

## Co-Editors' Note

**John D. Iceland<sup>1</sup> · Stephen A. Matthews<sup>1</sup> ·  
Jennifer Van Hook<sup>1</sup>**

Published online: 5 April 2018  
© Population Association of America 2018

*Demography* is a scientific journal that publishes peer-reviewed research on a broad range of topics related to the study of human populations. Part of our intellectual growth as a field is to encourage debate and exchange, and the forum the journal provides for this activity is a *Commentary*. Commentaries are designed to focus on the scientific issues raised in a published paper and to reflect current conversations in the field.

In the August 2017 issue (Vol. 54, No. 4), we published a paper by Daniel Goodkind on the population averted by China's birth restrictions. This paper generated a heated reaction from several scholars both in e-mails to the co-editors and in discussions in other forums online and in print. Early in this conversation, and consistent with our philosophy, we welcomed the submission of commentaries, coupled with the opportunity for the author to respond. Further, we waived the typical word-length restrictions that are placed on commentaries published in *Demography*.

Three commentaries and an author reply were received and are included in this issue of *Demography*. These commentaries have not been subject to a standard review, but the co-editors and members of the PAA Publications Committee read these materials and strongly urged the authors to focus on the scientific questions about China's family planning programs.

---

This note refers to the article available at [<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13524-017-0595-x>].  
The comments to the original article are available at [<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13524-018-0658-7>], [<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13524-018-0660-0>], and [<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13524-018-0662-y>].  
An author's reply to these comments is available at [<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13524-018-0661-z>].

✉ Stephen A. Matthews  
sxm27@psu.edu

John D. Iceland  
jdi10@psu.edu

Jennifer Van Hook  
jxv21@psu.edu

<sup>1</sup> Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA, USA

It is important to note that the commentators raised questions about how this original submission was handled. Given the journal's double-blind review policy, we can only say that Goodkind's manuscript was first submitted to *Demography* in April 2016, was revised to meet the journal's word-length requirements, and then formally entered into the review system in May 2016. The manuscript underwent the standard review process. This entailed a double-blind review in which three expert reviewers were solicited and provided critical reviews. The paper was revised and resubmitted (October 2016), accepted (January 2017), and ultimately published (August 2017).