



## Branding foods as ‘healthy’ or ‘unhealthy’ based on marginal data calls findings into question. Reply to Kanter M [letter]

Fenglei Wang<sup>1</sup> · Megu Y. Baden<sup>1,2</sup> · Frank B. Hu<sup>1,3,4</sup>

Received: 25 May 2022 / Accepted: 8 June 2022 / Published online: 13 August 2022  
© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2022

**Keywords** Metabolomics · Plant-based diets · Potato · Type 2 diabetes

*To the Editor:* We appreciate the comments by Kanter [1] on our recent publication in *Diabetologia* [2]. The letter was mainly focused on the rationale for differentiating between ‘healthy’ and ‘unhealthy’ plant-based foods and classifying potatoes as an ‘unhealthy plant food’.

We distinguished ‘healthy’ and ‘unhealthy’ plant foods based on existing knowledge of the associations between intakes of these foods and chronic disease outcomes [3], rather than their metabolite profiles. Although there are many overlapping metabolites in the metabolite profile of the healthy plant-based diet index and that of the unhealthy plant-based diet index, the associations of these overlapping metabolites (39 out of 43) with healthy and unhealthy plant-based diet indices are in the opposite direction, indicating that these two dietary patterns have distinct metabolic profiles. Our procedure for creating the three plant-based diet indices was similar to that used by Martínez-González and colleagues [4]. However, the aim of that study was to explore the health effects of encouraging the consumption of all plant-derived foods while discouraging the consumption of all animal foods. Under this rationale, potatoes were included as a positive component because of their plant origin. Because not every plant food is a healthy food choice, we further categorised plant foods into ‘healthy’ and ‘unhealthy’ groups. Consistent evidence indicates that higher potato intake, especially frequent consumption of

French fries, is associated with an increased risk of type 2 diabetes [5–7]. More importantly, our study is focused on overall dietary patterns instead of metabolic signatures or health effects of individual foods. The plant-based diet indices we developed have been used in other cohorts [8–10], which also observed differential associations for healthy and unhealthy plant-based diets with respect to health outcomes. These data support the generalisability of our methods for deriving plant-based dietary indices in different populations.

We agree with Kanter that dietary modifications are a promising intervention strategy for both human health and environmental sustainability. Our metabolomics findings support the benefits of increasing consumption of healthy plant foods and decreasing (but not eliminating) the consumption of unhealthy plant foods for diabetes prevention.

**Authors’ relationships and activities** The authors declare that there are no relationships or activities that might bias, or be perceived to bias, their work.

**Contribution statement** All authors were responsible for drafting the article and revising it critically for important intellectual content. All authors approved the version to be published.

## References

1. Kanter M (2022) Branding foods as ‘healthy’ or ‘unhealthy’ based on marginal data calls findings into question. *Diabetologia* 65. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00125-022-05767-6>
2. Wang F, Baden MY, Guasch-Ferré M et al (2022) Plasma metabolite profiles related to plant-based diets and the risk of type 2 diabetes. *Diabetologia* 65:1119–1132. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00125-022-05692-8>
3. Satija A, Bhupathiraju SN, Rimm EB et al (2016) Plant-based dietary patterns and incidence of type 2 diabetes in US men and women: results from three prospective cohort studies. *PLoS Med* 13(6):e1002039. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1002039>
4. Martínez-González MA, Sánchez-Tainta A, Corella D et al (2014) A provegetarian food pattern and reduction in total mortality in the Prevención con Dieta Mediterránea (PREDIMED) study. *Am J*

✉ Frank B. Hu  
fhu@hsph.harvard.edu

<sup>1</sup> Department of Nutrition, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, MA, USA

<sup>2</sup> Department of Lifestyle Medicine, Osaka University Graduate School of Medicine, Osaka, Japan

<sup>3</sup> Channing Division of Network Medicine, Brigham and Women’s Hospital and Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA

<sup>4</sup> Department of Epidemiology, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, MA, USA

- Clin Nutr 100(suppl\_1):320S–328S. <https://doi.org/10.3945/ajcn.113.071431>
5. Guo F, Zhang Q, Jiang H et al (2021) Dietary potato intake and risks of type 2 diabetes and gestational diabetes mellitus. Clin Nutr 40(6):3754–3764. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnu.2021.04.039>
  6. Bidel Z, Teymoori F, Davari SJ, Nazarzadeh M (2018) Potato consumption and risk of type 2 diabetes: a dose–response meta-analysis of cohort studies. Clin Nutr ESPEN 27:86–91. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnesp.2018.06.004>
  7. Quan W, Jiao Y, Xue C et al (2022) Processed potatoes intake and risk of type 2 diabetes: a systematic review and meta-analysis of nine prospective cohort studies. Crit Rev Food Sci Nutr 62(5):1417–1425. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2020.1843395>
  8. Li H, Zeng X, Wang Y et al (2022) A prospective study of healthful and unhealthful plant-based diet and risk of overall and cause-specific mortality. Eur J Nutr 61(1):387–398. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00394-021-02660-7>
  9. Lee K, Kim H, Rebholz CM, Kim J (2021) Association between different types of plant-based diets and risk of dyslipidemia: a prospective cohort study. Nutrients 13(1):220. <https://doi.org/10.3390/nu13010220>
  10. Zamani B, Daneshzad E, Siassi F, Guilani B, Bellissimo N, Azadbakht L (2020) Association of plant-based dietary patterns with psychological profile and obesity in Iranian women. Clin Nutr 39(6):1799–1808. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnu.2019.07.019>

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.