The Debate on Marriage in *The Canterbury Tales*," in *Chaucer: Modern Essays in Criticism*, ed. Edward Wagenknecht (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 220.
  22. Virginia Woolf, "Professions for Women," in *The Death of the Moth and Other Essays* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1961), p. 202.

23. By being human and divine, Christ is a hybrid. Both His wounds and His powers fit with aspects of the cyborg. See Cranny-Francis, "From Extension to Engagement," pp. 368–69. For Grisilde as a type of Christ in *The Clerk's Tale*, see Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, p. 130. "Robotic wives are fully directed towards productivity" and "are forever busy with their duties." Czarniawska and Gustavsson, "The (D)evolution of the Cyberwoman?," p. 672. See also p. 678 and Haraway, *Simians*, p. 151. Such wives as depicted in science fiction are often duplicatable like simulacra and often unable "to feel empathy." They often cause and represent schizophrenia similar to Walter's. Hayles, *How We Became Posthuman*, pp. 161–62, 165–67. Yet, robotic performances can involve parody of human and of robotic behaviors, including behaviors associated with gender. See Yuji Sone, "Realism of the Unreal: The Japanese Robot and the Performance of Representation," *Visual Communication* 7 (2008): 347–49, 355.
24. See Hayles, *How We Became Posthuman*, pp. 2–3, for the best articulation of the assumptions behind posthumanism.
25. Woolf, "Professions," pp. 202, 206; Chaucer, *Clerk's Tale*, line 1177. See Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, p. 149. Cf. Charlotte C. Morse, "The Exemplary Griselda," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 7 (1985): 55.
26. "Feminist readings tend to literalism" (Mitchell, "Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*," n. 16), so I am in good company.
27. Anne Middleton, "The Clerk and His Tale: Some Literary Contexts," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 2 (1980): 149. See n. 37, and Andrea Denny-Brown, "Povre Griselda and the All-Consuming Archewyves," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 28 (2006): 99, n. 50, and pp. 104–08. A "song" in mixed company implies dancing, when such pairing off into couples would have a particular effect after the relating of any tale concerning marriage.
28. Scott Bukatman, *Terminal Identity: The Virtual Subject in Postmodern Science Fiction* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1993), p. 9.
29. More than the "flicker . . . of irony" that Jill Mann suggests. See *Feminizing Chaucer*, 2nd ed. (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2002), p. 118.
30. See Sprung, "If it youre wille be," p. 364. See Allen, "Chaucer Answers Gower," p. 629, for Chaucer's similar treatment of Custance in *The Man of Law's Tale*.
31. William McClellan, "Bakhtin's Theory of Dialogic Discourse, Medieval Rhetoric Theory, and the Multi-Voiced Structure of the *Clerk's Tale*," *Exemplaria* 1 (1989): 478.
32. Harold Bloom, *The Anxiety of Influence: A Theory of Poetry* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980), p. 95; Bakhtin, "From Notes Made in 1970–1," in *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*, ed. C. Emerson Michael Holquist, trans. Vern McGee (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986), pp. 132–33.
33. The *Livre* is directed explicitly against antifeminist literature to which Christine feels she must respond (2.43.2, 2.47.1, 2.49.5). See also Joseph Baird and John Kane, trans., *La Querrele de la Rose: Letters and Documents*

- (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1978), p. 112; and Judith Laird, "Good Women and *Bonnes Dames*: Virtuous Females in Chaucer and Christine de Pizan," *Chaucer Review* 30 (1995): 62, 68. For examples of studies of Christine's feminism, see the notes on p. 69 of Laird's article.
34. See Mann's investigation of the meanings of "ynogh" in *The Clerk's Tale*, in *Feminizing Chaucer*, pp. 120, 123–24.
  35. The moral aspects of this look by Valterius occur in all versions of the story under investigation.
  36. At the abduction of Walter's son, Chaucer, like Christine, removes any reference to sight (673–86). Perhaps Chaucer wants to stress that Grisilde only has eyes for Walter. Certainly this omission shows that Chaucer carefully thinks about each character's use of a gaze and does not merely expand upon images of sight when he happens upon them, or whimsically insert them when they seem to suit his momentary designs.
  37. Thomas J. Farrell, "The Chronotopes of Monology in Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*," in *Bakhtin and Medieval Voices*, ed. Thomas J. Farrell (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1995), p. 146.
  38. See, for instance, *The Wedding of Sir Gawain and Dame Ragnell*, in *Middle English Verse Romances*, ed. Donald B. Sands (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1966), pp. 323–47, lines 19–63.
  39. See Genesis 24:13–67, 29:7–11, and Sprung, "'If it youre wille be,'" p. 349, and n. 13.
  40. See M. Mills, ed., *Lybeaus Desconus* (London: Oxford University Press, 1969), pp. 42–60, and p. 242, nn. 2029–31; p. 243, note L (Lambeth) 2192, for recognition scenes and weddings. See also the romance of *La Cote Mal Taillé* in *Le Roman de Tristan en Prose*, vol. 1, ed. Philippe Ménard (Geneva: Librairie Droz S. A., 1987), pp. 88–127. Marriage is often inimical to a knightly career. See Chaucer's *Franklin's Tale*.
  41. In Chaucer's version, Walter notices his love-object when he is "on huntynge . . . paraventure" (234), a journey that parallels and contrasts with Grisilde's daily journey from tending her sheep (his aim is self-indulgence; hers is service). In this version Grisilde does not replace Walter on horseback, but all versions present her replacing him in the castle, the space of civic responsibility. The satire of political precepts becomes more extreme when Walter's lies cause the spreading of ill-fame about himself (722–25). The public is shown to be fickle in its loyalties, and subject to misinformation and error (995–1005). The role of public opinion in the political sphere is at best paradoxical.
  42. See *Lybeaus Desconus*, Lambeth, lines 2178–201.
  43. Stanbury has produced much work on this subject. See *Visual Object of Desire*, pp. 101–02.
  44. See David Wallace, *Chaucerian Polity: Absolutist Lineages and Associational Forms in England and Italy* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1997), p. 284. Both Chaucer and Christine seem to work from Petrarch's



- version together with a French translation of the *Epistola*, though Chaucer's French translation is almost certainly a different one from the one Christine uses. See Severs, *Literary Relationships*, p. 27; Richards, trans., *The Book of the City of Ladies*, pp. 265–66. Walter's unique sense of sight also seems to work in reverse in that he plays a game of secrets with his people. He desires to conceal whatever is his desire, to the point that his concealment amounts to political, social, and individual abnegation of his responsibilities as ruler, husband, and father. See Patricia Cramer, "Lordship, Bondage, and the Erotic: The Psychological Bases of Chaucer's 'Clerk's Tale,'" *Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 89 (1990): 497. Walter's secret life suggests connections between him and such hypocrites as Faux Semblant in Guillaume de Lorris and Jean de Meun, *Le Roman de la Rose*, ed. Ernest Langlois, 5 vols. (Paris: Société des anciens textes français, 1914–24), Book 11: 23–26, 67, 219–22.
45. See McKinley, "The Clerk's Tale: Hagiography," p. 92, and Mann, *Feminizing Chaucer*, p. 119, who says: "patience conquers ... through pity." See also pp. 124–25. The Clerk notes that the testing of Grisilde is both needless and the product of obsession (*The Clerk's Tale*, lines 455–62, 696–707).
  46. Stanbury, however, notes that the split between a male-traditional gaze and its objects is not as simple in the Middle Ages as has often been assumed. See "Regimes of the Visual," p. 268.
  47. Dinshaw, *Chaucer's Sexual Poetics*, p. 150; Seth Lerer, *Chaucer and His Readers: Imagining the Author in Late-Medieval England* (Princeton, N J: Princeton University Press, 1993), pp. 30; 28–29. In contrast to Lerer, I think that the appropriation of Petrarch's gaze by the Clerk makes the Italian poet into a "maker" who goes beyond the status Lerer gives him: "only ... another maker for a locally and temporarily defined community." See *Chaucer and His Readers*, p. 30.
  48. Dinshaw, *Chaucer's Sexual Poetics*, pp. 152–53; 137. For further discussion, see Emma Campbell, "Sexual Poetics and the Politics of Translation in the Tale of Griselda," *Comparative Literature* 55 (2003): 204–05.
  49. Kathryn L. Lynch, "Despoiling Griselda: Chaucer's Walter and the Problem of Knowledge in *The Clerk's Tale*," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 10 (1988): 69. Part of the (erotic) appeal of the cyborg is that it may be replicated. It can become a simulacrum. See Haynes, *How We Became Posthuman*, pp. 165–67.
  50. The passage is probably not Petrarch's and may well not have been in the sources that Chaucer uses. The French text also omits this action. See Severs, *Literary Relationships*, p. 284, n. 25, and pp. 274–75. Later still, at the casting out scene, Walter leaves her presence before she strips.
  51. For a profeminine view of Grisilde at the casting out, see, for instance, Alcuin Blamires, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), pp. 164–71.
  52. See A. C. Spearing, *Criticism and Medieval Poetry*, 2nd ed. (London: Arnold, 1972), pp. 95–96.

53. See Michel Foucault, *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*, trans. Alan Sheridan (New York: Vintage, 1979), p. 202. For the critics who see Grisilde as genuinely a paragon of patience, see Kathy Lavezzo, "Chaucer and Everyday Death: *The Clerk's Tale*, Burial, and the Subject of Poverty," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 23 (2001): 257, n. 7. To actually see someone's moral qualities is impossible, even if Walter finally seems to gain his desire when he "sees" in Grisilde an abstract virtue along with the countenance that he usually surveys: "And whan this Walter saugh hire pacience, / Hir glade chiere, and no malice at al" (lines 1044–45). Perhaps one may "see" a virtue only as a written text (Chaucer, *Nun's Priest's Tale* [VII], lines 3438–43), or as a work of art.
54. Robin Kirkpatrick, "The Griselda Story in Boccaccio, Petrarch, and Chaucer," in *Chaucer and the Italian Trecento*, ed. Piero Boitano (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1983), p. 244.
55. M. M. Bakhtin, *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, ed. Michael Holquist, trans. Caryl Emerson and Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), p. 108 (he is talking about the protagonists of early Greek romances); Stanbury, "Regimes of the Visual," p. 281. See also the infinitely fractured images of women in Bukatman, *Terminal Identity*, pp. 244–47.
56. Chaucer's examples of hagiography and secular hagiography tend to be more sophisticated than previous examples. See Spearing, "Narrative Voice," p. 741.
57. The most stalwart defender of Griselda's exemplary role is Morse, "The Exemplary Griselda," pp. 51–86. More generally, see Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), pp. xi–xii, xiv, 2–5, 8.
58. Morse, "Exemplary Griselda," p. 76.
59. See Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, p. 149, Goodwin, "The Griselda Game," p. 46, and Lynch "Despoiling Griselda," pp. 42–43.
60. Francis Lee Utley, "The Five Genres of Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*," *Chaucer Review* 6 (1971): 210. The exemplarity argument is a refusal to acknowledge this dead end—often, in fact, a refusal to admit into discussion the specific context of the *Tale*, particularly the Envoy. See, for example, Gerald Morgan, "The Logic of the *Clerk's Tale*," *Modern Language Review* 104 (2009): 25.
61. See Goodwin, "Griselda Game," pp. 45–46, 49, 54, 57–58.
62. One might argue that this speech completely contradicts the false inheritance on view in much of the French Griselda material that is openly misogynist. See Morse, "Exemplary Griselda," pp. 74–76; Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, p. 143.
63. I am not so "literalist" so as to miss the fact that Chaucer (or the Clerk) undercuts this feminine inheritance of language by prefacing it with the advice: "Folweth Ekko, that holdeth no silence, / But evere answereth at

- the countretaille” (lines 1198–99), a phrase that suggests empty repetition and contradiction merely for its own sake. Perhaps any such language inheritance is empty repetition and any search for an exemplar is useless.
64. For discussion of the significance of Griselda’s immovable expression, see Thomas H. Bestul, “True and False *Cheere* in Chaucer’s *Clerk’s Tale*,” *Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 82 (1983): 500–14; and Sprung, “If it youre wille be,” pp. 350–52. For Griselda as a work of art, see Muriel Whitaker, “The Artist’s Ideal Griselda,” in *Sovereign Lady: Essays on Women in Middle English Literature* (New York: Garland, 1995), pp. 87–91. More generally, see Roland Barthes, *S/Z: An Essay*, trans. Richard Miller (New York: Hill and Wang, 1975), pp. 40–43.
  65. See Lavezzo, “Chaucer and Everyday Death,” p. 269, for the pietà image.
  66. Kirkpatrick, “The Griselda Story,” p. 243.
  67. It is possible to interpret Walter as “tamed” by Grisilde, so that her example has worked on him, but there is little evidence in the *Tale* to suggest that he has changed, as one may see through examining his relations with his people (his eventual “conversion” involves only his dubious and absurdly belated understanding of his wife, so far as readers can tell). By the end of the narrative, Walter has both fooled and completely subjected a previously interventionist populace. He would even seem to choose Grisilde as his wife in order to spite them, once they have insisted that he marry (181–85). He then removes his children from their mother and from public view for several years (so that his own influence over them will dominate: once again the sign of a tyrant), without apparently caring that the people think that he has murdered his children when the prospect of an heir was their principal reason that he marry. Finally, one might note that Walter does not explicitly release Grisilde from her vow at the end of the *Tale*.
  68. See Robin Waugh, “A Woman in the Mind’s Eye (and not): Narrator’s and Gazes in Chaucer’s *Clerk’s Tale* and in Two Analogues,” *Philological Quarterly* 79 (2000): 9–10. Mann says “in this tale, patience is shorn of its quality of movement . . . is frozen into the marble stillness of endurance.” *Feminizing Chaucer*, p. 117.
  69. See Severs, *Literary Relationships*, pp. 278–79. See Chaucer’s *Nun’s Priest’s Tale*, line 3217, for “heigh” as a vantage point where one may see widely, almost with divine omniscience.
  70. See Lynn Staley, “Chaucer and the Postures of Sanctity,” in *The Powers of the Holy: Religion, Politics, and Genders in Late Medieval English Culture*, ed. David Aers and Lynn Staley (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1996), p. 241.
  71. See Elizabeth A. Castelli, “‘I Will Make Mary Male’: Pieties of the Body and Gender Transformation of Christian Women in Late Antiquity,” in *Body Guards: The Cultural Politics of Gender Ambiguity*, ed. Julia Epstein and Kristina Straub (New York: Routledge, 1991), pp. 3, 42, 46–47.

## 6 The Female Patience Figure as Shrine

1. See the bibliography in John H. Arnold and Katherine J. Lewis, eds., *A Companion to The Book of Margery Kempe* (Cambridge, UK: Brewer, 2004), pp. 223–40.
2. See, for example, Stanley Hussey, “The Rehabilitation of Margery Kempe,” *Leeds Studies in English*, new series 32 (2001): 171–94.
3. See Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints’ Lives in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), pp. xvi, 116–42.
4. See Timea K. Szell, “From Woe to Weal and Weal to Woe: Notes on the Structure of *The Book of Margery Kempe*,” in *Margery Kempe: A Book of Essays*, ed. Sandra J. McEntire (New York: Garland, 1992), pp. 73–91.
5. In some ways I agree with Sanok that such extreme material is meant to satirize the society that Margery tries to both live in and transcend. See *Her Life Historical*, pp. 140–41.
6. Sanok, *Her Life Historical*, pp. 124; 18, 136–37.
7. Julia Kristeva, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, ed. Leon S. Roudiez, trans. Thomas Gora, Alice Jardine, and Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980), p. 240; Cynthia Hahn, “Seeing and Believing: The Construction of Sanctity in Early-Medieval Saints’ Shrines,” *Speculum* 72 (1997): 1079–87; and Virginia Chieffo Raguin and Stanbury, eds., *Women’s Space: Patronage, Place, and Gender in the Medieval Church* (Binghamton: State University of New York Press, 2005). One could argue that a kind of feminine language exists in and from the shrines of female saints because of the roles of saints and their votive objects as intercessors. Such female votive objects express their messages of intervention upon a pilgrim’s behalf through their gazes. See Susan Signe Morrison, *Women Pilgrims in Late Medieval England: Private Piety as Public Performance* (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 27.
8. Sarah Stanbury, “Regimes of the Visual in Premodern England: Gaze, Body, and Chaucer’s *Clerk’s Tale*,” *New Literary History* 28 (1997): 264–65.
9. Morrison, *Women Pilgrims*, pp. 16–42, and nn. 41–43. The shrine attracted many famous women. See p. 17, and Carol F. Heffernan, “Praying Before the Image of Mary: Chaucer’s *Prioress’s Tale*, VII 502–12,” *Chaucer Review* 39 (2004): 106.
10. Stanbury, “Regimes of the Visual,” pp. 267, 269. Inside the basilica at Loreto, the shrine appears to consist of three walls made out of local bricks together with stone purportedly from the house of the holy family in Nazareth. The holy house, by tradition, was miraculously brought to Loreto by angels in 1294 (representations of this miracle appear in many churches). Entry to the shrine is gained by two side openings in its nine and one half by four meters structure. So, entering the large space of the basilica, one must make one’s way to the smaller, confined space—associated with the domestic skill of Mary—in order to get into the shrine.

A pilgrim entering from one of the side doors walks into the gaze of a fresco of Mary, which dates from about the fourteenth century and is now situated about three feet above eye-level.

11. For changes in art starting in the twelfth century, see Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, p. 251.
12. The contrast is especially clear in the Saint Cecilia in Trastevere church where, inside the lower part of the altar, is a modern depiction of how Cecilia was found positioned in her grave when she was dug up. Her eyes and face are averted from the viewer. See Laura Mulvey, "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema," in *Contemporary Literary Criticism: Literary and Cultural Studies*, ed. Robert Con Davis and Ronald Schleifer, 3rd ed. (New York: Longman, 1994), p. 429.
13. Stanbury, "Regimes of the Visual," p. 279.
14. This poem contains one explicit shrine (670–80) and several pseudoshrines (F 203–07, 785, 1225, etc.).
15. Morrison, *Women Pilgrims*, pp. 27–29, 84. Carol Heffernan notes that Chaucer could have been familiar with Eastern icons. See "Praying Before the Image of Mary," p. 105.
16. See Sarah Stanbury, *The Visual Object of Desire in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), p. 125.
17. See J. Burke Severs, *Literary Relationships of Chaucer's "Clerkes Tale"* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1942), pp. 262–63, and Gail Ashton, "Patient Mimesis: Griselda and the Clerk's Tale," *Chaucer Review* 32 (1998): 234.
18. See Stanbury, "Regimes of the Visual," p. 280. Cf. *Wife of Bath's Prologue*, lines 596–602, 723.
19. See Virginia Cieffo Raguin, "Real and Imagined Bodies in Architectural Space: The Setting for Margery Kempe's *Book*," in Raguin and Stanbury, eds., *Women's Space*, pp. 116, 119; and Morrison, *Women Pilgrims*, pp. 4, 28, 112.
20. Cf. the spaces associated with Perpetua in her passion. She is able to establish a space of her own wherever she is, even highly politicized spaces such as the arena and forum in Carthage. In the martyrs' prison, she says, *ut ibi malle esse quam alicubi* (Musurillo, ed., *Passio Sanctorum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 110), [I wanted to be there rather than anywhere else] (p. 111). One might note also in *The Book of Margery Kempe* an instance of Margery's expectation of being led off to prison, only to find that she ends up in a private bedchamber (p. 130).
21. Chaucer's lists of his works suggest that *The Second Nun's Tale* existed in some discrete form before its appearance in *The Canterbury Tales*. See Larry D. Benson, ed., *The Riverside Chaucer*, 3rd ed. (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1987), p. 942.
22. See Kristina Sessa, "Christianity and the *cubiculum*: Spiritual Politics and Domestic Space in Late Ancient Rome," *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 15 (2007): 171–204.
23. See Sanok, *Her Life Historical*, pp. 7, 168; and Miller, "The Blazing Body," pp. 27–28.

24. See Deborah S. Ellis, "Domestic Treachery in the *Clerk's Tale*," in *Ambiguous Realities: Women in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, ed. Carole Levin and Jeanie Watson (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1987), pp. 106–07; and Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, p. 139. Krueger notes that the various versions of the Griselda story vary greatly in their emphasis upon the heroine's domestic activities. See Roberta L. Krueger, "Uncovering Griselda—Christine de Pizan, 'une seule chemise,' and the Clerical Tradition: Boccaccio, Petrarch, Philippe de Mézières and the Ménagier de Paris," in *Medieval Fabrications: Dress, Textiles, Clothwork, and Other Cultural Imaginings*, ed. E. Jane Burns (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), p. 79.
25. Stanbury, "Regimes of the Visual," p. 282.
26. See Robin Waugh, "Word, Breath, and Vomit: Oral Composition in Old English and Old Norse Literature," *Oral Tradition* 10 (1995): 359–86.
27. Also a motif of martyrdoms. See Andrea Rossi-Reder, "Embodying Christ, Embodying Nation: Ælfric's Accounts of Saints Agatha and Lucy," in *Sex and Sexuality in Anglo-Saxon England: Essays in Memory of Daniel Gillmore Calder*, ed. Carol Braun Pasternack and Lisa M. C. Weston (Tempe: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2004), p. 188.
28. Wolfgang E. H. Rudat, *Earnest Exuberance in Chaucer's Poetic's: Textual Games in the Canterbury Tales* (Lewiston: Mellen, 1993), pp. 187–88.
29. Patricia Cramer, "Lordship, Bondage, and the Erotic: The Psychological Bases of Chaucer's 'Clerk's Tale,'" *Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 89 (1990): 497.
30. Allyson Newton, "The Occlusion of Maternity in Chaucer's *Clerk's Tale*," in *Medieval Mothering*, ed. John Carmi Parsons and Bonnie Wheeler (New York: Garland, 1996), pp. 67, 63–65.
31. Newton, "Occlusion of Maternity," p. 69.
32. Carolyn Dinshaw, *Chaucer's Sexual Poetics* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1989), p. 146; Alcuin Blamires, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), pp. 164–71.
33. Cramer, "Lordship, Bondage, and the Erotic," p. 497; Kristeva, *Desire in Language*, pp. 247; 281–86; *Tales of Love*, trans. Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), pp. 246–59. Walter tries to reproduce Grisilde with his new bride, who is her inheritor through being Grisilde's daughter. In other words, Walter wants the most refined kind of male-centered reduplication of himself together with his love-object (counterfeit consciousness) by the elimination of any possibility of female, maternal education. The daughter (in his eyes) is a duplication of the satisfaction of his sexual desire and nothing more. Counterfeit consciousness also figures in the supposed sacrificing of Grisilde's children. See Kathy Lavezzo, "Chaucer and Everyday Death: *The Clerk's Tale*, Burial, and the Subject of Poverty," *Studies in the Age of Chaucer* 23 (2001): 269, 271.

34. For the gazes of the lovers in *Troilus and Criseyde* more generally, see Stanbury, *Visual Object of Desire*, pp. 106–07.
35. See, for examples, Xavier F. Baron, “Chaucer’s *Troilus* and Self-Renunciation in Love,” *Papers on Literature and Language* 10 (1974): 5–14; and Michael Masi, “*Troilus*: A Medieval Psychoanalysis,” *Annuaire Medievale* 11 (1970): 81–88.
36. Lisa Manter, “The Savior of Her Desire: Margery Kempe’s Passionate Gaze,” *Exemplaria* 13 (2001): 39–66. See also Robert Mills, “Seeing Face to Face: Troubled Looks in the Katherine Group,” in *Troubled Vision: Gender, Sexuality and Sight in Medieval Text and Image*, ed. Emma Campbell and Robert Mills (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004), pp. 117–36.
37. See Carolyn Dinshaw, *Getting Medieval: Sexualities and Communities, Pre- and Postmodern* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999), pp. 144–46.
38. See Sue Ellen Holbrook, “‘About Her’: Margery Kempe’s Book of Feeling and Writing,” in *The Idea of Medieval Literature: New Essays on Chaucer and Medieval Culture in Honor of Donald R. Howard*, ed. James M. Dean and Christian K. Zacher (Newark, NJ: University of Delaware Press, 1992), pp. 265–84.
39. Even the negative reactions to Margery tend to stress the idea of space. Upon witnessing her actions people often literally want to put distance between themselves and her (69). To go about one’s business as if Margery were not present would be another way of reacting to her: presumably a difficult task, and of course a highly problematic and paradoxical task for any reader of her *Book*.
40. For a late thirteenth-century or early fourteenth-century devotional object that depicts the Virgin as a container of the Holy Trinity, see Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), plate 13.
41. See Sarah Beckwith, *Christ’s Body: Identity, Culture and Society in Late Medieval Writings* (New York: Routledge, 1993), p. 91.
42. Ruth Summar McIntyre, “Margery’s ‘Mixed Life’: Place, Pilgrimage, and the Problem of Genre in *The Book of Margery Kempe*,” *English Studies* 89 (2008): 650. Morrison describes Gilles Deleuze’s and Félix Guattari’s idea of “nomad space,” “open-ended, enterable at any point, acentered, anti-hierarchical, multiple, open, without borders and in marginalized areas,” as the kind of space Margery wants, but I see Margery as *embodying* this idea of nomad space, a leap Morrison does not make. See *Women Pilgrims*, p. 122, n. 65.
43. McIntyre, “Margery’s ‘Mixed Life,’” p. 656; Raguin, “Real and Imagined Bodies,” pp. 122, 125. Margery also breaks down barriers between performer and audience in these spaces. See Morrison, *Women Pilgrims*, pp. 89–90.
44. See Herbert Thurston, “Margery the Astonishing,” *The Month* 168 (1936): 446–56.

45. McIntyre, "Margery's 'Mixed Life,'" p. 656.
46. Raguin, "Real and Imagined Bodies," p. 123.
47. *Burial*, in *The Late Medieval Religious Plays of Bodleian MSS Digby 133 and E Museo 160*, ed. Donald C. Baker, John L. Murphy, and Louis B. Hall, Jr. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), line 637. See also pp. lxxxviii–xcv, n. 2, and *English Lyrics of the XIIIth Century*, ed. Carleton Brown (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1932), Number 47, lines 8–9, and Number 49, lines 40–42, 46–48, 54.
48. See Dhira B. Mahoney, "Margery Kempe's Tears and the Power over Language," in *Margery Kempe: A Book of Essays*, ed. S.J. McEntire (New York: Garland, 1992), pp. 37–50.
49. See, for example, Sarah Beckwith, "A Very Material Mysticism: The Medieval Mysticism of Margery Kempe," in *Medieval Literature: Criticism, Ideology and History*, ed. David Aers (Sussex: Harvester, 1988), pp. 34–57.
50. The content of the monk's reaction demonstrates that, significantly, Margery's main problems for him are that she is movable and speaks.



## INDEX

Note: Principal discussions are noted in bold.

- Abraham (Bible)  
    bargaining, 102  
    gaze at Loth's wife, 97, 196n56  
    inheritance, 93, 105, **107–8**
- abstraction, 26, 32
- Achilles Tatius, 17
- Acta Sanctorum*, 183n120
- Acts of Literature* (Derrida), 75
- The Acts of Martyrs*, 10, 15
- Adam (Bible), 104, 106
- The Adventures of Leucippe and Clitophon* (Achilles Tatius), 17, 26
- Aeneas, 15
- Aesop, 195–6n50
- Agatha (saint), 26, 27, 32, 115
- Agnes (saint), 26, 27, 113–14
- Alceste, 132
- Alcuin, 92, 101–2, 105–6, 198n70, 207n51
- Alfred (king), 194n35
- Ælfric, 92, 100–1, 102, 103, 107, 194n34, 196–7n59, 198n72
- Amaltheias-Keras (Job's daughter), 23
- Ambrose (church father)  
    Agnes, 113–14  
    female line of knowledge, 46  
    patience and clothing, 192n5  
    pornographic aspects, 117, 201n10  
    Saint Cecilia, 164  
    space in writing, 190n70  
    see also *De Virginitibus* (Ambrose)
- Ammon (Lot's grandchild), 106
- Andreas Capellanus, 121
- Anistrude (nun), 73
- Annals* (Tacitus), 11
- Antiochus (Roman authority figure), 19, 20
- Antiquities* (Josephus), 98
- Apollonius of Tyre, 111
- Apologeticum* (Tertullian), 21, 24, 178n41
- Arcadia* (Pausanias), **21–3**
- Artaxius (martyr), 57
- artificiality  
    cyborgs, 137, 139–40, 150, 205nn23, 49  
    element of narratives, 26  
    “The Assumption of the Virgin” (Jacobus de Voragine), 118
- athletic allegory, 190n74  
    about, **13–14**  
    *Legenda Aurea*, 114–15  
    Perpetua, 49, 52–5, 55–6, 186nn21–22  
    Roman space, 27–8  
    Virgin of Antioch, 68  
    women, 49
- Augustine (saint), 4, 24, 93, 102, 196n51
- authority. *see* break with authority
- averted eyes. *see* gaze(s)
- Bailey, Harry, 134, 154
- Bakhtin, M. M., 3, 13, 15, 16, 157
- Barthes, Roland, 22, 128, 182n107
- Bede, 95, 101, 194nn30, 38, 195n45, 197n66, 198n73

- belief identification  
 Blandina, 13, 14, 34  
 defined, **26**  
 Griselda legend, 135  
 martyrs, 9  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, **39–43**, 48, 181n94  
 patience literature, 9  
 suffering, 9
- Beowulf*, 110, 200n89
- Bernabo (character), 139
- Bhabha, Homi K., 33
- Biggs, Frederick M., 194n34
- Blandina (martyr), 4, **11–13**  
 Dialogue Portion, 12  
 egalitarian ideas, 153  
 fame of, 24  
 heroic values, **14, 15**, 20–1  
*Legenda Aurea*, 115, 119  
 martyrdom of, 28, 60, 68, 140  
 motherhood, **18–21**  
 space, 28  
 undercutting of, 19  
 within literary tradition, 23
- blood  
 blood as milk, 46, 197n61  
 Lot's wife, 99, 197n60
- Bloom, Harold, 142
- Boccaccio, Giovanni, 133, 139, 143
- Book of Margery Kempe* (Kempe)  
 analysis of, 1, 36  
 patience literature, **157–9, 172–3**  
 prison, 211n20  
 suffering, 157–9, 210n5  
 visionary paralysis, 35, 163, 168, 171–2, 173  
 women and the Shrine, 162, 163, **168–73**  
*see also* Kempe, Margery
- Book of Revelation, 45
- The Book of the City of Ladies* (Christine de Pizan), 133–4, **138–9**, 144  
*see also* Gliseldis (Christine's character)
- The Book of the Duchess* (Chaucer), 131
- Boyarin, Daniel, 190n68
- Braswell, Laurel, 3
- break with authority  
 defined, **25–6**  
 Loth's wife, 81, 87, 100, 107–8, 195nn41, 45  
 patience literature, 24  
 Perpetua, 37–8, 43–4, **56–8**  
 romance genre, 37  
 Sarra, 107–9  
*Vitae Columbani*, 72  
*compare* egalitarian ideas; power structures
- breast-feeding, 40, 45–6, 54
- Brody, Saul Nathaniel, 3
- brothels  
 as By Way, 63  
 introduction of, **27**  
 Irenê, 31  
 Virgin of Antioch, 63–6  
*compare* By Ways; sexuality; space
- Brown, Peter, 200n88
- Burgundofara (royal abbess), **71–4**
- Burrus, Virginia, 13–14, 57, 60, 64–5, 68, 70
- Butler, Judith, 1
- Butler, Rex, 55
- By Ways  
 defined, **27**  
 female protagonists, 44  
 Griselda legend, 145  
 Loth's wife, 82  
 Margery Kempe, 168–9  
 Perpetua, 43, 44, 181n94  
 prisons, 181n93, 211n20  
*Second Nun's Tale*, 163–4  
*compare* brothels; space
- The Canterbury Tales* (Chaucer), 134, 165–6  
 order of, 141  
 retraction, 204n17  
*see also* Chaucer, Geoffrey; *The Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer)
- Cassia (Job's daughter), 23
- Castelli, Elizabeth A., 29, 38, 55, 57, 156

- castration, 117
- Cazelles, Brigitte, 126
- Cecilia (saint)
- abstraction, 26
  - chastity, 27
  - churches, 160, 196n57, 211n12
  - gender inequality, 32
  - inheritance, 153, 164
  - musical language, 32, 119
  - Second Nun's Tale*, **163–5**
- Cecilie (character), **163–5**
- Cecilie, inheritance, 164
- Chaucer, Geoffrey
- The Book of the Duchess*, 131
  - Eastern icons, 211n15
  - Griselda legend, 155
  - hagiography, 208n56
  - impatience, 133
  - The Legend of Good Women*, 3, 33, **131–3**, 142, 162
  - The Man of Law's Tale*, 7, 131, 134, 139, 141
  - The Merchant's Tale*, 37
  - patience literature, 131–2, 132, 142
  - The Physician's Tale*, 131
  - Prioress's Tale*, **119–20**, 201n18
  - satire, 120, 132–3, 137, 140–2, 145, 146, 152–3, 156, 201n20, 204n14
  - Second Nun's Tale*, 131, 139, **163–5**, 211n21
  - Tale of Melibee*, 5–6, 131, 139, 141
  - Troilus and Criseyde*, 131, **167–8**
  - women and the Shrine, 159, **162–7**
  - see also *The Canterbury Tales* (Chaucer); *The Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer)
- cheese, 45, 186nn25, 27
- childbirth comparison, martyrs, 15–16
- Childress, Diana T., 3
- chora, 185n10
- Chrétien de Troyes
- satire, 124, 202n10
  - see also *Cligés* (Chrétien de Troyes)
- Christ
- cyborg nature, 205n23
  - Lot's wife, 101, 103, 196n58
  - Perpetua, 59, 188n46
  - sexuality, 168
  - as virgin, 46
- Christianity
- birth imagery, 15–16, 50, 187n41
  - Christian language, 48
  - egalitarian ideas, 10–11
  - heritage of, 46, 50–1
  - oral modes of thought, 8
  - public space, 28
  - saints and civic authority, 200n88
  - use of “Christian,” **41–2**
  - visions, 44
- Christina (martyr), 21, 46
- Christine de Pizan, 1, 133–4, 204n17, 205n33
- Griselda legend, 155
  - on patience, 138
  - satire, 142, 145, 146
  - source for, 206–7n44
- churches, **160–1**, 164, 196n57, 211n12
- Cicero, 22, 194n35
- Cixous, Hélène, 22, 29–30, 31
- class. see egalitarian ideas
- Cleanness*, 87, 95
- Clement of Alexandria, 45, 46
- Clement of Rome, 10, 12, 92, 95
- The Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer), 149–51
- definition of patience, 5
  - fame, 2–4
  - Griselda legend, **133–7**, 155–6
  - iconography of, 36
  - patience figures, 23
  - patience literature, 9, 131, 133–4, 138
  - satire, 36
  - the Shrine, 162
  - songs, 141, 205n27
  - source for, 206–7n44
  - see also Chaucer, Geoffrey; Grisilde (Chaucer's character); Walter (Chaucer's character)
- Cligés* (Chrétien de Troyes)
- intervention, **126–9**
  - as profeminine work, 36
  - see also Chrétien de Troyes; Fénicé (empress)

- Cligés (titular character), 121–2, 123, 129
- clothing
- Griselda legend, 136, 145–6
  - Margery Kempe, 168
  - patience as, 192n4, 192n5
  - Perpetua, 52–4, 186n21
  - sexual conquest, 190n75
  - transvestite saints, 62
  - Virgin of Antioch, 64–6, 68–70, 190–1n83
- Colgrave, Bertram, 183n114
- complexity (growth of), **26**
- conquered demon story, 5
- Corinthians, 52
- counterfeit consciousness
- egalitarian ideas, **31–3, 35**, 133
  - Fénice, 124
  - Griselde, 134, 152, 212n33
  - Legenda Aurea*, 117, 132–3
  - Prioress's Tale*, **119–20**, 201n18
  - compare* mimicry; repetition syndrome
- courtly love, 8, 66, 121–2, 124–6
- court records. *see* Dialogue Portion
- Cramer, Patricia, 165
- Criseyde (character), 9, 167–8
- Crispina (martyr), 10
- Custance (character), 7, 134, 139, 141, 205n30
- cyborgs, 137, 139–40, 150, 205nn23, 49
- Cynewulf, 110
- Cyprian (church father), 6, 24, 194n32
- Daly, Emily Joseph, 180n79, 191n3
- Dame Prudence (character), 5
- de bono patientiae* (Cyprian), 24
- Decameron* (Boccaccio), 139
- Delany, Sheila, 29, 204n14
- Delehay, Hippolyte, 183n115
- Deleuze, Gilles, 213n42
- de Nie, Giselle, 45, 54, 187n28, 188n44
- de patientia* (Augustine), 24
- de patientia* (Tertullian), 24, 75, **76–80**
- Derrida, Jacques
- history of patience, 4–5
  - power relationships, 18
  - theories of language, 75, 182n104
  - theory of desire, 8, 30
- desire
- Derrida's theories, 8, 30
  - Griselda, 135–7
  - Grisilde (Chaucer's character), 135–7, 162–3, 206n36
  - Loth's wife, 98, **100–4**, 196n58, 197n66
  - Walter (Chaucer's character), 135–6, 154, **165–7**, 203n11, 206–7n44, 208n53, 212n33
  - compare* sexuality
- Desire in Language* (Kristeva), 167
- Dialogia* (Gregory), 24
- Dialogic Imagination* (Bakhtin), 3
- Dialogue Portion
- Blandina, 12
  - defined, **25**, 26
  - Felicitas (martyr), 38
  - judicial hearings, 181n94
  - marriage disputes, 25
  - Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 38
  - see also* judicial hearings
- Dinocrates (Perpetua's brother), 48–9, 50, 57, 59, 185n8, 189n58
- Dinshaw, Carolyn, 148, 149
- divine language, 73
- Doane, A. N., 80
- Dodds, E. R., 186n27
- Domna (nun), 73
- doubling. *see* mimicry
- The Earliest Life of Gregory the Great* (Colgrave), 183n114
- Easton, Martha, 116–17
- ecstatic languages, 32
- Edden, Valerie, 3
- egalitarian ideas
- Blandina, 12, 153
  - Christianity, 10–11, 18, 30
  - Christine de Pizan, 138–9
  - counterfeit consciousness, **31–3, 35**, 133
  - de Patientia*, 78

- gender order, 62  
 glimpses in literature, 182n104  
 Griselda legend, 139–40  
 martyrologies, 11, 178n43  
 saints' lives, **30**  
 stasis motif, 34  
 Tertullian, 10, 178n41, 192n8  
 Virgin of Antioch, 69–71  
*Vitae Columbani*, 72–3  
*compare* break with authority;  
 power structures  
 the Egyptian, 52–4, 56, 59  
 Eleazar (martyr), 16, 19–20  
 Elene (Cynewulf), 110  
 endurance. *see hypomonē*  
*Epistola I* (Jerome), 18  
 Ercantrude (nun), 71–2  
 Eugenia (martyr), 115, 188n44  
 Eulalia (saint), 114, 118  
 Eusebius of Caesarea, 11, 12, 14, 24  
 expressive power  
 automatic speech, 48  
 biting out tongue, **21–3**, 180n81  
 Grisilde, 135  
 Lot/Loth story, 91–7, 96, 106  
 Margery Kempe, 168–71, 213n39,  
 214n50  
 Marian sorrow, 171  
 Perpetua, **45–7**, **48–9**, **51**, 96  
*Prioress's Tale*, 119–20  
 Sarrah, **107–9**  
 subversiveness of, 110  
 Virgin of Antioch, 191n87  
 writing with the body, **21–3**  
*compare* language
- fame  
*de Patientia*, 76  
 evolution of attitudes, 24  
 Griselda legend, 2–4, 147  
 Lot's daughters, 106  
 patience literature, 1  
 Perpetua, 55  
 reputation, 2–3, 14–15  
 sources of, 1  
 women, 1
- family  
 authority in Roman Empire,  
 181n94  
 impact on, 47  
 Perpetua, 41–2  
 Farrell, Thomas J., 145, 182n109  
 Felicitas (martyr)  
 Dialogue Portion, 38  
 martyrdom, 53–4, 59–60, 68  
 motherhood and inheritance, 50–1,  
**60–1**, 115  
 Felicity (saint), 118, 153  
 Felix, Minucius, 10  
 female protagonists  
 By Ways, 44  
 hagiography, 7, 201nn11, 13  
*Legenda Aurea*, **116–19**  
 martyrologies, **9–11**  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, 37  
 secular hagiography, 7  
 Tertullian, 192n4
- feminism  
 feminist methodology, **28–30**  
*l'écriture féminine*, **28–30**, 31  
 temporal context, 29, 182n104,  
 188n51  
 Tertullian, 190n2
- feminist methodology  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, criticism of masculinist  
 traditions in, **55–6**  
 readings of Chaucer, 205n26
- Fénice (empress)  
 counterfeit consciousness, 124  
 courtly love, 121–2, 124–6  
 desire, 121–2, 123  
 Griselda legend, 121  
 martyrdom, 122–6  
 passivity, 140  
 patience figures, 128  
 stasis motif, 124–5, 126, 136,  
 159, 173  
*see also Cligés* (Chrétien de Troyes)
- fertility. *see* inheritance  
 film screening, 36, 168

- Foucault, Michel, 17–18, 22  
 Frantzen, Allen J., 87, 198n74, 199n80  
 Frese, Dolores Warwick, 198n73  
 Friedman, Susan Stanford, 12
- Galatians, 62
- gaze(s)  
 Abraham, 97, 196n56  
 averted eyes imagery, 160–2, 211n12  
 the daisy, 162  
 female saints, 160, 210n7  
 Griselda legend, 136, 143–4, 147–51,  
 153–4, 156, 162–3, 206nn35–36,  
 207n47  
 language, 28  
 Lot/Loth's wife, 81–2, 86–7, 91–2,  
 98–102, 108–9, 195nn41, 45  
 Margery Kempe, 168–9  
 Perpetua, 53–4, 59  
 power of, 167  
 screen theory, 36, 168  
 Stanbury on, 162, 167, 207n46  
 Troilus, 167  
 Virgin Mary, 160, 210n10  
 Virgin of Antioch, 63, 190–1n84  
*compare* imagery
- gendering  
 class issues, 12  
*de Patientia*, 76–9  
 development of, **26–7**  
 heroic values, **14–15**  
*hypomonê*, 17  
*Legenda Aurea*, 117–18  
 Lot's wife, 36  
 patience, 134, 134–5  
 reputations, **2–3**  
 saints' lives, 24  
 stasis motif, **34–5**  
 suffering, **17–18**, 173  
*compare* women
- gender order  
*Cligés*, **126–9**  
 egalitarian ideas, 62  
 inequality, Cecilia (saint), 32  
 Lot's daughters, 106  
 saints' lives, 39, 61  
 sex–distinguishing punishments,  
**31–2**, 59–60, 68  
 transvestite saints, 62  
 Virgin of Antioch, 63–4
- gender roles  
*de Patientia*, 79  
*Legenda Aurea*, 117  
 masculine identity, 181n91  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, 52–5  
 passivity as role, 9, 134  
 patience (virtue), 167  
 saints' lives, 61
- Genesis (Old Testament), 80
- Genesis A*  
 dating of, 80  
 expansions of Vulgate–Genesis, 80  
 patience figures, 76  
 punishments, 102, 103  
*see also* Lot's wife (*Genesis A*)
- Gliselidis (Christine's character), 139,  
**143–7**, 154, 163  
*see also* *Book of the City of Ladies*  
 (Christine de Pizan)
- glory. *see* fame
- God  
*de Patientia*, patience figures, 78–9  
 Griselda legend, 155  
 language, 81, 91–2  
 patience figures, 78–9  
 plans of, 176n17  
 source of all knowledge, 45–6
- Godden, Malcolm R., 101, 102, 106,  
 107, 199n80
- Gregory the Great, 9, 24, 33
- Grimbert, Joan Tasker, 129, 202n14
- Griselda legend, 1–2  
 belief identification, 135  
*The Book of the City of Ladies*, 133–4  
*The Clerk's Tale*, **133–7**  
 counterfeit consciousness, 134, 152,  
 212n33  
 desire, 135–7  
 domestic space, 139–40, 212n24

- Fénice (empress), 121  
 heroic virtues, 145  
 patience as female, 134–5  
 patience figures, 152, 152–3  
 Petrarch, 133, 141, 143–5, 147, 155, 203n10, 206–7n44  
 popularity of, 152, 158  
 repetition syndrome, 152  
 the Shrine, 163  
 stasis motif, 135–7, 159, 173  
 suffering, 135
- Griseldis (Petrarch's character), 143, 144, 150
- Grisilde (Chaucer's character), 1  
 artificiality/cyborg nature, 139–40, 150, 204n13  
 as art object, **153–6**  
 casting out of, 3, 151, 155, 166  
 Clerk's sympathy for, 149  
 connection with saints, 7  
 counterfeit consciousness, 134, 212n33  
 death of, **141–2**  
 desire, 135–7, 162–3, 206n36  
 exemplarity of, **152–3**, 208n60  
 objectification of women, 29, 144–5, 150, 156  
 patience figure, 4, 5, 6–7, 134, 208n53  
 pseudo-saints, 3–4  
 the Shrine, **165–7**, 170, 206n41  
 virtue of, 147, 148  
 vow to Walter, 144, 146  
 see also *Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer)
- Gualtier (Christine's character), 139, 143, 144–5, 146, 147
- Guattari, Félix, 213n42
- hagiography, 3  
 belief identification, **26**  
*Book of Margery Kempe*, 157–8  
 Chaucer, 3–4, 5–7, 131–2, 208n56  
 endurance, 16  
 female protagonists, 7, 201nn11, 13  
 heroic virtues, **13–16**  
 Miracles of the Virgin, 118–19  
 other genres, 2, 17  
*compare* patience literature
- Hahn, Cynthia, 159
- Hanna, Ralph, III, 9, 177n35
- Haraway, Donna, 137, 140
- Harries, Martin, 87, 94, 103, 196n58
- heaven  
 By Ways, 164  
 gender, 68  
 Perpetua, 45, 57, 188n46, 189n61
- Heffernan, Carol, 211n15
- Helena (saint), 164
- Hemera (Job's daughter), 23
- Heptateuch*, 92, 196n56
- heroic values  
 Blandina, 14, 15, 20–1  
 fame, 1  
 gendering, 17  
 Griselda legend, 145  
 hagiography, **13–16**  
 martyrs, 15, 22  
 patience literature, 23–4  
 Perpetua, 55–6
- Hilarianus (governor), 47
- Historia Ecclesia* (Eusebius of Caesarea), 11, 12
- History of Sexuality*, 17–18
- Holy House of Nazareth, 163, 210–11n10
- honey, 45, 186n26
- Huppé, Bernard, 101
- Hurley, Margaret, 3
- hypomoné*  
 first appearance of noun, 16  
 gendering, **17–18**  
 patience literature, 7–8, 23–4  
 shift towards, **16–17**  
 see also suffering
- identity  
 masculine identity, 59, 181n91  
 Perpetua (Vibia Perpetua)  
 (martyr), 42
- Ignatius of Antioch, 16, 179n67

- imagery  
 athletic imagery, 50  
 averted eyes, 160–2, 211n12  
 blood as milk, 46  
 breast-feeding, 40, **45–6**, 54  
 Christ-like, 188n46  
 Eastern icons, 211n15  
 executions, 117  
 Father-with-breasts, **45–6**  
 of the feminine, 42  
 Griselda legend, 149  
 inheritance, 199n79  
 Lot text, **83–4**, **84–92**, 98–9, 100,  
 193nn21, 25–28, 197n62,  
 197n67, 199n80  
 Margery Kempe, 172  
 vases and waterpots, 42, 145, 154,  
 165, 185–6nn15, 17, 186n19  
*compare* gaze(s)
- impatience  
 Chaucer, 133  
 2 Maccabees, 20  
 sin of, 176n17  
*compare* patience
- inheritance  
 Cecilia, 153, 164  
 Felicitas, 50–1, 115  
 Felicity [mentioned in passing], 153  
 female line of knowledge, 46,  
 49–50, 116, 153, 188n44, 212n33  
 female saints, 153  
 imagery, 199n79  
 Job's daughters, 23, **104–5**  
 Lucy [mentioned in passing], 153  
 Paula [mentioned in passing], 153  
 phantom inheritance, 35  
*Interrogationes Sigewulf Presbyteri*  
 (Alcuin/Ælfric), 92, 101, 102  
 Irenaeus (c. 180), 95–6  
 Irenê (saint), 27, 31
- Jacobo (saint), 115  
 Jacobus de Voragine  
 etymologies of saint's names, 200n5  
 Roman authorities, 124  
 Saint Lucy source, 183n120  
 see also *Legenda Aurea* (Jacobus de  
 Voragine)  
 “James the Dismembered,” 115–16  
 Jerome (saint), 18, 117, 185n17,  
 185–6n17, 191n87, 194n35
- Job (Bible)  
*de Patientia*, 76, 77  
 family legacy, 23, 104  
 Job's daughters, 23, 32, 35  
 proverbial patience figure of, 6, 23  
*Vitae Columbani*, 71  
 women as inheritors of, 23  
 see also *The Testament of Job*
- John (Margery's husband), 171, 172  
 Jonas of Bobbio, 71–3  
 Josephus, 98  
 Jucundus (martyr), 57
- judicial hearings  
 Dialogue Portion, 181n94  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, 181n94  
 see also Dialogue Portion
- Julian of Norwich, 35
- Karkov, Catherine E., 199n79  
 Katherine of Alexandria, 26  
 Kempe, Margery  
 expressive power, 168–71, 213n39,  
 214n50  
 the Shrine, 159  
 space, 213nn39, 42–43  
 see also *Book of Margery Kempe*  
 (Kempe)
- Kidd, Peter, 193n25  
 Kirk, Elizabeth D., 28
- knowledge  
 female line of, 46, 49–50, 116, 153,  
 188n44, 212n33  
*Prioress's Tale*, 119–20  
 source of, 45–6  
 women's tradition, 181–2n104
- Kraemer, Ross Shepard, 38  
 Kristeva, Julia  
 on language, 39–41, 43, 48, 50, 72,  
 167, 185n10  
 sacrifice for family, 47



- space, time and separation, 82,  
97, 159
- Krueger, Roberta L., 212n24
- Kuefler, Mathew, 62
- Lacan, Jacques, 28, 96–7
- Langland, William, 191n1
- language
- Christian language, 48
  - Derrida's theories of, 75, 182n104
  - divine language, 73
  - ecstatic languages, 32
  - feminine language, 39–40, 43–4,  
46, 47, 73–4, 208–9n63, 210n5
  - forms of address, 56
  - gaze, 28
  - God, 81, 91–2
  - language acquisition, 39–40, 49, 50,  
165–7
  - oral vs. written language, 8, 97, 99,  
196n55
  - paternal function of, 41
  - poetic language, 43
  - semen and speech, 45, 95, 186n27
  - symbolic language, 40–1
  - transformational language, 39–43,  
97, 185n15
  - compare* expressive power
- Laurence (saint), 114–15
- Leaena (martyr), **21–3**
- Legenda Aurea* (Jacobus de Voragine),  
200n6
- abstraction, 26
  - apex of patience literature, 8, 30,  
**113–14**
  - contest between saints, 134
  - counterfeit consciousness, 117, 132–3
  - female patience figures, **116–19**
  - gender roles, 117
  - James the Dismembered, 115–16
  - patience attributes, **114–16**
  - stasis motif, **33–4**
  - suffering, 135
  - Virgin Mary, 118
  - Virgin of Antioch, 62
  - see also* Jacobus de Voragine
- The Legend of Good Women* (Chaucer),  
3, 33, **131–3**, 142, 162
- Lerer, Seth, 148, 207n47
- lesbian relationships, 60
- Levinas, Emmanuel, 30
- Le Livre de la cité des dames*. *see* *Book of the City of Ladies*
- Lot (Old Testament), 101, 102, 105–6,  
194n36, 199n80
- see also* Loth (*Genesis A*)
- Loth (*Genesis A*), 80, 85, 86, 96, 97
- see also* Lot (Old Testament)
- Loth's daughters, 84–5, 97, 102,  
**104–7**, 109, 111, 198n68, 199n80
- Loth's wife (*Genesis A*)
- Abraham, 97, 196n56
  - break with authority, 81, 87, 100,  
107–8, 195nn41, 45
  - By Ways, 82
  - desire, 98, 196n58, 197n66
  - frozen speaker, 96, 170
  - Genesis A* story, 80–2
  - imagery of, **84–92**, 98–9, 100,  
193nn21, 25–28, 197nn62, 67
  - interpretations of, **83–4**
  - Old English tradition, **80–2**
  - paralysis, 81–2, 94–7
  - patience figures, 76, 80, 104,  
111–12
  - place, 96–7, **98–100**, **109–11**,  
196–7n59
  - poet's work on, 199n77
  - punishment of, 102
  - symbolic role, **91–4**, 103
  - transformation, 81–2, 91, 94–100,  
103, 109, 195nn41, 43, 50
  - see also* *Genesis A*; Lot's wife (Old Testament)
- Lot's wife (Old Testament)
- desire, **100–4**
  - first appearance of, 80
  - gendering, 36
  - landscape, 98, **98–100**, 196n51
  - Margery Kempe, 173
  - passion figures, 36, 171, 198n68
  - the Shrine, 159, 163

- Lot's wife (Old Testament)—*Continued*  
 transformation, 84, 93, 95–6, 99,  
 173, 193n20, 195–6n50, 197n60,  
 198n68  
*De Virginitibus*, 92  
*see also* Loth's wife (*Genesis A*)
- Lucy (saint)  
 chastity, 27  
 inheritance, 153  
 Jacobus's source for, 183n120  
 mimicry, 34, 135, 137, 183n122  
 stasis motif, **33–4**, **35**, 124,  
 125–6, 159  
 visionary paralysis, 173
- 2 and 4 Maccabees, 14, **18–21**, 22–3,  
 117–18, 180n77
- mægdā sið*, 104–7, 111
- Mann, Jill, 209n68
- The Man of Law's Tale* (Chaucer), 7,  
 131, 134, 139, 141
- Manter, Lisa, 168
- marriage disputes  
 Dialogue Portion, 25  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, 181n94
- martyrdom  
 Blandina, 28  
 crown of, 114  
*de Patientia*, 78  
 Fénice, 122–6  
 Irène, 31  
 narrative mechanic of, **26**  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et  
 Felicitatis*, 49–52, 53–4, 57,  
 189nn59, 60  
 Saint Cecilia, 164  
 Virgin of Antioch, 69–70
- martyrologies  
 Blandina, **11–13**  
 egalitarian ideas, 11, 178n43  
 fact and fiction, 25  
 female protagonists, **9–11**  
 patience (virtue), 18  
 prisons, 181n93  
 study of, 3  
 virgin martyrs, 34–5  
*see also* saints' lives
- martyrs  
 belief identification, 9  
 bodies of martyrs, 113–14, 182n107  
 childbirth comparison, 15–16  
 Christian historical traditions, 18  
 classical comparisons, 14  
 Griselda, 137  
 growth of cults, 24  
 heroic values, 15, 22  
 Leaena and, 21  
 martyrs of love, 131–2  
 virtue of patience, 4  
 “The Martyrs of Lyon and Vienne,”  
 12–13, 15, 28
- Mary (Virgin), 121, 213n40  
 gaze of, 160  
 Holy House of Nazareth, 160, 163,  
 210–11n10  
*Legenda Aurea*, 118  
 Margery Kempe, 163, 171, 172  
 Miracles of the Virgin, 118–19  
*Prioress's Tale*, 119–20
- Mary Magdalene, 103
- masculinity  
*de Patientia*, 79–80  
 Loth's wife, 100  
 masculine identity, 59, 181n91  
*Psychomachia*, 79–80  
 Virgin of Antioch, 64–5, 70  
*compare* men
- masculinization  
 Perpetua, 53–5, 69  
 Virgin of Antioch, 68–71
- Matthew (apostle), 157
- Maurus, Rabanus, 98
- McClellan, William, 142
- McInerney, Maud, 34, 63, 117, 118,  
 188n47, 191nn85, 87
- McIntyre, Ruth Summar, 170
- McKinley, Kathryn, 3, 204n13
- medieval romance genre. *see* romance  
 genre

- Melibee (character), 5, 6
- men  
 domination of, **56–60**  
 fame, 1  
 language, 40–1  
 male discourse, *Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 48–9  
 passivity as choice, 9  
 search element, **26**  
*compare* masculinity  
*The Merchant's Tale* (Chaucer), 37  
 milk, 45, 186n25  
 mimicry  
 character repetition, 61  
 Lucy (saint), 34, 135, 137, 183n122  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 51, 61  
 Perpetua, 38  
 saints' lives, **33**  
*compare* counterfeit consciousness;  
 repetition syndrome
- Moab (Lot's grandchild), 106
- moral amnesia, 30, 31, 117
- Morrison, Signe, 213n42
- Morse, Charlotte C., 208n57
- Moses (Bible), 103
- motherhood  
 Blandina and 2/4 Maccabees, **18–21**  
 heritage of the mother, 50–1  
 language, 39–40  
 Perpetua (martyr), 39, **60–1**  
 pregnancy and martyrdom, 50  
 semiotic language, 39–40, 49, 50  
*compare* women
- Mulvey, Laura, 36, 162, 168
- musical language, Cecilia (saint), 32
- Musonius Rufus, 17
- Musurillo, Herbert, 176n16
- naming  
 Loth's daughters, 106  
 Perpetua, 40–2, 43–4, 53, 186n22
- narcissism, 47, 66
- Naturalis historia* (Pliny the Elder), **21–3**
- Newton, Allyson, 166
- Niobe, 96, 195n50
- Old Testament  
 Book of Job, 23  
 Lot's wife, 84  
 patience figures, 76  
 suffering, 80  
 sweetness in the mouth, 45  
 written texts, 196n55
- oral modes of thought, 8
- Orth, William, 119
- paralysis  
 about, **35**  
*Legenda Aurea*, 117  
 Loth's wife, 81–2, 94–7  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 47  
*compare* stasis motif
- Paschasius, 33–4
- passion figures, Lot's wife (Old Testament), 36, 171
- Passion of Lucy*, 35
- passios  
 academic neglect of, 184n2  
 description of martyrs, 4  
 heroic rhetoric, **13–16**  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 37  
 about, 37  
 art, 42  
 athletic imagery, 49  
 belief identification, 39–43, 48, 181n94  
 break with authority, 37–8, 43–4, **56–8**  
 By Ways and space, 43, 43–4, 44, 181n94, 185n14, 211n20  
 dating of, 37  
 Dialogue Portion, 38  
 feminine language, 39–40  
 gender, 52–5, **55–6**, **56–60**  
 judicial hearings, 181n94  
 male discourse, 48–9  
 marriage disputes, 181n94

- Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis—Continued*  
 martyrdom portion, 49–52, 53–4, 57, 189nn59, 60  
 mimicry, 51, 61  
 naming, 40–2, 43–4, 53, 186n22  
 prayer, 48–9  
 profeminism of, 36, 38–9  
 vase debate, 39–43, 185nn15, 17  
 visions, **45–7**, **48–9**, **51**, 53–4, 55, 57–8, 186n20, 188n46, 189nn55, 59, 60, 62  
*compare* Roman Empire; *see also* Perpetua (Vibia Perpetua) (martyr)
- patience (virtue)  
 Chaucer, 138  
 Christine de Pizan, 138  
*Clerk's Tale*, 2–4  
 conquered demon story, 5  
 definition of, 4–5  
 difficulty of establishing, 15, 20  
 gendering, 134, 134–5  
 gender roles, 167  
*Legenda Aurea*, **114–16**  
 martyrologies, 18  
 medieval tradition of, **4–7**  
 miraculous nature of, 6–7  
 negative establishment of, 4  
*patientia corporis*, Leena, 22  
 proof of, 4  
 righteous patience, about, **5–6**  
*compare* impatience
- patience figures  
*de patientia* (Tertullian), 75, **76–80**  
 Fénice, 128  
*Genesis A*, 76  
 God, 78–9  
 Griselda legend, 4–7, 134, 152–3, 208n53  
 Job, 6, 23  
*Legenda Aurea*, **116–19**  
 Lot/Loth's wife, 36, 76, 80, 104, 111–12  
 as male, 191n1  
 medieval tradition, **4–7**, 75–6  
 popularity of, 32  
 pseudo-saints, 3–4  
*Psychomachia*, 75–6, 79–80  
 representations of the virtue, 3  
*Vitae Columbani*, 71–3
- patience literature  
 ability to endure, **7–8**  
 birth of genre, **23–4**  
*Book of Margery Kempe*, **157–9**, **172–3**  
 Chaucer, 132, 142  
 Christine de Pizan, 138  
*The Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer), 131, 133–4, 138  
 counterfeit consciousness, **31–3**  
 functioning of genre, 8  
 gendering, **8–9**  
 as genre, **1–2**, 80  
 mechanics of, **24–7**  
*compare* hagiography; satire
- Patientia (character), 75–6, 79
- patriarchy, 29  
 Grisilde, 137, 165–6  
 inheritance, 104–5
- Patterson, Lee, 119
- Paul (apostle), 34
- Paula (saint), 116, 153
- Pausanias, 21, 22, 180n82
- Peristephanon* (Prudentius), 114, 118
- Perkins, Judith  
 Christian community, 28  
 Perpetua, 37–8, 54, 55, 56  
 self as sufferer, 7, 8, 16–17  
 significance of martyrs, 18
- Perpetua (Vibia Perpetua) (martyr)  
 emotions of, 47–8  
 expressive power of, 96  
 fame, 55  
 identity, 42  
 later influences of, 62  
 leadership role of, 47, 52–3, 54  
*Legenda Aurea*, 115–16  
 mimicry, 38  
 motherhood, 39, **60–1**  
 sex change of, **52–5**, 186nn21–22, 188nn45–47  
 space, 211n20

- see also *Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*
- Petrarch, Francis  
 Griselda legend, 133, 141, 143–5, 147–50, 155, 203n10, 206–7n44, 47  
 rule of God and man, 138
- The Physician's Tale* (Chaucer), 131
- Piers Plowman* (Langland), 191n1
- place. *see* space
- Plato, 185n10
- Pliny the Elder, 21
- Pliny the Younger, 10, 11
- Pluto (character), 37
- Polycarp (martyr), 26, 28
- Pomponia Graecina, 11, 15
- Pomponius (deacon), 52–3, 58, 59, 189n62
- Ponticus (martyr), 20
- Potamiaena (martyr), 15
- power structures  
 counterfeit consciousness, **31–3**  
 and Leaena, **21–3**  
 patience literature, 24  
 patriarchy, 29  
 sexuality, **22–3**  
*compare* break with authority;  
 egalitarian ideas
- prayer  
 ecstatic language, 73  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 48–9, 186n20  
 pregnancy and martyrdom, 50  
 Virgin of Antioch, 63
- Priores's Tale* (Chaucer), **119–20**, 201n18
- prisons  
 By Ways, 181n93  
 Margery Kempe, 211n20  
 martyrologies, 181n93  
 Perpetua, 211n20
- profeminine work, *Cligés* (Chrétien de Troyes), 36
- Proserpine (character), 37
- prostitutes  
 brothels, 27, 31, 63–6  
 Leaena, 21–3, 180nn81–82
- protofeminism  
*de Patientia*, 79  
*The Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas*, 36  
*Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*, 36, 38–9
- pseudo-saints, 3–4
- Psychomachia* (Prudentius), patience figures, 75–6, 79–80
- Quilligan, Maureen, 139
- Raguin, Virginia Chieffo, 170
- Ramsey, Boniface, 190n70
- Reames, Sherry L., 183n115
- Rebecca, 185–6n17
- reductio ad absurdum. *see* satire
- Regulae Pastoralis* (Gregory), 24
- Remley, Paul G., 80
- repetition syndrome  
 bodies of martyrs, 182n107  
 Griselda legend, 152  
 repeating events, 61  
 saints' lives, **30**, 35, 183nn114, 116  
*compare* counterfeit consciousness;  
 mimicry
- reputation. *see* fame
- Richards, Earl Jeffrey, 204n16
- Riedinger, Anita R., 111
- romance genre  
 break with authority, 37  
 Christine de Pizan, 146–7  
 relationship to hagiography, 17  
 saints' lives, 3
- Roman Empire  
 egalitarian ideas, 10–11, 178n41  
 family authority, 181n94  
 gender and politics, 37  
 gendering of virtues, 17  
 self-understanding, 7–8  
 space, 27–8  
*compare* *Passio Sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis*
- Ronsse, Erin, 38, 42, 49, 50, 51, 184n2
- Rousselle, Robert, 189n55
- Rudat, Wolfgang, 165

- Sainted Women of the Dark Ages*  
(McNamara, Halborg, and  
Whatley, eds.), 74
- saints  
civic authority, 200n88  
patience attributes, **114–16**  
pseudo-saints, 3–4
- saints' lives  
difficulty of patience, 15  
gendering, 24  
gender order, 39  
gender roles, 61  
medieval romance genre, 3  
mimicry, **33**  
repetition syndrome, **30, 35,**  
183nn114, 116  
statis motif, **33–4, 135**  
*see also* martyrologies
- Sanctus (martyr), 11, 34
- Sanok, Catherine, 210n5
- Sarra (Abraham's wife), 81, 105,  
**107–9, 111**
- satire  
Chaucer, 120, 132–3, 137, 140–2,  
145, 146, 152–3, 156, 201n20,  
204n14  
Chrétien de Troyes, 124,  
202n10  
Christine de Pizan, 142, 145, 146  
Margery Kempe, 210n5  
patience literature, 1  
*compare* patience literature
- Saturninus (martyr), 57, 115
- Saturus (martyr), 38, 56, 57, 58, 115,  
189nn59–61
- search, **26**
- Second Nun's Tale* (Chaucer), 131, 139,  
**163–5, 211n21**
- secular hagiography.  
*see* hagiography
- self-consciousness, 26
- semen, 45, 93, 186n27
- semiotic language, 39–40, 49, 50
- Seneca, 17
- Severs, J. Burke, 144
- sex change  
Perpetua, **52–5, 186nn21–22,**  
188nn45–47  
Virgin of Antioch, 66–8
- sexuality  
Christ, 168  
clothing, 190n75  
erotic fantasy/assault, 186n19  
erotic stasis, 117  
Foucault on, 17–18  
*Genesis A*, 81  
lesbian relationships, 60  
Loth, 97, 98, 102, 198n68, 199n80  
Margery Kempe, 171–2  
phallic symbols, 189n55  
pornographic aspects, 117, 201n10  
power structures, **22–3**  
self-castration, 180n81  
Sodomites, 198nn72, 74,  
199nn80, 86  
statis motif, **33–4**  
taste in the mouth, 45  
Virgin of Antioch, 63–9  
visions, 45  
*compare* desire
- Shaw, Brent D.  
ability to endure, 7, 8, 16, 17, 18, 20  
Blandina, 12  
egalitarian ideas, 10  
Foucault's ideas, 17–18  
on gender, 9, 11, 14, 17  
heroic values, 14, 22  
patience as clothing, 192n4  
Perpetua, 39, 59–60  
public shaming, 28  
relationships between works, 23
- the Shrine  
*Book of Margery Kempe*, 162, 163,  
**168–73**  
Chaucer's works, **162–7, 165–7,**  
**167–8**  
context of, 36  
feminine language, 210n7  
Griselda legend, 163, **165–7**  
innovation and, 36  
Shrine to the Virgin, 160  
space and, 27

- women, **159–62**, 210n9  
*compare* space
- Sodoma (anon), 95, 194n32, 195nn40, 47, 197n60
- Sodom and Gomorrah, 80, 87, 94–8, 101–9, 193n28, 196n59, 198nn68, 72, 74, 199nn80, 86
- Song of Songs, 45
- space  
 brothels, **27**, 31, 63–6  
 domestic space, 44, 117, **162–3**, 185n14, 210–11n10, 212n24  
 language as space, 41  
 Lot/Loth's wife, 96–7, **98–100**, **109–11**, 196–7n59  
 Margery Kempe, 213nn39, 42  
 patience figures, 75  
 patience literature, **27–8**  
 Perpetua, 43–4, 211n20  
 writings of Ambrose, 190n70  
*compare* brothels; By Ways; the Shrine
- Stanbury, Sarah, 159–60, 162, 165, 167, 206n43, 207n46
- stasis motif, **34–5**  
 erotic stasis, 117  
 Fénice, 124–5, 126, 136, 159  
 Griselda, 135–7  
 Lucy, **33–4**, **35**, 124, 125–6, 159  
 saints' lives, **33–4**, 135  
*compare* paralysis
- suffering  
 belief identification, 9  
*Book of Margery Kempe*, 157–9, 172, 210n5  
 castration, 117  
 focus on motif, 24  
 gendering, **17–18**, 173, 181n91  
 Griselda, 135  
*Legenda Aurea*, 135  
 2 and 4 Maccabees, 20  
 multiplication of suffering, **26**  
 mutilation, **21–3**, 117  
 Old Testament, 80  
 prisons, 181n93  
 self as sufferer, **7–8**  
 Suffering Portion (defined), **25**, 26
- Vitae Columbani*, 71–2  
 see also *hypomonê*
- Tacitus, 11, 15
- The Tale of Melibee* (Chaucer), 5–6, 131, 139
- Tertullian (early church father)  
*Apologeticum*, 21, 24, 178n41  
 athletic allegory, 49, 190n74  
 egalitarian rhetoric, 10, 178n41, 192n8  
 feminism/protofeminism, 79, 190n2  
 heroic virtues, 14  
 Leaena (martyr), **21–3**, 180n82  
 Lot's wife, 194n32  
 martyrdom metaphor of, 46  
 patience as woman, 192n4  
*de patientia*, 24, 75, **76–80**  
 stasis motif, 34
- The Testament of Job*  
 dating of, 181n88  
 ecstatic languages, 32, 73  
 female patience figures, 23  
 societal benefits, 35  
 see also Job (Bible)
- Thessala (Fénice's servant), 121, 128
- Trajan (emperor), 10
- transformation  
 Lot/Loth's wife, 81–2, 84, 91, 93–100, 103, 109, 173, 193n20, 195–6nn41, 43, 50, 197n60, 198n68  
 Sarra, 109  
 transformational language, 39–43, 97, 185n15  
 transubstantiation, 73
- transvestism  
 Jewish virgin story, 190n68  
*Psychomachia*, 79–80  
 Virgin of Antioch, **61–71**, 190–1nn79, 83
- Travels of John Mandeville*, 98, 110
- Troilus (character), 167
- Troilus and Criseyde* (Chaucer), 131, **167–8**

- undercutting of women  
 Blandina, 19  
 Grisilde, 165–6  
 mother in 2 Maccabees, 19, 180n77  
 status of motherhood, 61  
*compare* women
- Urban (pope), 164
- Valerian (saint), 160, 163–4
- Valterius (Petrarch's character), 143, 150, 206n35
- vases. *see* waterpots
- Vettius Epagathus (martyr), 7, 13, 176n24
- Vincent (saint), 115, 125
- virgin(s)  
 Chaucer, 133  
 Christ as, 46  
 Margery Kempe, 169  
 martyrologies, 34–5  
 Shrine to the Virgin, 160  
 virgin martyrs, 46  
 Virgin of Antioch, **61–71**, 190–1nn79, 83, 87
- De Virginitibus* (Ambrose), **61–71**  
 Ambrose's writing style, 190nn72, 80, 191n85  
 athletic allegory, 190n74  
 Christ as virgin, 46  
 Lot's wife, 92  
 related works, 79–80  
 significance of, 62  
*see also* Ambrose (church father)
- visions  
 female leadership, 47  
 Margery Kempe, 163, 168, 171–2  
 Perpetua's visions, 38, 39, **45–7**, **48–9**, **51**, 53–4, 55, 57–8, 115, 186n20, 188n46, 189nn55, 59, 62  
 Saturninus' visions, 115  
 Saturus' vision, 57, 189n60  
*Vitae Columbani* (Jonas of Bobbio), **71–4**
- Vitz, Birge, 46
- Walter (Chaucer's character)  
 casting out of Grisilde, 3, 155, 166  
 desire, 135–6, 154, 165–7, 203n11, 206–7n44, 208n53, 212n33  
 gaze of, 147–8, 150, 151, 206–7nn41, 44  
 mirror to Grisilde, 153  
 reconciliation with Grisilde, 6, 209n67  
 space, **165–7**  
 testing of Grisilde, 134, 148, 207n45  
 vow to, 144, 146, 209n67  
*see also* *The Clerk's Tale* (Chaucer)
- waterpots, 39–43, 145, 154, 165, 185–6nn15, 17, 19
- weapons, 55–6, 189n55
- wic* (word), **110–11**, 200n89
- Wife of Bath (character), 23, 128, 134, 153, 156
- Wilcox, Jonathan, 107, 199n84
- Wogan-Brown, Jocelyn, 3
- women  
 commodification of, 42, 81  
 emotions of, 47–8  
 feminine language, 39–40, 43–4, 47, 73–4  
 monumental quality, 80, 82  
 objectification of, 80, 136, 139–40, 165  
 patience literature, 24  
*compare* gendering; motherhood; undercutting of women
- Woolf, Virginia, 140, 141